



CHESTER COUNTY

**COMPLIANCE AUDIT REPORT** 

FOR THE PERIOD

JANUARY 1, 2009 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

**RELEASED MARCH 2014** 

# COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

## **EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE - AUDITOR GENERAL**

## **DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL**





Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

Mr. Anthony J. DiJoseph, Jr., President AVONDALE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION Chester County

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Avondale Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association pursuant to authority derived from Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, Act of April 9, 1929, (P.L. 343, No. 176), and mandated by the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act, as consolidated by the Act of November 23, 2010 (P.L. 1181, No. 118), at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 *et seq.*, for the period January 1, 2009 to December 31, 2011.

We conducted this compliance audit in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* applicable to performance audits, issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our audit results and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our audit results and conclusions based on our audit results and conclusions based on our audit results and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The objectives of the audit were:

- 1. To determine if the volunteer firefighters' relief association took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report; and
- 2. To determine if the volunteer firefighters' relief association received state aid and expended state aid and accumulated relief funds in compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above.

Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Avondale Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association's administration of state aid and accumulated relief funds complies with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures including the safeguarding of assets. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the volunteer firefighters' relief association's internal controls as they relate to the association's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of the audit objectives, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Our audit procedures also included tests of documentary evidence supporting the Avondale Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association's recorded financial transactions, tests of the physical existence of inventories, interviews of selected officials and direct confirmation of the Avondale Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association's cash, investments, and certain other assets and liabilities as of December 31, 2011, with the custodians of the funds, debtors, creditors, and financial institutions to the extent necessary to satisfy the audit objectives. Additionally, we performed procedures to provide a reasonable assurance of detecting instances of violations of legal and regulatory requirements or violations of provisions of contracts that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our audit, for the period January 1, 2009 to December 31, 2011, found the Avondale Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association did not take appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report, as detailed below and discussed in the Status of Prior Finding section of this report. In addition, the results of our audit found the Avondale Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association did not, in all significant respects, receive state aid and expend state aid and accumulated relief funds in compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures as noted in the findings listed below and discussed in detail in the Findings and Recommendations section of this report. Therefore, the Avondale Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association will be subject to the potential withhold of its upcoming state aid distribution, as discussed in the Potential Withhold of State Aid section of this report. The results of our tests also indicated the Avondale Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association expended funds as presented in the Accompanying Expenditure Information and, as of December 31, 2011, had a cash balance of \$256,637 and an investment balance with a fair value of \$292,220.

Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance with Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Equipment Roster

Finding No. 2 – Undocumented Expenditures

Finding No. 3 – Unauthorized Expenditures

Finding No. 4 - Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Membership Roster

The contents of this report were discussed with the management of the Avondale Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report.

Eugent: O-Pager

July 11, 2013

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE Auditor General

## CONTENTS

Background 1
Status of Prior Finding
Findings and Recommendations:
Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Equipment Roster
Finding No. 2 – Undocumented Expenditures
Finding No. 3 – Unauthorized Expenditures
Finding No. 4 – Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Membership Roster 10
Potential Withhold of State Aid 11
Accompanying Expenditure Information 12
Report Distribution List

## BACKGROUND

Pursuant to Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, Act of April 9, 1929, (P.L. 343, No. 176), and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act, as consolidated by the Act of November 23, 2010, (P.L. 1181, No. 118), at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 *et seq.*, the Department of the Auditor General's duty is to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association to determine that funds received under the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution Law, Act of December 18, 1984, (P.L. 1005, No. 205), as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.701 *et seq.* (commonly referred to as Act 205), are properly expended.

The Avondale Fire Company No. 1 Relief Association, herein referred to as Avondale Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association, is a charitable organization that was formed primarily to afford financial protection to volunteer firefighters and to encourage individuals to participate in volunteer fire service.

Act 118 governs the overall operation of the volunteer firefighters' relief association. The relief association's bylaws define the specific operational procedures by which the volunteer firefighters' relief association conducts business. To fulfill its primary purpose, Act 118 authorizes specific types of expenditures and prescribes appropriate volunteer firefighters' relief association investment options. Within the parameters established by Act 118, it is the responsibility of the volunteer firefighters' relief association to choose investments in a proper and prudent manner.

Volunteer firefighters' relief associations receive public tax monies, and the association officers therefore have a responsibility to the public to conduct the association's financial affairs in a businesslike manner and to maintain sufficient financial records to support the propriety of all association transactions. Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are also responsible for ensuring that the association operates in accordance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures.

Act 205 sets forth the computation of the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution paid to each applicable municipality throughout the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. The amount of the distribution is based upon the population of each municipality and the market value of real estate within the municipality. Upon receipt of this distribution, the municipality must allocate the funds to the volunteer firefighters' relief association of the fire service organization or fire service organizations, which is or are recognized as providing the service to the municipality.

#### BACKGROUND (Continued)

The Avondale Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association was allocated state aid from the following municipalities:

Municipality	County	2009	2010	2011
Avondale Borough	Chester	\$ 6,380	\$ 7,182	\$ 11,572
Franklin Township	Chester	\$ 3,365	\$ 3,787	\$ 6,018
London Britain Township	Chester	\$ 8,118	\$ 9,137	\$ 14,434
London Grove Township	Chester	\$19,231	\$ 21,645	\$ 38,238
New Garden Township	Chester	\$89,348	\$100,566	\$166,339
West Marlborough Township	Chester	\$ 1,633	\$ 1,839	\$ 2,849

The volunteer firefighters' relief association and the affiliated fire service organizations are separate, legal entities. The Avondale Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association is affiliated with the following fire service organizations:

Avondale Fire Company EMS Division Avondale Fire Company No. 1

## AVONDALE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION STATUS OF PRIOR FINDING

#### NONCOMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

The Avondale Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association has not complied with the following prior audit finding. This finding is noted below and discussed in detail in the Finding and Recommendation section of this report:

• Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Equipment Roster

We are concerned with the volunteer firefighters' relief association's failure to correct the previously reported audit finding. The association management should strive to implement the recommendations and corrective actions noted in this audit report.

## <u>Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation –</u> Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Equipment Roster

<u>Condition</u>: As cited in our two prior audit report, the relief association officials again failed to maintain a complete and accurate roster of equipment owned by the relief association. While a roster of relief association owned equipment was provided, it did not include equipment purchases made during the 2009 year. In addition, the relief association did not accurately identify the equipment owned by the relief association. Specifically, the equipment roster provided during the current audit period did not contain serial/identification numbers and the current locations of items to accurately identify the equipment owned. Equipment purchased during the 2009 year totaled \$83,872.

<u>Criteria</u>: The relief association should establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster of all items purchased by the relief association in order to provide an effective accounting control over the relief association's equipment. A cumulative equipment roster of all relief association equipment should include the following:

- Types of equipment purchased;
- Dates of purchase;
- Unit costs;
- Names of suppliers;
- Serial numbers, if applicable;
- Current locations of items;
- Final dispositions of sold or damaged equipment; and
- Evidence of the performance and results of an annual physical inventory.

<u>Cause</u>: Even though notified of this condition during our prior two audits, relief association officials, again, neglected to establish adequate internal control procedures over fixed assets requiring the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster.

<u>Effect</u>: The failure to properly record equipment purchases in a detailed equipment roster prevents officials from effectively monitoring the relief association's equipment purchases. In addition, the failure to maintain a detailed equipment roster prevents adequate accountability for, and safeguarding of, relief association owned equipment.

Furthermore, the relief association's continued failure to maintain a complete and accurate roster of relief association owned equipment, may lead to a total withholding of its state aid, as detailed on page 11 of this report.

#### Finding No. 1 – (Continued)

<u>Recommendation</u>: We, again, recommend the relief association officials maintain a cumulative equipment roster of all relief association owned equipment. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

#### Finding No. 2 – Undocumented Expenditures

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association was unable to provide adequate supporting documentation for the following expenditures:

Date	Check No.		Amount	
09/21/09 10/19/09	1508 1516		\$	538 230
12/31/09 07/15/10	1552 1639			290 649
04/11/11 08/10/11	1754 1813			737 695
09/13/11	1823			402
		Total	\$	3,541

#### Criteria: Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418(a) states:

The Office of Auditor General shall have the power and its duty shall be to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association receiving money under Chapter 7 of the Act of December 18, 1984 (P.L. 1005, No. 205), [FN1] known as the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act, as far as may be necessary to satisfy the Auditor General that the money received was or is being expended for no purpose other than that authorized by this subchapter. Copies of all audits shall be furnished to the Governor.

Without adequate supporting documentation, such as invoices and detailed meeting minutes evidencing authorization of expenditures, this department is unable to determine whether relief association funds were expended for purposes authorized by Act 118. Furthermore, prudent business practice dictates that supporting documentation be maintained to verify the propriety of all financial transactions.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials failed to establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure supporting documentation is maintained for all expenditures.

#### Finding No. 2 – (Continued)

<u>Effect</u>: Lack of supporting documentation, such as invoices and detailed minutes of meetings, made it impossible to determine if the expenditures were made in accordance with Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7416(f). In addition, the failure to maintain adequate supporting documentation for relief association expenditures can lead to an increased risk of errors occurring and funds being misappropriated.

However, as a result of our audit, subsequent to the audit period, on July 9, 2012, the relief association received reimbursement from the affiliated fire company, in the amount of \$3,541, for the undocumented expenditures.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials maintain supporting documentation for all future expenditures. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

#### Finding No. 3 – Unauthorized Expenditures

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association expended funds for the following items that are not authorized by Act 118:

nount	Description Amoun		Date
1,807	\$	07/15/10 1639	07/15/10
139		01/19/11 1712	01/19/11
273		02/23/11 1731	02/23/11
-			

Total \$ 2,219

Criteria: Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7416(f)(11) states:

The funds of any volunteer firefighters' relief association may be spent:

(11) To purchase safeguards for preserving life, health and safety of volunteer firefighters to ensure their availability to participate in the volunteer fire service.

Costs associated with services on a vehicle 100% owned by the fire company or service costs not in proportion with the relief association ownership of a vehicle do not qualify as authorized volunteer firefighters' relief association expenditures; consequently, these disbursements are not authorized under Act 118.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials were unaware that the aforementioned expenditures were not authorized by Act 118.

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of these improper expenditures, relief association funds were not available for investment purposes, or to pay for expenditures authorized by Act 118.

However, as a result of our audit, subsequent to the audit period, on May 16, 2012, the relief association received reimbursement from the affiliated fire company, in the amount of \$2,219, for the unauthorized expenditures.

#### Finding No. 3 – (Continued)

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend the relief association become familiar with Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7416(f) to aid them in determining the propriety of future expenditures. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

## Finding No. 4 – Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Membership Roster

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association officials failed to maintain a complete and accurate roster of relief association members. Specifically, the membership roster provided by the relief association did not contain mailing addresses for 88 of 126 members listed.

<u>Criteria</u>: Relief association officials should maintain a complete and accurate roster of the relief association's membership, as identified by criteria set forth in the relief association's bylaws. A comprehensive roster of all relief association members should include the following:

- Names of each member;
- Members' mailing addresses;
- Dates of births;
- Dates of memberships; and
- Membership classifications.

In addition, when warranted, a notation should be made on the roster identifying the date of a member's resignation or death.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials were unaware that they should maintain a comprehensive roster of relief association members.

<u>Effect</u>: The failure to maintain a comprehensive membership roster could result in the payment of benefits to nonmembers, or deprive eligible relief association members from receiving authorized benefit payments.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend the relief association officials compile and maintain a complete and accurate roster of the relief association's membership. For additional guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

## AVONDALE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION POTENTIAL WITHHOLD OF STATE AID

A condition of a repeat finding, such as that reported in Finding No. 1, contained in this report, may lead to a total withholding of state aid unless that finding is corrected. However, such action will not be taken if sufficient documentation is provided within 60 days to verify compliance with this department's recommendation. Such documentation should be submitted by the volunteer firefighters' relief association to: Department of the Auditor General, Bureau of Firefighters' Relief Association Audits, Room 316-D Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120.

#### AVONDALE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION ACCOMPANYING EXPENDITURE INFORMATION FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2009 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7412 states: a volunteer firefighters' relief association is an organization formed primarily for the purpose of affording financial protection to volunteer firefighters against the consequences of misfortune suffered as a result of their participation in the fire service. The organization may contain within its membership the members of one or more fire companies and may serve secondary purposes, as set forth in this subchapter, but only if adequate provisions have been first made to serve the primary purpose.

Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7416 authorizes the investment of relief association funds and outlines the types of benefits and services that can be provided with volunteer firefighters' relief association funds.

Furthermore, all expenditures must be properly authorized as prescribed in the volunteer firefighters' relief association bylaws and approved at an association meeting.

#### USES OF FUNDS:

Benefit Services:		
Insurance premiums	\$	29,106
Death benefits		10,000
Relief benefits		260
Tokens of sympathy and goodwill		1,381
Total Benefit Services	\$	40,747
Fire Services:		
Equipment purchased	\$	209,925
Equipment maintenance		51,602
Training expenses		44,525
Fire prevention materials		1,646
Total Fire Services	\$	307,698
Administrative Services:		
Miscellaneous administrative expenses	\$	12,449
Total Administrative Services	\$	12,449
	¢	100.005
Total Investments Purchased:	\$	138,025
Other Expenditures:		
Undocumented expenditures	\$	3,541
Total Other Expenditures	\$	3,541

## AVONDALE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

### The Honorable Tom Corbett Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Avondale Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Governing Body:

Mr. Anthony J. DiJoseph, Jr., President

Mr. Douglas Isakoff, Vice President

Ms. Nichole B. Cole, Secretary

Ms. Erin M. Reed, Treasurer

The following municipalities allocated foreign fire insurance tax monies to this relief association and received a copy of this report.

Ms. Becky Brownback, Secretary	Ms. Sharon K. Norris, Secretary
Avondale Borough	Franklin Township
Ms. Carolyn Matalon, Secretary	Ms. Marilyn Venegas, Secretary
London Britain Township	London Grove Township
Mr. Lewis Gay, Secretary	Ms. Shirley K. Walton, Secretary
New Garden Township	West Marlborough Township

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at <u>www.auditorgen.state.pa.us.</u> Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: <u>news@auditorgen.state.pa.us</u>.