

ROBERT FULTON FIREMEN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION, LANCASTER COUNTY, PENNSYLVANIA

LANCASTER COUNTY

COMPLIANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR THE PERIOD

JANUARY 1, 2009 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

RELEASED MARCH 2014

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE - AUDITOR GENERAL

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL





Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

Mr. James Rogers, President ROBERT FULTON VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION Lancaster County

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association pursuant to authority derived from Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, Act of April 9, 1929, (P.L. 343, No. 176), and mandated by the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act, as consolidated by the Act of November 23, 2010 (P.L. 1181, No. 118), at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 et seq., for the period January 1, 2009 to December 31, 2011.

We conducted this compliance audit in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* applicable to performance audits, issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our audit results and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our audit results and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The objectives of the audit were:

- 1. To determine if the volunteer firefighters' relief association took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report; and
- 2. To determine if the volunteer firefighters' relief association received state aid and expended state aid and accumulated relief funds in compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above.

Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association's administration of state aid and accumulated relief funds complies with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures including the safeguarding of assets. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the volunteer firefighters' relief association's internal controls as they relate to the association's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of the audit objectives, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Our audit procedures also included tests of documentary evidence supporting the Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association's recorded financial transactions, tests of the physical existence of inventories, interviews of selected officials and direct confirmation of the Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association's cash, investments, and certain other assets and liabilities as of December 31, 2011, with the custodians of the funds, debtors, creditors, and financial institutions to the extent necessary to satisfy the audit objectives. Additionally, we performed procedures to provide a reasonable assurance of detecting instances of violations of legal and regulatory requirements or violations of provisions of contracts that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our audit, for the period January 1, 2009 to December 31, 2011, found the Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association took appropriate corrective action to address one of the two findings contained in our prior audit report. However, the Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association failed to take appropriate corrective action to address the remaining finding contained in our prior audit report, as listed below and discussed in the Status of Prior Finding section of this report. In addition, the results of our audit found the Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association did not, in all significant respects, receive state aid and expend state aid and accumulated relief funds in compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures, as noted in the findings listed below and discussed later in this report. Therefore, the Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association will be subject to the potential withhold of its upcoming state aid distribution, as discussed in the Potential Withhold of State Aid section of this report. The results of our tests also indicated the Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association expended funds as presented in the Accompanying Expenditure Information and, as of December 31, 2011, had a cash balance of \$135,697 and no investments.

Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance with Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Equipment Roster

Finding No. 2 – Undocumented Expenditure

Finding No. 3 – Failure to Secure Ownership in Jointly Purchased Equipment

The contents of this report were discussed with the management of the Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report.

October 1, 2012

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE

Auditor General

CONTENTS

Background
Status of Prior Findings
Findings and Recommendations:
Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Equipment Roster
Finding No. 2 – Undocumented Expenditure
Finding No. 3 – Failure to Secure Ownership Interest in Jointly Purchased Vehicle 7
Potential Withhold of State Aid
Accompanying Expenditure Information
Report Distribution List

BACKGROUND

Pursuant to Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, Act of April 9, 1929, (P.L. 343, No. 176), and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act, as consolidated by the Act of November 23, 2010, (P.L. 1181, No. 118), at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 *et seq.*, the Department of the Auditor General's duty is to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association to determine that funds received under the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution Law, Act of December 18, 1984, (P.L. 1005, No. 205), as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.701 *et seq.* (commonly referred to as Act 205), are properly expended.

The Robert Fulton Firemen's Relief Association, Lancaster County, Pennsylvania, herein referred to as Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association, is a charitable organization that was formed primarily to afford financial protection to volunteer firefighters and to encourage individuals to participate in volunteer fire service.

Act 118 governs the overall operation of the volunteer firefighters' relief association. The relief association's bylaws define the specific operational procedures by which the volunteer firefighters' relief association conducts business. To fulfill its primary purpose, Act 118 authorizes specific types of expenditures and prescribes appropriate volunteer firefighters' relief association investment options. Within the parameters established by Act 118, it is the responsibility of the volunteer firefighters' relief association to choose investments in a proper and prudent manner.

Volunteer firefighters' relief associations receive public tax monies, and the association officers therefore have a responsibility to the public to conduct the association's financial affairs in a businesslike manner and to maintain sufficient financial records to support the propriety of all association transactions. Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are also responsible for ensuring that the association operates in accordance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures.

Act 205 sets forth the computation of the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution paid to each applicable municipality throughout the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. The amount of the distribution is based upon the population of each municipality and the market value of real estate within the municipality. Upon receipt of this distribution, the municipality must allocate the funds to the volunteer firefighters' relief association of the fire service organization or fire service organizations, which is or are recognized as providing the service to the municipality.

BACKGROUND (Continued)

The Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association was allocated state aid from the following municipalities:

Municipality	County	2009	2010	2011
Drumore Township	Lancaster	\$ 6,231	\$ 6,770	\$10,600
East Drumore Township	Lancaster	\$ 9,000	\$11,018	\$16,000
Fulton Township	Lancaster	\$12,626	\$14,210	\$22,757
Little Britain Township	Lancaster	\$20,817	\$23,430	\$39,524

The volunteer firefighters' relief association and the affiliated fire service organization are separate, legal entities. The Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association is affiliated with the following fire service organization:

Robert Fulton Fire Company Auxiliary

ROBERT FULTON VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION STATUS OF PRIOR FINDINGS

COMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association has complied with the following prior audit finding and recommendation:

• Inadequate Financial Record-Keeping System

By establishing adequate accounting procedures that meet the minimum financial record-keeping requirements of this department.

NONCOMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

The Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association has not complied with one of the two prior audit findings. This finding is noted below and discussed in detail in the Findings and Recommendations section of this report:

Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation –
 Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Equipment Roster

We are concerned with the volunteer firefighters' relief association's failure to correct the previously reported audit finding. The association management should strive to implement the recommendation and corrective action noted in this audit report.

ROBERT FULTON VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

<u>Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Equipment Roster</u>

<u>Condition</u>: As cited in our two previous audit reports, the relief association officials failed to maintain a complete and accurate roster of equipment owned by the relief association. Even though a roster of relief association equipment was provided, this roster was not cumulative. Also, the equipment roster lacked names of suppliers, dates of purchase, unit costs, serial numbers, and locations of items. In addition, there was no indication that a physical inventory of equipment was conducted on an annual basis, nor whether such inventory accounted for all of the relief association's equipment.

<u>Criteria</u>: Prudent business practice dictates that relief associations should establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster of all items purchased by the relief association in order to provide an effective accounting control over the relief association's equipment. A cumulative equipment roster of all relief association equipment should include the following:

- Types of equipment purchased;
- Dates of purchase;
- Unit costs:
- Names of suppliers;
- Serial numbers, if applicable;
- Current locations of items:
- Final dispositions of sold or damaged equipment; and
- Evidence of the performance and results of an annual physical inventory.

<u>Cause</u>: Even though notified of this condition during our prior audit, relief association officials, again, neglected to establish adequate internal control procedures over equipment requiring the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster and the performance of an annual physical inventory of equipment.

ROBERT FULTON VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (Continued)

Finding No. 1 – (Continued)

<u>Effect</u>: The failure to properly record equipment purchases in a detailed equipment roster prevents officials from effectively monitoring the relief association's equipment purchases. In addition, the failure to maintain a detailed equipment roster and perform an annual physical inventory of fixed assets prevents adequate accountability for, and safeguarding of, relief association equipment. Furthermore, the relief association's continued failure to maintain a complete and accurate equipment roster and to ensure that annual physical inventories of relief association owned equipment are conducted, and the results properly documented, the relief association may be subject to a total withholding of its state aid, unless appropriate corrective action is taken, as detailed on page 8 of this report.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We, again, recommend the relief association officials maintain a cumulative equipment roster of all relief association owned equipment. Furthermore, the relief association should ensure it performs an annual physical inventory of all operable equipment and that the completion of the inventory be sufficiently documented. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

ROBERT FULTON VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (Continued)

<u>Finding No. 2 – Undocumented Expenditure</u>

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association was unable to provide adequate supporting documentation for an expenditure made during the current audit period, in the amount of \$1,600, to a relief association member on March 8, 2009.

<u>Criteria</u>: Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418(a) states:

The Office of Auditor General shall have the power and its duty shall be to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association receiving money under Chapter 7 of the Act of December 18, 1984 (P.L. 1005, No. 205), [FN1] known as the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act, as far as may be necessary to satisfy the Auditor General that the money received was or is being expended for no purpose other than that authorized by this subchapter. Copies of all audits shall be furnished to the Governor.

Without adequate supporting documentation, such as invoices, this department is unable to determine whether relief association funds were expended for purposes authorized by Act 118. Furthermore, prudent business practice dictates that supporting documentation be maintained to evidence the propriety of all financial transactions.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials failed to establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure supporting documentation is maintained for all expenditures.

<u>Effect</u>: Lack of supporting documentation, such as an invoice, made it impossible to determine if the expenditure was made in accordance with Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7416(f). In addition, the failure to maintain adequate supporting documentation for relief association expenditures can lead to an increased risk of errors occurring and funds being misappropriated.

However, subsequent to the audit period and as a result of our audit engagement, on August 27, 2013, the relief association was reimbursed in the amount of \$1,600, by the affiliated fire department for the above undocumented expenditure.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials maintain supporting documentation for all future expenditures. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and have taken action to comply with the recommendation.

ROBERT FULTON VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 3 – Failure to Secure Ownership Interest in Jointly Purchased Vehicle

<u>Condition</u>: On October 26, 2006, the relief association expended \$8,404 for the purpose of jointly purchasing equipment with the Robert Fulton Fire Company. However, the relief association did not adequately secure its ownership interest in this jointly purchased equipment.

<u>Criteria</u>: Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418(a) states:

The Office of Auditor General shall have the power and its duty shall be to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association receiving money under Chapter 7 of the Act of December 18, 1984 (P.L. 1005, No. 205), [FN1] known as the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act, as far as may be necessary to satisfy the Auditor General that the money received was or is being expended for no purpose other than that authorized by this subchapter. Copies of all audits shall be furnished to the Governor.

Prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should secure its proportional ownership interest in the jointly purchased equipment by executing a formal written agreement that enumerates the relief association's proportional share of financing. Such agreement shall specify that the relief association shall receive its prorated share of the proceeds upon sale of the vehicle, in the event the vehicle is ever sold.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials failed to adequately secure its proportional ownership interest in the jointly purchased vehicle.

<u>Effect</u>: Failure to adequately secure the proportional share of ownership interest in the jointly purchased vehicle places the relief association's ownership interest at greater risk. However, subsequent to the audit period and as a result of our audit engagement, on August 31, 2013, the relief association and the affiliated fire company executed a formal written agreement that enumerates the relief association's proportional ownership of the jointly purchased equipment.

Recommendation: We recommend the relief association execute a formal written agreement with the affiliated fire company, for all future jointly purchased equipment, that enumerates the relief association's proportional ownership interest in the jointly purchased vehicle as well as stipulating that the proportionate sales proceeds shall revert to the relief association in the event the vehicle is ever sold. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

ROBERT FULTON VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION POTENTIAL WITHHOLD OF STATE AID

A condition of a repeat finding such as that reported in Finding No. 1 contained in this report, may lead to a total withholding of state aid in the future unless that finding is corrected. However, such action will not be aken if sufficient documentation is provided within 60 days to verify compliance with this department's recommendations. Such documentation should be submitted by the volunteer firefighters' relief association to: Department of the Auditor General, Bureau of Firefighters' Relief Association Audits, Room 316-D Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120.

ROBERT FULTON VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION ACCOMPANYING EXPENDITURE INFORMATION FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2009 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7412 states: a volunteer firefighters' relief association is an organization formed primarily for the purpose of affording financial protection to volunteer firefighters against the consequences of misfortune suffered as a result of their participation in the fire service. The organization may contain within its membership the members of one or more fire companies and may serve secondary purposes, as set forth in this subchapter, but only if adequate provisions have been first made to serve the primary purpose.

Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7416 authorizes the investment of relief association funds and outlines the types of benefits and services that can be provided with volunteer firefighters' relief association funds.

Furthermore, all expenditures must be properly authorized as prescribed in the volunteer firefighters' relief association bylaws and approved at an association meeting.

USES OF FUNDS:

Benefit Services:		
Insurance premiums	\$	10,894
Total Benefit Services		10,894
Fire Services:		
Equipment purchased	\$	108,137
Equipment maintenance		33,488
Training expenses		14,351
Fire prevention materials		820
Total Fire Services	\$	156,796
Administrative Services:		
Miscellaneous administrative expenses	\$	512
Total Administrative Services	\$	512
Other Expenditures:		
Undocumented expenditure	\$	1,600
Total Other Expenditures	\$	1,600

ROBERT FULTON VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom Corbett Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Robert Fulton Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Governing Body:

Mr. James Rogers, President

Mr. Kevin Brown, Vice President

Ms. Christy Rogers, Secretary

Mr. Michael L. Urbanik, Treasurer

The following municipalities allocated foreign fire insurance tax monies to this relief association and received a copy of this report.

Ms. Sharon H. Roth, Secretary
Drumore Township

Ms. Vickie Kreider, Secretary
East Drumore Township

Ms. Margaret G. Gordon, Secretary
Fulton Township

Ms. Margaret DeCarolis, Secretary
Little Britain Township

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.auditorgen.state.pa.us. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@auditorgen.state.pa.us.