

COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Chambersburg Borough Firemen's Pension Plan Franklin County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2014

February 2016



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council
Chambersburg Borough
Franklin County
Chambersburg, PA 17201

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Chambersburg Borough Firemen's Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2014. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- × We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.
- × We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.

- × We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- × We determined that there were no benefit calculations prepared for the years covered by our audit period.
- × We determined whether the January 1, 2011 and January 1, 2013 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2012 and 2014, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.
- × We determined whether all annual special ad hoc postretirement reimbursements received by the municipality were authorized and appropriately deposited in accordance with Act 147 by tracing information to supporting documentation maintained by plan officials.

Chambersburg Borough contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for annual audits of its basic financial statements which are available at the borough's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Chambersburg Borough Firemen's Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the borough's internal controls as they relate to the borough's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Chambersburg Borough Firemen's Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Chambersburg Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

January 29, 2016

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Eugene A. DePasquale". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background	1
Supplementary Information	3
Report Distribution List	9

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Chambersburg Borough Firemen's Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 147 - Special Ad Hoc Municipal Police and Firefighter Postretirement Adjustment Act, Act of December 14, 1988 (P.L. 1192, No. 147), as amended, 53 P.S. § 896.101 et seq.

The Chambersburg Borough Firemen's Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 2009-3. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the borough and its firefighters. The plan was established July 1, 1960. Active members were required to contribute 5 percent of compensation to the plan for the years 2012 and 2013, and 4 percent of compensation to the plan for the year 2014. As of December 31, 2014, the plan had 22 active members, no terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 17 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2014, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	Age 50 and 25 years of service.
Early Retirement	None
Vesting	A member is 100% vested after 12 years of service.

Retirement Benefit:

Lifetime monthly pension benefit with 120 months guaranteed of 50% of average monthly compensation based on highest 3 years of earnings.

Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility	Refund of member contributions plus interest.
After Retirement Eligibility	A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension the member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the day of the member's death.

Disability Benefit:

None

CHAMBERSBURG BOROUGH FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The supplementary information contained on Pages 3 and 4 reflect the implementation of GASB Statement No. 67, *Financial Reporting for Pension Plans*. The objective of this statement is to improve financial reporting by state and local governmental pension plans.

SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION
LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS
FOR THE YEAR ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2014

Total Pension Liability	
Service cost	\$ 183,801
Interest	505,051
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(290,995)
Net Change in Total Pension Liability	397,857
Total Pension Liability – Beginning	6,274,830
Total Pension Liability - Ending (a)	\$ 6,672,687
 Plan Fiduciary Net Position	
Contributions – employer	\$ 269,702
Contribution – member	62,106
Net investment income	270,869
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(290,995)
Administrative expense	(4,800)
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position	306,882
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Beginning	4,782,570
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Ending (b)	\$ 5,089,452
 Net Pension Liability - Ending (a-b)	\$ 1,583,235
 Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability	76.27%
 Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	\$ 1,464,554
 Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll	108.10%

CHAMBERSBURG BOROUGH FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to Changes in the Discount Rate

The following presents the net pension liability of the borough, calculated using the discount rate of 8.0%, as well as what the borough's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (7.0%)	Current Discount Rate (8.0%)	1% Increase (9.0%)
Net Pension Liability	\$ 2,431,228	\$ 1,583,235	\$ 865,701

SCHEDULE OF INVESTMENT RETURNS

Annual Money-Weighted Rate of Return, Net of Investment Expense:

2014	5.9%
------	------

CHAMBERSBURG BOROUGH FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2009, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-09	\$ 3,584,099	\$ 4,619,052	\$ 1,034,953	77.6%
01-01-11	3,946,197	5,221,325	1,275,128	75.6%
01-01-13	4,542,705	5,905,610	1,362,905	76.9%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-11 and 01-01-13 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses subject to a corridor between 80 to 120 percent of the market value of assets. The market value of the plan's assets at 01-01-09 has been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 5-year averaging period subject to a corridor between 70 to 130 percent of the market value of assets. These methods will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

CHAMBERSBURG BOROUGH FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

CHAMBERSBURG BOROUGH FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2009	\$ 124,682	100.0%
2010	116,340	100.0%
2011	204,343	100.0%
2012	209,739	100.0%
2013	244,149	100.0%
2014	269,702	100.0%

CHAMBERSBURG BOROUGH FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
 (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2013
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar
Remaining amortization period	14 years
Asset valuation method	Plan assets are valued using the method described in Section 210 of Act 205, as amended, subject to a corridor between 80-120% of the market value of assets.
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	8.0%
Projected salary increases	5.0%
Cost-of-living adjustments	If retired on or after 1/1/2008, an annual cost-of-living adjustment (COLA) will be made equal to the increase in CPI for the preceding calendar year, with a maximum total COLA increase of 30% and pension benefit of 75% of salary.

CHAMBERSBURG BOROUGH FIREMEN’S PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Chambersburg Borough Firemen’s Pension Plan
Franklin County
100 South Second Street
Chambersburg, PA 17201

The Honorable Darren Brown	Mayor
Mr. William McLaughlin	Council President
Mr. Bradley Elter	Council Vice President
Mr. Allen Coffman	Council Member
Mr. Thomas Newcomer	Council Member
Ms. Elaine Swartz	Council Member
Mr. John A. Scott	Council Member
Ms. Louisa Cowles	Council Member
Mr. Jeffrey Cate	Council Member
Ms. Sharon Bigler	Council Member
Mr. Heath Talhelm	Council Member
Mr. Jeffrey Stonehill	Borough Manager
Mr. Jason Cohen	Director of Finance

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.