

# COMPLIANCE AUDIT

---

## Dalton Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan Lackawanna County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2011 to December 31, 2013

---

April 2015



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General  
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018  
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General  
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen  
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE  
AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council  
Dalton Borough  
Lackawanna County  
Dalton, PA 18414

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Dalton Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2011 to December 31, 2013. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements for the 2014 year when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- × We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.
- × We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.

- × We determined that there were no employee contributions required by the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations for the years covered by our audit period.
- × We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for the plan member who retired during the current audit period represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefit due to the retired individual and comparing this amount to supporting documentation evidencing the amount determined and actually paid to the recipient.
- × We determined whether the January 1, 2011 and January 1, 2013 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2012 and 2014, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.
- × We determined whether the terms of the contractual agreement with the Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement System were in accordance with the plan's governing document, if separately stated, and applicable laws and regulations by comparing the terms of the contractual agreement with the plan's governing document, if separately stated, and applicable laws and regulations.

Dalton Borough contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for annual audits of its financial statements prepared in conformity with the accounting practices prescribed or permitted by the Department of Community and Economic Development of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, which are available at the borough's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

The Dalton Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan participates in the Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement System (PMRS), which is an agent multiple-employer public employee retirement system that acts as a common investment and administrative agent for participating municipal pension plans. PMRS issues a separate Comprehensive Annual Financial Report, copies of which are available from the PMRS accounting office. PMRS's financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Dalton Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the borough's internal controls as they relate to the borough's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our tests indicated that, in all significant respects, the Dalton Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following finding further discussed later in this report:

Finding – Failure To Properly Determine And Fully Pay The Minimum  
Municipal Obligation Of The Plan

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Dalton Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.



EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE  
Auditor General

March 19, 2015

# CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background .....	1
Finding and Recommendation:	
Finding – Failure To Properly Determine And Fully Pay The Minimum Municipal Obligation Of The Plan .....	3
Supplementary Information .....	5
Report Distribution List .....	9

## BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Dalton Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 15 - Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement Law, Act of February 1, 1974  
(P.L. 34, No. 15), as amended, 53 P.S. § 881.101 et seq.

The Dalton Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 5, adopted pursuant to Act 15. The plan was established January 1, 1999. Active members are not required to contribute to the plan. As of December 31, 2013, the plan had 3 active members, 2 terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 1 retiree receiving benefits funded through annuities purchased with plan assets.

## **BACKGROUND – (Continued)**

As of December 31, 2013, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

### Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	Available upon attainment of age 60.
Early Retirement	A voluntary early retirement available after 20 years of service. An involuntary early retirement is available after 8 years of service.
Vesting	A member is 100% vested after 5 years of service.

### Retirement Benefit:

Benefit equals 1.5% times credited service times Final Average Salary (FAS). FAS based upon last 3 years annualized salary.

### Survivor Benefit:

If eligible to retire at the time of death, beneficiary receives present value of accrued benefit. At retirement, member may select a survivor benefit.

### Disability Benefit:

Service Related	A 50% disability benefit is provided to a member who is unable to perform gainful employment regardless of age or service, offset by available Workers' Compensation benefits.
Non-service Related	A 30% disability benefit is provided to a member who has at least 10 years of service and who is unable to perform gainful employment.

DALTON BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN  
FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

**Finding – Failure To Properly Determine And Fully Pay The Minimum Municipal Obligation Of The Plan**

Condition: Plan officials did not properly determine and fully pay the minimum municipal obligation (MMO) of the non-uniformed pension plan for the years 2013 and 2014, as required by Act 205. The MMO calculation made by the municipality contained payroll amounts that were understated payroll by \$18,065 in 2013 and \$31,285 in 2014, which resulted in an understated MMO. Based upon an estimate prepared by this department, the municipality had unpaid MMO balances of \$1,652 and \$2,935 for the years 2013 and 2014, respectively.

Criteria: With regard to the MMO, Section 302(c) of Act 205 states, in part:

Annually, the chief administrative officer of the pension plan shall determine the minimum obligation of the municipality with respect to the pension plan for the following plan year.

With regard to the payroll estimate used in the preparation of the MMO, the Pennsylvania Code, Title 16, Section 204.1(c)(1) states, in part:

The payroll used in determining the minimum municipal obligation of a pension plan under section 302(c) of the act shall be based on the payroll to be reported on the Internal Revenue Service Form W-2 and shall be calculated as the total payroll for active members of the plan as of the date of the determination, plus the payroll for the same active members of the plan projected to the year's end using the payroll rates in effect as of the date of the determination.

Section 302(d) of Act 205 states, in part:

The minimum obligation of the municipality shall be payable to the pension plan from the revenue of the municipality.



DALTON BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN  
FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

**Finding – (Continued)**

Furthermore, Section 302(e) of Act 205 states:

Any amount of the minimum obligation of the municipality which remains unpaid as of December 31 of the year in which the minimum obligation is due shall be added to the minimum obligation of the municipality for the following year, with interest from January 1 of the year in which the minimum obligation was first due until the date the payment is paid at a rate equal to the interest assumption used for the actuarial valuation report or the discount rate applicable to treasury bills issued by the Department of Treasury of the United States with a six-month maturity as of the last business day in December of the plan year in which the obligation was due, whichever is greater, expressed as a monthly rate and compounded monthly.

Cause: Plan officials failed to establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the plan's MMOs were properly determined and fully paid in accordance with Act 205 requirements.

Effect: The proper determination of the plan's MMO ensures plan officials can properly allocate the necessary resources to the pension plan for the upcoming year. The failure to fully pay the MMO could result in the plan not having adequate resources to meet current and future benefit obligations to its members.

Due to the municipality's failure to fully pay the 2013 and 2014 MMOs by the December 31, deadlines, the municipality must add the 2013 and 2014 MMO balances to the current year's MMO and include interest, as required by Act 205.

Recommendation: We recommend that the municipality pay the MMO due to the non-uniformed pension plan for the years 2013 and 2014, with interest, in accordance with Section 302(e) of Act 205. A copy of the interest calculation must be maintained by the borough for examination during our next audit of the plan.

Furthermore, we recommend that plan officials establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure that future MMOs are determined and paid in accordance with Act 205 requirements.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification throughout our next audit.

DALTON BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN  
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2009, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)	Covered Payroll (c)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability as a % of Payroll [(b-a)/(c)]
01-01-09	\$ 181,296	\$ 174,140	\$ (7,156)	104.1%	\$ 78,622	(9.1%)
01-01-11	222,394	220,271	(2,123)	101.0%	85,886	(2.5%)
01-01-13	249,376	255,938	6,562	97.4%	60,089	10.9%

DALTON BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

Trends in unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability and annual covered payroll are both affected by inflation. Expressing the unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability as a percentage of annual covered payroll (Column 6) approximately adjusts for the effects of inflation and aids analysis of the plan's progress made in accumulating sufficient assets to pay benefits when due. Generally, where there is an unfunded actuarial accrued liability, the smaller this percentage, the stronger the plan. When assets are in excess of the actuarial accrued liability, the higher the bracketed percentage, the stronger the plan.

DALTON BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER  
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2008	\$ 12,348	100.0%
2009	8,777	100.0%
2010	9,466	100.0%
2011	9,196	100.0%
2012	9,071	100.0%
2013	7,171	77.0%*

\* Refer to the Finding in this audit report.

DALTON BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN  
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
 NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES  
 (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the required supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2013
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar
Remaining amortization period	14 years
Asset valuation method	Fair value
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	5.5%, net of expenses
Projected salary increases *	Age-related scale for merit/ seniority (e.g. age 30 - 6.4%; age 40 - 5.0%; age 50 - 4.1%; age 60 - 3.7%)
Cost-of-living adjustments	3.0%, where applicable

\* Includes inflation at 3.0%

DALTON BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN  
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf  
Governor  
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Dalton Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan  
Lackawanna County  
105 West Main Street  
P.O. Box 95  
Dalton, PA 18414

The Honorable Aaron Holzman      Mayor

Dr. Gus Vlassis      Council President

Ms. Joanne Davies      Chief Administrative Officer

Ms. Kristine M. Cline      Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement System

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at [www.PaAuditor.gov](http://www.PaAuditor.gov). Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: [news@PaAuditor.gov](mailto:news@PaAuditor.gov).