ATTESTATION ENGAGEMENT

Township of Susquehanna

Juniata County, Pennsylvania 34-210

Liquid Fuels Tax Fund
For the Period
January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2015

January 2017



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

Independent Auditor's Report

The Honorable Leslie Richards Secretary Department of Transportation Harrisburg, PA 17120

We examined the accompanying Forms MS-965 With Adjustments for the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund of the Township of Susquehanna, Juniata County, for the period January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2015. The municipality's management is responsible for the Forms MS-965. Our responsibility is to express an opinion on the Forms MS-965 With Adjustments based on our examination.

Our examination was conducted in accordance with attestation standards established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants and the standards applicable to attestation engagements contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. An examination includes examining, on a test basis, evidence supporting the Township of Susquehanna, Juniata County's Forms MS-965 for the period January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2015 and performing such other procedures as we considered necessary in the circumstances. We believe that our examination provides a reasonable basis for our opinion.

We are mandated by Section 403 of *The Fiscal Code*, 72 P.S. § 403, to audit each municipality's Liquid Fuels Tax Fund to ensure that funds received are expended in accordance with applicable laws and regulations. *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States include attestation engagements as a separate type of audit. An attestation engagement performed pursuant to *Government Auditing Standards* involves additional standards that exceed the standards provided by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants. Accordingly, this attestation engagement complies with both *Government Auditing Standards* and Section 403 of *The Fiscal Code*.

In our opinion, the Forms MS-965 With Adjustments present, in all material respects, the information required by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation for the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund of the Township of Susquehanna, Juniata County, for the period January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2015, in conformity with the criteria set forth in Note 1.

<u>Independent Auditor's Report (Continued)</u>

In accordance with *Government Auditing Standards*, we are required to report all deficiencies that are considered to be significant deficiencies or material weaknesses in internal control; fraud and noncompliance with provisions of laws or regulations that have a material effect on the Forms MS-965; and any other instances that warrant the attention of those charged with governance; noncompliance with provisions of contracts or grant agreements, and abuse that has a material effect on the Forms MS-965. We are also required to obtain and report the views of responsible officials concerning the findings, conclusions, and recommendations, as well as any planned corrective actions. We performed our examination to express an opinion on whether the Forms MS-965 are presented in accordance with the criteria described above and not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on internal control over reporting on the Forms MS-965 or on compliance and other matters; accordingly, we express no such opinions.

A *deficiency in internal control* exists when the design or operation of a control does not allow management or employees, in the normal course of performing their assigned functions, to prevent, or detect and correct, misstatements on a timely basis. A *material weakness* is a deficiency, or combination of deficiencies, in internal control such that there is a reasonable possibility that a material misstatement of the Forms MS-965 will not be prevented, or detected and corrected, on a timely basis. A *significant deficiency* is a deficiency, or a combination of deficiencies, in internal control that is less severe than a material weakness, yet important enough to merit attention by those charged with governance.

Our consideration of internal control over reporting on the Forms MS-965 was for the limited purpose of expressing an opinion on whether the Forms MS-965 are presented in accordance with the criteria described above and would not necessarily identify all deficiencies in internal control that might be material weaknesses or significant deficiencies. Given these limitations, during our engagement we did not identify any deficiencies in internal control that we consider to be material weaknesses. However, material weaknesses may exist that have not been identified.

As part of obtaining reasonable assurance about whether the Forms MS-965 are free from material misstatement, we performed tests of the Township of Susquehanna, Juniata County's compliance with certain provisions of laws, regulations, contracts, and grant agreements, noncompliance with which could have a direct and material effect on the determination of amounts on the Forms MS-965. However, providing an opinion on compliance with those provisions was not an objective of our engagement, and accordingly, we do not express such an opinion. The results of our tests disclosed no instances of noncompliance or other matters that are required to be reported under *Government Auditing Standards*. However, we did note a matter that, while not required to be included in this report by *Government Auditing Standards*, has been included in the finding below:

• Contracts Not Awarded To Lowest Responsible Bidders.

This report is intended solely for the information and use of the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation and the management of the Township of Susquehanna, Juniata County, and is not intended to be and should not be used by anyone other than these specified parties.

<u>Independent Auditor's Report (Continued)</u>

We appreciate the courtesy extended by the Township of Susquehanna, Juniata County, to us during the course of our examination. If you have any questions, please feel free to contact Michael B. Kashishian, CPA, CGAP, CFE, Director, Bureau of County Audits, at 717-787-1363.

October 31, 2016

Eugene A. DePasquale

Eugraf: O-Pagur

Auditor General

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background	1
Financial Section:	
2013 Form MS-965 With Adjustments	3
2014 Form MS-965 With Adjustments	6
2015 Form MS-965 With Adjustments	9
Notes To Forms MS-965 With Adjustments	12
Finding And Recommendations:	
Finding - Contracts Not Awarded To Lowest Responsible Bidders	16
Summary Of Prior Examination Recommendations	19
Summary Of Exit Conference	20
Report Distribution	21

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND BACKGROUND FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2013 TO DECEMBER 31, 2015

Background

The Liquid Fuels Tax Municipal Allocation Law, Act 655 of 1956, as amended, (72 P.S. § 2615.5 et sec.), provides municipalities other than counties (townships, boroughs, cities, towns, home rule, and optional plan governments) with an annual allocation of liquid fuels taxes from the state's Motor License Fund to be used for the maintenance and repair of streets, roads, and bridges for which the municipality is responsible. The allocation of these funds to municipalities is based: (1) 50 percent on the municipality's proportion of local road mileage to the total local road mileage in the state, and (2) 50 percent on the proportion of a municipality's population to the total population in the state.

The Vehicle Code, Title 75 P.S. § 9511, provides municipalities with annual maintenance payments to be received from the Motor License Fund for functionally local highways that were transferred to a municipality from the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.

Each municipality must deposit their allocation of Liquid Fuels Tax funds and annual maintenance payments that it receives into a special fund called the Municipal Liquid Fuels Tax Fund or State Fund. A municipality may not deposit any other monies into this fund except when the municipality does not have enough money in the special fund to meet the payments called for by its current annual budget for road and bridge purposes. In this case, the municipality may borrow money or transfer money from its General Fund to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

The Department of Transportation has been given the regulatory authority for the administration of these funds. Department of Transportation's *Publication 9* includes the policies and procedures for the administration of Act 655, as amended, and the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money. However, if there is a difference between *Publication 9* and any legislation, the legislation shall govern.

To qualify for the annual allocation of Liquid Fuels Tax funds, *Publication 9* indicates that each municipality shall:

- 1. Submit annual reports (MS-965, Actual Use Report, MS-965P, Project and Miscellaneous Receipts, and MS-965S, Record of Checks).
- 2. Make deposits and payments or expenditures in compliance with Act 655 of 1956, as amended. Failure to do so may result in not receiving allocations from PennDOT until all discrepancies are resolved. *Publication 9*, Section 2.6, includes information about investing Liquid Fuels Tax monies, using loan or bond proceeds, and types of receipts into the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND BACKGROUND FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2013 TO DECEMBER 31, 2015

Background (Continued)

- 3. Submit the Pennsylvania Department of Community and Economic Development's (DCED) Report of Elected and Appointed Officials by January 31st and the Survey of Financial Condition By March 15th.
- 4. Ensure resolution of all Contractor Responsibility Program (CRP) holds and blocks imposed by the Department of Revenue and the Department of Labor and Industry.
- 5. Ensure resolution of all reimbursements required as a result of audits performed by the Department of the Auditor General or monitoring reviews performed by the Department of Transportation's Financial Consultants.

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2013 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 1 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Expenditure Summary	Reported		Adjustments		Adjusted Amount	
	•	•				
Major equipment purchases	\$	28,949.24	\$	-	\$	28,949.24
Minor equipment purchases		-		-		-
Computer/Computer related training		-		-		-
Agility projects		-		-		-
Cleaning streets and gutters		-		-		-
Winter maintenance services		4,906.13		-		4,906.13
Traffic control devices		-		-		-
Street lighting		-		-		-
Storm sewers and drains		-		-		-
Repairs of tools and machinery		-		-		-
Maintenance and repair of						
roads and bridges		52,022.29		-		52,022.29
Highway construction and						
rebuilding projects		-		-		-
Miscellaneous				=		
Total (To Section 2, Line 5)	\$	85,877.66	\$		\$	85,877.66

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2013 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 2 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Fund Balance	Reported		Adjustments		Adjusted Amount	
1. Balance, January 1, 2013	\$	64,280.38	\$	-	\$	64,280.38
Receipts: 2. State allocation 2a. Turnback allocation 2b. Interest on investments (Note 3) 2c. Miscellaneous		89,233.74 - 428.27 -		- - - -		89,233.74 - 428.27 -
3. Total receipts		89,662.01				89,662.01
4. Total funds available		153,942.39				153,942.39
5. Expenditures (Section 1)		85,877.66				85,877.66
6. Balance, December 31, 2013	\$	68,064.73	\$	_	\$	68,064.73

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2013 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 3 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Equipment Balance	Reported		Reported		Reported		Adju	stments	Adjusted Amount
1. Prior year equipment balance	\$	22,445.16	\$	-	\$ 22,445.16				
2. Add: Current year equipment allocation (20% of Lines 2 + 2a, Section 2)		17,846.75		-	17,846.75				
3. PENNDOT approved adjustments									
4. Total funds available for equipment acquisition		40,291.91		-	40,291.91				
5. Less: Major equipment expenditures		28,949.24			28,949.24				
6. Remainder		11,342.67			11,342.67				
7. Equipment balance available for subsequent year (Lesser of Line 6 or Section 2 balance, but not less than zero)	\$	11,342.67	\$		\$ 11,342.67				

Notes to Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are an integral part of this report.

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2014 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 1 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Expenditure Summary	Reported		Adjustments		Adjusted Amount	
Major equipment purchases	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-
Minor equipment purchases		-		-		-
Computer/Computer related training		-		-		_
Agility projects		-		-		_
Cleaning streets and gutters		-		-		-
Winter maintenance services		4,967.57		-		4,967.57
Traffic control devices		866.35		-		866.35
Street lighting		-		-		-
Storm sewers and drains		-		-		-
Repairs of tools and machinery		19,630.70		-		19,630.70
Maintenance and repair of						
roads and bridges		79,662.83		-		79,662.83
Highway construction and						
rebuilding projects		-		-		-
Miscellaneous						
Total (To Section 2, Line 5)	\$	105,127.45	\$	_	\$	105,127.45

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2014 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 2 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Fund Balance	Reported		Reported		Adjı	ustments	 Adjusted Amount
1. Balance, January 1, 2014	\$	68,064.73	\$	-	\$ 68,064.73		
Receipts: 2. State allocation		06 005 16			06 005 16		
2. State affocation 2a. Turnback allocation		96,095.16		-	96,095.16		
2b. Interest on investments (Note 3) 2c. Miscellaneous		452.98		- - -	452.98		
3. Total receipts		96,548.14			 96,548.14		
4. Total funds available		164,612.87			164,612.87		
5. Expenditures (Section 1)		105,127.45			 105,127.45		
6. Balance, December 31, 2014	\$	59,485.42	\$	-	\$ 59,485.42		

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2014 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 3 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Equipment Balance	Reported		Reported		Reported		Adju	stments	Adjusted Amount
1. Prior year equipment balance	\$	11,342.67	\$	-	\$ 11,342.67				
2. Add: Current year equipment allocation (20% of Lines 2 + 2a, Section 2)		19,219.03		-	19,219.03				
3. PENNDOT approved adjustments									
4. Total funds available for equipment acquisition		30,561.70		-	30,561.70				
5. Less: Major equipment expenditures					 <u>-</u>				
6. Remainder		30,561.70		_	 30,561.70				
7. Equipment balance available for subsequent year (Lesser of Line 6 or Section 2 balance, but not less than zero)	\$	30,561.70	\$	<u>-</u>	\$ 30,561.70				

Notes to Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are an integral part of this report.

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2015 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 1 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Expenditure Summary	Reported		Adjustments		Adjusted Amount	
Major equipment purchases	\$	14,474.62	\$	-	\$	14,474.62
Minor equipment purchases		-		-		-
Computer/Computer related training		-		-		_
Agility projects		-		-		_
Cleaning streets and gutters		-		-		_
Winter maintenance services		18,149.83		-		18,149.83
Traffic control devices		81.95		-		81.95
Street lighting		-		-		-
Storm sewers and drains		-		-		-
Repairs of tools and machinery		11,474.97		-		11,474.97
Maintenance and repair of						
roads and bridges		84,527.28		-		84,527.28
Highway construction and						
rebuilding projects		-		-		-
Miscellaneous						
Total (To Section 2, Line 5)	\$	128,708.65	\$	_	\$	128,708.65

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2015 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 2 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Fund Balance	Reported		Adjı	ustments	 Adjusted Amount
1. Balance, January 1, 2015	\$	59,485.42	\$	-	\$ 59,485.42
Receipts: 2. State allocation 2a. Turnback allocation 2b. Interest on investments (Note 3) 2c. Miscellaneous		105,792.31 - 259.48 -		- - - -	105,792.31 - 259.48 -
3. Total receipts		106,051.79		-	 106,051.79
4. Total funds available		165,537.21		-	165,537.21
5. Expenditures (Section 1)		128,708.65			128,708.65
6. Balance, December 31, 2015	\$	36,828.56	\$	-	\$ 36,828.56

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2015 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 3 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Equipment Balance	Reported		Reported Adjustments		 Adjusted Amount
1. Prior year equipment balance	\$	30,561.70	\$	-	\$ 30,561.70
2. Add: Current year equipment allocation (20% of Lines 2 + 2a, Section 2)		21,158.46		-	21,158.46
3. PENNDOT approved adjustments		-			-
4. Total funds available for equipment acquisition		51,720.16		-	51,720.16
5. Less: Major equipment expenditures		14,474.62			14,474.62
6. Remainder		37,245.54			37,245.54
7. Equipment balance available for subsequent year (Lesser of Line 6 or Section 2 balance, but not less than zero)	\$	36,828.56	\$	<u>-</u>	\$ 36,828.56

Notes to Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are an integral part of this report.

1. Criteria

Section 1

This section of Form MS-965 With Adjustments provides a summary of Liquid Fuels Tax Fund expenditures by category. Categories requiring explanation include:

• Major equipment purchases are purchases of road machinery and road equipment with varying yearly costs in excess of the amounts indicated below:

2012	2013	2014	2015/2016
\$10,000.00	\$10,200.00	\$10,300.00	\$10,500.00

• Minor equipment purchases are purchases of road machinery and road equipment with varying yearly costs, or less, than the amounts indicated below:

2012	2013	2014	2015/2016
\$10,000,00	\$10,200,00	\$10,200,00	\$10,500,00
\$10,000.00	\$10,200.00	\$10,300.00	\$10,500.00

• Agility projects are exchanges of services with the Department of Transportation.

Section 2

This section of Form MS-965 With Adjustments provides information on the fund balance. Categories requiring explanation include:

- The state allocation was received from the Department of Transportation during the first week in April of each year through 2013. Municipalities began receiving the state allocation in March of each year beginning in 2014. The amount the municipality receives is based half on its population and half on its road mileage.
- The turnback allocation was received from the Department of Transportation during the first week in April of each year through 2013. Municipalities began receiving the turnback allocation in March of each year beginning in 2014. A municipality receives a yearly turnback allocation based on road mileage for all roads that were transferred to the municipality from the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania through the Highway Transfer Program.

1. <u>Criteria (Continued)</u>

Section 2 (Continued)

• Expenditures include the total transferred from Section 1.

Section 3

This section of Form MS-965 With Adjustments determines if the municipality expended Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money in excess of the permissible amount for equipment and the balance that the municipality may carry forward for the purchase of equipment to the subsequent year.

Department of Transportation *Publication 9* requires that the amount expended for equipment purchases in a given year not exceed the sum of the equipment balance carried forward from the previous year and 20 percent of the current year's Liquid Fuels Tax Fund allocation and, if applicable, 20 percent of the turnback allocation plus other Department of Transportation approved adjustments.

If the municipality spent in excess of the amount listed on Line 4, the excess must be reimbursed to the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

The equipment balance to be carried forward for the subsequent year is the lesser of the amount on Line 6 or the ending fund balance on Line 6 of Section 2, but not less than zero.

Basis Of Presentation

The financial activities of the municipality are accounted for in separate funds. The Liquid Fuels Tax Fund is used to account for state aid revenues from the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation used primarily for building and improving local roads and bridges. The Forms MS-965 have been prepared in accordance with reporting requirements prescribed by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation as a result of the Fuels Tax Act 655, dated 1956 and as amended, which does not constitute a complete presentation of the entity's assets, liabilities, expenses, and fund balance. Accordingly, the presentation of Forms MS-965 With Adjustments is restricted to the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund, which represents a segment of the entity.

1. <u>Criteria (Continued)</u>

Basis Of Accounting

The accompanying Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are prepared in accordance with reporting requirements prescribed by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation. Under this method, revenues are recognized when received and expenditures are recorded when paid.

General Fixed Assets

General fixed assets are recognized as expenditures at the time of purchase. No depreciation has been provided on the heavy equipment used to maintain and repair roads and bridges.

2. Deposits

The Second Class Township Code, Title 53 P.S. § 68204, authorizes the township to deposit its funds in the following:

- Deposits in savings accounts or time deposits, other than certificates of deposit or share accounts of institutions having their principal place of business in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and insured by the Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation (FDIC) or other like insurance. For any amount above the insured maximum, the depository shall pledge approved collateral.
- Certificates of deposit purchased from institutions insured by the FDIC or other like
 insurance to the extent that such accounts are so insured. For any amounts in excess
 of the insured maximum, such deposits shall be collateralized by a pledge or
 assignment of assets. Certificates of deposit may not exceed 20 percent of a bank's
 total capital surplus or 20 percent of a savings and loan or savings bank's assets
 minus liabilities.

Deposits consist of receipts and deposits in a financial institution. Pennsylvania statutes require all deposits to be insured and, for any amount above the insured maximum, to be secured with approved collateral as defined.

2. <u>Deposits (Continued)</u>

There were no deposits exposed to custodial credit risk as of December 31, 2015. Custodial credit risk, as defined by GASB No. 40, includes deposits that are not covered by depository insurance and the deposits are uncollateralized, collateralized with securities held by the pledging financial institution, or collateralized with securities held by the pledging financial institution's trust department or agent but not in the municipality's name.

Fund Balance

The fund balance as of December 31, 2015, consists of the following:

Cash \$36,828.56

3. <u>Interest On Investments</u>

Our examination disclosed that the municipality deposited idle liquid fuels tax money in interest-bearing accounts which earned \$428.27 during 2013, \$452.98 during 2014, and \$259.48 during 2015, thus providing additional funds for road maintenance and repairs.

4. Lease-Purchase Agreement

On January 6, 2012, the municipality purchased a 2011 John Deere 6330 tractor with a Tiger Model RT-50D Panther boom mower for \$98,463.00. The municipality made a down payment of \$20,000.00 from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund. The down payment from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund is reflected in major equipment purchases on the 2012 Form MS-965 - Section 1. The municipality leased the remaining \$78,463.00 from F.N.B. Commercial Leasing for a term of six years at an interest rate of 4.25 percent. Principal and interest payments of \$14,474.62 are due annually. Prior years' principal and interest payments from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund were \$11,798.18 and \$2,676.44, respectively.

During the current examination period, the municipality paid principal of \$38,379.96 and interest of \$5,043.90 from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund. These amounts are reflected in major equipment purchases on the 2013 and 2015 Forms MS-965 - Section 1. The outstanding balance of the lease-purchase agreement as of December 31, 2015 was \$28,284.86, plus interest.

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND FINDING AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2013 TO DECEMBER 31, 2015

Finding - Contracts Not Awarded To Lowest Responsible Bidders

Our examination disclosed that on May 13, 2013, the township opened bids for stone. The township awarded the bid for stone to Vendor A for a total of \$33,587.50. However, Vendor B was the low bidder at \$29,301.25. No reason was given in the township minute book for not awarding the contract to the lowest responsible bidder. During 2013 the township purchased 406.61 tons of #8 washed stone from Vendor A at \$10.50 per ton. Had the township purchased the #8 washed stone from Vendor B at \$8.05 per ton, it would have saved \$996.20. Additionally, the township purchased 283.68 tons of #57 stone from Vendor A at \$10.50 per ton. Had the township purchased the #57 stone from Vendor B at \$8.20 per ton, it would have saved \$652.46.

On May 13, 2013, the township opened bids for CRS-2 road oil. It received two bids for the CRS-2 road oil as follows:

<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Unit Price/Gallon</u>
Vendor A	\$2.026
Vendor B	2.02

Although Vendor B was the low bidder for the road oil, Vendor A was awarded the bid. No reason was given in the township minute book for not awarding the contract to the lowest responsible bidder. During 2013, the township purchased 14,800 gallons of CRS-2 road oil from Vendor A. Had the township purchased the CRS-2 road oil from Vendor B, it would have saved \$88.80.

On May 12, 2014, the township opened bids for E-3 road oil. It received two bids for the E-3 road oil as follows:

<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Unit Price/Gallon</u>
Vendor A	\$2.015
Vendor B	1.988

Although Vendor B was the low bidder for the E-3 road oil, Vendor A was awarded the bid. No reason was given in the township minute book for not awarding the contract to the lowest responsible bidder. On September 16, 2014, the township purchased 24,550 gallons of E-3 road oil from Vendor A. Had the township purchased the E-3 road oil from Vendor B, it would have saved \$662.85.

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND FINDING AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2013 TO DECEMBER 31, 2015

<u>Finding - Contracts Not Awarded To Lowest Responsible Bidders (Continued)</u>

On May 11, 2015, the township opened bids for E-3 road oil. It received two bids for the E-3 road oil as follows:

<u>Unit Price/Gallon</u>
\$1.780
1.778

Although Vendor B was the low bidder for the E-3 road oil, Vendor A was awarded the bid. No reason was given in the township minute book for not awarding the contract to the lowest responsible bidder. On September 18, 2015, the township purchased 21,550 gallons of E-3 road oil from Vendor A. Had the township purchased the E-3 road oil from Vendor B, it would have saved \$43.10.

The above purchases were not made in compliance with the advertising, bidding, and contract requirements of *The Second Class Township Code*, 53 P.S.§ 68102(a), (also found at § 3102(a) of *The Second class Township Code* as published by the Local Government Commission), which states:

All contracts or purchases in excess of the required advertising amount of eighteen thousand five hundred dollars (\$18,500), except those specifically excluded, shall not be made except with and from the lowest responsible bidder...

The threshold for advertising for bids increased to purchases over \$18,900.00 for 2013, \$19,100.00 for 2014, and \$19,500.00 for 2015 and 2016.

If the lowest bid is not accepted, the township must provide an explanation in the township supervisors meeting minute book as to why the low bid was not accepted. The township did not provide explanations.

The failure to comply with *The Second Class Township Code* could result in the township having to reimburse \$2,443.41 to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND FINDING AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2013 TO DECEMBER 31, 2015

Finding - Contracts Not Awarded To Lowest Responsible Bidders (Continued)

Recommendations

We recommend that the township reimburse \$2,443.41 to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund upon official notification by the Department of Transportation.

We further recommend that, in the future, the township complies with *The Second Class Township Code* as noted in this finding.

Management's Response

The Secretary/Treasurer stated:

The reasons why the lowest bids were not accepted are as follows:

During 2013, Vendor B continued to only have dirty stone available, which can't be used for quality chipping on the roads. During 2013, 2014, and 2015, Vendor B's distribution of oil showed a constant issue with poor workmanship. This has been an ongoing issue. We needed to use the vendor's employees for the distribution of the oil since we could not do it ourselves. Going forward, the explanations of the bids will be included in the meeting minutes.

Auditor's Conclusion

During our next examination we will determine if the township complied with our recommendations.

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND SUMMARY OF PRIOR EXAMINATION RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2013 TO DECEMBER 31, 2015

Summary Of Prior Examination Recommendations

In our prior report we recommended that the Department of Transportation review our examination finding to determine if the municipality should reimburse \$34,474.62 to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund for failure to maintain documentation for a purchase made from a COSTARS contract.

During our current examination we reviewed a letter dated August 22, 2014, from the Department of Transportation, informing the municipality that the reimbursement of \$34,474.62 would not be required.

In our prior report we also recommended that the township maintain a contract number, copies of its supplier's information, price/discount information, and any documentation of negotiations with other COSTARS suppliers.

During our current examination we noted that the municipality complied with our recommendations.

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND SUMMARY OF EXIT CONFERENCE FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2013 TO DECEMBER 31, 2015

An exit conference was held October 13, 2016. Those participating were:

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA

Ms. Brenda Arnold, Secretary/Treasurer

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL

Ms. Tammy Fleisher, Audit Supervisor

The results of the examination were presented and discussed in their entirety.

TOWNSHIP OF SUSQUEHANNA JUNIATA COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND REPORT DISTRIBUTION FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2013 TO DECEMBER 31, 2015

This report was initially distributed to:

The Honorable Leslie Richards

Secretary
Department of Transportation

Township of Susquehanna

Juniata County 2024 Turkey Valley Road Liverpool, PA 17045

The Honorable Nathan Kerstetter Chairman of the Board of Supervisors

> Ms. Brenda Arnold Secretary/Treasurer

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.