

COMPLIANCE AUDIT

City of Clairton Non-Uniformed Pension Plan Allegheny County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2019 to December 31, 2021

December 2022



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Timothy L. DeFoor • Auditor General



**Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov**

**TIMOTHY L. DEFOOR
AUDITOR GENERAL**

The Honorable Mayor and City Council
City of Clairton
Allegheny County
Clairton, PA 15025

We have conducted a compliance audit of the City of Clairton Non-Uniformed Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2019 to December 31, 2021. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (Act 205 of 1984, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.402(j)), which requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to audit every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited. The audit was not conducted, nor was it required to be, in accordance with Government Auditing Standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. We planned and performed the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.

- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.
- We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing total members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- We determined whether the retirement benefit calculated for plan members who retired during the current audit period, and through the completion of our fieldwork procedures, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws, and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefits due to the retired individuals and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to the recipients.
- We determined whether the January 1, 2019 actuarial valuation report was prepared and submitted by March 31, 2020 in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on this report is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.

City officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the City of Clairton Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. As previously described, we tested transactions, interviewed selected officials and performed procedures to the extent necessary to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the City of Clairton Non-Uniformed Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following findings further discussed later in this report:

Finding No. 1 – Incorrect Pension Benefit Calculation

Finding No. 2 – Inadequate Accounting/Reporting Over Activity Of The Pension Plan

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of City of Clairton and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank city officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Timothy L. DeFoor". The signature is written in a cursive style with a long horizontal line extending to the left of the first letter.

Timothy L. DeFoor
Auditor General
November 30, 2022

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background.....	1
Findings and Recommendations:	
Finding No. 1 – Incorrect Pension Benefit Calculation	2
Finding No. 2 – Inadequate Accounting/Reporting Over Activity Of The Pension Plan.....	2
Supplementary Information	4
Report Distribution List	8

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The Act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the City of Clairton Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 15 - Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement Law, Act of February 1, 1974
(P.L. 34, No. 15), as amended, 53 P.S. § 881.101 et seq.

The City of Clairton Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 1776, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 15, and a separately executed plan agreement with the plan custodian. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the city and its non-uniformed employees. The plan was established February 1, 1964. Active members are required to contribute two (2.0) percent of compensation to the plan. As of December 31, 2021, the plan had 8 active members, 3 terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 16 retirees receiving benefits.

CITY OF CLAIRTON NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – Incorrect Pension Benefit Calculation

Condition: A member of the pension plan who retired on January 4, 2021, had his pension benefit incorrectly determined based on provisions of the plan document. The city used a 1.0% pension benefit multiplier which was not prescribed in the plan document.

Criteria: Ordinance No. 1953, enacted May 12, 2020, amended the pension plan multiplier in the plan’s governing document, as follows:

Any current non-union employees as of January 1, 2019 and any future non-union employees hired after January 1, 2019 who are members of the Employee’s Pension Plan 02-069-N, would be eligible for the one and one-half percent (1.5%) multiplier.

Cause: The city lacked adequate internal control procedures to ensure the pension benefit was properly determined in accordance with the plan’s governing document, as most recently amended.

Effect: The retiree is receiving a lesser benefit than otherwise entitled to under the plan document.

Recommendation: We recommend that municipal officials adjust the retiree’s pension benefit in accordance with the provisions contained in the plan’s governing document.

We also recommend that the city implement adequate procedures to ensure that future pension benefits are calculated and paid in accordance with the applicable provisions contained in the plan’s governing document in effect at the time of a plan member’s retirement.

Management’s Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor’s Conclusion: Compliance will be evaluated during our next audit of the plan.

Finding No. 2 – Inadequate Accounting/Reporting Over Activity Of The Pension Plan

Condition: The municipality’s accounting/reporting system did not provide effective control over the transactional activity of the pension plan during the year 2021. Municipal officials were unable to furnish annual financial statements or custodial account statements summarizing the financial activity of its pension plan.

CITY OF CLAIRTON NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 2 – (Continued)

Criteria: An adequate system of accounting and record keeping is a prerequisite for sound administration of pension plans. In addition, assets held in a custodial account for the purpose of plan management are to be governed by the terms and provisions of the account contract, provided that the terms and provisions of the contract are within the parameters of all prevailing pension legislation. Although the municipality may contract with a trustee to administer the financial management of the plan, the fiduciary responsibility for the plan remains with the municipality.

Cause: Municipal officials did not maintain a separate detailed accounting of pension plan transactions which, among other things, helps assure the production of proper financial statements to effectively monitor the annual activity of the pension plan. Additionally, municipal officials indicated that the plan’s custodian failed to provide copies of the custodial account transaction statements summarizing activity of the pension plan account for the year 2021.

Effect: Although we were able to obtain alternate documentation from the municipality to evidence the propriety of individual transactions tested during performance of the audit, the failure to maintain annual financial and/or account transaction statements prohibits municipal officials from effectively monitoring the plan’s financial operations and could lead to undetected errors or improprieties in account transactions.

Recommendation: We recommend that municipal officials establish and maintain a financial accounting and reporting system that allows the municipality to effectively monitor the plan’s financial operations, even in the absence of statements from the plan custodian. Municipal officials should refer to the Auditor General’s Bulletin No. 2-88 entitled “Preparation, Maintenance and Auditability of Financial Records,” for further guidance in establishing adequate accounting and record-keeping procedures. In addition, we recommend that municipal officials contact the plan custodian and obtain annual financial statements of the custodial account for its pension plan for the year 2021 to ensure the accuracy and propriety of the transaction activity.

Management Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor Conclusion: It was noted that the plan custodian recently went through a substantial upgrade to the plan administration software and implemented a new accounting system. The modernization process, along with the COVID-19 pandemic, resulted in unforeseen delays in the year-end reporting process for financial statements and GASB 68 reports. In addition, the custodian has taken active measures to resolve these issues and expects the 2021 financial reports and statements to be distributed before the end of 2022. Compliance with the finding recommendation will be evaluated during our next audit of the plan

CITY OF CLAIRTON NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2015, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-15	\$ 3,007,027	\$ 2,628,958	\$ (378,069)	114.4%
01-01-17	3,061,979	2,548,206	(513,773)	120.2%
01-01-19	2,893,305	2,435,238	(458,067)	118.8%

The information presented represents the most recently filed actuarial information available and although the actuarial valuation report valued 1-1-21 is currently due in accordance with Act 205, the municipality is working with the Municipal Pension Reporting Program as of the date of this report to finalize the information submitted

CITY OF CLAIRTON NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

CITY OF CLAIRTON NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS

Year Ended December 31	Actuarially Determined Contribution (ADC)*	Contributions in Relation to the ADC	Contribution Deficiency (Excess)	Covered- Employee Payroll**	Contributions as a Percentage of Covered- Employee Payroll**
2014	\$ -	\$ 1,408	\$ (1,408)	\$ 376,176	0.37%
2015	-	-	-	353,970	-
2016	-	-	-	354,735	-
2017	-	-	-	370,962	-
2018	-	20	(20)	378,958	0.01%
2019	-	20	(20)	399,274	0.01%
2020	-	-	-	426,409	-
2021	-	-	-		

* The actuarial value of assets exceeded the actuarial present value of future benefits and therefore, there were no actuarially determined contributions required for the year.

** Due to the timing of this audit, covered-employee payroll for 2021 was not provided in this schedule.

CITY OF CLAIRTON NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
 (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2019
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar for plan bases and an average for Aggregate Gain/Loss, 10% of surplus is credited against aggregate cost where applicable.
Remaining amortization period	N/A
Asset valuation method	The Actuarial Value of Assets equal the sum of all audited reserve funds as of the valuation date, including Member, Municipal, Retired, Disability, and DROP Reserves, when applicable, and a one year administration expense reserve, plus the portion of any additional investment income to be distributed as excess interest, based on PMRS Policy Statement 05-2. This asset valuation is based on the unique legislative structure of PMRS and the administrative rules adopted by the PMRS Board in conjunction with Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement Law. ¹

Actuarial assumptions:

Investment rate of return *	5.25%, compounded annually, net of investment and administration expenses
Projected salary increases *	2.8%-7.05%
* Includes inflation at	2.8%
Cost-of-living adjustments	2.8% per year, subject to plan limitations

The information presented represents the most recently filed actuarial information available and although the actuarial valuation report valued 1-1-21 is currently due in accordance with Act 205, the municipality is working with the Municipal Pension Reporting Program as of the date of this report to finalize the information submitted.

¹ The administrative rules adopted by the PMRS Board, which are not subject to comply with Actuarial Standards of Practice (ASOP), when defining the Actuarial Value of Assets (AVA), does not necessarily meet the requirement of ASOP 44 Selection and Use of Asset Valuation Methods for Pension Valuations. The AVA provided within this report follow the Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement Law and the PMRS policy statement.

CITY OF CLAIRTON NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

The Honorable Richard L. Lattanzi
Mayor

The Honorable Raymond A. Kurta
Deputy Mayor

Mr. Howard J. Bednar
City Manager

Mr. Richard Cardamone, CPA, CGMA
Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement System

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.