COMPLIANCE AUDIT

City of DuBois
Non-Uniformed Pension Plan

Clearfield County, Pennsylvania

For the Period

January 1, 2016 to December 31, 2017

June 2018

Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General

Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and City Council
City of DuBois
Clearfield County
DuBois, PA 15801

We have conducted a compliance audit of the City of DuBois Non-Uniformed Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2016 to December 31, 2017. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.

- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.

- We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing total members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.

- We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for the 2 plan members who retired during the current audit period, and through the completion of our fieldwork procedures, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefit due to the retired individuals and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to the recipients.

- We determined whether the January 1, 2013, January 1, 2015 and January 1, 2017 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the former Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2014, 2016 and 2018, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.

For the year 2016, the City of DuBois contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for annual audit of its basic financial statements which is available at the city's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

City officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the City of DuBois Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the city's internal controls as they relate to the city's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the City of DuBois Non-Uniformed Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of City of DuBois and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank city officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

June 6, 2018

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

CONTENTS

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The Act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the City of DuBois Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the former Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 317 - The Third Class City Code, Act of June 23, 1931 (P.L. 932, No. 317), as amended, 53 P.S. § 35101 et seq.

The City of DuBois Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 1776, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 317. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the city and its non-uniformed employees. The plan was established January 1, 1972. Active members are required to contribute 3.5 percent of total compensation to the plan. As of December 31, 2017, the plan had 41 active members, 3 terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 33 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2017, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	Hired Before 1/1/2013 - Age 60 and 12 years of service.
	Hired on or after 1/1/2013 – Age 60 and 20 years of service.
Early Retirement	Hired before 1/1/2013 - Eligible with 20 years of service if the retirement is voluntary and 8 years of service if the retirement is involuntary. Benefits will be actuarially reduced for each year prior to age 60.
	Hired on or after 1/1/2013 – Eligible with 20 years of service and payable at age 60 if the participant continues paying monthly employee contributions, equal to the last amount due while in active employment, until the participant reaches age 60.
Vesting	A member is 100% vested after 12 years of service.

Retirement Benefit:

Hired before 1/1/2013 - Benefit equals 2.5% credit for each year of service with a maximum benefit of 90%, times the average monthly compensation over the participant's highest 5 consecutive years of employment.

Hired on or after 1/1/2013 – Benefit equals 50% of average annual salary during the last or any 5 years of employment, whichever is higher.

Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility	Refund of member contributions plus interest.
After Retirement Eligibility	Beneficiary will receive the present value of the participant's accrued benefit. At retirement the participant may select a survivor benefit option.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

Disability Benefit:

Hired before 1/1/2013:

Service Related	Benefit equals 50% of the member's salary at the time the disability was incurred, offset by any Workers' Compensation benefits.
Non-Service Related	Upon attainment of 10 years of credited service, a benefit is provided to a participant who is certified to be unable to engage in any gainful employment. The benefit is equal to 30% of the participant's salary at the time the disability was incurred.

Hired on or after 1/1/2013:

Service and Non-Service Related	After 10 years of service and before age 60, the member shall be entitled to a normal retirement benefit which shall not be reduced for Social Security benefits.

CITY OF DUBOIS NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The supplementary information contained on Pages 4 through 6 reflects the implementation of GASB Statement No. 67, *Financial Reporting for Pension Plans*. The objective of this statement is to improve financial reporting by state and local governmental pension plans.

SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION
LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS
FOR THE YEARS ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2014 AND 2015

	2014	2015
Total Pension Liability		
Service cost	$ 181,914	$ 168,527
Interest	726,246	748,425
Difference between expected and actual experience	-	55,168
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(632,929)	(712,495)
Net Change in Total Pension Liability	275,231	259,625
Total Pension Liability – Beginning	9,212,629	9,487,860
Total Pension Liability - Ending (a)	$ 9,487,860	$ 9,747,485
Plan Fiduciary Net Position		
Contributions – employer	$ 4,090	$ 90,350
Contribution – member	87,476	71,402
Net investment income	315,005	(241,825)
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(632,930)	(712,495)
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position	(226,359)	(792,568)
Plan Fiduciary Net Position – Beginning	8,999,785	8,773,426
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Ending (b)	$ 8,773,426	$ 7,980,858
Net Pension Liability - Ending (a-b)	$ 714,434	$ 1,766,627
Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability	92.5%	81.9%
Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	$ 1,884,611	$ 1,864,202
Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll	37.9%	94.8%

CITY OF DUBOIS NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION
LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS
FOR THE YEARS ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2016 AND 2017

	2016	2017
Total Pension Liability		
Service cost	$ 176,953	$ 194,728
Interest	765,139	860,525
Difference between expected and actual experience	-	559,495
Changes of assumptions	-	417,530
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(720,405)	(768,720)
Net Change in Total Pension Liability	221,687	1,263,558
Total Pension Liability - Beginning	9,747,485	9,969,172
Total Pension Liability - Ending (a)	$ 9,969,172	$ 11,232,730
Plan Fiduciary Net Position		
Contributions - employer	$ 97,693	$ 199,304
Contribution - member	69,916	73,214
Net investment income	371,267	1,033,208
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(720,405)	(768,720)
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position	$ (181,529)	$ 537,006
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Beginning	7,980,858	7,799,329
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Ending (b)	$ 7,799,329	$ 8,336,335
Net Pension Liability - Ending (a-b)	$ 2,169,843	$ 2,896,395
Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability	78.2%	74.2%
Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	$ 1,986,368	$ 1,919,753
Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll	109.2%	150.9%

CITY OF DUBOIS NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to Changes in the Discount Rate

The following presents the net pension liability of the city as of December 31, 2016 and 2017, calculated using the discount rate of 8.0%, as well as what the city's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (7.0%)	Current Discount Rate (8.0%)	1% Increase (9.0%)
Net Pension Liability - 12/31/16	$ 3,055,706	$ 2,169,843	$ 1,404,037
Net Pension Liability - 12/31/17	$ 3,924,889	$ 2,896,395	$ 2,007,763

CITY OF DUBOIS NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2013, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-13	$ 9,100,897	$ 8,883,809	$ (217,088)	102.4%
01-01-15	8,856,833	9,543,028	686,195	92.8%
01-01-17	8,539,812	10,945,323	2,405,511	78.0%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-13, 01-01-15, and 01-01-17 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 4-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

CITY OF DUBOIS NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2012	$ 74,935	100.0%
2013	None	N/A
2014	4,090	100.0%
2015	90,350	100.0%
2016	97,693	100.0%
2017	199,304	100.0%

CITY OF DUBOIS NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2017
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar
Remaining amortization period	13 years
Asset valuation method	Fair value, 4-year smoothing
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	8.0%
Projected salary increases	5.0%

CITY OF DUBOIS NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

The Honorable Gary D. Gilbert
Mayor/Council President

Mr. John Suplizio
City Manager/CAO

Mr. Randy E. Schmidt
Council Vice-President

Mr. James Aughenbaugh
Councilman

Ms. Diane L. Bernardo
Councilwoman

Mr. Edward Walsh
Councilman

Ms. DeLean Shepherd
Finance Officer

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.