# **COMPLIANCE AUDIT**

# Mifflin Fireman's Relief Association Juniata County, Pennsylvania For the Period

January 1, 2018 to December 31, 2021

April 2022



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General

Timothy L. DeFoor • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen www.PaAuditor.gov

TIMOTHY L. DEFOOR AUDITOR GENERAL

Mr. Nathan A. Jones, President Mifflin Fireman's Relief Association Juniata County

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Mifflin Fireman's Relief Association (relief association) for the period January 1, 2018 to December 31, 2021. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, 72 P.S. § 403; and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act ("VFRA Act"), see 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418.

The objectives of the audit were:

- 1. To determine if the relief association took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report.
- 2. To determine if the relief association complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above and was not, nor was it required to be, conducted in accordance with Government Auditing Standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States.

Relief association officers are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the relief association's administration of state aid and accumulated relief funds complies with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures, including the safeguarding of assets. Relief association officers are responsible for complying with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures. It is our responsibility to perform procedures to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to the extent necessary to satisfy the audit objectives. We believe that our audit provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions.

Based on our audit procedures, we conclude that, for the period January 1, 2018 to December 31, 2021:

- The relief association took appropriate corrective action to address four of the five findings contained in our prior audit report. However, the relief association failed to take appropriate corrective action to address the one remaining finding contained in our prior audit report, as listed below and discussed in the Status of Prior Findings section of this report.
- The relief association, in all significant respects, complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds, except as noted in the findings listed below and discussed later in this report.

Finding No. 1	_	Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Inadequate Investment Records		
Finding No. 2	_	Untimely Receipt And Deposit Of State Aid		
Finding No. 3 – Failure To Maintain Minutes Of Meetings				
Finding No. 4	_	Failure To Adhere To Relief Association Bylaws		
Finding No. 5	_	Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster		
Finding No. 6	_	Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Membership Roster		

We are concerned by the number of findings noted and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendations noted in this audit report.

The contents of this report were discussed with the management of the relief association and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank the relief association officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

Timothy L. Detoor

Timothy L. DeFoor Auditor General March 25, 2022

# CONTENTS

Page
------

Background1
Status of Prior Findings
Findings and Recommendations:
Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Inadequate Investment Records
Finding No. 2 – Untimely Receipt And Deposit Of State Aid7
Finding No. 3 – Failure To Maintain Minutes Of Meetings
Finding No. 4 – Failure To Adhere To Relief Association Bylaws
Finding No. 5 – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster11
Finding No. 6 – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Membership Roster12
Report Distribution List

#### BACKGROUND

Pursuant to Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code<sup>1</sup>, and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act<sup>2</sup> ("VFRA Act"), the Department of the Auditor General's duty is to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association to determine that funds received under the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution Law<sup>3</sup> (commonly referred to as Act 205) are properly expended.

The relief association is a charitable organization that was formed primarily to afford financial protection to volunteer firefighters and to encourage individuals to participate in volunteer fire service.

The VFRA Act governs the overall operation of volunteer firefighters' relief associations. Relief association bylaws define the specific operational procedures by which relief associations conduct business. To fulfill its primary purpose, the VFRA Act authorizes specific types of expenditures and prescribes appropriate volunteer firefighters' relief association investment options. Within the parameters established by the VFRA Act, it is the responsibility of relief associations to choose investments in a proper and prudent manner.

Volunteer firefighters' relief associations receive public tax monies, and the association officers therefore have a responsibility to the public to conduct the association's financial affairs in a businesslike manner and to maintain sufficient financial records to support the propriety of all association transactions. Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are also responsible for ensuring that the association operates in accordance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures.

Act 205 sets forth the computation of the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution paid to each applicable municipality throughout the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. The amount of the distribution is based upon the population of each municipality and the market value of real estate within the municipality. Upon receipt of this distribution, the municipality must allocate the funds to the volunteer firefighters' relief association of the fire service organization or fire service organizations that is or are recognized as providing the service to the municipality.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> 72 P.S. § 403 (as last amended by Act 44 of 2017).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 *et seq*. See specifically, 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418 (amended by Act 91 of 2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> 53 P.S. § 895.701 et seq. (Act 205 of 1984, as amended by Act 119 of 1990).

# **BACKGROUND – (Continued)**

The relief association was allocated state aid from the following municipalities:

Municipality	County	2018	2019	2020	2021
Mifflin Borough	Juniata	\$2,098	\$2,260	\$2,304*	\$2,070*
Milford Township	Juniata	\$7,938	\$8,701	\$8,194	\$7,768

\* The 2020 and 2021 state aid allocations received from Mifflin Borough were not deposited by the relief association until January 5, 2021 and February 1, 2022, respectively, as disclosed in Finding No. 2 in this report.

Based on the relief association's records, its total cash as of December 31, 2021 was \$13,706, as illustrated below:

Cash

\$ 13,706

#### **BACKGROUND** – (Continued)

Based on the relief association's records, its total expenditures for the period January 1, 2018 to December 31, 2021 were \$46,651, as noted below. The accuracy of these expenditures was evaluated as part of the Department's audit to conclude on the relief association's compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds.<sup>4</sup> The scope of the Department's audit does not include the issuance of an opinion on the accuracy of these amounts.

**Expenditures**:

Benefit Services:	
Insurance premiums	\$ 9,245
Fire Services:	
Equipment purchased	\$ 5,850
Equipment maintenance	8,384
Training expenses	70
Total Fire Services	\$ 14,304
Administrative Services:	
Officer compensation	\$ 2,550
Other administrative expenses	319
Bond premiums	 250
Total Administrative Services	\$ 3,119
Other Expenditures:	
Payments on loan	\$ 19,833
Unauthorized Expenditures*	150
Total Other Expenditures	\$ 19,983
Total Expenditures	\$ 46,651

\*During 2020 and 2021, the relief association made insignificant disbursements totaling \$150 which were not authorized by the VFRA Act. We disclosed these issues to relief association officials on February 9, 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Accuracy was evaluated for a selection of transactions based on dollar amount, category, and/or random selection.

# BACKGROUND – (Continued)

The volunteer firefighters' relief association and the affiliated fire service organization are separate, legal entities. The relief association is affiliated with the following fire service organization:

Mifflin Fire Department #2

# MIFFLIN FIREMAN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION STATUS OF PRIOR FINDINGS

# COMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The relief association has complied with four of the five prior audit findings and recommendations, as follows:

# • Failure To Fully Enforce The Terms Of The Agreements

By receiving a reimbursement of \$8,813 from the affiliated fire company for the proportional shares of the proceeds from the sales of the jointly purchased vehicles.

• <u>Undocumented Expenditures</u>

By receiving a reimbursement of \$889 from the affiliated fire company for the undocumented expenditures that were made in the prior audit period.

• Failure To Secure Ownership Interest In Jointly Purchased Equipment

By executing written formal agreements with the affiliated fire company that adequately secures its proportional ownership interests in the jointly purchased equipment.

• Inadequate Financial Record-Keeping System

By establishing and maintaining a financial record-keeping system that allows the membership to effectively monitor the relief association's financial operations.

#### NONCOMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The relief association has not complied with one of the five prior audit findings. This finding is noted below and discussed in detail in the Findings and Recommendations section of this report:

• Inadequate Investment Records

We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding. The relief association management should strive to implement the recommendation and corrective action noted in this audit report.

# <u>Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Inadequate Investment</u> <u>Records</u>

<u>Condition</u>: Relief association officials did not maintain adequate records of investments purchased and sold, as well as the source of investment income. Specifically, all investment transactions were not recorded in the relief association's journal, nor were they identified in the minutes of the relief association's meetings.

A similar condition was noted in our prior audit report.

Criteria: Section 7415(a) of the VFRA Act states:

A volunteer firefighters' relief association may be a body corporate, governed by a charter and bylaws or an unincorporated association of individuals governed by bylaws and a constitution. In either case, it must provide for taking and preserving minutes of all meetings and maintenance of such books of account as may be necessary and appropriate to afford a permanent record of its fiscal affairs.

Additionally, sound accounting procedures for investment purchases and sales should include the recording of the following:

- Date of purchase or sale of the security
- Identification number of the security
- Rate of interest
- Date of receipt of interest income
- Date of maturity

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials indicated that due to the death of a previous relief association treasurer, investment records were lost. In addition, the relief association failed to establish adequate accounting procedures to record the transactions of each investment.

<u>Effect</u>: The continued failure to maintain an adequate record-keeping system for investment transactions prevents officials from effectively monitoring the relief association's financial position.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We again recommend that the relief association officials take the necessary steps to record all investments purchased and sold, and identify the source and amount of investment income, so that all investment transactions are sufficiently documented. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

#### **Finding No. 1 – (Continued)**

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendation noted in this audit report.

#### Finding No. 2 – Untimely Receipt And Deposit Of State Aid

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association did not deposit the 2020 state aid allocation it received from Mifflin Borough, in the amount of \$2,304, until January 5, 2021. The foreign fire insurance tax allocation was distributed to the municipal treasurer on September 22, 2020; however, municipal officials failed to forward the state aid allocation to the relief association until December 19, 2020, which is not within 60 days of receipt, as required by Section 706 (b)(2) of the Act of December 18, 1984, (P.L. 1005, No. 205). In addition, upon receipt of the state aid allocation, the relief association did not ensure the funds were deposited timely into a relief association account.

In addition, the relief association did not deposit the 2021 state aid allocation it received from Mifflin Borough, in the amount of \$2,070, until February 1, 2022. The foreign fire insurance tax allocation was distributed to the municipal treasurer on September 21, 2021, who forwarded this state aid to the relief association on October 23, 2021, which is within 60 days of receipt, as required by Section 706 (b)(2) of the Act of December 18, 1984, (P.L. 1005, No. 205); however, upon receipt of the state aid allocation, the relief association did not ensure the funds were deposited timely into a relief association account.

Criteria: Section 706 (b)(2) of the Act of December 18, 1984, (P.L. 1005, No. 205), states:

The foreign fire insurance premium tax amount applicable to a municipality served solely by volunteer firefighters shall be paid to the municipality, which shall within 60 days of the date of the receipt of the moneys from the State Treasurer pay the amount received to the relief association fund of the fire department or departments, or fire company or companies, now existing or hereafter organized, inside or outside of the municipality, which is or are actively engaged in the service of the municipality and duly recognized by the governing body of the municipality.

#### **Finding No. 2 – (Continued)**

Furthermore, prudent business practice dictates that, upon receipt of its state aid allocation, the relief association should establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the funds are deposited in a timely manner.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials indicated that the 2020 state aid allocation was deposited late due to changes in the individuals holding the relief association officers' positions. In addition, relief association officials indicated that the 2021 state aid allocation was not timely deposited into the relief association's account as it was erroneously deposited into the affiliated fire company general account.

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of the untimely receipt and deposits, funds were not available to pay general operating expenses or for investment purposes. In addition, an untimely receipt and deposit of funds increases the risk that funds could be lost or misappropriated.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials adopt internal control procedures to ensure the timely receipt and deposit of all future income received. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

#### Finding No. 3 – Failure To Maintain Minutes Of Meetings

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association did not maintain minutes of meetings as required by the VFRA Act and the relief association's bylaws. In 2020, the relief association only held and provided meeting minutes for three meetings and in 2021, the relief association only held and provided meeting minutes for two meetings. In 2018 and 2019, the relief association held monthly meetings as required in the bylaws.

Criteria: Section 7415(a) of the VFRA Act states, in part, that the relief association:

... must provide for taking and preserving minutes of all meetings and maintenance of such books of account as may be necessary and appropriate to afford a permanent record of its fiscal affairs.

#### **Finding No. 3 – (Continued)**

In addition, the relief association's bylaws at Article III, Section 1 (of the Constitution) states, in part:

Regular meetings of the association shall be conducted once every month.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials indicated that meetings were not held due to the COVID-19 pandemic.

<u>Effect</u>: Without holding regular meetings and maintaining detailed minutes of meetings, evidence that relief association business was presented before the membership for approval does not exist.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials hold all required meetings and maintain a permanent record of all relief association meetings as required by the VFRA Act and the relief association's bylaws (constitution). The minutes should include an adequate record of all financial-related business conducted by the relief association. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

# Finding No. 4 – Failure To Adhere To Relief Association Bylaws

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association did not adhere to a provision in the relief association's bylaws. Specifically, the relief association did not abide by the following bylaw stipulation for the relief association officers' salaries, payable to the President, Vice President, Secretary, Assistant Secretary and Treasurer. The relief association paid a salary to an ineligible individual.

# **Finding No. 4 – (Continued)**

Criteria: The relief association's bylaws at Article IV, Section 5 states:

Officers salaries shall be paid to the President of the association in the amount of \$150.00, Secretary in the amount of \$150.00, Asst. Secretary in the amount of \$150.00, Vice President in the amount of \$150.00, and the Treasurer in the amount of \$150.00 for service rendered in office, to be paid in equal payments once a year.

Furthermore, prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should adhere to all provisions stipulated in the relief association's bylaws to ensure that the relief association conducts its affairs with proper authorization.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials voted to change the amount of the officer's salary as documented in the May 2021 meeting minutes; however, the relief association officials were unaware that the bylaws need to be amended to include the changes of the officer's salary amounts and only pay the positions designated within the bylaws.

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of the relief association not following the mandatory provisions stipulated in the bylaws, the relief association may have conducted its affairs without proper authorization.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials review the bylaws governing their organization, establish guidelines and procedures and ensure they follow the provisions contained in the bylaws in order to assure that the association conducts its affairs with proper authorization. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

# Finding No. 5 – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association failed to maintain a complete and accurate roster of equipment owned by the relief association. Although a listing of relief association owned equipment was provided during the current audit period, it was incomplete because it did not contain the names of suppliers (vendors), dates of purchase, cost of equipment and serial numbers to accurately identify equipment owned by the relief association. As such, it was impossible to determine if all equipment purchased during the audit period in the amount of \$5,850 was recorded. In addition, there was no indication that a physical inventory of equipment was conducted on an annual basis to account for the equipment owned by the relief association.

<u>Criteria</u>: Prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster of all items purchased by the relief association in order to provide an effective accounting control over the relief association's equipment. A cumulative equipment roster of all relief association equipment should include all of the following:

- Types of equipment purchased
- Dates of purchase
- Unit costs
- Names of suppliers
- Serial numbers, if applicable
- Current locations of items
- Final dispositions of sold or damaged equipment
- Evidence of the performance and results of an annual physical inventory

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials did not provide a reason for why this occurred.

<u>Effect</u>: The failure to properly record equipment purchases in a detailed equipment roster prevents officials from effectively monitoring the relief association's equipment purchases. In addition, the failure to maintain a detailed equipment roster and perform an annual physical inventory of equipment prevents adequate accountability for, and safeguarding of, relief association equipment.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials maintain a cumulative equipment roster of all equipment owned by the relief association. Furthermore, the relief association should ensure it performs an annual physical inventory of all operable equipment and that the completion of the inventory be sufficiently documented. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

# **Finding No. 5 – (Continued)**

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

# Finding No. 6 – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Membership Roster

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association officials did not maintain a complete and accurate roster of relief association members. The membership roster provided did not include four of the five individuals listed as current officers of the relief association.

<u>Criteria</u>: Relief association officials should maintain a complete and accurate roster of the relief association's membership, as identified by criteria set forth in the relief association's bylaws. A comprehensive roster of all relief association members should include the following:

- Names of each member
- Members' mailing addresses
- Dates of births
- Dates of memberships
- Membership classifications

In addition, when warranted, a notation should be made on the roster identifying the date of a member's resignation or death.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials indicated that they were unaware that they should maintain a comprehensive roster of relief association members.

<u>Effect</u>: The failure to maintain a comprehensive membership roster could result in the payment of benefits to nonmembers, or deprive eligible relief association members from receiving authorized benefit payments.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials compile and maintain a complete and accurate roster of the relief association's membership. For additional guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

# **Finding No. 6 – (Continued)**

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

# MIFFLIN FIREMAN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

#### **The Honorable Tom W. Wolf** Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

#### Mr. Charles J. McGarvey, Sr. State Fire Commissioner

Mifflin Fireman's Relief Association Governing Body:

Mr. Nathan A. Jones President

Mr. Donald Peck, Jr. Vice President

Mr. Jordan Klinger Secretary

Ms. Christina Geesey Treasurer

The following municipalities allocated foreign fire insurance tax monies to this relief association and received a copy of this report:

Ms. Amber B. Eby Secretary Mifflin Borough

# Ms. Mary D. Houtz Secretary

Milford Township

# MIFFLIN FIREMAN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at <u>www.PaAuditor.gov.</u> Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: <u>news@PaAuditor.gov</u>.