COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Manheim Township Fire Rescue Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association

Lancaster County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2019, to December 31, 2021

February 2023





Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen www.PaAuditor.gov

TIMOTHY L. DEFOOR AUDITOR GENERAL

Mr. Steve Leayman, President Manheim Township Fire Rescue Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Lancaster County

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Manheim Township Fire Rescue Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association (relief association) for the period January 1, 2019, to December 31, 2021. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, 72 P.S. § 403; and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act ("VFRA Act"), see 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418.

The objectives of the audit were:

- 1. To determine if the relief association took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report.
- 2. To determine if the relief association complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above and was not, nor was it required to be, conducted in accordance with Government Auditing Standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States.

Relief association officers are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the relief association's administration of state aid and accumulated relief funds complies with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures, including the safeguarding of assets. Relief association officers are responsible for complying with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures. It is our responsibility to perform procedures to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to the extent necessary to satisfy the audit objectives. We believe that our audit provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions.

Based on our audit procedures, we conclude that, for the period January 1, 2019, to December 31, 2021:

- The relief association took appropriate corrective action to address two of the five findings contained in our prior audit report. However, the relief association failed to take appropriate corrective action to address the three remaining findings contained in our prior audit report, as listed below, and discussed in the Status of Prior Findings section of this report.
- Because of the significance of the matter described in Finding No. 2 below and discussed later in this report, the relief association did not, in all significant respects, comply with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds, collectively as a whole. Therefore, the relief association may be subject to the potential withholding of its upcoming state aid distribution, as discussed in the Potential Withhold of State Aid section of this report.

Finding No. 1	 Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster 				
Finding No. 2	 Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Unauthorized Expenditures 				
Finding No. 3	 Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Undocumented Expenditures 				
Finding No. 4	 Failure To Deposit Insurance Claim Proceeds 				
Finding No. 5	 Failure To Secure Ownership Interest In Jointly Purchased Equipment 				

Three of the five audit findings contained in this report cite conditions that existed in the operation of the relief association during the prior audit period and were not corrected during the current audit period. We are concerned by the number of findings noted and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendations noted in this audit report.

The contents of this report were discussed with the management of the relief association and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank the relief association officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

Timothy L. Detoor

Timothy L. DeFoor Auditor General January 13, 2023

CONTENTS

Page

Background1
Status of Prior Findings
Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster6
Finding No. 2 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Unauthorized Expenditures
Finding No. 3 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Undocumented Expenditures
Finding No. 4 – Failure To Deposit Insurance Claim Proceeds11
Finding No. 5 – Failure To Secure Ownership Interest In Jointly Purchased Equipment11
Potential Withhold of State Aid
Report Distribution List

BACKGROUND

Pursuant to Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code¹, and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act² ("VFRA Act"), the Department of the Auditor General's duty is to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association to determine that funds received under the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution Law³ (commonly referred to as Act 205) are properly expended.

The relief association is a charitable organization that was formed primarily to afford financial protection to volunteer firefighters and to encourage individuals to participate in volunteer fire service.

The VFRA Act governs the overall operation of volunteer firefighters' relief associations. Relief association bylaws define the specific operational procedures by which relief associations conduct business. To fulfill its primary purpose, the VFRA Act authorizes specific types of expenditures and prescribes appropriate volunteer firefighters' relief association investment options. Within the parameters established by the VFRA Act, it is the responsibility of relief associations to choose investments in a proper and prudent manner.

Volunteer firefighters' relief associations receive public tax monies, and the association officers therefore have a responsibility to the public to conduct the association's financial affairs in a businesslike manner and to maintain sufficient financial records to support the propriety of all association transactions. Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are also responsible for ensuring that the association operates in accordance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures.

Act 205 sets forth the computation of the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution paid to each applicable municipality throughout the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. The amount of the distribution is based upon the population of each municipality and the market value of real estate within the municipality. Upon receipt of this distribution, the municipality must allocate the funds to the volunteer firefighters' relief association of the fire service organization or fire service organizations that is or are recognized as providing the service to the municipality.

¹ 72 P.S. § 403 (as last amended by Act 44 of 2017).

² 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 et seq. See specifically, 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418 (amended by Act 91 of 2020).

³ 53 P.S. § 895.701 et seq. (Act 205 of 1984, as amended by Act 119 of 1990).

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

The relief association was allocated state aid from the following municipality:

Municipality	County	2019	2020	2021
Manheim Township	Lancaster	\$242,304	\$226,293	\$204,408

Based on the relief association's records, its total cash and investments as of December 31, 2021, were \$888,150, as illustrated below:

Cash	\$ 200,514
Fair Value of Investments	 687,636
Total Cash and Investments	\$ 888,150

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

Based on the relief association's records, its total expenditures for the period January 1, 2019, to December 31, 2021, were \$893,626, as noted below. The accuracy of these expenditures was evaluated as part of the Department's audit to conclude on the relief association's compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds.⁴ The scope of the Department's audit does not include the issuance of an opinion on the accuracy of these amounts.

Expenditures:

Benefit Services:	
Insurance premiums	\$ 61,102
Death benefits	7,500
Relief benefits	135
Total Benefit Services	\$ 68,737
Fire Services:	
Equipment purchased	\$ 164,601
Equipment maintenance	99,312
Training expenses	21,649
Fire prevention materials	 6,306
Total Fire Services	\$ 291,868
Administrative Services:	
Bond premiums	\$ 864
Other administrative expenses	 16,789
Total Administrative Services	\$ 17,653
Total Investments Purchased	\$ 100,000
Other Expenditures:	
Payments on lease-financing	\$ 402,438
Undocumented expenditures	1,760
Unauthorized expenditures	11,170
Total Other Expenditures	\$ 415,368
Total Expenditures	\$ 893,626

⁴ Accuracy was evaluated for a selection of transactions based on dollar amount, category, and/or random selection.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

The volunteer firefighters' relief association and the affiliated fire service organization are separate, legal entities. The relief association is affiliated with the following fire service organization:

Manheim Township Fire Rescue

MANHEIM TOWNSHIP FIRE RESCUE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION STATUS OF PRIOR FINDINGS

COMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The relief association has complied with two of the five prior audit findings and recommendations, as follows:

• Inadequate Internal Controls

By adopting sufficient internal control procedures to adequately safeguard relief association assets and ensure the propriety of all relief association transactions.

• Inadequate Minutes Of Meetings

By maintaining detailed minutes of all relief association meetings held during the period.

NONCOMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The relief association has not complied with three of the five prior audit findings. These findings are noted below and discussed in detail in the Findings and Recommendations section of this report:

- Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster
- Unauthorized Expenditures

Although the relief association received reimbursement of \$6,301 from the affiliated fire company for the unauthorized expenditures that were made in the prior audit period, the relief association again expended funds in the current audit period that were not authorized by the VFRA Act as further disclosed in Finding No. 2 of this report.

• <u>Undocumented Expenditures</u>

Although the relief association provided invoices to support \$5,356 of the undocumented expenditures and received reimbursement of \$604 from the affiliated fire company for the remaining undocumented expenditures that were made in the prior audit period, the relief association again failed to provide adequate documentation to support all expenditures in the current audit period as further disclosed in Finding No. 3 of this report.

We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct those previously reported audit findings. The relief association management should strive to implement the recommendations and corrective actions noted in this audit report.

<u>Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain</u> <u>A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster</u>

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association failed to maintain a complete and accurate roster of equipment owned by the relief association. Although a listing of relief association owned equipment was provided during the current audit period, it was incomplete because it did not contain all the names of suppliers (vendors), dates of purchase, cost of equipment and serial numbers to accurately identify equipment owned by the relief association. As such, it was impossible to determine if all equipment purchased during the audit period in the amount of \$164,601 was recorded. In addition, there was no indication that a physical inventory of equipment was conducted on an annual basis to account for the equipment owned by the relief association.

A similar condition was noted in our prior audit report.

<u>Criteria</u>: Prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster of all items purchased by the relief association in order to provide an effective accounting control over the relief association's equipment. A cumulative equipment roster of all relief association equipment should include all of the following:

- Types of equipment purchased
- Dates of purchase
- Unit costs
- Names of suppliers
- Serial numbers, if applicable
- Current locations of items
- Final dispositions of sold or damaged equipment
- Evidence of the performance and results of an annual physical inventory

<u>Cause</u>: Although notified of this condition during our prior audit, the relief association officials stated that they were unaware of the criteria for the equipment roster.

<u>Effect</u>: The continued failure to properly record equipment purchases in a detailed equipment roster prevents officials from effectively monitoring the relief association's equipment purchases. In addition, the failure to maintain a detailed equipment roster and perform an annual physical inventory of equipment prevents adequate accountability for, and safeguarding of, relief association equipment.

Finding No. 1 – (Continued)

<u>Recommendation</u>: We again recommend that the relief association officials maintain a cumulative equipment roster of all equipment owned by the relief association. Furthermore, the relief association should ensure it performs an annual physical inventory of all operable equipment and that the completion of the inventory be sufficiently documented. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendation noted in this audit report.

<u>Finding No. 2 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Unauthorized</u> <u>Expenditures</u>

<u>Condition</u>: Although the relief association received reimbursement from the affiliated fire company for the unauthorized expenditures that were made in the prior audit period, the relief association again expended funds for the following items during the current audit period that are not authorized by the VFRA Act:

Date	Check No.	Description					Amount
08/01/2019	1349	Training for caree				\$	825
12/05/2019	1385	Training for caree	Training for career staff				135
01/10/2020	1396	Equipment for car	Equipment for career staff				4,402
04/02/2020	1419	Training-related (Instructor fee)	expenses	for	non-members		4,099
04/02/2020	1416	Training-related (meals)	expenses	for	non-members		1,605
06/04/2020	1428	Equipment for car	reer staff				104
					Total	\$	11,170

Finding No. 2 – (Continued)

Criteria: Section 7416(f) of the VFRA Act states:

The funds of any volunteer firefighters' relief association may be spent:

- (10) To pay reasonable expenses actually and necessarily incurred for attending bona fide firefighters' training schools.
- (11) To purchase safeguards for preserving life, health, and safety of volunteer firefighters to ensure their availability to participate in the volunteer fire service, including necessary training.

In addition, Section 7418(b) of the VFRA Act states:

(b) Findings -- If the Auditor General finds that money received by a volunteer firefighters' relief association has been expended for a purpose other than one authorized by this subchapter, the commissioner, upon receiving notice of the finding from the auditor general, shall decline to approve payment to the volunteer firefighters' relief association until the improperly expended amount has been reimbursed to the relief association fund.

Costs associated with training and equipment for career staff, and training for non-members do not qualify as authorized volunteer firefighters' relief association expenditures; consequently, these disbursements are not authorized under the VFRA Act.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials indicated that they were unaware that the non-member training expenditures were not authorized by the VFRA Act and that it was a bookkeeping error that expenses were paid on behalf of career staff.

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of these improper expenditures, relief association funds were not available for investment purposes, or to pay for expenditures authorized by the VFRA Act. Furthermore, the relief association's future state aid allocations may be withheld until the finding recommendation is complied with.

Finding No. 2 – (Continued)

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association be reimbursed \$11,170 for the unauthorized expenditures and that relief association officials become familiar with Section 7416(f) of the VFRA Act to aid them in determining the propriety of future expenditures. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: Due to the potential withhold of state aid, the relief association's compliance with the finding recommendation will be monitored subsequent to the release of the audit report and through our next audit of the relief association.

<u>Finding No. 3 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Undocumented</u> <u>Expenditures</u>

<u>Condition</u>: Although the relief association provided invoices to support \$5,356 of the undocumented expenditures and received reimbursement of \$604 from the affiliated fire company for the remaining undocumented expenditures that were made in the prior audit period, the relief association was again unable to provide adequate supporting documentation for the following expenditures made during the current audit period:

Date	Check No.	Payee Description	1	Amount
04/04/2019 08/01/2019 07/01/2020	1309 1354 1430	Credit card Training vendor Training vendor	\$	760 825 175
		Total	\$	1,760

Finding No. 3 – (Continued)

Criteria: Section 7418(a) of the VFRA Act states:

The Office of Auditor General shall have the power and its duty shall be to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association receiving money under Chapter 7 of the Act of December 18, 1984 (P.L. 1005, No. 205), known as the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act, as far as may be necessary to satisfy the Auditor General that the money received was or is being expended for no purpose other than that authorized by this subchapter. Copies of all audits shall be furnished to the Governor.

Prudent business practice dictates that supporting documentation be maintained to evidence the propriety of all financial transactions.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials indicated they were unaware that the invoices and/or training certificates were missing.

<u>Effect</u>: Lack of supporting documentation, such as invoices, itemized receipts, and detailed minutes of meetings, made it impossible to determine if the expenditures were made in accordance with Section 7416(f) of the VFRA Act. In addition, the failure to maintain adequate supporting documentation for relief association expenditures can lead to an increased risk of errors occurring and funds being misappropriated.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials provide this department with adequate supporting documentation, such as invoices and/or itemized receipts, to ensure the propriety of the expenditures or that the relief association be reimbursed \$1,760 for the undocumented expenditures. We also recommend that the relief association officials maintain supporting documentation for all future expenditures. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendation noted in this audit report.

Finding No. 4 – Failure To Deposit Insurance Claim Proceeds

<u>Condition</u>: In 2019, proceeds in the amount of \$2,445 for an insurance claim filed on behalf of the relief association for a damaged gas meter was erroneously deposited into the fire company's bank account.

<u>Criteria</u>: Prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should closely monitor all insurance claims filed to make sure all insurance claim proceeds are received and timely deposited into a relief association account.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials indicated that they were unaware that the check was not received and deposited into their account.

<u>Effect</u>: The failure to deposit all relief association insurance claim proceeds in a timely manner can lead to a greater risk that funds could be lost or misappropriated. As a result of the proceeds from the insurance claim being deposited into a fire company account, the relief association was unable to use the funds to purchase replacement equipment, for general operating expenses, or for investment purposes.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association be reimbursed \$2,445 for the erroneous deposit. We also recommend the relief association officials establish accounting and internal control procedures to ensure that all insurance claim proceeds are timely deposited in a relief association account. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

Finding No. 5 – Failure To Secure Ownership Interest In Jointly Purchased Equipment

<u>Condition</u>: On June 6, 2019, the relief association jointly expended \$1,504 towards \$16,150 of equipment (turnout gear) without properly securing its ownership interest.

Finding No. 5 – (Continued)

Criteria: Section 7418(a) of the VFRA Act states:

The Office of Auditor General shall have the power and its duty shall be to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association receiving money under Chapter 7 of the Act of December 18, 1984 (P.L. 1005, No. 205), known as the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act, as far as may be necessary to satisfy the Auditor General that the money received was or is being expended for no purpose other than that authorized by this subchapter. Copies of all audits shall be furnished to the Governor.

Prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should secure its proportional ownership interest in the equipment purchased by the relief association by executing a formal written agreement that enumerates the relief association's proportional share of the cost of the equipment. Such agreement shall specify that the relief association shall receive its prorated share of the proceeds upon sale of the equipment, in the event the equipment is ever sold.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials indicated they were unaware of the necessity of an agreement.

<u>Effect</u>: The failure to adequately secure the proportional share of ownership interest in the equipment for which relief association purchased places the relief association's ownership interest at greater risk.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials execute a formal written agreement with the fire company that enumerates the relief association's proportional ownership interest in the equipment as well as stipulating that the proportionate sales proceeds shall revert to the relief association in the event the equipment is ever sold. If such action is not taken, we recommend that the relief association be reimbursed \$1,504. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

MANHEIM TOWNSHIP FIRE RESCUE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION POTENTIAL WITHHOLD OF STATE AID

A condition of a repeat finding such as that reported by Finding No. 2 contained in this audit report may lead to a total withholding of state aid in the future unless the finding is corrected. However, such action may not be considered if sufficient documentation is provided within 60 days to verify compliance with this department's recommendations. Such documentation should be submitted by the relief association to: Department of the Auditor General, Bureau of Fire Relief Audits, Room 316E Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120.

MANHEIM TOWNSHIP FIRE RESCUE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Joshua D. Shapiro

Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Manheim Township Fire Rescue Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Governing Body:

Mr. Steve Leayman President

Mr. Jeffrey Ober Vice President

Mr. Joseph H. Banzhof Secretary

Mr. Christopher J. Oberle, II Treasurer

Mr. Carl Everhart Director

Mr. Randal Bixler Director

A report was also distributed to the following municipality, which allocated foreign fire insurance tax monies to this relief association:

Mr. Rick Kane Secretary Manheim Township

MANHEIM TOWNSHIP FIRE RESCUE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at <u>www.PaAuditor.gov.</u> Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: <u>news@PaAuditor.gov</u>.