

COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Chambersburg Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan Franklin County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2014

February 2016



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council
Chambersburg Borough
Franklin County
Chambersburg, PA 17201

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Chambersburg Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2014. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- × We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.
- × We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.

- × We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- × We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for all 11 of the plan members who retired during the current audit period, and through the completion of our fieldwork procedures, represent payments to all and only those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefit due to the retired individuals and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to the recipients. We also determined whether retirement benefits calculated for the 1 plan member who elected to vest during the current audit period, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the pension benefit due and comparing this amount to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined.
- × We determined whether the January 1, 2011 and January 1, 2013 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2012 and 2014, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.

Chambersburg Borough contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for annual audits of its basic financial statements which are available at the borough's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Chambersburg Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the borough's internal controls as they relate to the borough's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Chambersburg Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Chambersburg Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

January 29, 2016

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Eugene A. DePasquale". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background	1
Supplementary Information	3
Report Distribution List	9

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Chambersburg Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes.

The Chambersburg Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance 2009-5, as amended. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the borough and its non-uniformed employees. The plan was established July 1, 1960. Active non-union members were required to contribute 2 percent of compensation to the plan in 2013, and all active members were required to contribute 3 percent of compensation to the plan in 2014. As of December 31, 2014, the plan had 145 active members, 12 terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 96 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2014, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	Age 65
Early Retirement	Age 60 and 10 years of service.
Vesting	A member is 100% vested after 12 years of service.

Retirement Benefit:

Benefit equals 1.5% of average monthly compensation based on high 3 years of last 5 years of service times service time accrued up to 35 years.

Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility	Refund of member contributions plus interest.
After Retirement Eligibility	If married and completed 10 years of service, a monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension accrued at time of death and then reduced by 0.5% for each year, if any, by which the spouse is more than 5 years younger than the member.

Disability Benefit:

Member is credited for years of service during period of total and permanent disability for purposes of calculating their retirement benefit at retirement.

CHAMBERSBURG BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

The supplementary information contained on Pages 3 and 4 reflect the implementation of GASB Statement No. 67, *Financial Reporting for Pension Plans*. The objective of this statement is to improve financial reporting by state and local governmental pension plans.

SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION
 LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS
 FOR THE YEAR ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2014

Total Pension Liability	\$	
Service cost		551,672
Interest		1,836,430
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions		(1,450,430)
Net Change in Total Pension Liability		<u>937,672</u>
Total Pension Liability – Beginning		<u>23,128,917</u>
Total Pension Liability - Ending (a)	\$	<u><u>24,066,589</u></u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position		
Contributions – employer	\$	640,380
Contribution – member		246,550
Net investment income		994,073
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions		(1,450,430)
Administrative expense		(6,000)
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position		<u>424,573</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position – Beginning		<u>18,570,186</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Ending (b)	\$	<u><u>18,994,759</u></u>
Net Pension Liability - Ending (a-b)	\$	<u><u>5,071,830</u></u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability		78.93%
Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	\$	8,505,696
Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll		59.63%

CHAMBERSBURG BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to Changes in the Discount Rate

The following presents the net pension liability of the borough, calculated using the discount rate of 8.0%, as well as what the borough's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (7.0%)	Current Discount Rate (8.0%)	1% Increase (9.0%)
Net Pension Liability	\$ 7,726,612	\$ 5,071,830	\$ 2,778,615

SCHEDULE OF INVESTMENT RETURNS

Annual Money-Weighted Rate of Return, Net of Investment Expense:

2014	5.7%
------	------

CHAMBERSBURG BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2009, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-09	\$ 15,984,144	\$ 17,342,609	\$ 1,358,465	92.2%
01-01-11	17,085,584	20,391,819	3,306,235	83.8%
01-01-13	18,369,432	22,248,614	3,879,182	82.6%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-11 and 01-01-13 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses subject to a corridor between 80 to 120 percent of the market value of assets. The market value of the plan's assets at 01-01-09 has been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 5-year averaging period subject to a corridor between 70 to 130 percent of the market value of assets. These methods will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

CHAMBERSBURG BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

CHAMBERSBURG BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2009	\$ 454,029	100.0%
2010	472,936	100.0%
2011	648,163	117.1%
2012	650,683	100.0%
2013	789,962	100.0%
2014	640,380	100.0%

CHAMBERSBURG BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2013
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar
Remaining amortization period	16 years
Asset valuation method	
Actuarial assumptions:	Plan assets are valued using the method described in Section 210 of Act 205, as amended, subject to a corridor between 80-120% of the market value of assets.
Investment rate of return	8.0%
Projected salary increases	5.0%
Cost-of-living adjustments	None assumed

CHAMBERSBURG BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Chambersburg Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan
Franklin County
100 South Second Street
Chambersburg, PA 17201

The Honorable Darren Brown	Mayor
Mr. William McLaughlin	Council President
Mr. Bradley Elter	Council Vice President
Mr. Allen Coffman	Council Member
Mr. Thomas Newcomer	Council Member
Ms. Elaine Swartz	Council Member
Mr. John A. Scott	Council Member
Ms. Louisa Cowles	Council Member
Mr. Jeffrey Cate	Council Member
Ms. Sharon Bigler	Council Member
Mr. Heath Talhelm	Council Member
Mr. Jeffrey Stonehill	Borough Manager
Mr. Jason Cohen	Director of Finance

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.