

# COMPLIANCE AUDIT

---

## Waynesboro Borough Police Pension Plan Franklin County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2014 to December 31, 2016

---

September 2017



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General  
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018  
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General  
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen  
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE  
AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council  
Waynesboro Borough  
Franklin County  
Waynesboro, PA 17268

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Waynesboro Borough Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2014 to December 31, 2016. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.
- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.

- We determined that there were no employee contributions required for the years covered by our audit period due to the fact that employee contributions were appropriately waived by the municipality.
- We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for the 3 plan members who retired during the current audit period represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefit due to the retired individuals and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to the recipients. We also determined whether retirement benefits calculated for the plan member who elected to vest during the current audit period represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the pension benefit due and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined.
- We determined whether the January 1, 2011, January 1, 2013 and January 1, 2015 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the former Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2012, 2014 and 2016, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports are accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.
- We determined whether all annual special ad hoc postretirement reimbursements received by the municipality were authorized and appropriately deposited in accordance with Act 147 by tracing information to supporting documentation maintained by plan officials.

Waynesboro Borough contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for annual audits of its basic financial statements for the years ending December 31, 2014 and 2015 which are available at the borough's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Waynesboro Borough Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the borough's internal controls as they relate to the borough's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Waynesboro Borough Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following finding further discussed later in this report:

Finding - Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In A Net Overpayment  
Of State Aid

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Waynesboro Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

September 22, 2017



EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE  
Auditor General

# CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background.....	1
Finding and Recommendation:	
Finding – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In A Net Overpayment Of State Aid.....	3
Supplementary Information .....	4
Report Distribution List .....	8

## BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The Act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Waynesboro Borough Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the former Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 147 - Special Ad Hoc Municipal Police and Firefighter Postretirement Adjustment Act, Act of December 14, 1988 (P.L. 1192, No. 147), as amended, 53 P.S. § 896.101 et seq.

Act 600 Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 767 et seq.

The Waynesboro Borough Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 1083, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 600. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the borough and its police officers. The plan was established April 1, 1956. Active members are required to contribute 5 percent of compensation to the plan; however, member contributions were eliminated during the audit period. As of December 31, 2016, the plan had 16 active members, 2 terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, 6 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan, and 11 retirees receiving benefits funded through annuities purchased with plan assets.

## **BACKGROUND – (Continued)**

As of December 31, 2016, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

### Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	Age 50 and 25 years of service.
Early Retirement	None
Vesting	A member is 100% vested after 12 years of service.

### Retirement Benefit:

Benefit equals 50% of average monthly compensation based on last 36 months, plus an incremental pension (max \$100) of \$15 per month for each of the first 5 years of benefit service and \$5 per month for each additional year of benefit service in excess of 25 years.

### Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility	Refund of member contributions plus interest
After Retirement Eligibility	A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension the member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the day of the member's death.

### Service Related Disability Benefit:

Benefit equals 50% of the member's salary at the time the disability, reduced by any Social Security disability benefits received by the member for the same injury.

WAYNESBORO BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN  
FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

**Finding – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In A Net Overpayment Of State Aid**

Condition: The borough understated non-uniformed employees’ payroll by \$47,686 and overstated police officers’ payroll by \$36,961 on the Certification Form AG 385 filed in 2015. The data contained on this certification form is based on prior calendar year information.

Criteria: Pursuant to the instructions that accompany Certification Form AG 385, the total payroll eligible to be certified should be Internal Revenue Service Form W-2 earnings pertaining to full-time positions for the certification year.

Cause: Plan officials incorrectly certified 2013 payroll data instead of 2014 payroll data for both the non-uniformed employees and police officers.

Effect: The data submitted on this certification form is used, in part, to calculate the state aid due to the municipality for distribution to its pension plans. Because the borough’s state aid allocation was based on pension costs, the incorrect certification of pension data affected the borough’s state aid allocation, as identified below:

<u>Year</u>	<u>Type Of Plan</u>	<u>Normal Cost</u>	<u>Payroll Overstated (Understated)</u>	<u>State Aid Overpayment (Underpayment)</u>
2015	Police	16.62232%	\$ 36,961	\$ 6,144
	Non-Uniformed	7.47104%	\$ (47,686)	(3,563)
			Total	<u>\$ 2,581</u>

Recommendation: We recommend that the overpayment of state aid, in the amount of \$2,581, plus interest, be returned to the Commonwealth. A check in this amount, with interest compounded annually from date of receipt to date of repayment, at a rate earned by the pension plan, should be made payable to: Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and mailed to: Department of the Auditor General, Municipal Pension & Fire Relief Programs Unit, 321 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120. A copy of the interest calculation must be submitted along with the check.

We also recommend that in the future, plan officials establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure compliance with the instructions that accompany Certification Form AG 385 to assist them in accurately reporting the required pension data.

Management’s Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor’s Conclusion: Compliance will be evaluated during our next audit of the plan.



WAYNESBORO BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN  
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2011, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-11	\$ 2,655,702	\$ 2,663,395	\$ 7,693	99.7%
01-01-13	3,077,961	3,108,388	30,427	99.0%
01-01-15	3,888,207	3,407,518	(480,689)	114.1%

WAYNESBORO BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

WAYNESBORO BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER  
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2011	\$ 163,007	107.3%
2012	169,746	100.0%
2013	160,520	100.0%
2014	166,218	100.0%
2015	168,306	100.0%
2016	125,637	100.0%

WAYNESBORO BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES  
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2015
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	N/A
Remaining amortization period	N/A
Asset valuation method	Market value
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	7.0%
Projected salary increases	5.0%

WAYNESBORO BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN  
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

**The Honorable Tom W. Wolf**  
Governor  
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

**The Honorable Richard Starliper**  
Mayor

**Mr. C. Harold Mumma**  
Council President

**Ms. Nicole Rolls**  
Council Vice-President

**Mr. Chad Rooney**  
Councilman

**Mr. Michael J. Cermak**  
Councilman

**Mr. Patrick Fleagle**  
Councilman

**Mr. Delmos Oldham**  
Councilman

**Mr. Jason B. Stains**  
Borough Manager

**Ms. Melinda Knott**  
Office Supervisor/Borough Secretary

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at [www.PaAuditor.gov](http://www.PaAuditor.gov). Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: [news@PaAuditor.gov](mailto:news@PaAuditor.gov).