COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Salisbury Volunteer Firemen's Relief Association

Somerset County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2018 to December 31, 2021

July 2022



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General

Timothy L. DeFoor • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

TIMOTHY L. DEFOOR AUDITOR GENERAL

Mr. Zachary Plummer, President Salisbury Volunteer Firemen's Relief Association Somerset County

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Salisbury Volunteer Firemen's Relief Association (relief association) for the period January 1, 2018 to December 31, 2021. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, 72 P.S. § 403; and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act ("VFRA Act"), see 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418.

The objectives of the audit were:

- 1. To determine if the relief association took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report.
- 2. To determine if the relief association complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above and was not, nor was it required to be, conducted in accordance with Government Auditing Standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States.

Relief association officers are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the relief association's administration of state aid and accumulated relief funds complies with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures, including the safeguarding of assets. Relief association officers are responsible for complying with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures. It is our responsibility to perform procedures to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to the extent necessary to satisfy the audit objectives. We believe that our audit provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions.

We were not able to obtain an independent confirmation of a portion of the investment balance directly from the financial institution. Therefore, while the relief association provided copies of investment statements that indicated that, as of December 31, 2021, the relief association had an investment balance with a fair value of \$142,796, we were not able to verify a portion of this investment balance.

Based on our audit procedures, we conclude that, for the period January 1, 2018 to December 31, 2021:

- The relief association did not take appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report, as detailed below and discussed in the Status of Prior Finding section of this report.
- Because of the significance of the matter described in Finding No. 2 below and discussed later in this report and the effects, if any, of the matter described in the preceding paragraph, the relief association did not, in all significant respects, comply with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds, collectively as a whole. Therefore, the relief association may be subject to the potential withholding of its upcoming state aid distribution, as discussed in the Potential Withhold of State Aid section of this report.
 - Finding No. 1 Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation Failure
 To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster
 - Finding No. 2 Failure To Secure Ownership Interest In Jointly Purchased Vehicle
 - Finding No. 3 Unauthorized Expenditures
 - Finding No. 4 Relief Association Checking Account And Certificates Of Deposit Inappropriately Registered Under Affiliated Fire Service Organization's Federal Tax Identification Number
 - Finding No. 5 Failure To Maintain Minutes Of Meetings
 - Finding No. 6 Inadequate Investment Records

We are concerned by the number of findings noted and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendations noted in this audit report.

The contents of this report were discussed with the management of the relief association and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank the relief association officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

Timothy L. DeFoor Auditor General

June 28, 2022

CONTENTS

<u>Page</u>
Background
Status of Prior Finding
Findings and Recommendations:
Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster5
Finding No. 2 – Failure To Secure Ownership Interest In Jointly Purchased Vehicle6
Finding No. 3 – Unauthorized Expenditures
Finding No. 4 – Relief Association Checking Account And Certificates Of Deposit Inappropriately Registered Under Affiliated Fire Service Organization's Federal Tax Identification Number
Finding No. 5 – Failure To Maintain Minutes Of Meetings
Finding No. 6 – Inadequate Investment Records
Potential Withhold of State Aid
Report Distribution List

BACKGROUND

Pursuant to Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code¹, and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act² ("VFRA Act"), the Department of the Auditor General's duty is to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association to determine that funds received under the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution Law³ (commonly referred to as Act 205) are properly expended.

The relief association is a charitable organization that was formed primarily to afford financial protection to volunteer firefighters and to encourage individuals to participate in volunteer fire service.

The VFRA Act governs the overall operation of volunteer firefighters' relief associations. Relief association bylaws define the specific operational procedures by which relief associations conduct business. To fulfill its primary purpose, the VFRA Act authorizes specific types of expenditures and prescribes appropriate volunteer firefighters' relief association investment options. Within the parameters established by the VFRA Act, it is the responsibility of relief associations to choose investments in a proper and prudent manner.

Volunteer firefighters' relief associations receive public tax monies, and the association officers therefore have a responsibility to the public to conduct the association's financial affairs in a businesslike manner and to maintain sufficient financial records to support the propriety of all association transactions. Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are also responsible for ensuring that the association operates in accordance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures.

Act 205 sets forth the computation of the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution paid to each applicable municipality throughout the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. The amount of the distribution is based upon the population of each municipality and the market value of real estate within the municipality. Upon receipt of this distribution, the municipality must allocate the funds to the volunteer firefighters' relief association of the fire service organization or fire service organizations that is or are recognized as providing the service to the municipality.

³ 53 P.S. § 895.701 et seq. (Act 205 of 1984, as amended by Act 119 of 1990).

¹ 72 P.S. § 403 (as last amended by Act 44 of 2017).

² 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 et seq. See specifically, 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418 (amended by Act 91 of 2020).

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

The relief association was allocated state aid from the following municipalities:

Municipality	County	2018	2019	2020	2021
Elk Lick Township Greenville Township	Somerset Somerset	\$10,600 \$ 1,770	\$11,321 \$ 1,870	\$11,512 \$ 1,886	\$10,179 \$ 1,762
Salisbury Borough	Somerset	\$ 3,038	\$ 3,210	\$ 3,247	\$ 2,930*

^{*} Although Salisbury Borough prepared and returned a Certification Form AG 385 for 2021, the borough failed to submit a 2021 Receipt And Distribution Of Foreign Fire Insurance Premium Tax Form 706-B to this department as required by the instructions accompanying Form 706-B and the instructions accompanying the 2021 state aid allocation received by the borough disclosing this information.

Salisbury Borough is still required to complete a 2021 Receipt And Distribution Of Foreign Fire Insurance Premium Tax Form 706-B online within the Department of Community & Economic Development's Municipal Statistics website (MunStats) immediately.

Based on the relief association's records, its total cash and investments as of December 31, 2021 were \$163,383, as illustrated below:

Cash	\$ 20,587
Fair Value of Investments	 142,796
Total Cash and Investments	\$ 163,383

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

Based on the relief association's records, its total expenditures for the period January 1, 2018 to December 31, 2021 were \$104,640, as noted below. The accuracy of these expenditures was evaluated as part of the Department's audit to conclude on the relief association's compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds.⁴ The scope of the Department's audit does not include the issuance of an opinion on the accuracy of these amounts.

Expenditures:

Benefit Services:	
Insurance premiums	\$ 10,259
Death benefits	 3,600
Total Benefit Services	\$ 13,859
Fire Services:	
Equipment purchased	\$ 47,845
Equipment maintenance	11,170
Total Fire Services	\$ 59,015
Administrative Services:	
Other administrative expenses	\$ 997
Bond premiums	250
Total Administrative Services	\$ 1,247
Total Investments Purchased	\$ 30,000
Other Expenditures:	
Unauthorized expenditures	\$ 519
Total Expenditures	\$ 104,640

The volunteer firefighters' relief association and the affiliated fire service organization are separate, legal entities. The relief association is affiliated with the following fire service organization:

Salisbury Volunteer Fire Department

⁴ Accuracy was evaluated for a selection of transactions based on dollar amount, category, and/or random selection.

SALISBURY VOLUNTEER FIREMEN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION STATUS OF PRIOR FINDING

NONCOMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

The relief association has not complied with the following prior audit finding. This finding is noted below and discussed in detail in the Findings and Recommendations section of this report:

• Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster

We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding. The relief association management should strive to implement the recommendation and corrective action noted in this audit report.

<u>Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain</u> <u>A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster</u>

Condition: The relief association failed to maintain a complete and accurate roster of equipment owned by the relief association. Specifically, the relief association purchased \$47,845 of equipment during the current audit period and there was no equipment roster created or maintained for these purchases. Of the \$47,845 of equipment purchased, \$35,000 was the relief association's contribution towards the joint purchase of a vehicle with the affiliated fire company (See Finding No. 2). In addition, the \$4,141 of equipment purchased in the prior audit period was still not properly accounted for on the relief association's equipment roster. Furthermore, there was no indication that a physical inventory of equipment was conducted on an annual basis, nor whether such inventory accounted for all equipment owned by the relief association.

A similar condition was noted in our prior audit report.

<u>Criteria</u>: Prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster of all items purchased by the relief association in order to provide an effective accounting control over the relief association's equipment. A cumulative equipment roster of all relief association equipment should include all of the following:

- Types of equipment purchased
- Dates of purchase
- Unit costs
- Names of suppliers
- Serial numbers, if applicable
- Current locations of items
- Final dispositions of sold or damaged equipment
- Evidence of the performance and results of an annual physical inventory

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association official indicated that they did not have an equipment roster to start with which resulted in not maintaining/providing an equipment roster in the current audit period.

<u>Effect</u>: The continued failure to properly record equipment purchases in a detailed equipment roster prevents officials from effectively monitoring the relief association's equipment purchases. In addition, the failure to maintain a detailed equipment roster and perform an annual physical inventory of equipment prevents adequate accountability for, and safeguarding of, relief association equipment.

Finding No. 1 – (Continued)

<u>Recommendation</u>: We again recommend that the relief association officials create and maintain a cumulative equipment roster of all equipment owned by the relief association. Furthermore, the relief association should ensure it performs an annual physical inventory of all operable equipment and that the completion of the inventory be sufficiently documented. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendation noted in this audit report.

Finding No. 2 - Failure To Secure Ownership Interest In Jointly Purchased Vehicle

Condition: On September 10, 2021 and March 18, 2022, the relief association expended \$35,000 and \$50,000, respectively, for contributions totaling \$85,000, for the purpose of jointly purchasing a 2021 Spartan Metrostar Pumper with the affiliated fire company without executing a formal written agreement to secure its proportional ownership interest. According to documentation provided, it appears that the total cost of the truck was \$455,805.

Criteria: Section 7418(a) of the VFRA Act states:

The Office of Auditor General shall have the power and its duty shall be to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association receiving money under Chapter 7 of the Act of December 18, 1984 (P.L. 1005, No. 205), known as the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act, as far as may be necessary to satisfy the Auditor General that the money received was or is being expended for no purpose other than that authorized by this subchapter. Copies of all audits shall be furnished to the Governor.

Prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should secure its proportional ownership interest in the jointly purchased vehicle by executing a formal written agreement that enumerates the relief association's proportional share of financing. Such agreement shall specify that the relief association shall receive its prorated share of the proceeds upon sale of the vehicle, in the event the vehicle is ever sold.

Finding No. 2 – (Continued)

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials did not provide a reason for why an agreement was not prepared.

<u>Effect</u>: The failure to adequately secure the proportional share of ownership interest in the jointly purchased vehicle places the relief association's ownership interest at greater risk. Furthermore, the relief association's future state aid allocations may be withheld until the finding recommendation is complied with.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials execute a formal written agreement with the fire company that enumerates the relief association's proportional ownership interest in the jointly purchased vehicle as well as stipulating that the proportionate sales proceeds shall revert to the relief association in the event the vehicle is ever sold. If such action is not taken, we recommend that the relief association be reimbursed \$85,000. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: Due to the potential withhold of state aid, the relief association's compliance with the finding recommendation will be monitored subsequent to the release of the audit report and through our next audit of the relief association.

<u>Finding No. 3 – Unauthorized Expenditures</u>

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association expended funds for the following items during the current audit period that are not authorized by the VFRA Act:

Date	Check No.	Description			Amount
02/04/2019	1034	Payment of sales tax		\$	12
03/15/2021	1050	Maintenance on fire truck pump			332
06/07/2021	1056	Payment of sales tax			89
07/05/2021	1060	Payment of sales tax			3
08/16/2021	1061	Payment of sales tax			4
10/18/2021	1065	Payment of sales tax			79
			Total	\$	519

Finding No. 3 – (Continued)

Criteria: Section 7416(f) of the VFRA Act states:

The funds of any volunteer firefighters' relief association may be spent:

- (1) To pay for such normal and reasonable running expenses as may be appropriate to the businesslike conduct of the affairs of the association, including legal fees, rental or purchase of offices, payment of reasonable compensation of employees and purchase of office equipment and supplies.
- (11) To purchase safeguards for preserving life, health and safety of volunteer firefighters to ensure their availability to participate in the volunteer fire service.

Costs associated with the payment of sales tax and maintenance on a fire truck pump do not qualify as authorized volunteer firefighters' relief association expenditures; consequently, these disbursements are not authorized under the VFRA Act.

Cause: The relief association officials did not provide a reason for why this occurred.

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of these improper expenditures, relief association funds were not available for investment purposes, or to pay for expenditures authorized by the VFRA Act.

Recommendation: We recommend that the relief association be reimbursed \$519 for the unauthorized expenditures and that relief association officials become familiar with Section 7416(f) of the VFRA Act to aid them in determining the propriety of future expenditures. We also recommend that the relief association officials furnish their Pennsylvania sales tax exemption number to all vendors from whom the relief association purchases equipment. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

Finding No. 4 – Relief Association Checking Account And Certificates Of Deposit Inappropriately Registered Under Affiliated Fire Service Organization's Federal Tax Identification Number

Condition: As of December 31, 2021, the relief association held two certificates of deposit and a checking account, with a total cost value of \$76,742, which were inappropriately registered under the fire company's federal tax identification number rather than the relief association's identification number. In addition, one of the two certificates of deposit, with a cost value of \$27,070, was inappropriately issued in the name of the fire company instead of the name of the relief association. These \$76,742 in cash and investments represent 47 percent of the relief association's total assets.

<u>Criteria</u>: Prudent business practice dictates that the relief association maintain ownership of all cash and investment accounts as a means of safeguarding its assets from unauthorized use or disposition.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials did not provide a reason for why this occurred.

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of the cash and investment accounts being inappropriately registered under another entity's federal tax identification number, these relief association assets were not properly safeguarded.

Recommendation: We recommend that the relief association officials secure ownership rights to all monetary assets. This requirement can be accomplished by ensuring that all investments are registered under the relief association's federal tax identification number and issued in the name of the relief association. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

Finding No. 5 – Failure To Maintain Minutes Of Meetings

Condition: The relief association did not maintain minutes of meetings as required by the VFRA Act and the relief association's bylaws. Specifically, the relief association's minutes did not address all financial-related transactions that occurred during the audit period. In addition, meetings were only held in six months during calendar year 2018, eight months during calendar year 2019 and four months during calendar year 2021. There were no meetings held during calendar year 2020. Furthermore, the meeting minutes were not signed by the recording officer and the relief association officials did not respond to our emails to confirm the validity of the meeting minutes to ensure the meeting minutes are not fraudulent, altered, etc.

Criteria: Section 7415(a) of the VFRA Act states, in part, that the relief association:

... must provide for taking and preserving minutes of all meetings and maintenance of such books of account as may be necessary and appropriate to afford a permanent record of its fiscal affairs.

The relief association's bylaws at Article II, Section 1 states, in part:

Regular meetings of this association shall be held on the first Monday of each month, immediately following the regular meeting of the Salisbury Volunteer Fire Department.

In addition, the relief association's bylaws at Article III, Section 3 states, in part:

SECRETARY: The secretary shall keep a true record of the proceedings of every meeting in the minutes. The minutes shall note authorization by the membership of all association financial transactions and all other pertinent business discussed at meetings.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials indicated that they did not have the minutes and were unaware that maintaining detailed minutes of meetings was required by the VFRA Act and the relief association's bylaws. The relief association officials did not provide a reason why meetings were not held in the calendar years 2018, 2019 and 2021; however, the relief association officials indicated that meetings in 2020 were not held due to the Covid-19 epidemic. In addition, relief association officials did not respond to our emails requesting verification of the validity of the meeting minutes.

<u>Effect</u>: Without holding regular meetings and maintaining detailed minutes of meetings, evidence that relief association business was presented before the membership for approval does not exist.

Finding No. 5 – (Continued)

Recommendation: We recommend that the relief association officials hold all required meetings and maintain a permanent record of all relief association meetings as required by the VFRA Act and the relief association's bylaws. The minutes should include an adequate record of all financial-related business conducted by the relief association. We also recommend that the relief association officials ensure that all meeting minutes are signed and dated by the Secretary of the relief association to ensure the validity of the meeting minutes. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

Finding No. 6 – Inadequate Investment Records

<u>Condition</u>: Relief association officials did not maintain adequate records of investments purchased and sold, as well as the source of investment income. Specifically, some of the investment transactions were not recorded in the relief association's journal, nor were they identified in the minutes of the relief association's meetings.

Criteria: Section 7415(a) of the VFRA Act states:

A volunteer firefighters' relief association may be a body corporate, governed by a charter and bylaws or an unincorporated association of individuals governed by bylaws and a constitution. In either case, it must provide for taking and preserving minutes of all meetings and maintenance of such books of account as may be necessary and appropriate to afford a permanent record of its fiscal affairs.

Additionally, sound accounting procedures for investment purchases and sales should include the recording of the following:

- Date of purchase or sale of the security
- Identification number of the security
- Rate of interest
- Date of receipt of interest income
- Date of maturity

Finding No. 6 – (Continued)

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials failed to establish adequate accounting procedures to record the transactions of each investment.

<u>Effect</u>: The failure to maintain an adequate record-keeping system for investment transactions prevents officials from effectively monitoring the relief association's financial position.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials take the necessary steps to record all investments purchased and sold, and identify the source and amount of investment income, so that all investment transactions are sufficiently documented. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

SALISBURY VOLUNTEER FIREMEN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION POTENTIAL WITHHOLD OF STATE AID

A condition such as that reported by Finding No. 2 contained in this audit report may lead to a total withholding of state aid in the future unless that finding is corrected. However, such action may not be considered if sufficient documentation is provided within 60 days to verify compliance with this department's recommendations. Such documentation should be submitted by the relief association to: Department of the Auditor General, Bureau of Fire Relief Audits, Room 327 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120.

SALISBURY VOLUNTEER FIREMEN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf

Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Mr. Charles J. McGarvey, Sr.

State Fire Commissioner

Salisbury Volunteer Firemen's Relief Association Governing Body:

Mr. Zachary Plummer

President

Mr. Daniel Short

Vice President

Mr. Daniel Johnson

Secretary

Mr. Paul Short

Treasurer

The following municipalities allocated foreign fire insurance tax monies to this relief association and received a copy of this report:

Ms. Tiffany R. Beal

Secretary Elk Lick Township

Ms. Teresa Snyder

Secretary Greenville Township

Ms. Nancy A. Green

Secretary Salisbury Borough

SALISBURY VOLUNTEER FIREMEN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.