



ALLEGHENY COUNTY

COMPLIANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR THE PERIOD

JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2012

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE - AUDITOR GENERAL

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL





Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council Brentwood Borough Allegheny County Pittsburgh, PA 15227

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Brentwood Borough Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2010 to December 31, 2012. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform our audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The objectives of the audit were:

- 1. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report; and
- 2. To determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above. Our methodology addressed determinations about the following:

- Whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements.
- Whether employer contributions are determined and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether employee contributions are required and, if so, are determined, deducted and deposited into the pension plan and are in accordance with the plan provisions and applicable laws and regulations.

- Whether benefit payments, if any, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and are properly determined in accordance with applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether obligations for plan benefits are accurately determined in accordance with plan provisions and based on complete and accurate participant data; and whether actuarial valuation reports are prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) in accordance with state law and selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program.
- Whether benefit payments have only been made to living recipients, based on the Social Security numbers found in the pension records for retirees and beneficiaries.
- Whether Deferred Retirement Option Plan (DROP) participants' benefit payments are properly determined in accordance with the provisions of the DROP and any other applicable laws and regulations.

Brentwood Borough contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for annual audits of its basic financial statements which are available at the borough's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Brentwood Borough Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the borough's internal controls as they relate to the borough's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objectives, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our tests indicated that, in all significant respects, the Brentwood Borough Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following finding further discussed later in this report:

Finding – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation - Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In A Net Underpayment Of State Aid The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Brentwood Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

Eugent: O-Pager

March 6, 2014

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE Auditor General

CONTENTS

Page
Background1
Status of Prior Finding
Finding and Recommendation:
Finding – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In A Net Underpayment Of State Aid4
Supplementary Information
Report Distribution List

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 <u>et seq.</u>). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Brentwood Borough Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 600 - Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 761 et seq.

The Brentwood Borough Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 1151, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 600. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the borough and its police officers. The plan was established December 31, 1954. Active members are required to contribute 3.5 percent of compensation to the plan. As of December 31, 2012, the plan had 13 active members, no terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future and 13 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2012, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	Age 55 and 25 years of service
Early Retirement	None
Vesting	100% after 12 years of service

Retirement Benefit:

50% of final 36 months average salary, plus a service increment of \$25 per month for each year of service in excess of 25 years, up to a maximum of \$100 per month.

Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility	Refund of member contributions plus interest
After Retirement Eligibility	A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension the member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the day of the member's death.

Service Related Disability Benefit:

50% of the member's salary at the time the disability was incurred, offset by Social Security disability benefits received for the same injury.

BRENTWOOD BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN STATUS OF PRIOR FINDING

Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation

Brentwood Borough has not complied with the prior audit recommendation concerning the following as further discussed in the Finding and Recommendation section of this report:

· Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In A Net Underpayment Of State Aid

BRENTWOOD BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

<u>Finding – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Incorrect Data On</u> <u>Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In A Net Underpayment Of State Aid</u>

<u>Condition</u>: Our prior audit report disclosed that the borough understated payroll by \$14,687 for 1 police officer in 2007 and failed to certify 1 eligible non-uniformed employee in 2008 and 2009 on Certification Form AG 385, resulting in underpayments of state aid in 2007, 2008 and 2009 in the total amount \$8,236. This amount was subsequently reimbursed to the borough in March 2011.

During the current audit period, the borough failed to certify 1 eligible police officer (2 units) on the Certification Form AG 385 filed in 2010. The borough also understated payroll by \$68,768 for 1 police officer and understated payroll by \$8,904 for 1 non-uniformed employee on the Certification Form AG 385 filed in 2011. In addition, the borough overstated 1 police officer (2 units) on the Certification Form AG 385 filed in 2013. The data contained on these certification forms is based on prior calendar year information.

<u>Criteria</u>: Pursuant to Act 205, at Section 402(e)(2), an employee who has been employed on a full-time basis for at least six consecutive months and has been participating in a pension plan during the certification year is eligible for certification.

<u>Cause</u>: Plan officials failed to establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the accuracy of the data certified and to ensure compliance with the prior audit recommendation.

<u>Effect</u>: The data submitted on these certification forms are used, in part, to calculate the state aid due to the municipality for distribution to its pension plans.

The borough's 2010 and 2013 state aid allocations were based on unit value. Therefore, the borough received an underpayment of state aid in the amount of \$6,470 in 2010 and an overpayment of state aid in the amount of \$7,768 in 2013, as identified below:

Year	Type Of Plan	Units Overstated/ (Understated)	Unit Value	Ove	tate Aid erpayment/ lerpayment)
2010	Police	(2)	\$ 3,235	\$	(6,470)
2013	Police	2	\$ 3,884	\$	7,768

BRENTWOOD BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

Finding – (Continued)

The borough's 2011 state aid allocation was based on pension costs. Therefore, the borough received an underpayment of state aid in the amount of \$9,297 in 2011, as identified below:

Year	Type Of Plan	Normal Cost		Payroll derstated	tate Aid erpayment
2011	Police Non-Uniformed	12.91% 4.71%	\$ \$	68,768 8,904	\$ (8,878) (419)
				Total	\$ (9,297)

Therefore, as a result of the certification errors, the borough received a net underpayment of state aid during and subsequent to the audit period in the amount of \$7,999.

Although the borough will be reimbursed for the underpayment of state aid due to the borough's certification errors, the full amounts of the 2010 and 2011 state aid allocations were not available to be deposited timely and therefore were not available to pay operating expenses or for investment.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We again recommend that in the future, plan officials establish adequate internal control procedures, such as having at least 2 people review the data certified, to ensure compliance with the instructions that accompany Certification Form AG 385 to assist them in accurately reporting the required pension data.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

BRENTWOOD BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2007, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
						Unfunded
			Unfunded			(Assets in
		Actuarial	(Assets in			Excess of)
		Accrued	Excess of)			Actuarial
	Actuarial	Liability	Actuarial			Accrued
Actuarial	Value of	(AAL) -	Accrued	Funded	Covered	Liability as a %
Valuation	Assets	Entry Age	Liability	Ratio	Payroll	of Payroll
Date	(a)	(b)	(b) - (a)	(a)/(b)	(c)	[(b-a)/(c)]
01-01-07	\$ 4,176,829	\$ 4,024,226	\$ (152,603)	103.8%	\$ 1,020,153	(15.0%)
01-01-09	4,258,162	4,288,707	30,545	99.3%	1,112,399	2.7%
01-01-11	4,334,319	5,246,753	912,434	82.6%	1,229,059	74.2%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-09 and 01-01-11 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 4-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

BRENTWOOD BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

Trends in unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability and annual covered payroll are both affected by inflation. Expressing the unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability as a percentage of annual covered payroll (Column 6) approximately adjusts for the effects of inflation and aids analysis of the plan's progress made in accumulating sufficient assets to pay benefits when due. Generally, where there is an unfunded actuarial accrued liability, the smaller this percentage, the stronger the plan. When assets are in excess of the actuarial accrued liability, the higher the bracketed percentage, the stronger the plan.

BRENTWOOD BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2007	\$ 103,037	106.7%
2008	105,646	102.1%
2009	134,642	100.0%
2010	135,879	100.0%
2011	161,767	100.0%
2012	124,961	100.0%

BRENTWOOD BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the required supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2011
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar, closed
Remaining amortization period	17 years
Asset valuation method	
Actuarial assumptions:	Fair value, 4-year smoothing
Investment rate of return	7.0%
Projected salary increases *	5.0%

* Includes inflation at 3.0%

BRENTWOOD BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom Corbett Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Brentwood Borough Police Pension Plan Allegheny County 3624 Brownsville Road Pittsburgh, PA 15227

The Honorable Dennis Troy	Mayor
Mr. Marty Vickless	Council President
Mr. George Zboyovsky	Borough Manager
Ms. Susan Toth	Finance Director

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at <u>www.auditorgen.state.pa.us</u>. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@auditorgen.state.pa.us.