COMPLIANCE AUDIT

East St. Clair Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan

Bedford County, Pennsylvania

For the Period

January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2015

June 2016

Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General

Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL

Board of Township Supervisors
East St. Clair Township
Bedford County
New Paris, PA 15554

We have conducted a compliance audit of the East St. Clair Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2015. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform our audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The objectives of the audit were:

1. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report; and

2. To determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report, we inquired of plan officials and evaluated supporting documentation provided by officials evidencing that the suggested corrective action has been appropriately taken. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.

- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.

- We determined that there were no employee contributions required by the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations for the years covered by our audit period.

- We determined that there were no benefit calculations prepared for the years covered by our audit period.

- We determined whether the January 1, 2013 and January 1, 2015 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2014 and 2016, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.

- We determined whether the terms of the plan's unallocated insurance contract, including ownership and any restrictions, were in compliance with plan provisions, investment policies, and state regulations by comparing the terms of the contract with the plan's provisions, investment policies, and state regulations.

Township officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the East St. Clair Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the township's internal controls as they relate to the township's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objectives, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the East St. Clair Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

As previously noted, one of the objectives of our audit of the East St. Clair Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan was to determine compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. Act 205 was amended on September 18, 2009, through the adoption of Act 44 of 2009. Among several provisions relating to municipal pension plans, the act provides for the implementation of a distress recovery program. Three levels of distress have been established:

Level	Indication	Funding Criteria
I	Minimal distress	70-89%
II	Moderate distress	50-69%
III	Severe distress	Less than 50%

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it. However, **we are extremely concerned about the funded status of the plan contained in the schedule of funding progress included in this report which indicates the plan's funded ratio is 52.0% as of January 1, 2015, which is the most recent data available. Based on this information, the township will receive a notification that it is in Level II moderate distress status**. We encourage township officials to monitor the funding of the non-uniformed pension plan to ensure its long-term financial stability.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of East St. Clair Township and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank township officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

June 17, 2016

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

CONTENTS

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the East St. Clair Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 69 - The Second Class Township Code, Act of May 1, 1933 (P.L. 103, No. 69), as reenacted and amended, 53 P.S. § 65101 et seq.

The East St. Clair Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of a resolution dated February 5, 2008, effective January 1, 2008, adopted pursuant to Act 69. The plan was established January 1, 2008. Active members are not required to contribute to the plan. As of December 31, 2015, the plan had 3 active members, 1 terminated member eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 1 retiree receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2015, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	Age 65 and 5 years of service.
Early Retirement	None
Vesting	A member is 100% vested after 5 years of service.

Retirement Benefit:

Benefit is $150 per month at retirement.

Survivor Benefit:

None

EAST ST. CLAIR TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
STATUS OF PRIOR FINDINGS

Compliance With Prior Audit Recommendations

East St. Clair Township has complied with the prior audit recommendations concerning the following:

- Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Underpayment Of State Aid

  During the current audit period, municipal officials complied with the instructions that accompany Certification Form AG 385 and accurately reported the required pension data.

- Failure To Implement Act 44 Mandatory Distressed Provisions

  Municipal officials submitted a plan for administrative improvement in accordance with Act 44 of 2009. In addition, the plan's funding status has improved from a Level III distress status at January 1, 2013 to a Level II distress status at January 1, 2015.

EAST ST. CLAIR TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The supplementary information contained on Pages 4 through 6 reflect the implementation of GASB Statement No. 67, *Financial Reporting for Pension Plans*. The objective of this statement is to improve financial reporting by state and local governmental pension plans.

SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION
LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS
FOR THE YEAR ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2015

Total Pension Liability		
Service cost	$	3,273
Interest		2,717
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions		(1,800)
Net Change in Total Pension Liability		4,190
Total Pension Liability - Beginning		59,490
Total Pension Liability - Ending (a)	$	63,680
Plan Fiduciary Net Position		
Contributions - employer	$	7,489
Net investment income		996
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions		(1,800)
Administrative expense		(661)
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position		6,024
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Beginning		30,933
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Ending (b)	$	36,957
Net Pension Liability - Ending (a-b)	$	26,723
Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability		58.04%
Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	$	102,766
Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll		26.00%

EAST ST. CLAIR TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to Changes in the Discount Rate

The following presents the net pension liability of the township, calculated using the discount rate of 4.5%, as well as what the township's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (3.5%)	Current Discount Rate (4.5%)	1% Increase (5.5%)
Net Pension Liability	$ 33,872	$ 26,723	$ 20,609

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS

Year Ended December 31	Actuarially Determined Contribution	Actual Contributions	Contribution Deficiency (Excess)	Covered-Employee Payroll*	Contributions as a Percentage of Covered-Employee Payroll
2008	$ 5,828	$ 5,828	$ -	$ 94,940	6.14%
2009	6,026	6,026	-		
2010	5,233	5,233	-	103,103	5.08%
2011	5,229	5,229	-		
2012	5,986	5,986	-	92,618	6.46%
2013	6,030	6,030	-		
2014	7,380	7,380	-	104,820	7.04%
2015	7,489	7,489	-	102,766	7.29%

* Due to GASB Statement No. 67, *Financial Reporting for Pension Plans,* being implemented only recently, the amount of Covered-Employee Payroll was not provided for the years 2009, 2011, and 2013.

EAST ST. CLAIR TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF INVESTMENT RETURNS

Annual Money-Weighted Rate of Return, Net of Investment Expense:

2015	2.98%
2014	3.26%
2013	3.29%
2012	3.37%
2011	5.08%
2010	4.10%
2009	5.44%
2008	7.21%

EAST ST. CLAIR TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2011, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-11	$ 12,650	$ 39,217	$ 26,567	32.3%
01-01-13	20,630	48,911	28,281	42.2%
01-01-15	30,933	59,490	28,557	52.0%

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

EAST ST. CLAIR TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2015
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar
Remaining amortization period	10 years
Asset valuation method	Market value
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	4.5%
Projected salary increases	3.5%

EAST ST. CLAIR TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Mr. David L. Ferguson
Chairman, Board of Township Supervisors

Mr. Carl R. Sabo
Township Supervisor

Mr. Troy A. Mickle
Township Supervisor

Ms. Dorothy R. Oldham
Chief Administrative Officer

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.