

LIMITED PROCEDURES ENGAGEMENT

Columbus Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan Warren County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2015

December 2016



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL

Board of Township Supervisors
Columbus Township
Warren County
Columbus, PA 16405

We conducted a Limited Procedures Engagement (LPE) of the Columbus Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2015 to determine its compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The LPE was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.) but was not conducted in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis to support our LPE results.

Our LPE was limited to determining the following:

- Whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the engagement period.
- Whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.
- Whether annual employee contributions were required during the engagement period and, if so, were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the engagement period and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.

- Whether the January 1, 2011, January 1, 2013, and January 1, 2015 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the former Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2012, 2014, and 2016, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.

Based on the results of our procedures performed during our LPE, nothing came to our attention indicating that the Columbus Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan was not being administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our determination to perform a LPE for this engagement period does not preclude the Department from conducting an audit in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* of the pension plan in subsequent periods. The township should continue to maintain documentation related to this pension plan.

As previously noted, we conducted a LPE of the Columbus Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan to determine compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. Act 205 was amended on September 18, 2009, through the adoption of Act 44 of 2009. Among several provisions relating to municipal pension plans, the act provides for the implementation of a distress recovery program. Three levels of distress have been established:

<u>Level</u>	<u>Indication</u>	<u>Funding Criteria</u>
I	Minimal distress	70-89%
II	Moderate distress	50-69%
III	Severe distress	Less than 50%

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it. However, **we are extremely concerned about the funded status of the plan contained in the schedule of funding progress included in this report which indicates the plan's funded ratio is 66.5% as of January 1, 2015, which is the most recent data available. Based on this information, the Public Employee Retirement Commission issued a notification that the township is currently in Level II moderate distress status.** We encourage township officials to monitor the funding of the non-uniformed pension plan to ensure its long-term financial stability.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Columbus Township and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in this report. We would like to thank township officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of this LPE.



EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

December 22, 2016

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Supplementary Information	1
Report Distribution List	7

COLUMBUS TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

The supplementary information contained on Pages 1 and 2 reflects the implementation of GASB Statement No. 67, *Financial Reporting for Pension Plans*. The objective of this statement is to improve financial reporting by state and local governmental pension plans.

SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION
 LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS
 FOR THE YEAR ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2014

Total Pension Liability		
Service cost	\$	7,914
Interest		16,314
Difference between expected and actual experience		7,919
Net Change in Total Pension Liability		<u>32,147</u>
Total Pension Liability - Beginning		288,707
Total Pension Liability - Ending (a)	\$	<u><u>320,854</u></u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position		
Contributions – employer	\$	18,815
Contribution – member		3,748
PMRS investment income		10,228
Market value investment income		(879)
PMRS administrative expense		(60)
Additional administrative expense		(392)
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position		<u>31,460</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Beginning		178,934
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Ending (b)	\$	<u><u>210,394</u></u>
Net Pension Liability - Ending (a-b)	\$	<u><u>110,460</u></u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability		65.6%
Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	\$	121,909
Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll		90.6%

COLUMBUS TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to Changes in the Discount Rate

The following presents the net pension liability of the township as of December 31, 2014, calculated using the discount rate of 5.5%, as well as what the township's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (4.5%)	Current Discount Rate (5.5%)	1% Increase (6.5%)
Net Pension Liability	\$ 151,195	\$ 110,460	\$ 74,418

COLUMBUS TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2011, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-11	\$ 91,002	\$ 228,705	\$ 137,703	39.8%
01-01-13	150,273	266,061	115,788	56.5%
01-01-15	213,358	320,854	107,496	66.5%

COLUMBUS TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

COLUMBUS TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2010	\$ 16,885	100.0%
2011	19,735	100.0%
2012	19,678	100.0%
2013	18,823	100.0%
2014	18,815	100.0%
2015	18,941	100.0%

COLUMBUS TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
 (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2015
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar, closed
Remaining amortization period	9 years
Asset valuation method	Fair value
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	5.5%, net of expenses
Projected salary increases *	Age-related scale for merit/ seniority (e.g. age 30 - 6.4%; age 40 - 5.0%; age 50 - 4.1%; age 60 - 3.7%)
Cost-of-living adjustments	3.0%, where applicable

* Includes inflation at 3.0%

COLUMBUS TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Mr. David A. Goodwill
Chairman, Board of Township Supervisors

Mr. Larry R. Curtis
Vice- Chairman, Board of Township Supervisors

Mr. Dan E. Wood
Township Supervisor

Ms. Mary Ann Burge
Secretary

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.