## **COMPLIANCE AUDIT**

# South Whitehall Township Police Pension Plan

Lehigh County, Pennsylvania
For the Period
January 1, 2015 to December 31, 2016

# August 2017



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General





Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

Board of Township Commissioners South Whitehall Township Lehigh County Allentown, PA 18104

We have conducted a compliance audit of the South Whitehall Township Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2015 to December 31, 2016. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.
- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.

- We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing total members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for all 10 of the plan members who retired during the current audit period, and through the completion of our fieldwork procedures, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefit due to the retired individuals and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to the recipients.
- We determined whether the January 1, 2013 and January 1, 2015 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the former Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2014 and 2016, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.
- · We determined whether transfers were properly authorized, timely, and appropriately recorded by plan officials by examining supporting documentation for all of the transfers made during the audit period and through the completion of our fieldwork procedures.
- · We determined whether provisions of the Deferred Retirement Option Plan (DROP) were in accordance with the provisions of Act 205 by examining provisions stated in the plan's governing documents.

Township officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the South Whitehall Township Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the township's internal controls as they relate to the township's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the South Whitehall Township Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following finding further discussed later in this report:

Finding – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Underpayment Of State Aid

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of South Whitehall Township and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank township officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

August 1, 2017

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE

Eugraf: O-Pager

**Auditor General** 

## CONTENTS

<u>Pa</u>	age
Background	1
Finding and Recommendation:	
Finding – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Underpayment Of State Aid	
Supplementary Information	5
Report Distribution List	9

#### **BACKGROUND**

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The Act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the South Whitehall Township Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the former Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 600 - Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 767 et seq.

The South Whitehall Township Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 149, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 600. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the township and its police officers. The plan was established June 4, 1971. Active members are required to contribute 5 percent of compensation; however member contributions were reduced to 1 percent of compensation in 2016 and were eliminated in 2015. As of December 31, 2016, the plan had 31 active members, 1 terminated member eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 25 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

#### **BACKGROUND** – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2016, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

### **Eligibility Requirements:**

Normal Retirement Age 50 and 25 years of service.

Early Retirement None

Vesting A member is 100% vested after 12 years of service.

#### Retirement Benefit:

Benefit equals 50% of final 36 months average salary, plus a service increment of \$100 per month for each year of service in excess of 25 years, up to a maximum of \$400 per month.

#### Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility Refund of member contributions plus interest.

After Retirement Eligibility A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension the

member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the

day of the member's death.

#### Service Related Disability Benefit:

Benefit equals 50% of the member's salary at the time the disability was incurred, offset by Social Security disability benefits received for the same injury.

# SOUTH WHITEHALL TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

# <u>Finding - Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Underpayment Of State Aid</u>

Condition: The township failed to certify 2 eligible police officers (4 units), failed to certify 4 eligible non-uniformed employees' defined contribution plan members (4 units), and failed to certify 1 eligible non-uniformed office personnel plan member (1 unit) on the Certification Form AG 385 filed in 2016. The data contained on this certification form is based on prior calendar year information.

<u>Criteria</u>: Pursuant to Act 205, at Section 402(e)(2), an employee who has been employed on a full-time basis for at least six consecutive months and has been participating in a pension plan during the certification year is eligible for certification.

<u>Cause</u>: Plan officials failed to establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the accuracy of the data certified.

<u>Effect</u>: The data submitted on this certification form is used, in part, to calculate the state aid due to the municipality for distribution to its pension plans. Because the township's state aid allocation was based on unit value, the township received an underpayment of state aid in the amount of \$39,375 as identified below:

Type Of Plan	Units Understated	Unit Value	 tate Aid lerpayment
Police	4	\$4,375	\$ 17,500
Non-Uniformed	5	\$4,375	 21,875
		Total	\$ 39,375

Although the township will be reimbursed for the underpayment of state aid due to the township's certification errors, the full amount of the 2016 state aid allocation was not available to be deposited timely and therefore was not available to pay operating expenses or for investment.

# SOUTH WHITEHALL TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

## **Finding - (Continued)**

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that in the future, plan officials establish adequate internal control procedures, such as having at least 2 people review the data certified, to ensure compliance with the instructions that accompany Certification Form AG 385 to assist them in accurately reporting the required pension data.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: Compliance will be evaluated during our next audit of the plan.

## SOUTH WHITEHALL TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

#### SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2011, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
			Unfunded	
		Actuarial	(Assets in	
		Accrued	Excess of)	
	Actuarial	Liability	Actuarial	
Actuarial	Value of	(AAL) -	Accrued	Funded
Valuation	Assets	Entry Age	Liability	Ratio
Date	(a)	(b)	(b) - (a)	(a)/(b)
01-01-11	\$ 10,926,081	\$ 13,277,993	\$ 2,351,912	82.3%
01-01-13	10,850,279	14,825,541	3,975,262	73.2%
01-01-15	13,610,189	16,283,109	2,672,920	83.6%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-11 and 01-01-13 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 5-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

## SOUTH WHITEHALL TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

## SOUTH WHITEHALL TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

# SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2011	\$ 529,157	100.0%
2012	569,967	100.0%
2013	712,818	100.0%
2014	715,489	100.0%
2015	966,966	100.0%
2016	875,856	100.0%

## SOUTH WHITEHALL TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date January 1, 2015

Actuarial cost method Entry age normal

Amortization method Level dollar

Remaining amortization period 8 years

Asset valuation method Fair value

Actuarial assumptions:

Investment rate of return 8.0%

Projected salary increases 5.0%

# SOUTH WHITEHALL TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

#### The Honorable Tom W. Wolf

Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

#### Ms. Christina Tori Morgan

President, Board of Township Commissioners

#### Mr. Glenn Block

Vice President, Board of Township Commissioners

#### Mr. David L. Bond

Assistant Secretary, Board of Township Supervisors

#### Mr. Matthew J. Mulqueen

Township Supervisor

#### Mr. Thomas J. Johns

**Township Supervisor** 

#### Ms. Renee Bickel

Acting Township Manager

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at <a href="www.PaAuditor.gov">www.PaAuditor.gov</a>. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.