

# COMPLIANCE AUDIT

---

## City of Beaver Falls Employees' Pension Plan Beaver County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2013

---

May 2015



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General  
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018  
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General  
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen  
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE  
AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and City Council  
City of Beaver Falls  
Beaver County  
Beaver Falls, PA 15010

We have conducted a compliance audit of the City of Beaver Falls Employees' Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2013. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform our audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The objectives of the audit were:

1. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report; and
2. To determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report, we inquired of plan officials and evaluated supporting documentation provided by officials evidencing that the suggested corrective action has been appropriately taken. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- × We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.

- × We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.
- × We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- × We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for all three of the plan members who retired during the current audit period, and through the completion of our fieldwork procedures represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefit due to retired individuals and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to recipients.
- × We determined whether the January 1, 2011 and January 1, 2013 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2012 and 2014, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program, by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.
- × We determined whether the pension plan is in compliance with Act 205 for distressed municipalities through inquiry of plan officials and evaluation of the recovery remedies implemented during the audit period and through the completion of our fieldwork procedures.

The City of Beaver Falls contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for annual audits of its basic financial statements which are available at the city's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

City officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the City of Beaver Falls Employees' Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the city's internal controls as they relate to the city's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objectives, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the City of Beaver Falls Employees' Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following finding further discussed later in this report:

Finding – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Underpayment Of State Aid

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of the City of Beaver Falls and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report.

April 8, 2015



EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE  
Auditor General

## CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background .....	1
Status of Prior Findings .....	3
Finding and Recommendation:	
Finding – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Underpayment Of State Aid .....	4
Supplementary Information .....	5
Report Distribution List .....	9

## BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the City of Beaver Falls Employees' Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 205 - Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act, Act of December 18, 1984 (P.L. 1005, No. 205), as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.

Act 317 - The Third Class City Code, Act of June 23, 1931 (P.L. 932, No. 317), as amended, 53 P.S. § 35101 et seq.

The City of Beaver Falls Employees' Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 1101, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 317. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the city and its employees. The plan was established January 1, 1960. Active members are required to contribute 5 percent of members' wages to the plan. As of December 31, 2013, the plan had 29 active members, no terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 14 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

## **BACKGROUND – (Continued)**

As of December 31, 2013, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

### Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	Age 60 and 20 years of service.
Early Retirement	None
Vesting	A member is 100% vested after 12 years of service.

### Retirement Benefit:

Benefit equals 50% of highest 60 months average salary.

### Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility	Refund of member contributions.
After Retirement Eligibility	A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension the member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the day of the member's death.

### Service Related Disability Benefit:

After the completion of 10 years of service, but prior to normal retirement age, 50% of the member's salary at the time the disability was incurred.

CITY OF BEAVER FALLS EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN  
STATUS OF PRIOR FINDINGS

Compliance With Prior Audit Recommendations

The City of Beaver Falls has complied with the prior audit recommendations concerning the following:

- Failure To Aggregate Pension Funds Pursuant To Act 44 Provisions

City officials implemented the mandatory aggregation remedy contained in Act 44 of 2009 during the year 2013.

- Failure To Fully Pay The Minimum Municipal Obligation

City officials paid the outstanding minimum municipal obligation due to the pension plan for the year 2009 in accordance with Act 205 requirements.



CITY OF BEAVER FALLS EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN  
FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

**Finding - Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Underpayment Of State Aid**

Condition: The city failed to certify one eligible non-uniformed employee (one unit) on the Certification Form AG 385 filed in 2014. The data contained on this certification form is based on prior calendar year information.

Criteria: Pursuant to Act 205, at Section 402(e)(2), an employee who has been employed on a full-time basis for at least six consecutive months and has been participating in a pension plan during the certification year is eligible for certification.

Cause: Plan officials failed to establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the accuracy of the data certified.

Effect: The data submitted on this certification form is used, in part, to calculate the state aid due to the municipality for distribution to its pension plans. Because the city's state aid allocation was based on unit value, the city received an underpayment of state aid of \$3,873 as identified below:

Year	Units Understated	Unit Value	State Aid Underpayment
2014	1	\$ 3,873	\$ 3,873

Although the city will be reimbursed for the underpayment of state aid due to the city's certification error, the full amount of the 2014 state aid allocation was not available to be deposited timely and therefore was not available to pay operating expenses or for investment.

Recommendation: We recommend that in the future, plan officials establish adequate internal control procedures, such as having at least 2 people review the data certified, to ensure compliance with the instructions that accompany Certification Form AG 385 to assist them in accurately reporting the required pension data.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

CITY OF BEAVER FALLS EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN  
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2009, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)	Covered Payroll (c)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability as a % of Payroll [(b-a)/(c)]
01-01-09	\$ 3,141,986	\$ 4,883,006	\$ 1,741,020	64.3%	\$ 860,392	202.4%
01-01-11	3,760,399	5,467,782	1,707,383	68.8%	986,354	173.1%
01-01-13	4,510,808	5,840,087	1,329,279	77.2%	1,103,070	120.5%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-09, 01-01-11 and 01-01-13 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 4-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

CITY OF BEAVER FALLS EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

Trends in unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability and annual covered payroll are both affected by inflation. Expressing the unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability as a percentage of annual covered payroll (Column 6) approximately adjusts for the effects of inflation and aids analysis of the plan's progress made in accumulating sufficient assets to pay benefits when due. Generally, where there is an unfunded actuarial accrued liability, the smaller this percentage, the stronger the plan. When assets are in excess of the actuarial accrued liability, the higher the bracketed percentage, the stronger the plan.

CITY OF BEAVER FALLS EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER  
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2008	\$ 272,116	100.0%
2009	242,102	100.0%
2010	172,285	137.7%
2011	232,170	100.0%
2012	254,007	126.7%
2013	302,010	129.5%

CITY OF BEAVER FALLS EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES  
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the required supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2013
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar, closed
Remaining amortization period	19 years
Asset valuation method	Fair value, 4-year smoothing
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	7.0%
Projected salary increases	5.0%

CITY OF BEAVER FALLS EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN  
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf  
Governor  
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

City of Beaver Falls Employees' Pension Plan  
Beaver County  
715 Fifteenth Street  
Beaver Falls, PA 15010

The Honorable George S. Quay, III	Mayor
Mr. Stephen L. Johnson	City Manager
Ms. Paula J. Burdine	City Clerk

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at [www.PaAuditor.gov](http://www.PaAuditor.gov). Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: [news@PaAuditor.gov](mailto:news@PaAuditor.gov).