

COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Municipality of Penn Hills Police Pension Plan Allegheny County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2011 to December 31, 2013

May 2015



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Municipal Council
Municipality of Penn Hills
Allegheny County
Penn Hills, PA 15235

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Municipality of Penn Hills Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2011 to December 31, 2013. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to the audit period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform our audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The objectives of the audit were:

1. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report; and
2. To determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report, we inquired of plan officials and evaluated supporting documentation provided by officials evidencing that the suggested corrective action has been appropriately taken. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- × We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.

- × We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.
- × We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- × We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for all 6 of the plan members who retired during the current audit period, and through the completion of our fieldwork procedures, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefit due to retired individuals and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to recipients.
- × We determined whether the January 1, 2011 and January 1, 2013 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2012 and 2014, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program, by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.
- × We determined whether all annual special ad hoc postretirement reimbursements received by the municipality were authorized and appropriately deposited in accordance with Act 147 by tracing information to supporting documentation maintained by plan officials.
- × We determined whether refunds made to plan members were authorized in accordance with plan provisions and applicable laws and regulations by testing all of the refunds disbursed to plan members during the current audit period.

We determined whether the terms and methodologies of the issuance of pension obligation bonds by the municipality, and any restrictions were in compliance with plan provisions and Act 205 through inquiry of plan officials and examination of supporting documentation for pension obligation bonds issued during the current audit period and through the completion of our fieldwork procedures.

The Municipality of Penn Hills contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for annual audits of its basic financial statements which are available at the municipality's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Municipal officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Municipality of Penn Hills Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the Municipality's internal controls as they relate to the Municipality's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objectives, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally, and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Municipality of Penn Hills Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

As previously noted, one of the objectives of our audit of the Municipality of Penn Hills Police Pension Plan was to determine compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. Act 205 was amended on September 18, 2009, through the adoption of Act 44 of 2009. Among several provisions relating to municipal pension plans, the act provides for the implementation of a distress recovery program. Three levels of distress have been established:

<u>Level</u>	<u>Indication</u>	<u>Funding Criteria</u>
I	Minimal distress	70-89%
II	Moderate distress	50-69%
III	Severe distress	Less than 50%

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it. However, we are extremely concerned about the funded status of the plan contained in the schedule of funding progress included in this report which indicates a decline of assets available to satisfy the long-term liabilities of the plan. **For example, the plan's funded ratio went from 74.9% as of January 1, 2009, to a ratio of 61.0% as of January 1, 2013**, which is the most recent data available. Based on this information, and the funding status of the municipality's non-uniformed pension plan, the Public Employee Retirement Commission issued a notification that the municipality is currently in Level II moderate distress status. We encourage municipal officials to monitor the funding of the police pension plan to ensure its long-term financial stability.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of the Municipality of Penn Hills and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank municipal officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

May 5, 2015

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Eugene A. DePasquale". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke at the end.

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background	1
Status of Prior Finding	3
Supplementary Information	4
Report Distribution List	8

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Municipality of Penn Hills Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

- Act 147 - Special Ad Hoc Municipal Police and Firefighter Postretirement Adjustment Act, Act of December 14, 1988 (P.L. 1192, No. 147), as amended, 53 P.S. § 896.101 et seq.
- Act 600 - Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 761 et seq.

The Municipality of Penn Hills Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 2010-2526, effective October 18, 2010, adopted pursuant to Act 600. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the municipality and its police officers. The plan was established October 1, 1957. Active members are required to contribute 5 percent of compensation to the plan. As of December 31, 2013, the plan had 44 active members, 1 terminated member eligible for vested benefits in the future, 61 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2013, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	Age 50 and 25 years of service. If hired prior to 1/1/2001 may retire at age 60 and 20 years of service.
Early Retirement	None
Vesting	A member is 100% vested after 12 years of service. If hired prior to 1/1/2001, 100% vested after 15 years of service.

Retirement Benefit:

A monthly benefit equal to 50% of gross pay averaged over the 36 months of employment that produce the greatest average (final 36 months if hired on or after 1/24/2001) plus a monthly service increment of 2% of final monthly average salary for each year in excess of 25 years, up to a maximum of 10%. If hired on or after 1/24/2001, the maximum monthly increment is \$100.

Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility	Refund of member contributions plus interest.
After Retirement Eligibility	A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension the member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the day of the member's death. After retirement: The form of benefit payment elected at retirement. If hired on or after 1/24/2001, same as after retirement eligibility.

Service Related Disability Benefit:

For total and permanent disability, a monthly benefit equal to 50% of the participant's average salary for the 12 months prior to disablement/retirement, offset by Social Security disability benefits received for the same injury.

MUNICIPALITY OF PENN HILLS POLICE PENSION PLAN
STATUS OF PRIOR FINDING

Compliance With Prior Audit Recommendation

The Municipality of Penn Hills has complied with the prior audit recommendation concerning the following:

- Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Underpayment Of State Aid

During the current audit period, municipal officials complied with the instructions that accompany Certification Form AG 385 and accurately reported the required pension data.

MUNICIPALITY OF PENN HILLS POLICE PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2009, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)	Covered Payroll (c)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability as a % of Payroll [(b-a)/(c)]
01-01-09	\$26,425,956	\$ 35,300,222	\$ 8,874,266	74.9%	\$ 4,006,565	221.5%
01-01-11	26,353,115	42,340,778	15,987,663	62.2%	4,045,452	395.2%
01-01-13	27,753,121	45,512,687	17,759,566	61.0%	4,301,148	413.0%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-09, 01-01-11 and 01-01-13 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 4-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

MUNICIPALITY OF PENN HILLS POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

Trends in unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability and annual covered payroll are both affected by inflation. Expressing the unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability as a percentage of annual covered payroll (Column 6) approximately adjusts for the effects of inflation and aids analysis of the plan's progress made in accumulating sufficient assets to pay benefits when due. Generally, where there is an unfunded actuarial accrued liability, the smaller this percentage, the stronger the plan. When assets are in excess of the actuarial accrued liability, the higher the bracketed percentage, the stronger the plan.

MUNICIPALITY OF PENN HILLS POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2008	\$ 870,804	100.0%
2009	998,064	100.0%
2010	935,287	100.0%
2011	1,465,874	100.0%
2012	1,488,646	100.0%
2013	2,341,449	100.0%

MUNICIPALITY OF PENN HILLS POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the required supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2013
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar, closed
Remaining amortization period	13 years
Asset valuation method	Fair value, 4-year smoothing
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	7.5%
Projected salary increases *	4.5%
Cost-of-living adjustments	3.0%

* Includes inflation at 3.0%

MUNICIPALITY OF PENN HILLS POLICE PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Municipality of Penn Hills Police Pension Plan
Allegheny County
12245 Frankstown Road
Penn Hills, PA 15235

The Honorable Anthony L. Deluca	Mayor
Mr. Mohammed F. Rayan	Municipal Manager
Mr. Edward P. Schrecengost	Finance Director

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.