COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Montoursville Firemen's Relief Association, Inc. of Montoursville, PA

Lycoming County, Pennsylvania
For the Period
January 1, 2020, to December 31, 2022

January 2024



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General

Timothy L. DeFoor • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

TIMOTHY L. DEFOOR AUDITOR GENERAL

Mr. Jeff Kukuchka, President Montoursville Firemen's Relief Association, Inc. of Montoursville, PA Lycoming County

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Montoursville Firemen's Relief Association, Inc. of Montoursville, PA (relief association) for the period January 1, 2020, to December 31, 2022. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, 72 P.S. § 403; and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act ("VFRA Act"), see 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418.

The objectives of the audit were:

- 1. To determine if the relief association took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report.
- 2. To determine if the relief association complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above and was not, nor was it required to be, conducted in accordance with Government Auditing Standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States.

Relief association officers are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the relief association's administration of state aid and accumulated relief association funds complies with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures, including the safeguarding of assets. Relief association officers are responsible for complying with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures. It is our responsibility to perform procedures to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to the extent necessary to satisfy the audit objectives. We believe that our audit provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions.

Based on our audit procedures, we conclude that, for the period January 1, 2020, to December 31, 2022:

- The relief association did not take appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report, as detailed below, and discussed in the Status of Prior Findings section of this report.
- The relief association, in all significant respects, complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds, except as noted in the findings listed below and discussed later in this report.
 - Finding No. 1 Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation Undocumented Expenditures
 - Finding No. 2 Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation Failure
 To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster
 - Finding No. 3 Untimely Receipt And Deposit Of State Aid
 - Finding No. 4 Inadequate Minutes Of Meetings And Relief Association Bylaws
 - Finding No. 5 Payment Of Pennsylvania Sales Tax
 - Finding No. 6 Duplicate Payment

Timothy L. Detool

We are concerned by the number of findings noted and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendations noted in this audit report.

The contents of this report were discussed with the management of the relief association and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank the relief association officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

Timothy L. DeFoor Auditor General

December 27, 2023

CONTENTS

<u>Page</u>
Background
Status of Prior Findings
Findings and Recommendations:
Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Undocumented Expenditures
Finding No. 2 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster6
Finding No. 3 – Untimely Receipt And Deposit Of State Aid
Finding No. 4 – Inadequate Minutes Of Meetings And Relief Association Bylaws9
Finding No. 5 – Payment Of Pennsylvania Sales Tax10
Finding No. 6 – Duplicate Payment
Report Distribution List

BACKGROUND

Pursuant to Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code¹, and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act² ("VFRA Act"), the Department of the Auditor General's duty is to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association to determine that funds received under the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution Law³ (commonly referred to as Act 205) are properly expended.

The relief association is a charitable organization that was formed primarily to afford financial protection to volunteer firefighters and to encourage individuals to participate in volunteer fire service.

The VFRA Act governs the overall operation of volunteer firefighters' relief associations. Relief association bylaws define the specific operational procedures by which relief associations conduct business. To fulfill its primary purpose, the VFRA Act authorizes specific types of expenditures and prescribes appropriate volunteer firefighters' relief association investment options. Within the parameters established by the VFRA Act, it is the responsibility of relief associations to choose investments in a proper and prudent manner.

Volunteer firefighters' relief associations receive public tax monies, and the relief association officers therefore have a responsibility to the public to conduct the relief association's financial affairs in a businesslike manner and to maintain sufficient financial records to support the propriety of all relief association transactions. Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are also responsible for ensuring that the relief association operates in accordance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures.

Act 205 sets forth the computation of the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution paid to each applicable municipality throughout the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. The amount of the distribution is based upon the population of each municipality and the market value of real estate within the municipality. Upon receipt of this distribution, the municipality must allocate the funds to the volunteer firefighters' relief association of the fire service organization or fire service organizations that is or are recognized as providing the service to the municipality.

³ 53 P.S. § 895.701 et seq. (Act 205 of 1984, as amended by Act 119 of 1990).

¹ 72 P.S. § 403 (as last amended by Act 44 of 2017).

² 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 et seq. See specifically, 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418 (amended by Act 91 of 2020).

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

The relief association was allocated state aid from the following municipalities:

Municipality	County	2020	2021	2022
Fairfield Township	Lycoming	\$19,022	\$17,644	\$21,784*
Montoursville Borough	Lycoming	\$26,276	\$23,442	\$29,128
Upper Fairfield Township	Lycoming	\$ 7,609	\$ 6,724	\$ 8,200

^{*} The 2022 state aid allocation received from Fairfield Township was not received and deposited by the relief association until January 3, 2023, as disclosed in Finding No. 3 in this report.

Based on the relief association's records, its total cash, and investments as of December 31, 2022, were \$209,034, as illustrated below:

Cash	\$ 32,598
Fair Value of Investments	 176,436
Total Cash and Investments	\$ 209,034

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

Based on the relief association's records, its total expenditures for the period January 1, 2020, to December 31, 2022, were \$213,233, as noted below. The accuracy of these expenditures was evaluated as part of the Department's audit to conclude on the relief association's compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds. The scope of the Department's audit does not include the issuance of an opinion on the accuracy of these amounts.

Expenditures:

Benefit Services:	
Insurance premiums	\$ 48,127
Death benefits	20,000
Relief benefits	3,038
Total Benefit Services	\$ 71,165
Fire Services:	
Equipment purchased	\$ 133,014
Equipment maintenance	2,720
Training expenses	3,160
Total Fire Services	\$ 138,894
Administrative Services:	
Bond premiums	\$ 1,710
Other administrative expenses	1,464
Total Administrative Services	\$ 3,174
Total Expenditures	\$ 213,233

The volunteer firefighters' relief association and the affiliated fire service organization are separate, legal entities. The relief association is affiliated with the following fire service organization:

Willing Hand Hose Company No. 1, Inc.

⁴ Accuracy was evaluated for a selection of transactions based on dollar amount, category, and/or random selection.

MONTOURSVILLE FIREMEN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION, INC. OF MONTOURSVILLE, PENNSYLVANIA STATUS OF PRIOR FINDINGS

NONCOMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The relief association has not complied with the following prior audit findings. These findings are noted below and discussed in detail in the Findings and Recommendations section of this report:

- <u>Undocumented Expenditures</u>
- Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster

We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct those previously reported audit findings. The relief association management should strive to implement the recommendations and corrective actions noted in this audit report.

<u>Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Undocumented Expenditures</u>

<u>Condition</u>: During the prior audit period, the relief association was unable to provide adequate supporting documentation or receive reimbursement for \$1,247 of undocumented expenditures, and the relief association officials did not take corrective action to address the undocumented expenditures prior to the current audit period ending December 31, 2022.

Criteria: Section 7418(a) of the VFRA Act states:

The Office of Auditor General shall have the power and its duty shall be to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association receiving money under Chapter 7 of the Act of December 18, 1984 (P.L. 1005, No. 205), known as the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act, as far as may be necessary to satisfy the Auditor General that the money received was or is being expended for no purpose other than that authorized by this subchapter. Copies of all audits shall be furnished to the Governor.

Prudent business practice dictates that supporting documentation be maintained to evidence the propriety of all financial transactions.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association management stated that they were not aware that the undocumented expenditures were not reimbursed from the prior audit.

<u>Effect</u>: Lack of supporting documentation, such as invoices, itemized receipts and detailed minutes of meetings, made it impossible to determine if the expenditures were made in accordance with Section 7416(f) of the VFRA Act. In addition, the failure to maintain adequate supporting documentation for relief association expenditures can lead to an increased risk of errors occurring and funds being misappropriated.

Recommendation: We recommend that the relief association officials provide this department with adequate supporting documentation, such as invoices and/or itemized receipts, to ensure the propriety of the expenditures or that the relief association be reimbursed \$1,247 for the undocumented expenditures. We also recommend that the relief association officials maintain supporting documentation for all future expenditures. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

Finding No. 1 – (Continued)

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendation noted in this audit report.

<u>Finding No. 2 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster</u>

Condition: The relief association failed to maintain a complete and accurate roster of equipment owned by the relief association. Although a listing of relief association owned equipment was provided during the current audit, it was incomplete because it did not contain the names of suppliers (vendors), dates of purchase, cost of equipment, and serial numbers to accurately identify equipment owned by the relief association. As such, it was impossible to determine if all equipment purchased during the audit period in the amount of \$133,014 was recorded. In addition, there was insufficient documentation to support that a physical inventory of equipment was conducted on an annual basis to account for the equipment owned by the relief association.

A similar condition was noted in our prior audit report.

<u>Criteria</u>: Prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster of all items purchased by the relief association in order to provide an effective accounting control over the relief association's equipment. A cumulative equipment roster of all relief association equipment should include all of the following:

- Types of equipment purchased
- Dates of purchase
- Unit costs
- Names of suppliers
- Serial numbers, if applicable
- Current locations of items
- Final dispositions of sold or damaged equipment
- Evidence of the performance and results of an annual physical inventory

Finding No. 2 – (Continued)

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials stated that they always did a year-to-year list; however, they will compile a cumulative list of all equipment owned by the relief association in the future.

<u>Effect</u>: The continued failure to properly record equipment purchases in a detailed equipment roster prevents officials from effectively monitoring the relief association's equipment purchases. In addition, the failure to maintain a detailed cumulative equipment roster and sufficiently document the performance of an annual physical inventory of equipment prevents adequate accountability for, and safeguarding of, relief association equipment.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We again recommend that the relief association officials maintain a cumulative equipment roster of all equipment owned by the relief association. Furthermore, the relief association should ensure it performs an annual physical inventory of all operable equipment and that the completion of the inventory be sufficiently documented. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendation noted in this audit report.

Finding No. 3 – Untimely Receipt And Deposit Of State Aid

Condition: Although Fairfield Township prepared and returned a Certification Form AG 385 for 2022 by the March 31 annual filing date in accordance with Act 205, the township did not distribute the 2022 state aid to the relief association in a timely manner. The foreign fire insurance tax allocation was distributed to the municipal treasurer on September 21, 2022, who forwarded this state aid to the relief association on December 19, 2022, which is not within 60 days of receipt, as required by Section 706 (b)(2) of the Act of December 18, 1984, (P.L. 1005, No. 205). The relief association had no documentation that it had attempted to obtain the funds from the township. Since there was no documentation indicating that the relief association attempted to retrieve the funds, the relief association did not document an attempt to ensure the funds were received and deposited timely. The relief association did not deposit the 2022 state aid allocation it received from Fairfield Township, in the amount of \$21,784, until January 3, 2023.

Finding No. 3 – (Continued)

<u>Criteria</u>: Section 706 (b)(2) of the Act of December 18, 1984, (P.L. 1005, No. 205), states:

The foreign fire insurance premium tax amount applicable to a municipality served solely by volunteer firefighters shall be paid to the municipality, which shall within 60 days of the date of the receipt of the moneys from the State Treasurer pay the amount received to the relief association fund of the fire department or departments, or fire company or companies, now existing or hereafter organized, inside or outside of the municipality, which is or are actively engaged in the service of the municipality and duly recognized by the governing body of the municipality.

Furthermore, prudent business practice dictates that upon receipt of its state aid allocation, the relief association should establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the funds are deposited in a timely manner.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association management stated the Township employed a new office administrator at the end of 2022 and they called to remind the township of the allotment, but going forward the relief association will work on calling sooner if the state aid allotment is not received timely in the future.

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of the untimely receipt and deposit, funds were not available to pay general operating expenses or for investment purposes. In addition, an untimely receipt and deposit of funds increases the risk that funds could be lost or misappropriated.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials adopt internal control procedures to ensure the timely receipt and deposit of all future income received. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

Finding No. 4 – Inadequate Minutes Of Meetings And Relief Association Bylaws

Condition: The relief association failed to maintain detailed minutes of meetings as required by the VFRA Act and the relief association's bylaws. Specifically, the relief association's minutes did not address all of the financial-related transactions that occurred during the audit period. Furthermore, the meeting minutes were not signed and dated by the recording officer/Secretary. Additionally, the existing bylaws of the relief association contains language to conduct business pertaining to the disbursement, investment, and purchase of funds based on Act 84 of June 11, 1968. Therefore, the relief association has not updated the bylaws to govern their organization to meet the current requirements set forth in the VFRA Act (Act 118 of 2010 and Act 91 of 2020).

Criteria: Section 7415(a) of the VFRA Act states, in part, that the relief association:

... must provide for taking and preserving minutes of all meetings and maintenance of such books of account as may be necessary and appropriate to afford a permanent record of its fiscal affairs.

The relief association's bylaws at Article IV, Section 3 states:

It shall be the duty of the Secretary to keep a complete record of all meetings and perform any other duties incumbent on the office by the Association. The Secretary shall deliver to the successor in office all books and papers pertaining to that office.

In addition, the relief association's bylaws at Article IX, Section 2 states:

These Bylaws are to be used to govern this Association. All other provisions not covered by these Bylaws shall be governed by Act No. 84, Public Law 149, enacted by the General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania on the 11th day of June A.D. 1968 as amended.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials indicated that they were unaware that maintaining detailed minutes of meetings was required by the VFRA Act and the relief association's bylaws. In addition, the relief association officials did not provide a reason why financial transactions were not addressed within the meeting minutes, why the Secretary of the Relief Association did not sign the meeting minutes, or why the bylaws were not updated to meet the requirements of the VFRA Act.

Finding No. 4 – (Continued)

<u>Effect</u>: Without maintaining detailed minutes of meetings that are signed and dated, evidence that relief association business was presented before the membership for approval does not exist. As a result of the relief association not updating the bylaws to meet the appropriate requirements, the relief association may have conducted its affairs without proper authorization.

Recommendation: We recommend that the relief association officials maintain detailed minutes of meetings as required by the VFRA Act and the relief association's bylaws, evidencing the discussion and approval of all financial-related business conducted by the relief association. We also recommend that the relief association officials ensure that all meeting minutes are signed and dated by the Secretary of the Relief Association to ensure the validity of the meeting minutes. In addition, we recommend that the relief association officials remove the language referring to Act 84 by updating the bylaws governing their organization so that the bylaws meet the requirements set forth in the VFRA Act (Act 118 of 2010 and Act 91 of 2020). For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

Finding No. 5 – Payment Of Pennsylvania Sales Tax

<u>Condition</u>: On November 24, 2019, the relief association paid \$70 of Pennsylvania sales tax to a vendor from which the relief association purchased equipment. This payment would not have been required if the relief association had provided its sales tax exemption number to the vendor. We provided a verbal observation to the relief association during the prior audit regarding the deficiency, but the deficiency was not corrected.

Criteria: Section 7415(e) of the VFRA Act states:

A volunteer firefighters' relief association organized or conducted in accordance with the requirements of this section shall be regarded as a charitable corporation for all purposes, including the right to establish exemption from the operation of certain taxes.

Finding No. 5 – (Continued)

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association management indicated that they were unaware of the necessity to provide their state sales tax exemption number to all vendors from which the relief association purchases equipment.

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of the relief association's failure to provide its sales tax exemption number to all vendors, the relief association was required to pay Pennsylvania sales tax on its purchase, which reduced the funds otherwise available for general operating expenditures and for investment purposes.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials seek a refund of the sales tax paid, in the amount of \$70, by filing an appeal form (REV-65BA) with the Pennsylvania Department of Revenue's Board of Appeals. In addition, we recommend that, in the future, relief association officials furnish its state sales tax exemption number to all vendors from which the relief association purchases equipment. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

<u>Finding No. 6 – Duplicate Payment</u>

Condition: During the prior audit and cited as a verbal observation, on November 15, 2018, the relief association expended \$160 for an equipment purchase. On December 3, 2018, the relief association erroneously made a duplicate payment for the same equipment purchase. As such, the second payment is considered an unauthorized disbursement because no goods or services were received for the payment. The relief association failed to obtain reimbursement for the duplicate payment during the current audit period.

<u>Criteria</u>: Adequate accounting and internal control procedures should be implemented to prevent duplicate payment of invoices and to ensure duplicate payments are recouped.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials stated they believe the invoices overlapped in the mail and it was therefore paid twice.

Finding No. 6 – (Continued)

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of failing to obtain reimbursement for the erroneous payment, the relief association was unable to use these funds for other general operating expenses or for investment purposes.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association be reimbursed \$160 for the erroneous duplicate payment. The relief association officials should consider contacting the vendor to recover the duplicate payment. In addition, the relief association officials should establish accounting and internal control procedures to monitor future relief association expenditures. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

MONTOURSVILLE FIREMEN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION, INC. OF MONTOURSVILLE, PENNSYLVANIA REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Joshua D. Shapiro

Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Montoursville Firemen's Relief Association, Inc. of Montoursville, PA Governing Body:

Mr. Jeff Kukuchka

President

Mr. Chris Suzadail

Vice President

Mr. Luke Davies

Secretary

Mr. Scott Konkle

Treasurer

Mr. Joseph Hanstine

Assistant Treasurer

MONTOURSVILLE FIREMEN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION, INC. OF MONTOURSVILLE, PENNSYLVANIA REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

The following municipalities allocated foreign fire insurance tax monies to this relief association and received a copy of this report:

Ms. Tracey Buffington
Secretary
Fairfield Township

Ms. Ginny A. Gardner
Secretary
Montoursville Borough

Ms. Penny RuggieriSecretary
Upper Fairfield Township

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.