

COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Aldan Borough Police Pension Plan Delaware County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2014

June 2015



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council
Aldan Borough
Delaware County
Aldan, PA 19018

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Aldan Borough Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2014. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform our audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The objectives of the audit were:

1. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report; and
2. To determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report, we inquired of plan officials and evaluated supporting documentation provided by officials evidencing that the suggested corrective action has been appropriately taken. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- × We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.

- × We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.
- × We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- × We determined that there were no benefit calculations prepared for the years covered by our audit period.
- × We determined whether the January 1, 2011 and January 1, 2013 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2012 and 2014, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.
- × We determined whether all annual special ad hoc postretirement reimbursements received by the municipality were authorized and appropriately deposited in accordance with Act 147 by tracing information to supporting documentation maintained by plan officials.
- × We determined whether transfers were properly authorized, timely, and appropriately recorded by plan officials by examining supporting documentation for all of the transfers made during the audit period.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Aldan Borough Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the borough's internal controls as they relate to the borough's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objectives, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Aldan Borough Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following findings further discussed later in this report:

Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance To Prior Audit Recommendation- Collective Bargaining Agreement Contains An Unauthorized Non-service Related Disability Benefit Provision.

Finding No. 2 – Inconsistent Pension Benefits

Finding No. 1 contained in this audit report repeats a condition that was cited in our previous audit report that have not been corrected by borough officials. We are concerned by the borough's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendation noted in this audit report.

As previously noted, one of the objectives of our audit of the Aldan Borough Police Pension Plan was to determine compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. Act 205 was amended on September 18, 2009, through the adoption of Act 44 of 2009. Among several provisions relating to municipal pension plans, the act provides for the implementation of a distress recovery program. Three levels of distress have been established:

<u>Level</u>	<u>Indication</u>	<u>Funding Criteria</u>
I	Minimal distress	70-89%
II	Moderate distress	50-69%
III	Severe distress	Less than 50%

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it. However, we are extremely concerned about the historical trend information contained in the schedule of funding progress included in this report which indicates a continued decline of assets available to satisfy the long-term liabilities of the plan. **The plan's funded ratio went from 74.0% as of January 1, 2011, to a ratio of 63.7% as of January 1, 2013**, which is the most recent data available. **Based on this information, the Public Employee Retirement Commission issued a notification that the borough is currently in Level II moderate distress status.** We encourage borough officials to monitor the funding of the police pension plan to ensure its long-term financial stability.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Aldan Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.



EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

May 14, 2015

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background	1
Status of Prior Findings	3
Findings and Recommendations:	
Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation –Collective Bargaining Agreement Contains An Unauthorized Non-Service Related Disability Benefit Provision.....	4
Finding No. 2 – Inconsistent Pension Benefits	5
Supplementary Information	7
Report Distribution List	11

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Aldan Borough Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

- Act 147 - Special Ad Hoc Municipal Police and Firefighter Postretirement Adjustment Act, Act of December 14, 1988 (P.L. 1192, No. 147), as amended, 53 P.S. § 896.101 et seq.
- Act 600 - Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 761 et seq.

The Aldan Borough Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 437, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 600. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the borough and its police officers. The plan was established December 18, 1959. Active members are required to contribute 5 percent of salary to the plan. As of December 31, 2014, the plan had 5 active members, no terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 5 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2014, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	Age 50 and 25 years of service
Early Retirement	None
Vesting	100% after 12 years of service

Retirement Benefit:

50% of final 36 months average salary, plus a service increment of \$100 per month for each year of service in excess of 25 years, up to a maximum of \$500 per month.

Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility	Refund of member contributions plus interest.
After Retirement Eligibility	A monthly benefit equal to 100% of the pension the member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the day of the member's death.

Service Related Disability Benefit:

70% of the member's salary at the time the disability was incurred, offset by Social Security disability benefits received for the same injury.

ALDAN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
STATUS OF PRIOR FINDINGS

Compliance With Prior Audit Recommendation

Aldan Borough has complied with the prior audit recommendation concerning the following:

- Late Filing Of Actuarial Valuation Report

Plan officials developed and implemented adequate internal control procedures to ensure that the actuarial valuation reports valued January 1, 2011 and January 1, 2013 were prepared and filed timely in accordance with Act 205 requirements.

Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation

Aldan Borough has not complied with the prior audit recommendation concerning the following as further discussed in the Findings and Recommendations section of this report:

- Collective Bargaining Agreement Contains An Unauthorized Non-Service Related Disability Benefit Provision

ALDAN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Collective Bargaining Agreement Contains An Unauthorized Non-Service Related Disability Benefit Provision

Condition: As disclosed in the prior audit report, Section 2 of Article 14 of the collective bargaining agreement between the borough and its police officers for calendar years 2011 through 2015 contains a provision for the payment of a non-service-related disability benefit which is not authorized by Act 600.

Criteria: Regarding disability benefits, Section 5(e)(1) of Act 600 states:

In the case of the payment of pensions for permanent injuries incurred in service, the amount and commencement of the payments shall be fixed by regulations of the governing body of the borough, town, township or regional police department and shall be calculated at a rate no less than fifty per centum of the member's salary at the time the disability was incurred, provided that any member who receives benefits for the same injuries under the Social Security Act (49 Stat. 620, 42 U.S.C. § 301 et. seq.) shall have his disability benefits offset or reduced by the amount of such benefits. (Emphasis added)

Furthermore, the Supreme Court of Pennsylvania in *Chirico v. Board of Supervisors for Newtown Township*, 518 Pa. 572, 544A.2d 1313 (1988) held that Act 600 does not provide for the payment of pension benefits for non-service related injuries.

Cause: Plan officials were unable to remove this provision because the collective bargaining agreement has not been renegotiated since our last report.

Effect: Providing unauthorized pension benefits increases the plan's pension costs and reduces the amount of funds available for investment purposes or for the payment of authorized benefits or administrative expenses. Since the borough received state aid based on unit value during the current audit period, it did not receive state aid allocations attributable to the excess pension benefits provided. However, in the future, the increased costs to the pension plan as a result of the excess pension benefits could result in the receipt of excess state aid and increase the municipal contributions necessary to fund the plan in accordance with Act 205 funding standards.

ALDAN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – (Continued)

Recommendation: We again recommend that the borough comply with Act 600 upon the renewal, extension, or renegotiation of the collective bargaining agreement. To the extent that the borough is not in compliance with Act 600 and/or is contractually obligated to pay non-service-related disability benefits, the cost of the unauthorized benefits must be reflected in the Act 205 actuarial valuation reports for the plan and funded in accordance with Act 205 funding standards. Furthermore, such benefits will be deemed ineligible for funding with state pension aid. In such case, the plan’s actuary may be required to determine the impact, if any, of the unauthorized benefits on the borough’s future state aid allocations and submit this information to the department.

Management’s Response: Municipal officials stated that the borough would attempt to negotiate for the removal of the non-service disability benefit provision during the next contract renewal process with its police department.

Auditor’s Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit of the plan.

Finding No. 2 – Inconsistent Pension Benefits

Condition: The pension plan’s governing document, Ordinance No. 437, as amended, contains a benefit provision that conflicts with the collective bargaining agreement between the police officers and the borough, as follows:

<u>Benefit Provision</u>	<u>Governing Document</u>	<u>Collective Bargaining Agreement</u>
Survivor Benefit	The amount of the monthly pension benefit shall be 50% of the pension the MEMBER was receiving or would have been entitled to receive if he had been retired at the time of death.	If a retired police officer dies and leaves a surviving spouse, the spouse shall continue to receive the deceased officer’s retirement benefits until their death. If no spouse survives, then any minor child of the deceased retiree shall receive the retirement benefits until attaining majority...

In addition, the actuarial valuation report form PC-201C, for the police pension plan, with a valuation date of January 1, 2013, submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission, reported the benefit provisions included in the collective bargaining agreement.

ALDAN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 2 – (Continued)

Criteria: The plan's governing document and the collective bargaining agreement should contain consistent benefit provisions to ensure the sound administration of retirement benefits.

Cause: Municipal officials failed to update the plan's governing document.

Effect: Inconsistent plan documents could result in inconsistent or improper benefit calculations and incorrect benefit payments from the pension plan.

Recommendation: We recommend that municipal officials amend the plan's governing document as necessary to reflect all benefit obligations of the pension plan and eliminate inconsistencies among the various plan documents.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be evaluated during our next audit of the plan.

ALDAN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2009, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)	Covered Payroll (c)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability as a % of Payroll [(b-a)/(c)]
01-01-09	\$ 1,612,346	\$ 2,506,039	\$ 893,693	64.3%	\$ 449,329	198.9%
01-01-11	1,954,893	2,642,301	687,408	74.0%	510,967	134.5%
01-01-13	2,143,980	3,366,328	1,222,348	63.7%	488,939	250.0%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-09 and 01-01-11 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses subject to a corridor between 80 to 120 percent of market value. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

ALDAN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

Trends in unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability and annual covered payroll are both affected by inflation. Expressing the unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability as a percentage of annual covered payroll (Column 6) approximately adjusts for the effects of inflation and aids analysis of the plan's progress made in accumulating sufficient assets to pay benefits when due. Generally, where there is an unfunded actuarial accrued liability, the smaller this percentage, the stronger the plan. When assets are in excess of the actuarial accrued liability, the higher the bracketed percentage, the stronger the plan.

ALDAN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2009	\$ 141,405	100.0%
2010	143,377	100.0%
2011	121,419	100.0%
2012	130,530	100.0%
2013	125,427	100.0%
2014	216,423	100.0%

ALDAN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the required supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2013
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar
Remaining amortization period	4 years
Asset valuation method	Market value
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	8.0%
Projected salary increases	5.0%
Cost-of-living adjustments	3.0% per annum

ALDAN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Aldan Borough Police Pension Plan
Delaware County
1 West Providence Road
Aldan, PA 19018

The Honorable James R Hopely	Mayor
Mr. Harry J. Short	Council President
Ms. Peggy Brooks	Chief Administrative Officer
Mr. John White	Borough Manager

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.