

COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Lower Makefield Township Police Pension Plan Bucks County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2014

March 2016



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL

Board of Township Supervisors
Lower Makefield Township
Bucks County
Yardley, PA 19067

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Lower Makefield Township Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2014. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform our audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The objectives of the audit were:

1. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report; and
2. To determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report, we inquired of plan officials and evaluated supporting documentation provided by officials evidencing that the suggested corrective action has been appropriately taken. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- × We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.

- × We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.
- × We determined that there were no employee contributions required for the years covered by our audit period due to the fact that employee contributions were appropriately waived by the municipality.
- × We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for the 1 plan member who retired during the current audit period, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefit due to the retired individual and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to the recipient. We also determined whether retirement benefits calculated for the 1 plan member who elected to vest during the current audit period, payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the pension benefit due and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined.
- × We determined whether the January 1, 2011 and January 1, 2013 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2012 and 2014, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.
- × We determined whether all annual special ad hoc postretirement reimbursements received by the municipality were authorized and appropriately deposited in accordance with Act 147 by tracing information to supporting documentation maintained by plan officials.
- × We determined whether provisions of the Deferred Retirement Option Plan (DROP) were in accordance with the provisions of Act 205 by examining provisions stated in the plan's governing documents.

Lower Makefield Township contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for annual audits of its basic financial statements which are available at the township's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Township officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Lower Makefield Township Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the township's internal controls as they relate to the township's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objectives, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Lower Makefield Township Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following findings further discussed later in this report:

Finding No. 1 – Partial Compliance With Prior Audit Recommendation -
Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An
Overpayment Of State Aid

Finding No. 2 – Unauthorized Provision For A Killed In Service Benefit

Finding No. 1 contained in this audit report repeats a condition that was cited in our previous audit report that has not been corrected by township officials. We are concerned by the township's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendation noted in this audit report.

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Lower Makefield Township and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report.

February 25, 2016



EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background.....	1
Status of Prior Finding.....	3
Findings and Recommendations:	
Finding No. 1 – Partial Compliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Overpayment Of State Aid.....	4
Finding No. 2 – Unauthorized Provision For A Killed In Service Benefit.....	6
Potential Withhold of State Aid.....	9
Supplementary Information	10
Report Distribution List	14

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Lower Makefield Township Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 600 - Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 761 et seq.

The Lower Makefield Township Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 377, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 600. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the township and its police officers. The plan was established on June 6, 1960. Active members are required to contribute 5 percent of compensation to the plan; however, member contributions were eliminated during the audit period. As of December 31, 2014, the plan had 34 active members, 1 terminated member eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 19 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2014, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

Eligibility Requirements:

- | | |
|-------------------|--|
| Normal Retirement | Age 55 and 25 years of service. |
| Early Retirement | Eligible with 20 years of service. |
| Vesting | A member is 100% vested after 12 years of service. |

Retirement Benefit:

Benefit equals 50% of final 36 months average salary, which excludes overtime pay, plus a service increment of \$100 per month for each year of service in excess of 25 years, up to a maximum of \$500 per month.

Survivor Benefit:

- | | |
|-------------------------------|---|
| Before Retirement Eligibility | Refund of member contributions plus interest. |
| After Retirement Eligibility | 75% of retirement benefit. |

Service Related Disability Benefit:

Benefit equals 50% of the member's salary at the time the disability was incurred, offset by Social Security disability benefits received for the same injury.

LOWER MAKEFIELD TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN
STATUS OF PRIOR FINDING

Partial Compliance With Prior Audit Recommendation

Lower Makefield Township has partially complied with the prior audit recommendation concerning the following:

- Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Overpayment Of State Aid

During the current audit period, the township reimbursed \$7,394 to the Commonwealth for the overpayment of state aid received in 2010; however, plan officials failed to comply with the instructions that accompany Certification Form AG 385 to assist them in accurately reporting the required pension data in the year 2014, as further discussed in the Findings and Recommendations section of this report.

LOWER MAKEFIELD TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – Partial Compliance With Prior Audit Recommendation - Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Overpayment Of State Aid

Condition: The township certified 1 ineligible police officer (2 units) and overstated payroll by \$118,558 and certified 1 ineligible 1 non-uniformed employee (1 unit) and overstated payroll by \$7,389 on the Certification Form AG 385 filed in 2014. The data contained on this certification form is based on prior calendar year information.

Criteria: Pursuant to Act 205, at Section 402(e)(2), in order to be eligible for certification, an employee must have been employed on a full-time basis for at least six consecutive months and must have been participating in a pension plan during the certification year.

Cause: Plan officials failed to establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the accuracy of the data certified.

Effect: The data submitted on this certification form is used, in part, to calculate the state aid due to the municipality for distribution to its pension plans. Because the township’s state aid allocation was based on unit value, the incorrect certification of pension data affected the township’s state aid allocation, as identified below:

<u>Year</u>	<u>Type Of Plan</u>	<u>Units Overstated</u>	<u>Unit Value</u>	<u>State Aid Overpayment</u>
2014	Police	2	\$ 3,873	\$ 7,746
	Non-Uniformed	1	\$ 3,873	3,873
Total Overpayment of State Aid				<u>\$ 11,619</u>

In addition, the township used the overpayment of state aid to pay the minimum municipal obligations (MMO) due to the police pension plan; therefore, if the reimbursement to the Commonwealth is made from the pension plan, the plan’s MMO will not be fully paid.

Furthermore, the township’s future state aid allocations may be withheld until the finding recommendation is complied with.

LOWER MAKEFIELD TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – (Continued)

Recommendation: We recommend that the total excess state aid, in the amount of \$11,619, be returned to the Commonwealth from the township's general fund. A check in this amount, with interest compounded annually from date of receipt to date of repayment, at a rate earned by the pension plan, should be made payable to: Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and mailed to: Department of the Auditor General, Municipal Pension & Fire Relief Programs Unit, 320 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120. A copy of the interest calculation must be submitted along with the check.

We also recommend that in the future, plan officials establish adequate internal control procedures, such as having at least 2 people review the data certified, to ensure compliance with the instructions that accompany Certification Form AG 385 to assist them in accurately reporting the required pension data.

Management Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor Conclusion: Compliance with evaluated subsequent to the release of the audit report and through our next audit of the plan.

LOWER MAKEFIELD TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 2 – Unauthorized Provision For A Killed In Service Benefit

Condition: Lower Makefield Township maintains a police pension plan governed by the provisions of Act 600, as amended. Prior to the adoption of Act 51 of 2009, Act 600 contained a mandatory killed in service benefit provision; however, Act 51 specifically repealed the section of Act 600 that referenced the mandatory killed in service benefit. During the prior audit period, a verbal observation was given to plan officials notifying them of the passage of Act 51. It was recommended that plan officials review the act’s implications for the police pension plan and the collective bargaining agreement in effect for the period January 1, 2010 to December 31, 2013 with their municipal solicitor. During the current audit period, we determined that the pension plan’s governing document continues to provide for a killed in service benefit that is no longer authorized by Act 600.

Section 4.5 (c) of Ordinance No. 377 states, in part:

The Beneficiaries of a police officer who dies due to injuries incurred while performing the duties of his/her employment shall be entitled to receive a Killed in Service Death Benefit, which shall consist of a series of monthly payments –

(3) in a monthly amount equal to one hundred percent (100%) of the police officer’s monthly Salary as of the date of death.

Criteria: Section 1(a) of Act 51 of 2009 states, in part:

In the event a law enforcement officer, ambulance service or rescue squad member, firefighter, certified hazardous material response team member or National Guard member dies as a result of the performance of his duties, such political subdivision, Commonwealth agency or, in the case of National Guard members, the Adjutant General, or, in the case of a member of a Commonwealth law enforcement agency, the authorized survivor or the agency head, within 90 days from the date of death, shall submit certification of such death to the Commonwealth.

LOWER MAKEFIELD TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 2 – (Continued)

In addition, Section 1(d) of Act 51 of 2009 states, in part:

. . . the Commonwealth shall, from moneys payable out of the General Fund, pay to the surviving spouse or, if there is no surviving spouse, to the minor children of the paid firefighter, ambulance service or rescue squad member or law enforcement officer who died as a result of the performance of his duty the sum of \$100,000, adjusted in accordance with subsection (f) of this section, and an amount equal to the monthly salary, adjusted in accordance with subsection (f) of this section, of the deceased paid firefighter, ambulance service or rescue squad member or law enforcement officer, less any workers' compensation or pension or retirement benefits paid to such survivors, and shall continue such monthly payments until there is no eligible beneficiary to receive them. For the purpose of this subsection, the term "eligible beneficiary" means the surviving spouse or the child or children under the age of eighteen years or, if attending college, under the age of twenty-three years, of the firefighter, ambulance service or rescue squad member or law enforcement officer who died as a result of the performance of his duty. When no spouse or minor children survive, a single sum of \$100,000, adjusted in accordance with subsection (f) of this section, shall be paid to the parent or parents of such firefighter, ambulance service member, rescue squad member or law enforcement officer. [Emphasis added.]

Furthermore, Section 2 of Act 51 of 2009 states:

Repeals are as follows:

- (1) The General Assembly declares that the repeals under paragraph (2) are necessary to effectuate the amendment of section 1 of the act.
- (2) The following parts of acts are repealed:
 - (i) Section 5(e)(2) of the act of May 29, 1956 (1955 P.L.1804, No. 600), referred to as the Municipal Police Pension Law.
 - (ii) Section 202(b)(3)(vi) and (4)(vi) of the act of December 18, 1984 (P.L.1005, No. 205), known as the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act.

Therefore, since Act 51 specifically repealed the killed in service provision of Act 600 and the funding provisions for the killed in service benefit that were contained in Act 205, the provision of a killed in service benefit is no longer authorized.

Cause: Plan officials failed to establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the plan's governing document is in compliance with Act 600, as amended.

LOWER MAKEFIELD TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 2 – (Continued)

Effect: Since Section 1 of Act 51 provides that the Commonwealth is obligated to pay the killed in service benefit less any pension or retirement benefits paid to eligible survivors, the continued provision of a killed in service benefit could result in the pension plan being obligated to pay a benefit that is no longer authorized by Act 600 and would have been paid entirely by the Commonwealth absent such provision.

Recommendation: We recommend that the municipality review the plan's killed in service benefit with its solicitor in conjunction with Act 51 of 2009 and eliminate this unauthorized benefit provision at its earliest opportunity to do so.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be evaluated during our next audit of the plan.

LOWER MAKEFIELD TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN
POTENTIAL WITHHOLD OF STATE AID

Finding No. 1 contained in this audit report cites an overpayment of state aid to the township in the amount of \$11,619. A condition of this nature may lead to a total withholding of state aid in the future unless the finding is corrected. A check in this amount with interest, at a rate earned by the pension plan, should be made payable to: Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, and mailed to: Department of the Auditor General, Municipal Pension & Fire Relief Programs Unit, 320 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120.

LOWER MAKEFIELD TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2011, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-11	\$ 8,184,092	\$ 11,223,302	\$ 3,039,210	72.9%
01-01-13	8,384,277	12,147,005	3,762,728	69.0%
01-01-15	9,870,867	13,068,090	3,197,223	75.5%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-11, 01-01-13 and 01-01-15 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 5-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

LOWER MAKEFIELD TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

LOWER MAKEFIELD TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2009	\$ 325,502	100.0%
2010	565,286	100.0%
2011	456,011	100.0%
2012	571,918	100.0%
2013	584,583	100.0%
2014	671,390	100.0%

LOWER MAKEFIELD TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2015
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar
Remaining amortization period	14 years
Asset valuation method	Fair value, 5-year smoothing
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	8.0%
Projected salary increases	5.0%
Cost-of-living adjustments	None assumed

LOWER MAKEFIELD TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Ms. Kristin Tyler
Chairman, Board of Township Supervisors

Mr. Daniel McLaughlin
Vice-Chairman, Board of Township Supervisors

Mr. Jeffrey Benedetto
Secretary

Mr. Dobby Dobson
Treasurer

Mr. Ronald A. Smith
Township Supervisor

Mr. Terry Fedorchak
Township Manager

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.