



ALLEGHENY COUNTY

COMPLIANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR THE PERIOD

JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2012

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE - AUDITOR GENERAL

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL





Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council Verona Borough Allegheny County Verona, PA 15147

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Verona Borough Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2010 to December 31, 2012. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. Our methodology addressed determinations about the following:

- Whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements.
- Whether employer contributions are determined and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether employee contributions are required and, if so, are determined, deducted and deposited into the pension plan and are in accordance with the plan provisions and applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether benefit payments, if any, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and are properly determined in accordance with applicable laws and regulations.

- Whether obligations for plan benefits are accurately determined in accordance with plan provisions and based on complete and accurate participant data; and whether actuarial valuation reports are prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) in accordance with state law and selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program.
- Whether the terms of the contractual agreement with the Pennsylvania State Association of Boroughs are in accordance with the plan's governing document, if separately stated, and applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether the special ad hoc postretirement adjustment granted to eligible pensioners is in accordance with applicable laws and regulations and whether the ad hoc reimbursement received by the municipality was treated in accordance with applicable laws and regulations.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Verona Borough Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the borough's internal controls as they relate to the borough's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our tests indicated that, in all significant respects, the Verona Borough Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following findings further discussed later in this report:

Finding No. 1	- Unauthorized Provision For A Killed In Service Benefit
Finding No. 2	- Failure to Reduce Pension Benefit By Social Security Offset

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Verona Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report.

Eugent: O-Purger

February 25, 2014

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE Auditor General

CONTENTS

Page
Background1
Findings and Recommendations:
Finding No. 1 – Unauthorized Provision For A Killed In Service Benefit
Finding No. 2 – Failure To Reduce Pension Benefit By Social Security Offset5
Supplementary Information
Report Distribution List10
ABBREVIATION

PSABMRT - Pennsylvania State Association of Boroughs Municipal Retirement Trust

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 <u>et</u> <u>seq</u>.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Verona Borough Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

- Act 147 Special Ad Hoc Municipal Police and Firefighter Postretirement Adjustment Act, Act of December 14, 1988 (P.L. 1192, No. 147), as amended, 53 P.S. § 896.101 et seq.
- Act 600 Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 761 et seq.

The Verona Borough Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 3 of 1981, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 600. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the borough and its police officers. The plan was established August 1, 1957. Active members are not required to contribute to the plan. As of December 31, 2012, the plan had 2 active members, no terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, 3 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan and 1 retiree receiving benefits funded through annuities purchased with plan assets.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2012, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	Age 55 and 25 years of service.
Early Retirement	None
Vesting	100% after 12 years of service.

Retirement Benefit:

A monthly benefit equal to 50% of gross pay averaged over the last 36 months of employment. Benefits will be reduced by 50% of the Social Security benefit. The reduction will commence with the month following eligibility for the full Social Security benefits.

Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility	Refund of member contributions plus interest.
After Retirement Eligibility	A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension the member was receiving or was entitled to receive at the time of the member's death.

Service Related Disability Benefit:

50% of the member's salary at the time the disability was incurred, offset by Social Security disability benefits received for the same injury.

VERONA BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – Unauthorized Provision For A Killed In Service Benefit

<u>Condition</u>: The borough maintains a police pension plan governed by the provisions of Act 600, as amended. Prior to the adoption of Act 51 of 2009, Act 600 contained a mandatory killed in service benefit provision; however, Act 51 specifically repealed the section of Act 600 that referenced the mandatory killed in service benefit. During the prior audit period, a verbal observation was given to plan officials notifying them of the passage of Act 51. It was recommended that plan officials review the act's implications for the police pension plan with their municipal solicitor. During the current audit period, it has been determined that the pension plan's governing document continues to provide for a killed in service benefit that is no longer authorized by Act 600.

Ordinance No. 03-07 adopts a joinder agreement dated May 1, 2007. The agreement, at Section 6.02, provides for a killed in service benefit of 100 percent of the member's salary at the time of death.

In addition, the borough continues to fund a killed in service benefit due to its inclusion in the plan's January 1, 2011, actuarial valuation report.

Criteria: Section 1(a) of Act 51 of 2009 states, in part:

In the event a law enforcement officer, ambulance service or rescue squad member, firefighter, certified hazardous material response team member or National Guard member dies as a result of the performance of his duties, such political subdivision, Commonwealth agency or, in the case of National Guard members, the Adjutant General, or, in the case of a member of a Commonwealth law enforcement agency, the authorized survivor or the agency head, within 90 days from the date of death, shall submit certification of such death to the Commonwealth.

VERONA BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – (Continued)

In addition, Section 1(d) of Act 51 of 2009 states, in part:

... the Commonwealth shall, from moneys payable out of the General Fund, pay to the surviving spouse or, if there is no surviving spouse, to the minor children of the paid firefighter, ambulance service or rescue squad member or law enforcement officer who died as a result of the performance of his duty the sum of \$100,000, adjusted in accordance with subsection (f) of this section, and an amount equal to the monthly salary, adjusted in accordance with subsection (f) of this section, of the deceased paid firefighter, ambulance service or rescue squad member or law enforcement officer, less any workers' compensation or pension or retirement benefits paid to such survivors, and shall continue such monthly payments until there is no eligible beneficiary to receive them. For the purpose of this subsection, the term "eligible beneficiary" means the surviving spouse or the child or children under the age of eighteen years or, if attending college, under the age of twenty-three years, of the firefighter, ambulance service or rescue squad member or law enforcement officer who died as a result of the performance of his duty. When no spouse or minor children survive, a single sum of \$100,000, adjusted in accordance with subsection (f) of this section, shall be paid to the parent or parents of such firefighter, ambulance service member, rescue squad member or law enforcement officer. (Emphasis added)

Furthermore, Section 2 of Act 51 of 2009 states:

Repeals are as follows:

- (1) The General Assembly declares that the repeals under paragraph (2) are necessary to effectuate the amendment of section 1 of the act.
- (2) The following parts of acts are repealed:
 - (i) Section 5(e)(2) of the act of May 29, 1956 (1955 P.L.1804, No. 600), referred to as the Municipal Police Pension Law.
 - (ii) Section 202(b)(3)(vi) and (4)(vi) of the act of December 18, 1984 (P.L.1005, No. 205), known as the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act.

Therefore, since Act 51 specifically repealed the killed in service provision of Act 600 and the funding provisions for the killed in service benefit that were contained in Act 205, the provision of a killed in service benefit is no longer authorized.

VERONA BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – (Continued)

<u>Cause</u>: Plan officials failed to establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the plan's governing document is in compliance with Act 600, as amended.

<u>Effect</u>: Since Section 1 of Act 51 provides that the Commonwealth is obligated to pay the killed in service benefit less any pension or retirement benefits paid to eligible survivors, the continued provision of a killed in service benefit could result in the pension plan being obligated to pay a benefit that is no longer authorized by Act 600, and would have been paid entirely by the Commonwealth absent such provision.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the municipality review the plan's killed in service benefit with its solicitor in conjunction with Act 51 of 2009, and eliminate this unauthorized benefit provision at its earliest opportunity to do so.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Finding No. 2 – Failure To Reduce Pension Benefit By Social Security Offset

<u>Condition</u>: Plan officials failed to reduce the pension benefit of a retiree who reached his Social Security age in 2010, as required by the plan's governing document. The plan's actuary informed borough officials that the retiree had reached his Social Security age in 2010 and his pension had not been offset.

<u>Criteria</u>: Ordinance No. 03-07 adopted a Joinder Agreement with the Pennsylvania State Association of Boroughs Master Retirement Trust. The agreement, at Section 4.02, provides that normal retirement benefits shall be offset by 50 percent of applicable old age Social Security benefits.

<u>Cause</u>: Plan officials have failed to adopt adequate internal control procedures to ensure that pension benefits are paid in accordance with the plan's governing document.

<u>Effect</u>: The borough's failure to apply the prescribed Social Security offset has resulted in the retiree being paid pension benefits in excess of his entitlement.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that municipal officials determine the dollar amount of the referenced retiree's Social Security offset and adjust his monthly pension benefit prospectively, in accordance with the plan's governing document.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

VERONA BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2007, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
						Unfunded
			Unfunded			(Assets in
		Actuarial	(Assets in			Excess of)
		Accrued	Excess of)			Actuarial
	Actuarial	Liability	Actuarial			Accrued
Actuarial	Value of	(AAL) -	Accrued	Funded	Covered	Liability as a %
Valuation	Assets	Entry Age	Liability	Ratio	Payroll	of Payroll
Date	(a)	(b)	(b) - (a)	(a)/(b)	(c)	[(b-a)/(c)]
01-01-07	\$ 412,205	\$ 343,466	\$ (68,739)	120.0%	\$ 108,824	(63.2%)
01-01-09	368,530	376,936	8,406	97.8%	151,902	5.5%
01-01-11	344,838	343,361	(1,477)	100.4%	73,215	(2.0%)

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-09 and 01-01-11 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 4-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

VERONA BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

Trends in unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability and annual covered payroll are both affected by inflation. Expressing the unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability as a percentage of annual covered payroll (Column 6) approximately adjusts for the effects of inflation and aids analysis of the plan's progress made in accumulating sufficient assets to pay benefits when due. Generally, where there is an unfunded actuarial accrued liability, the smaller this percentage, the stronger the plan. When assets are in excess of the actuarial accrued liability, the higher the bracketed percentage, the stronger the plan.

VERONA BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2007	\$ 12,317	106.7%
2008	12,609	100.0%
2009	17,575	100.0%
2010	14,020	100.0%
2011	13,292	100.0%
2012	12,082	100.0%

VERONA BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the required supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2011
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	N/A
Remaining amortization period	N/A
Asset valuation method	Fair value, 4-year smoothing
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	7.25%
Projected salary increases	5.0%

VERONA BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom Corbett Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Verona Borough Police Pension Plan Allegheny County 736 East Railroad Avenue Verona, PA 15147

The Honorable David P. Ricupero	Mayor
Mr. Dominic Conte	Council President
Ms. Bonita M. Conway	Borough Manager

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at <u>www.auditorgen.state.pa.us</u>. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@auditorgen.state.pa.us.