

COMPLIANCE AUDIT

City of Lock Haven Employees' Retirement Fund Clinton County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2014 to December 31, 2015

November 2016



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and City Council
City of Lock Haven
Clinton County
Lock Haven, PA 17745

We have conducted a compliance audit of the City of Lock Haven Employees' Retirement Fund for the period January 1, 2014 to December 31, 2015. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.
- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.

- We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for all 5 of the plan members who retired during the current audit period, represent payments to all and only those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefit due to the retired individuals and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to the recipients.
- Whether the January 1, 2011, January 1, 2013 and January 1, 2015 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the former Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2012, 2014 and 2016, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.

The City of Lock Haven contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for an audit of its basic financial statements for the year ended December 31, 2014, which is available at the city's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

City officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the City of Lock Haven Employees' Retirement Fund is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the city's internal controls as they relate to the city's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the City of Lock Haven Employees' Retirement Fund was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of the City of Lock Haven and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank city officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

November 4, 2016

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Eugene A. DePasquale". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background.....	1
Supplementary Information	3
Report Distribution List	9

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the City of Lock Haven Employees' Retirement Fund is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the former Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 399 - Optional Third Class City Charter Law, Act of July 15, 1957 (P.L. 901, No. 399), as amended, 53 P.S. § 41101 et seq.

The City of Lock Haven Employees' Retirement Fund is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Chapter 1, Part 8B of the city's codified ordinances. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the city and its non-uniformed employees. The plan was established February 1, 1966. Active members are required to contribute 6 percent of salary to the plan. As of December 31, 2015, the plan had 38 active members, 1 terminated member eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 30 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2015, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	Age 65 and 10 years of continuous service.
Early Retirement	Age 50 and 10 years of continuous service.
Vesting	A member is 100% vested after 10 years of service.

Retirement Benefit:

Benefit equals 1.8% of average monthly earnings times years of service. Average monthly earnings are based on the highest 5 consecutive years of earnings out of the 10 years prior to retirement.

Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility	Return of member contributions plus interest.
After Retirement Eligibility	The normal form of benefit is a life annuity. A survivor benefit may be selected at the time of retirement.

Service Related Disability Benefit:

None

CITY OF LOCK HAVEN EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT FUND
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The supplementary information contained on Pages 3 and 4 reflect the implementation of GASB Statement No. 67, *Financial Reporting for Pension Plans*. The objective of this statement is to improve financial reporting by state and local governmental pension plans.

SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION
LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS
FOR THE YEAR ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2014

Total Pension Liability	
Service cost	\$ 162,495
Interest	378,253
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(242,392)
Net Change in Total Pension Liability	298,356
Total Pension Liability – Beginning	5,788,070
Total Pension Liability - Ending (a)	\$ 6,086,426
Plan Fiduciary Net Position	
Contributions – employer	\$ 103,387
Contribution – member	84,254
Net investment income	347,838
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(242,392)
Administrative expense	(9,903)
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position	283,184
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Beginning	5,802,108
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Ending (b)	\$ 6,085,292
Net Pension Liability - Ending (a-b)	\$ 1,134
Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability	99.98%
Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	\$ 1,520,906
Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll	0.7%

CITY OF LOCK HAVEN EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT FUND
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to Changes in the Discount Rate

The following presents the net pension liability of the city as of December 31, 2014, calculated using the discount rate of 6.5%, as well as what the city's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (5.5%)	Current Discount Rate (6.5%)*	1% Increase (7.5%)
Net Pension Liability	\$ 697,020	\$ 1,134	\$ (596,700)

* This rate differs from the 7.0% used in the plan's January 1, 2015, actuarial valuation report.

SCHEDULE OF INVESTMENT RETURNS

Annual Money-Weighted Rate of Return, Net of Investment Expense:

2014	6.5%
------	------

CITY OF LOCK HAVEN EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT FUND
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2011, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-11	\$ 4,476,383	\$ 4,500,489	\$ 24,106	99.5%
01-01-13	4,752,868	5,133,350	380,482	92.6%
01-01-15	5,745,356	5,934,083	188,727	96.8%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-11, 01-01-13 and 01-01-15 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 4-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

CITY OF LOCK HAVEN EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT FUND
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

CITY OF LOCK HAVEN EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT FUND
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER
 AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2010	\$ 12,320	1,129.0%
2011	87,184	104.9%
2012	90,931	100.0%
2013	86,957	100.0%
2014	91,331	113.2%
2015	138,657	100.0%

CITY OF LOCK HAVEN EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT FUND
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2015
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar
Remaining amortization period	9 years
Asset valuation method	Fair value, 4-year smoothing
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	7.0%
Projected salary increases *	4.0%
Cost-of-living adjustments	None assumed

* Includes inflation at 2.75%

CITY OF LOCK HAVEN EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT FUND
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

The Honorable William Baney III
Mayor

Mr. Stephen L. Stevenson
Council Vice-President

Mr. Jonathan Bravard
Councilman

Mr. Richard Conklin
Councilman

Mr. Ted Forbes
Councilman

Mr. Douglas Byerly
Councilman

Ms. Sara Stringfellow
Councilwoman

Mr. Richard W. Marcinkevage
City Manager

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.