

# COMPLIANCE AUDIT

---

## City of Monessen Police Pension Plan Westmoreland County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2014

---

May 2015



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General  
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018  
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General  
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen  
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE  
AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and City Council  
City of Monessen  
Westmoreland County  
Monessen, PA 15062

We have conducted a compliance audit of the City of Monessen Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2014. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- × We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.
- × We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.

- × We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- × We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for all 4 of the plan members who retired during the current audit period, and through the completion of our fieldwork procedures, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefit due to retired individuals and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to recipients.
- × We determined whether the January 1, 2011 and January 1, 2013 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2012 and 2014, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program, by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.
- × We determined whether all annual special ad hoc postretirement reimbursements received by the municipality were authorized and appropriately deposited in accordance with Act 147 by tracing information to supporting documentation maintained by plan officials.
- × We determined whether transfers were properly authorized, timely, and appropriately recorded by plan officials by examining supporting documentation for all \$3,813,873 of the transfers made during the audit period.

The City of Monessen contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for the audits of its 2012 and 2013 basic financial statements which are available at the city's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

City officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the City of Monessen Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the city's internal controls as they relate to the city's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally, and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical

procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the City of Monessen Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following finding further discussed later in this report:

Finding – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 64 Resulting In An Excess Reimbursement For Special 2002 Ad Hoc Postretirement Adjustment

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of the City of Monessen and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank city officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

May 6, 2015



EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE  
Auditor General

## CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background .....	1
Finding and Recommendation:	
Finding – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 64 Resulting In An Excess Reimbursement For Special 2002 Ad Hoc Postretirement Adjustment .....	4
Supplementary Information .....	6
Report Distribution List .....	10

## BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the City of Monessen Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

- Act 147 - Special Ad Hoc Municipal Police and Firefighter Postretirement Adjustment Act, Act of December 14, 1988 (P.L. 1192, No. 147), as amended, 53 P.S. § 896.101 et seq.
- Act 317 - The Third Class City Code, Act of June 23, 1931 (P.L. 932, No. 317), as amended, 53 P.S. § 35101 et seq.

The City of Monessen Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance 6 of 2000, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 317. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the city and its police officers. The plan was established February 28, 1945. Active members are required to contribute 4.5 percent of their base salary plus \$12 a year for service increments to the plan. As of December 31, 2014, the plan had 10 active members, no terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 21 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

## **BACKGROUND – (Continued)**

As of December 31, 2014, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

### Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	Age 50 and 20 years of service.
Early Retirement	None
Vesting	A member is 100% vested after 12 years of service.

### Retirement Benefit:

A monthly benefit equal to 50% of average compensation at retirement, plus a monthly service increment of 1/40 of normal retirement benefit for each year of service in excess of 20 years, up to a maximum increment of \$100 per month.

### Survivor Benefit:

Killed in Service:	A monthly benefit equal to 50% of average compensation is payable to spouse until death. Upon death of spouse (or no spouse is alive when participant dies), each of the participant's dependent children will receive an equal share of the benefit until age 18.
--------------------	--

Non-Service Related Death Before 10 Years of Service:	A monthly benefit equal to 25% of average compensation, payable to spouse until the youngest child attains age 18, then the benefit drops to ½ of that amount, and is payable until the spouse's death. If the spouse dies prior to the youngest child attaining 18, the children will share the 25% of average compensation benefit until the youngest attains age 18, at which time no further benefits will be payable.
--	--

Non-Service Related Death After 10 Years of Service but Before Retirement Eligibility:	Same as before 10 years of service, but monthly benefit is 50% of average compensation.
--	---

## **BACKGROUND – (Continued)**

### Survivor Benefit – (Continued):

Non-Service Related Death  
After Retirement Eligibility: A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension the participant was receiving or entitled to receive on the day of death is payable to the spouse for life. Upon death of spouse, each of the participant's dependent children will receive an equal share of the benefit until age 18.

### Service Related Disability Benefit:

For total and permanent disablement, a monthly benefit equal to 50% of average compensation is payable.

### Non-Service Related Disability Benefit:

After completion of 10 years of service, a monthly benefit equal to 50% of compensation is payable. Prior to the completion of 10 years of service, 25% of compensation is payable.

CITY OF MONESSEN POLICE PENSION PLAN  
FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

**Finding – Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 64 Resulting In An Excess Reimbursement For Special 2002 Ad Hoc Postretirement Adjustment**

Condition: The City of Monessen overstated the total non-employee contributions made to all pension plans on the Certification Form AG 64 filed for 2013, resulting in an excess reimbursement for the special 2002 special ad hoc postretirement adjustment.

Criteria: Section 502.1(a)(2) of Act 147 states, in part:

The determination of the reimbursable amount of the amortization contribution requirement attributable to the special ad hoc postretirement adjustment under Chapter 4 in any year shall be calculated as the amortization contribution requirement attributable to the special ad hoc postretirement adjustments under Chapter 4 and reflected in the determination of the financial requirements of the pension plan under Chapter 3 of the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act for the immediate prior year less the product of that amortization contribution requirement multiplied by the ratio of the amount of general municipal pension system State aid allocated to the retirement system in the immediate prior year to the total amount of municipal contributions made to the retirement system from all sources other than employee contributions in the immediate prior year. (Emphasis added)

Cause: Plan officials failed to comply with the instructions that accompany Certification Form AG 64.

Effect: The data submitted on this certification form is used to calculate the reimbursement due the city for ad hoc postretirement adjustments granted pursuant to Chapter 4 of Act 147. The effect of the incorrect certification of pension data on the city's reimbursement is identified below:

<u>Reimbursement Claimed</u>	<u>Reimbursement Due</u>	<u>Excess Reimbursement</u>
\$ 4,063	\$ 3,943	\$ 120

CITY OF MONESSEN POLICE PENSION PLAN  
FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

**Finding – (Continued)**

Recommendation: We recommend that the total excess reimbursement, in the amount of \$120, be returned to the Commonwealth. A check in this amount, with interest compounded annually from date of receipt to date of repayment, at a rate earned by the pension plan, should be made payable to: Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and mailed to: Department of the Auditor General, Municipal Pension & Fire Relief Programs Unit, 320 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120. A copy of the interest calculation must be submitted along with the check.

We also recommend that in the future, plan officials establish adequate internal control procedures, such as having at least 2 people review the data certified, to ensure compliance with the instructions that accompany Certification Form AG 64 to assist them in accurately reporting the required pension data.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be evaluated during our next audit of the plan.

CITY OF MONESSEN POLICE PENSION PLAN  
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2009, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)	Covered Payroll (c)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability as a % of Payroll [(b-a)/(c)]
01-01-09	\$ 2,974,633	\$ 4,404,911	\$ 1,430,278	67.5%	\$ 631,214	226.6%
01-01-11	3,353,874	4,693,620	1,339,746	71.5%	668,759	200.3%
01-01-13	3,581,611	4,967,729	1,386,118	72.1%	724,727	191.3%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-09, 01-01-11 and 01-01-13 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 4-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

CITY OF MONESSEN POLICE PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

Trends in unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability and annual covered payroll are both affected by inflation. Expressing the unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability as a percentage of annual covered payroll (Column 6) approximately adjusts for the effects of inflation and aids analysis of the plan's progress made in accumulating sufficient assets to pay benefits when due. Generally, where there is an unfunded actuarial accrued liability, the smaller this percentage, the stronger the plan. When assets are in excess of the actuarial accrued liability, the higher the bracketed percentage, the stronger the plan.

CITY OF MONESSEN POLICE PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER  
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2009	\$ 248,740	100.0%
2010	238,973	100.0%
2011	236,266	100.0%
2012	245,854	100.0%
2013	292,522	100.0%
2014	276,090	100.0%

CITY OF MONESSEN POLICE PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES  
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the required supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2013
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar, open
Remaining amortization period	14 years
Asset valuation method	Fair value, 4-year smoothing
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	7.5%
Projected salary increases *	5.0%

\* Includes inflation at 3.0%

CITY OF MONESSEN POLICE PENSION PLAN  
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf  
Governor  
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

City of Monessen Police Pension Plan  
Westmoreland County  
1 Wendell Ramey Lane, Suite 400  
Monessen, PA 15062

The Honorable Louis Mavrakis      Mayor

Ms. Holly L. Minno                      City Clerk

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at [www.PaAuditor.gov](http://www.PaAuditor.gov). Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: [news@PaAuditor.gov](mailto:news@PaAuditor.gov).