COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Bushkill Volunteer Firefighter's Relief Association

Pike County, Pennsylvania
For the Period
January 1, 2019 to December 31, 2021

October 2022



Timothy L. DeFoor • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

TIMOTHY L. DEFOOR AUDITOR GENERAL

Ms. Jessica T. Frawley, President Bushkill Volunteer Firefighter's Relief Association Pike County

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Bushkill Volunteer Firefighter's Relief Association (relief association) for the period January 1, 2019 to December 31, 2021. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, 72 P.S. § 403; and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act ("VFRA Act"), see 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418.

The objectives of the audit were:

- 1. To determine if the relief association took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report.
- 2. To determine if the relief association complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above and was not, nor was it required to be, conducted in accordance with Government Auditing Standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States.

Relief association officers are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the relief association's administration of state aid and accumulated relief funds complies with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures, including the safeguarding of assets. Relief association officers are responsible for complying with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures. It is our responsibility to perform procedures to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to the extent necessary to satisfy the audit objectives. We believe that our audit provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions.

We were not able to obtain an independent confirmation of the investment balance directly from the financial institution. Therefore, while the relief association provided investment statements that indicated that, as of December 31, 2021, the relief association had an investment balance with a fair value of \$13,793, we were not able to verify this investment balance.

Based on our audit procedures, we conclude that, for the period January 1, 2019 to December 31, 2021:

- The relief association did not take appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report, as detailed below, and discussed in the Status of Prior Finding section of this report.
- Except for the effects, if any, of the matter described in the preceding paragraph, the relief association, in all significant respects, complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds, except as noted in the findings listed below and discussed later in this report.

Finding No. 1 - Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendations - Failure
To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster

Finding No. 2 – Unauthorized Expenditure

Timothy L. Detoor

Finding No. 3 – Inadequate Minutes Of Meetings

The contents of this report were discussed with the management of the relief association and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank the relief association officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

Timothy L. DeFoor Auditor General

August 11, 2022

CONTENTS

| | <u>Page</u> |
|--|-------------|
| Background | 1 |
| Status of Prior Finding | 4 |
| Findings and Recommendations: | |
| Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster | 5 |
| Finding No. 2 – Unauthorized Expenditure | 6 |
| Finding No. 3 – Inadequate Minutes Of Meetings | 7 |
| Report Distribution List | 9 |

BACKGROUND

Pursuant to Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code¹, and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act² ("VFRA Act"), the Department of the Auditor General's duty is to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association to determine that funds received under the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution Law³ (commonly referred to as Act 205) are properly expended.

The relief association is a charitable organization that was formed primarily to afford financial protection to volunteer firefighters and to encourage individuals to participate in volunteer fire service.

The VFRA Act governs the overall operation of volunteer firefighters' relief associations. Relief association bylaws define the specific operational procedures by which relief associations conduct business. To fulfill its primary purpose, the VFRA Act authorizes specific types of expenditures and prescribes appropriate volunteer firefighters' relief association investment options. Within the parameters established by the VFRA Act, it is the responsibility of relief associations to choose investments in a proper and prudent manner.

Volunteer firefighters' relief associations receive public tax monies, and the association officers therefore have a responsibility to the public to conduct the association's financial affairs in a businesslike manner and to maintain sufficient financial records to support the propriety of all association transactions. Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are also responsible for ensuring that the association operates in accordance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures.

Act 205 sets forth the computation of the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution paid to each applicable municipality throughout the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. The amount of the distribution is based upon the population of each municipality and the market value of real estate within the municipality. Upon receipt of this distribution, the municipality must allocate the funds to the volunteer firefighters' relief association of the fire service organization or fire service organizations that is or are recognized as providing the service to the municipality.

³ 53 P.S. § 895.701 et seq. (Act 205 of 1984, as amended by Act 119 of 1990).

¹ 72 P.S. § 403 (as last amended by Act 44 of 2017).

² 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 et seq. See specifically, 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418 (amended by Act 91 of 2020).

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

The relief association was allocated state aid from the following municipalities:

| Municipality | County | 2019 | 2020 | 2021 |
|----------------------------|--------|----------|----------|----------|
| Middle Smithfield Township | Monroe | \$14,801 | \$14,888 | \$12,979 |
| Lehman Township | Pike | \$55,394 | \$55,689 | \$49,816 |

Based on the relief association's records, its total cash and investments as of December 31, 2021 were \$55,992, as illustrated below:

| Cash | \$ 42,199 |
|----------------------------|--------------|
| Fair Value of Investments | 13,793 |
| Total Cash and Investments | \$ 55,992 |

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

Based on the relief association's records, its total expenditures for the period January 1, 2019 to December 31, 2021 were \$194,911, as noted below. The accuracy of these expenditures was evaluated as part of the Department's audit to conclude on the relief association's compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds. The scope of the Department's audit does not include the issuance of an opinion on the accuracy of these amounts.

Expenditures:

| Benefit Services: | |
|-------------------------------|---------------|
| Insurance premiums | \$ 29,065 |
| Death benefits | 1,000 |
| Total Benefit Services | \$ 30,065 |
| Fire Services: | |
| Equipment purchased | \$ 52,278 |
| Equipment maintenance | 10,230 |
| Training expenses | 3,750 |
| Total Fire Services | \$ 66,258 |
| Administrative Services: | |
| Officer compensation | \$ 1,725 |
| Other administrative expenses | 13,597 |
| Bond premiums | 835 |
| Total Administrative Services | \$ 16,157 |
| Other Expenditures: | |
| Payments on lease-financing | \$ 81,432 |
| Unauthorized expenditure | 999 |
| Total Other Expenditures | \$ 82,431 |
| Total Expenditures | \$ 194,911 |
| | |

The volunteer firefighters' relief association and the affiliated fire service organization are separate, legal entities. The relief association is affiliated with the following fire service organization:

Bushkill Fire Company

⁴ Accuracy was evaluated for a selection of transactions based on dollar amount, category, and/or random selection.

BUSHKILL VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTER'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION STATUS OF PRIOR FINDING

NONCOMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

The relief association has not complied with the following prior audit finding. This finding is noted below and discussed in detail in the Findings and Recommendations section of this report:

• Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster

We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding. The relief association management should strive to implement the recommendation and corrective action noted in this audit report.

<u>Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster</u>

Condition: The relief association did not maintain a complete and accurate roster of equipment owned by the relief association. Although a listing of relief association owned equipment was provided during the current audit period, it was incomplete because it did not contain names of suppliers (vendors), dates of purchase, cost of equipment, and serial numbers to accurately identify equipment owned by the relief association. As such, it was impossible to determine if all equipment purchased during the audit period in the amount of \$52,278 was recorded. It also appears that the equipment roster contains all the equipment owned by both the affiliated fire company and the relief association. In addition, there was no indication that a physical inventory of equipment was conducted on an annual basis to account for the equipment owned by the relief association.

A similar condition was noted in our prior audit report.

<u>Criteria</u>: Prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster of all items purchased by the relief association in order to provide an effective accounting control over the relief association's equipment. A cumulative equipment roster of all relief association equipment should include all of the following:

- Types of equipment purchased
- Dates of purchase
- Unit costs
- Names of suppliers
- Serial numbers, if applicable
- Current locations of items
- Final dispositions of sold or damaged equipment
- Evidence of the performance and results of an annual physical inventory

The relief association's equipment roster should not be commingled with any other organization's roster in order to maintain effective control of its assets.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials indicated that the equipment roster contains all the equipment owned by both the fire company and the relief association and there is no separation of costs listed on the inventory. The relief association officials did not provide a reason why a cumulative equipment roster with only relief association owned equipment was not provided.

Finding No. 1 – (Continued)

<u>Effect</u>: The continued failure to properly record equipment purchases in a detailed equipment roster and the practice of commingling the equipment on the relief association's equipment roster prevents officials from effectively monitoring the relief association's equipment purchases. In addition, the failure to maintain a detailed equipment roster of only relief association equipment and perform an annual physical inventory of the equipment prevents adequate accountability for, and safeguarding of, relief association equipment.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials discontinue the current practice of commingling the equipment roster with the affiliated fire company. We again recommend that the relief association officials maintain a cumulative equipment roster of all equipment owned by the relief association. Furthermore, the relief association should ensure it performs an annual physical inventory of all operable equipment and that the completion of the inventory be sufficiently documented. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendation noted in this audit report.

Finding No. 2 – Unauthorized Expenditure

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association expended \$999 for an underwater drone during the current audit period that is not authorized by the VFRA Act.

Criteria: Section 7416(f) of the VFRA Act states:

The funds of any volunteer firefighters' relief association may be spent:

(11) To purchase safeguards for preserving life, health, and safety of volunteer firefighters to ensure their availability to participate in the volunteer fire service.

Costs associated with the purchase of an underwater drone do not qualify as an authorized volunteer firefighters' relief association expenditure; consequently, this disbursement is not authorized under the VFRA Act.

Finding No. 2 – (Continued)

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials indicated that since the drone was to be used to ensure the safety of relief members before and during dive operations (check water conditions, hazard observations, etc.) it was believed that, before this audit, it would be a legitimate expenditure given the goals of the relief association.

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of this improper expenditure, relief association funds were not available for investment purposes or to pay for expenditures authorized by the VFRA Act.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association be reimbursed \$999 for the unauthorized expenditure and that relief association officials become familiar with Section 7416(f) of the VFRA Act to aid them in determining the propriety of future expenditures. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

Finding No. 3 – Inadequate Minutes Of Meetings

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association failed to maintain detailed minutes of meetings as required by the VFRA Act and the relief association's constitution and bylaws. Specifically, the relief association's minutes did not address all of the financial-related transactions that occurred during the audit period and the minutes were not signed by the recording officer.

<u>Criteria</u>: Section 7415(a) of the VFRA Act states, in part, that the relief association:

... must provide for taking and preserving minutes of all meetings and maintenance of such books of account as may be necessary and appropriate to afford a permanent record of its fiscal affairs.

The relief association's bylaws at Article I, Section 1 states, in part:

Regular meetings of this Association shall be held on the first Monday of each month immediately following the regular meeting of the Bushkill Fire Company.

Finding No. 3 – (Continued)

In addition, the relief association's bylaws at Article III, Section 3 states:

The secretary shall keep a true record of the proceedings of every meeting in the minutes. The Association financial transactions and all other pertinent business discussed at the meetings.

Furthermore, the relief association's constitution at Article IV, Section 1 states:

Funds of the Association shall not be expended for any purpose other than those authorized by Act 84 and the Association bylaws and must be approved by a majority vote of the Board of Control. These expenditures are to be reported to the membership for majority approval and be recorded in the minutes of the next regular meeting.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association's new secretary was unaware of the requirements of the meeting minutes and the necessity to sign the minutes.

<u>Effect</u>: Without detailed minutes of meetings, evidence that relief association business was presented before the membership for approval does not exist.

Recommendation: We recommend that the relief association officials maintain detailed minutes of meetings, evidencing the discussion and approval of all financial-related business conducted by the relief association and ensure that the meeting minutes are signed by the Secretary of the Relief Association. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

BUSHKILL VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTER'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf

Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Mr. Charles J. McGarvey, Sr.

State Fire Commissioner

Bushkill Volunteer Firefighter's Relief Association Governing Body:

Ms. Jessica T. Frawley

President

Mr. Anthony Scozzafava

Vice President

Mr. Wilfredo Crespo

Secretary

Ms. Kristin Fehr

Treasurer

Mr. John Gandolfo

Trustee

Mr. Austin Conklin

Trustee

Mr. Alexander Kuna

Trustee

BUSHKILL VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTER'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

The following municipalities allocated foreign fire insurance tax monies to this relief association and received a copy of this report:

Mr. Robert H. Rohner, Jr.
Secretary
Lehman Township

Ms. Michele L. Clewell
Secretary
Middle Smithfield Township

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.