

COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Franklin Township Volunteer Firemen's Relief Association

Erie County, Pennsylvania

For the Period

January 1, 2016 to December 31, 2019

July 2020



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL

Ms. Teresa Brown, President
Franklin Township Volunteer Firemen's
Relief Association
Erie County

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Franklin Township Volunteer Firemen's Relief Association (relief association) pursuant to authority derived from Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, Act of April 9, 1929, (P.L. 343, No. 176), and mandated by the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act, as consolidated by the Act of November 23, 2010 (P.L. 1181, No. 118), at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 *et seq.*, for the period January 1, 2016 to December 31, 2019.

The objectives of the audit were:

1. To determine if the relief association took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report.
2. To determine if the relief association complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above and was not, nor was it required to be, conducted in accordance with Government Auditing Standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States.

Relief association officers are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the relief association's administration of state aid and accumulated relief funds complies with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures, including the safeguarding of assets. Relief association officers are responsible for complying with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures. It is our responsibility to perform procedures to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to the extent necessary to satisfy the audit objectives. We believe that our audit provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions.

We were not able to obtain an independent confirmation of the cash balance directly from the financial institution. Therefore, while the relief association provided copies of bank statements that indicated that, as of December 31, 2019, the relief association had a cash balance of \$12,323, we were not able to verify this cash balance.

In addition, due to a stay at home order issued by the Governor of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania during the COVID-19 pandemic, we were unable to observe any of the relief association's equipment to verify its existence.

Based on our audit procedures, we conclude that, for the period January 1, 2016 to December 31, 2019:

- The relief association did not take appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report, as detailed below and discussed in the Status of Prior Findings section of this report.
- Except for the effects, if any, of the matters described in the two preceding paragraphs, the relief association, in all significant respects, complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds, except as noted in the findings listed below and discussed later in this report.

Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation –
Undocumented Expenditure


Finding No. 2 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation –
Unauthorized Expenditure

Finding No. 3 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure
To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster

All of the audit findings contained in this report cite conditions that existed in the operation of the relief association during the prior audit period and were not corrected during the current audit period. We are concerned by the number of findings noted and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendations noted in this audit report.

The contents of this report were discussed with the management of the relief association and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank the relief association officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

July 1, 2020


EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background	1
Status of Prior Findings	3
Findings and Recommendations:	
Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Undocumented Expenditure	4
Finding No. 2 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Unauthorized Expenditure	5
Finding No. 3 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster	6
Report Distribution List	8

BACKGROUND

Pursuant to Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, Act of April 9, 1929, (P.L. 343, No. 176), and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act, as consolidated by the Act of November 23, 2010, (P.L. 1181, No. 118), at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 *et seq.*, the Department of the Auditor General's duty is to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association to determine that funds received under the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution Law, Act of December 18, 1984, (P.L. 1005, No. 205), as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.701 *et seq.* (commonly referred to as Act 205), are properly expended.

The relief association is a charitable organization that was formed primarily to afford financial protection to volunteer firefighters and to encourage individuals to participate in volunteer fire service.

Act 118 governs the overall operation of volunteer firefighters' relief associations. Relief association bylaws define the specific operational procedures by which relief associations conduct business. To fulfill its primary purpose, Act 118 authorizes specific types of expenditures and prescribes appropriate volunteer firefighters' relief association investment options. Within the parameters established by Act 118, it is the responsibility of relief associations to choose investments in a proper and prudent manner.

Volunteer firefighters' relief associations receive public tax monies, and the association officers therefore have a responsibility to the public to conduct the association's financial affairs in a businesslike manner and to maintain sufficient financial records to support the propriety of all association transactions. Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are also responsible for ensuring that the association operates in accordance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures.

Act 205 sets forth the computation of the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution paid to each applicable municipality throughout the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. The amount of the distribution is based upon the population of each municipality and the market value of real estate within the municipality. Upon receipt of this distribution, the municipality must allocate the funds to the volunteer firefighters' relief association of the fire service organization or fire service organizations that is or are recognized as providing the service to the municipality.

The relief association was allocated state aid from the following municipality:

<u>Municipality</u>	<u>County</u>	<u>2016</u>	<u>2017</u>	<u>2018</u>	<u>2019</u>
Franklin Township	Erie	\$9,818	\$9,280	\$8,560	\$9,502

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

Based on the relief association’s records, their total cash as of December 31, 2019 was \$12,323, as illustrated below:

Cash	<u>\$ 12,323</u>
------	------------------

Based on the relief association’s records, their total expenditures for the period January 1, 2016 to December 31, 2019 were \$42,261, as noted below. The accuracy of these expenditures was evaluated as part of the Department’s audit to conclude on the relief association’s compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds.¹ **The scope of the Department’s audit does not include the issuance of an opinion on the accuracy of these amounts.**

Expenditures:

Benefit Services:	
Insurance premiums	<u>\$ 12,994</u>
Fire Services:	
Equipment purchased	\$ 5,984
Equipment maintenance	960
Training expenses	<u>5,472</u>
Total Fire Services	<u>\$ 12,416</u>
Administrative Services:	
Other administrative expenses	\$ 16,551
Bond premiums	<u>300</u>
Total Administrative Services	<u>\$ 16,851</u>
Total Investments Purchased	<u>\$ 42,261</u>

The volunteer firefighters’ relief association and the affiliated fire service organization are separate, legal entities. The relief association is affiliated with the following fire service organization:

Franklin Township Volunteer Fire Department

¹ Accuracy was evaluated for a selection of transactions based on dollar amount, category, and/or random selection.

FRANKLIN TOWNSHIP VOLUNTEER FIREMEN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION
STATUS OF PRIOR FINDINGS

NONCOMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The relief association has not complied with the following prior audit findings. These findings are noted below and discussed in detail in the Findings and Recommendations section of this report:

- Undocumented Expenditure
- Unauthorized Expenditure
- Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster

We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct those previously reported audit findings. The association management should strive to implement the recommendations and corrective actions noted in this audit report.

FRANKLIN TOWNSHIP VOLUNTEER FIREMEN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Undocumented Expenditure

Condition: During the prior audit period, the relief association was unable to provide adequate supporting documentation for an expenditure amounting to \$380 disbursed to a vendor on February 22, 2013, and the relief association officials did not take corrective action to address the undocumented expenditure prior to the current audit period ending December 31, 2019.

Criteria: Section 7418(a) of Act 118 states:

The Office of Auditor General shall have the power and its duty shall be to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association receiving money under Chapter 7 of the Act of December 18, 1984 (P.L. 1005, No. 205), known as the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act, as far as may be necessary to satisfy the Auditor General that the money received was or is being expended for no purpose other than that authorized by this subchapter. Copies of all audits shall be furnished to the Governor.

Without adequate supporting documentation, such as an invoice and/or itemized receipt, this department is unable to determine whether relief association funds were expended for purposes authorized by Act 118. Furthermore, prudent business practice dictates that supporting documentation be maintained to evidence the propriety of all financial transactions.

Cause: Even though notified of this condition during our prior audit, relief association officials again neglected to comply with the recommendation.

Effect: Lack of supporting documentation, such as an invoice and/or itemized receipt, made it impossible to determine if the expenditure was made in accordance with Section 7416(f) of Act 118. In addition, the failure to maintain adequate supporting documentation for relief association expenditures can lead to an increased risk of errors occurring and funds being misappropriated.

Recommendation: We recommend that the relief association officials provide this department with adequate supporting documentation, such as an invoice and/or itemized receipt, to ensure the propriety of the expenditure or that the relief association be reimbursed \$380 for the undocumented expenditure. We also recommend that the relief association officials maintain supporting documentation for all future expenditures. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

FRANKLIN TOWNSHIP VOLUNTEER FIREMEN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – (Continued)

Management's Response: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and, as a result of our audit, the affiliated fire company reimbursed the relief association \$380 for the undocumented expenditure on May 26, 2020.

Auditor's Conclusion: We reviewed documentation verifying that the reimbursement of \$380 was received. Compliance for maintaining appropriate documentation for expenditures made during the next audit period will be subject to verification through our next audit.

Finding No. 2 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Unauthorized Expenditure

Condition: During the prior audit period, the relief association expended \$946 for automotive insurance for the fire company that is not authorized by Act 118, and relief association officials did not take corrective action to address the expenditure prior to the current audit period ending December 31, 2019.

Criteria: Section 7416(f) of Act 118 states:

The funds of any volunteer firefighters' relief association may be spent:

- (1) To pay for such normal and reasonable running expenses as may be appropriate to the businesslike conduct of the affairs of the association, including legal fees, rental or purchase of offices, payment of reasonable compensation of employees and purchase of office equipment and supplies.
- (2) To purchase contracts of insurance which, at a minimum, shall afford financial assistance to active members of the fire service represented by the association against losses due to injury suffered in the fire service and may also provide, in the order named: (i) for payments to the surviving spouse or other dependents of a member in the event of the member's death; (ii) for protection of active firefighters against disease; (iii) for replacement or purchase of prosthetic devices such as visual aids, hearing aids, dentures, braces, crutches and the like, where those devices have been lost or damaged while the owner was engaged in the fire service or where the need for those devices arose because of functional impairment attributable to participation in the fire service; (iv) for repair or replacement, if necessary, of articles of clothing or pocket pagers damaged or lost in the course of participation in the fire service; and (v) for disability incurred after service for a minimum of 20 years as a volunteer firefighter.

FRANKLIN TOWNSHIP VOLUNTEER FIREMEN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 2 – (Continued)

The cost associated with the purchase of automotive insurance for the fire company and not for the direct benefit of relief association members does not qualify as an authorized volunteer firefighters' relief association expenditure; consequently, this disbursement is not authorized under Act 118.

Cause: Even though notified of this condition during our prior audit, relief association officials again neglected the fact that an expenditure for fire company automotive insurance was not authorized by Act 118.

Effect: As a result of this improper expenditure, relief association funds were not available for investment purposes or to pay for expenditures authorized by Act 118.

Recommendation: We recommend that the relief association be reimbursed \$946 for the unauthorized expenditure and that relief association officials become familiar with Section 7416(f) of Act 118 to aid them in determining the propriety of future expenditures. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

Management's Response: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and, as a result of our audit, the affiliated fire company reimbursed the relief association \$946 for the unauthorized expenditure on May 26, 2020.

Auditor's Conclusion: We reviewed documentation verifying that the reimbursement of \$946 was received. Compliance for expenditures made during the next audit period will be subject to verification through our next audit.

Finding No. 3 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster

Condition: As disclosed in the prior two audit reports, the relief association failed to maintain a complete and accurate roster of equipment owned by the relief association. Specifically, the relief association purchased \$5,984 of equipment during the current audit period and there was no equipment roster created or maintained for these purchases. In addition, there was no indication that a physical inventory of equipment was conducted on an annual basis, nor whether such inventory accounted for all equipment owned by the relief association.

FRANKLIN TOWNSHIP VOLUNTEER FIREMEN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 3 – (Continued)

Criteria: Prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster of all items purchased by the relief association in order to provide an effective accounting control over the relief association's equipment. A cumulative equipment roster of all relief association equipment should include all of the following:

- Types of equipment purchased
- Dates of purchase
- Unit costs
- Names of suppliers
- Serial numbers, if applicable
- Current locations of items
- Final dispositions of sold or damaged equipment
- Evidence of the performance and results of an annual physical inventory

Cause: Even though notified of this condition during our prior two audits, relief association officials again failed to establish adequate internal control procedures over equipment by requiring the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster and the performance of an annual physical inventory of equipment.

Effect: The continued failure to properly record equipment purchases in a detailed equipment roster prevents officials from effectively monitoring the relief association's equipment purchases. In addition, the failure to maintain a detailed equipment roster and perform an annual physical inventory of equipment prevents adequate accountability for, and safeguarding of, relief association equipment.

Recommendation: We again recommend that the relief association officials maintain a cumulative equipment roster of all equipment owned by the relief association. Furthermore, the relief association should ensure it performs an annual physical inventory of all operable equipment and that the completion of the inventory be sufficiently documented. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

Management's Response: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendation noted in this audit report.

FRANKLIN TOWNSHIP VOLUNTEER FIREMEN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Franklin Township Volunteer Firemen's Relief Association Governing Body:

Ms. Teresa Brown
President

Mr. Daniel Netzler
Vice President

Ms. Marielle Lafaro
Secretary

Ms. Liana Thayer
Treasurer

A report was also distributed to the following municipality, which allocated foreign fire insurance tax monies to this relief association:

Ms. Ramona Junkins
Secretary
Franklin Township

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.