



**BEAVER COUNTY** 

**COMPLIANCE AUDIT REPORT** 

FOR THE PERIOD

JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2012

## **COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA**

# **EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE - AUDITOR GENERAL**

## **DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL**





Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

Board of Township Supervisors New Sewickley Township Beaver County Rochester, PA 15074

We have conducted a compliance audit of the New Sewickley Township Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2010 to December 31, 2012. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. Our methodology addressed determinations about the following:

- Whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements.
- Whether employer contributions are determined and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether employee contributions are required and, if so, are determined, deducted and deposited into the pension plan and are in accordance with the plan provisions and applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether benefit payments, if any, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and are properly determined in accordance with applicable laws and regulations.

- Whether obligations for plan benefits are accurately determined in accordance with plan provisions and based on complete and accurate participant data; and whether actuarial valuation reports are prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) in accordance with state law and selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program.
  - Whether benefit payments have only been made to living recipients, based on the Social Security numbers found in the pension records for retirees and beneficiaries.

Township officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the New Sewickley Township Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the township's internal controls as they relate to the township's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our tests indicated that, in all significant respects, the New Sewickley Township Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following finding further discussed later in this report:

Finding – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Overpayment Of State Aid

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of New Sewickley Township and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank township officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

Eugent. O-Twom

March 26, 2014

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE Auditor General

## CONTENTS

Pag	<u>3e</u>
Background	.1
Finding and Recommendation:	
Finding – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Overpayment Of State Aid	.3
Supplementary Information	.5
Report Distribution List	.9

#### BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 <u>et seq.</u>). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the New Sewickley Township Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 600 - Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 761 et seq.

The New Sewickley Township Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 180, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 600. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the township and its police officers. The plan was established January 3, 1963. Active members are required to contribute 5 percent of annual compensation to the plan. As of December 31, 2012, the plan had 8 active members, no terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future and 5 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

## **BACKGROUND** – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2012, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

### **Eligibility Requirements**:

Normal Retirement	Age 50 and 25 years of service.
Early Retirement	None
Vesting	100% after 12 years of service.

#### Retirement Benefit:

50% of final 36 months average salary, plus a service increment of \$100 per month after 26 years of service.

### Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility	Refund of member contributions plus interest.
After Retirement Eligibility	A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension the member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the day of the member's death.

#### Service Related Disability Benefit:

The greater of: 50% of the most recent 36 months final average salary at the time the disability was incurred or 50% of the participant's salary (within the meaning of Act 30 of 2002) at the time the disability was incurred. Benefit is offset by Social Security disability benefits received for the same injury.

## NEW SEWICKLEY TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

## <u>Finding – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Overpayment Of</u> <u>State Aid</u>

<u>Condition</u>: The township certified 1 ineligible police officer (2 units) on the Certification Form AG 385 filed in 2013. The data contained on this certification form is based on prior calendar year information. The police officer was classified as a part-time police officer until hired full-time by the township on July 29, 2012.

<u>Criteria</u>: Pursuant to Act 205, at Section 402(e)(2), in order to be eligible for certification, an employee must have been employed on a full-time basis for at least six consecutive months and must have been participating in a pension plan during the certification year.

<u>Cause</u>: Since the officer worked 35 hours per week when he was a part-time employee and was then hired full-time in 2012, the township considered the officer to have met the requirements for certification.

<u>Effect</u>: The data submitted on this certification form is used, in part, to calculate the state aid due to the municipality for distribution to its pension plans. Because the township's state aid allocation was based on unit value the incorrect certification of pension data affected the township's state aid allocation, as identified below:

Units	Unit	State Aid	
Overstated	Value	Overpayment	
2	\$ 3,884	\$ 7,768	

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the total excess state aid, in the amount of \$7,768, be returned to the Commonwealth. A check in this amount, with interest compounded annually from date of receipt to date of repayment, at a rate earned by the pension plan, should be made payable to: Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and mailed to: Department of the Auditor General, Municipal Pension & Fire Relief Programs Unit, 320 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120. A copy of the interest calculation must be submitted along with the check.

<u>Management's Response</u>: It is our understanding that your finding is based on your conclusion that in order to be certified, the officer must be a "full-time" officer for six consecutive months. By so finding you have added a condition to certification that is not found in the AG 385 instructions.

## NEW SEWICKLEY TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

## Finding – (Continued)

The Certification Form AG 385 instructions state:

- 1a. WORKING, ACTIVE, FULL-TIME POLICE OFFICERS
  - Each Police Officer **MUST meet each of these conditions** <u>anytime</u> between 1/1/12 to 12/31/12 (emphasis added)
  - A. Be an **ACTIVE**, **FULL-TIME POLICE OFFICER** employed by the municipality.
  - B. Be <u>EMPLOYED FOR ANY SIX (6) CONSECUTIVE MONTHS</u> during calendar year 2012.
  - C. WORK NOT LESS THAN 35 HOURS PER WEEK. DISABILITY BENEFITS-You may report Police Officers receiving TEMPORARY SERVICE-RELATED DISABILITY BENEFITS.
  - D. Be a **MEMBER OF A POLICE PENSION PLAN** and meet all its requirements.

Section B above does not contain the term "full-time". If this requirement was intended, it would have been stated just as is done in Section A. Further, as Section C makes clear, part-time employment and certification are not mutually exclusive.

In this case as you have concluded, the officer worked 35 hours weekly though July 2012 and 40 hours weekly thereafter. As such, he meets the precise and literal terms of AG 385. It is improper to insert terms and conditions that are not found in the AG 385 instructions. Clearly, the officer was "employed for any six (6) consecutive months during calendar year 2012" as required and he should be so certified.

The township respectfully objects to your finding and requests that this response be submitted for review.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: The Certification Form AG 385 instructions are an enumeration of the certification requirements contained in Act 205, which is cited in the Criteria section of the Finding. Sections 1(a) A through D of the instructions must be considered together. Although the officer in question worked 35 hours per week prior to July 29, 2012, he was not considered by the township to be a full-time employee until July 29, 2012, as evidenced by the fact the township did not convey the benefits of a full-time employee to the officer until that date. Therefore, since the officer did not meet the Act 205 requirements for certification, the finding and recommendation remain as stated.

### NEW SEWICKLEY TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

#### SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2007, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
						Unfunded
			Unfunded			(Assets in
		Actuarial	(Assets in			Excess of)
		Accrued	Excess of)			Actuarial
	Actuarial	Liability	Actuarial			Accrued
Actuarial	Value of	(AAL) -	Accrued	Funded	Covered	Liability as a %
Valuation	Assets	Entry Age	Liability	Ratio	Payroll	of Payroll
Date	(a)	(b)	(b) - (a)	(a)/(b)	(c)	[(b-a)/(c)]
01-01-07	\$ 2,117,283	\$ 1,812,349	\$ (304,934)	116.8%	\$ 483,351	(63.1%)
01-01-09	2,009,065	2,061,195	52,130	97.5%	444,810	11.7%
01-01-11	2,054,701	2,029,434	(25,267)	101.2%	471,287	(5.4%)

The amounts in the above table for 01-01-07 have been adjusted as appropriate, for insurance/annuity contracts maintained preretirement to fund a portion of the benefits provided by the pension plan at retirement.

The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-09 and 01-01-11 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 4-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

### NEW SEWICKLEY TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

Trends in unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability and annual covered payroll are both affected by inflation. Expressing the unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability as a percentage of annual covered payroll (Column 6) approximately adjusts for the effects of inflation and aids analysis of the plan's progress made in accumulating sufficient assets to pay benefits when due. Generally, where there is an unfunded actuarial accrued liability, the smaller this percentage, the stronger the plan. When assets are in excess of the actuarial accrued liability, the higher the bracketed percentage, the stronger the plan.

## NEW SEWICKLEY TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

## SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2007	\$ 58,503	100.0%
2008	52,068	100.0%
2009	38,553	100.0%
2010	38,492	100.0%
2011	67,560	112.4%
2012	50,579	100.0%

## NEW SEWICKLEY TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the required supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2011
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	N/A
Remaining amortization period	N/A
Asset valuation method	Fair value, 4-year smoothing
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return *	7.0%
Projected salary increases *	5.0%
Cost-of-living adjustments	Not disclosed

\* Includes inflation at 3.0%

## NEW SEWICKLEY TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom Corbett Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

New Sewickley Township Police Pension Plan Beaver County 233 Miller Road Rochester, PA 15074

Mr. Duane Rape Chairman, Board of Township Supervisors

Mr. Walter Beighey, Jr. Township Manager

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at <u>www.auditorgen.state.pa.us</u>. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@auditorgen.state.pa.us.