

LIMITED PROCEDURES ENGAGEMENT

Beaver Borough Municipal Employees' Pension Plan Beaver County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2014

November 2015



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council
Beaver Borough
Beaver County
Beaver, PA 15009

We conducted a Limited Procedures Engagement (LPE) of the Beaver Borough Municipal Employees' Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2014 to determine its compliance with certain relevant state laws, regulations, policies, and administrative procedures. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The LPE was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 *et seq.*) but was not conducted in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis to support our LPE results.

Our LPE was limited to determining the following:

- × Whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the engagement period.
- × Whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.
- × Whether annual employee contributions were required during the engagement period and, if so, were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the engagement period and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.

- × Whether retirement benefits calculated for plan members who retired during the engagement period represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefit due to retired individuals and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to recipients.
- × Whether the January 1, 2011 and January 1, 2013 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2012 and 2014, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.

Based on the results of our procedures performed during our LPE, nothing came to our attention indicating that the Beaver Borough Municipal Employees' Pension Plan was not being administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following finding further discussed subsequent to this letter:

Finding – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In A Net
Overpayment Of State Aid

Our determination to perform a LPE for this engagement period does not preclude the Department from conducting an audit in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* of the pension plan in subsequent periods. The borough should continue to maintain documentation related to this pension plan.

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this letter were discussed with officials of Beaver Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in this letter. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of this LPE.

October 28, 2015



EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Finding and Recommendation:	
Finding – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In A Net Overpayment Of State Aid.....	1
Supplementary Information	3
Distribution List	7

BEAVER BOROUGH MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN
FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

Finding – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In A Net Overpayment Of State Aid

Condition: The borough certified 2 ineligible employees (2 units) who were members of the municipal employees' pension plan and overstated payroll by \$46,172 on the Certification Form AG 385 filed in 2012. In addition, the borough failed to certify an eligible employee (1 unit) who was a member of the money purchase plan and understated payroll by \$37,850 on the Certification Form AG 385 filed in 2013. The data contained on these certification forms is based on prior calendar year information.

Criteria: Pursuant to Act 205, at Section 402(e)(2), in order to be eligible for certification, an employee must have been employed on a full-time basis for at least six consecutive months and must have been participating in a pension plan during the certification year.

Cause: Plan officials failed to establish adequate procedures to ensure the accuracy of the data certified.

Effect: The data submitted on these certification forms is used, in part, to calculate the state aid due to the municipality for distribution to its pension plans. Because the borough's state aid allocations were based on unit value, the incorrect certification of pension data affected the borough's state aid allocations, as identified below:

<u>Year</u>	<u>Type Of Plan</u>	<u>Units Overstated (Understated)</u>	<u>Unit Value</u>	<u>State Aid Overpayment (Underpayment)</u>
2012	Municipal Employees'	2	\$ 3,576	\$ 7,152
2013	Money Purchase	(1)	3,884	<u>(3,884)</u>
Net Overpayment of State Aid				<u>\$ 3,268</u>

In addition, the borough used the overpayment of state aid to pay the minimum municipal obligation (MMO) due to the municipal employees' pension plan; therefore, if the reimbursement to the Commonwealth is made from this pension plan, the plan's MMO will not be fully paid.

BEAVER BOROUGH MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN
FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

Finding – (Continued)

Recommendation: We recommend that the total net overpayment of state aid, in the amount of \$3,268, be returned to the Commonwealth. A check in this amount, with interest compounded annually from date of receipt to date of repayment, at a rate earned by the pension plan, should be made payable to: Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and mailed to: Department of the Auditor General, Municipal Pension & Fire Relief Programs Unit, 320 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120. A copy of the interest calculation must be submitted along with the check.

We also recommend that in the future, plan officials establish adequate procedures, such as having at least 2 people review the data certified, to ensure compliance with the instructions that accompany Certification Form AG 385 to assist them in accurately reporting the required pension data.

In addition, if the reimbursement to the Commonwealth is made from pension plan funds, we recommend that any resulting MMO deficiency be paid to the pension plan with interest, at a rate earned by the pension plan.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor's Conclusion: The borough's compliance with the finding recommendation will be monitored subsequent to the release of the LPE results letter and through our next engagement of the pension plan.

BEAVER BOROUGH MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2009, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-09	\$ 2,871,559	\$ 3,273,910	\$ 402,351	87.7%
01-01-11	2,999,547	3,372,941	373,394	88.9%
01-01-13	3,018,224	3,645,487	627,263	82.8%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-09, 01-01-11, and 01-01-13 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 4-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

BEAVER BOROUGH MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

BEAVER BOROUGH MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2009	\$ 103,909	100.0%
2010	105,205	100.0%
2011	106,939	100.0%
2012	98,643	100.0%
2013	130,587	100.0%
2014	123,288	100.0%

BEAVER BOROUGH MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2013
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar, closed
Remaining amortization period	13 years
Asset valuation method	Fair value, 4-year smoothing
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	7.25%
Projected salary increases *	5.5%

* Includes inflation at 3.0%

BEAVER BOROUGH MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN
DISTRIBUTION LIST

This letter was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Beaver Borough Municipal Employees' Pension Plan
Beaver County
469 Third Street
Beaver, PA 15009

The Honorable Thomas Hamilton	Mayor
Mr. Michael Deelo	President, Borough Council
Mr. Daniel Madgar	Interim Borough Manager
Ms. Victoria Vandebord	Assistant Administrator

This letter is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the letter can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.