

## CHESWICK BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN

**ALLEGHENY COUNTY** 

**COMPLIANCE AUDIT REPORT** 

FOR THE PERIOD

JANUARY 1, 2011 TO DECEMBER 31, 2012

#### **COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA**

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE - AUDITOR GENERAL

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL





# Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen

#### EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council Cheswick Borough Allegheny County Cheswick, PA 15024

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Cheswick Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2011 to December 31, 2012. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. Our methodology addressed determinations about the following:

- · Whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements.
- · Whether employer contributions are determined and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations.
- · Whether employee contributions are required and, if so, are determined, deducted and deposited into the pension plan and are in accordance with the plan provisions and applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether benefit payments, if any, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and are properly determined in accordance with applicable laws and regulations.

- · Whether obligations for plan benefits are accurately determined in accordance with plan provisions and based on complete and accurate participant data; and whether actuarial valuation reports are prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) in accordance with state law and selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program.
- · Whether the terms of the unallocated insurance contract, including ownership and any restrictions, are in compliance with plan provisions, investment policies and state regulations.

Cheswick Borough contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for an audit of its basic financial statements for the year ended December 31, 2011 which are available at the borough's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Cheswick Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the borough's internal controls as they relate to the borough's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our tests indicated that, in all significant respects, the Cheswick Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following finding further discussed later in this report:

Finding – Failure To Fully Pay The Minimum Municipal Obligation Of The Plan

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it. However, we are extremely concerned about the historical trend information contained in the schedule of funding progress included in this report which indicates a decline of assets available to satisfy the long-term liabilities of the plan. For example, the plan's funded ratio went from 104.7% as of January 1, 2007, to a ratio of 67.0% as of January 1, 2011, which is the most recent date available. We encourage borough officials to monitor the funding of the non-uniformed pension plan to ensure its long-term financial stability.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Cheswick Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

April 25, 2014

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE

Eugent: O-Pager

Auditor General

#### **CONTENTS**

	<u>Page</u>
Background	1
Finding and Recommendation:	
Finding – Failure To Fully Pay The Minimum Municipal Obligation Of The Plan	3
Supplementary Information	6
Report Distribution List	10

#### **BACKGROUND**

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Cheswick Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes.

The Cheswick Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 727-C, as amended. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the borough and its non-uniformed employees. The plan was established January 1, 1966. Active members are required to contribute 1 percent of annual compensation to the plan. As of December 31, 2012, the plan had 3 active members, 1 terminated member eligible for vested benefits in the future and 2 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

#### **BACKGROUND** – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2012, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

#### Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement Attainment of age 60.

Early Retirement Attainment of age 55 and 10 years of service.

Vesting 20% after three years of vesting service plus 20% per year

thereafter, up to 100%.

#### Retirement Benefit:

The greater of (A) 2.0% of average compensation (the monthly average of total pay received for the 36 latest months prior to normal retirement date), multiplied by accrual service or (B) required contributions account.

#### Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility The greater of 50% of the accrued benefit or the required

contribution account, payable to spouse of qualified married participant. A single sum equal to the required contribution account is payable to the beneficiary who is

not eligible for survivor benefits.

After Retirement Eligibility A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension the

member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the

day of the member's death.

#### **Disability Benefit**:

Service Related 50% of average compensation on the day before the month

disability benefit begins. Minimum benefit of \$20.

Non-Service Related Same as Service Related.

### CHESWICK BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

#### Finding - Failure To Fully Pay The Minimum Municipal Obligation Of The Plan

<u>Condition</u>: The municipality did not fully pay the minimum municipal obligation (MMO) that was due to the non-uninformed pension plan for the year 2013, as required by Act 205. The municipality had an unpaid 2013 MMO balance of \$56,906.

<u>Criteria</u>: With regard to the MMO, Section 302(c) of Act 205 states, in part:

Annually, the chief administrative officer of the pension plan shall determine the minimum obligation of the municipality with respect to the pension plan for the following plan year.

Section 302(d) of Act 205 states, in part:

The minimum obligation of the municipality shall be payable to the pension plan from the revenue of the municipality.

Furthermore, Section 302(e) of Act 205 states:

Any amount of the minimum obligation of the municipality which remains unpaid as of December 31 of the year in which the minimum obligation is due shall be added to the minimum obligation of the municipality for the following year, with interest from January 1 of the year in which the minimum obligation was first due until the date the payment is paid at a rate equal to the interest assumption used for the actuarial valuation report or the discount rate applicable to treasury bills issued by the Department of Treasury of the United States with a six month maturity as of the last business day in December of the plan year in which the obligation was due, whichever is greater, expressed as a monthly rate and compounded monthly.

<u>Cause</u>: Plan officials did not comply with the Act 205 requirements due to insufficient municipal funds being available to pay the full amount of the MMO due to the plan.

<u>Effect</u>: The failure to fully pay the MMO could result in the plan not having adequate resources to meet current and future benefit obligations to its members.

Due to the municipality's failure to fully pay the 2013 MMO by the December 31, 2013, deadline, the municipality must add the 2013 MMO balance to the current year's MMO and include interest, as required by Act 205.

#### CHESWICK BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

#### **Finding - (Continued)**

Furthermore, the borough's future state aid allocations may be withheld until the finding recommendation is complied with.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the municipality pay the MMO balance due to the non-uniformed pension plan for the year 2013, with interest, in accordance with Section 302(e) of Act 205. A copy of the interest calculation must be submitted to this Department along with evidence of payment of the MMO balance.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u> The borough's compliance with the finding recommendation will be monitored subsequent to the release of the audit report and through our next audit of the pension plan.

## CHESWICK BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN POTENTIAL WITHHOLD OF STATE AID

A condition such as that reported by the finding contained in this audit report may lead to a total withholding of state aid in the future unless that finding is corrected. However, such action will not be considered if sufficient written documentation is provided to verify compliance with this department's recommendation. Such documentation should be submitted to: Department of the Auditor General, Bureau of Municipal Pension & VFRA Audits, 316-D Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120.

#### CHESWICK BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

#### SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2007, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
						Unfunded
			Unfunded			(Assets in
		Actuarial	(Assets in			Excess of)
		Accrued	Excess of)			Actuarial
	Actuarial	Liability	Actuarial			Accrued
Actuarial	Value of	(AAL) -	Accrued	Funded	Covered	Liability as a %
Valuation	Assets	Entry Age	Liability	Ratio	Payroll	of Payroll
Date	(a)	(b)	(b) - (a)	(a)/(b)	(c)	[(b-a)/(c)]
01-01-07	\$ 527,626	\$ 504,112	\$ (23,514)	104.7%	\$ 126,147	(18.6%)
01-01-09	495,925	777,077	281,152	63.8%	142,544	197.2%
01-01-11	601,691	898,413	296,722	67.0%	154,971	191.5%

Note: The market value of the plan's assets at 01-01-09 has been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses subject to a corridor between 70 and 130 percent of the market value of assets. The market value of the plan's assets at 01-01-11 has been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 5-year averaging period. These methods will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

#### CHESWICK BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

Trends in unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability and annual covered payroll are both affected by inflation. Expressing the unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability as a percentage of annual covered payroll (Column 6) approximately adjusts for the effects of inflation and aids analysis of the plan's progress made in accumulating sufficient assets to pay benefits when due. Generally, where there is an unfunded actuarial accrued liability, the smaller this percentage, the stronger the plan. When assets are in excess of the actuarial accrued liability, the higher the bracketed percentage, the stronger the plan.

## CHESWICK BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

## SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2007	\$ 39,304	100.0%
2008	23,124	103.0%
2009	24,045	104.8%
2010	64,232	100.0%
2011	55,828	100.0%
2012	66,699	100.6%

#### CHESWICK BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the required supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date January 1, 2011

Actuarial cost method Entry age normal

Amortization method Level dollar, closed

Remaining amortization period 11 years

Asset valuation method Fair value -5 year smoothing

Actuarial assumptions:

Investment rate of return 8.0%

Projected salary increases 5.0%

Cost-of-living adjustments 3.0%

#### CHESWICK BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom Corbett Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Cheswick Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan Allegheny County 220 South Atlantic Avenue Cheswick, PA 15024

The Honorable Daniel Carroll Mayor

Mr. Paul Jack Council President

Mr. Andrew R. Bock Secretary

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at <a href="www.auditorgen.state.pa.us">www.auditorgen.state.pa.us</a>. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@auditorgen.state.pa.us.