

LIMITED PROCEDURES ENGAGEMENT

Waterford Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan Erie County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2014 to December 31, 2017

November 2018



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council
Waterford Borough
Erie County
Waterford, PA 16441

We conducted a Limited Procedures Engagement (LPE) of the Waterford Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2014 to December 31, 2017 to determine its compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The LPE was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.) but was not conducted in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis to support our LPE results.

Our LPE was limited to determining the following:

- Whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the engagement period.
- Whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.
- Whether annual employee contributions were required during the engagement period and, if so, were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing total members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the engagement period and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.

- Whether retirement benefits calculated for plan members who retired during the engagement period represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefit due to retired individuals and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to recipients.
- Whether the January 1, 2013, January 1, 2015, and January 1, 2017 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted by March 31, 2014, 2016, and 2018, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.
- Whether refunds made to plan members were authorized in accordance with plan provisions and applicable laws and regulations.

Based on the results of our procedures performed during our LPE, nothing came to our attention indicating that the Waterford Borough Non-Uniformed Pension Plan was not being administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following finding further discussed later in this report:

Finding – Failure To File Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Underpayment Of State Aid

Our determination to perform a LPE for this engagement period does not preclude the Department from conducting an audit in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* of the pension plan in subsequent periods. The borough should continue to maintain documentation related to this pension plan.

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Waterford Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in this report. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of this LPE.

October 30, 2018



EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Finding and Recommendation:	
Finding – Failure To File Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Underpayment Of State Aid	1
Supplementary Information	2
Report Distribution List	8

WATERFORD BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

Finding – Failure To File Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Underpayment Of State Aid

Condition: The borough failed to file Certification Form AG 385 in 2017; therefore, the borough failed to certify 2 eligible non-uniformed employees and payroll of \$76,849 on the Certification Form AG 385 that was due March 31, 2017. The data contained on this certification form is based on prior calendar year information. When the error was discovered, the form was prepared and filed in May 2018.

Criteria: The general instructions that accompany Certification Form AG 385 disclose that municipalities must complete and return the Certification Form AG 385 to the Department of the Auditor General by March 31st.

Cause: Plan officials failed to establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the timely submission of the certification form.

Effect: Since the borough failed to file the form by the March 31st deadline, it did not receive a state aid allocation in 2017. Based on the data reported on the form filed in May 2018, the borough is entitled to receive a state aid allocation in the amount of \$158.

Although the state aid for 2017 will be allocated to the borough, the full amount of the 2017 state aid allocation was not available to be deposited timely and therefore was not available to pay operating expenses or for investment.

Recommendation: We recommend that in the future, plan officials comply with the instructions that accompany Certification Form AG 385 to assist them in timely and accurately filing the required pension data.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be evaluated during our next engagement.

WATERFORD BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The supplementary information contained on Pages 2 through 3 reflects the implementation of GASB Statement No. 67, *Financial Reporting for Pension Plans*. The objective of this statement is to improve financial reporting by state and local governmental pension plans.

SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION
LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS
FOR THE YEARS ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2014, 2015, AND 2016

	<u>2014</u>	<u>2015</u>	<u>2016</u>
Total Pension Liability			
Service cost	\$ 3,749	\$ 3,997	\$ 6,427
Interest	2,745	2,705	2,715
Difference between expected and actual experience	(2,957)	-	(6,892)
Changes of assumptions	-	(2,994)	1,013
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(1,124)	(8,011)	(3,836)
Net Change in Total Pension Liability	2,413	(4,303)	(573)
Total Pension Liability - Beginning	46,723	49,136	44,833
Total Pension Liability - Ending (a)	<u>\$ 49,136</u>	<u>\$ 44,833</u>	<u>\$ 44,260</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position			
Contributions – employer*	\$ 185	\$ -	\$ -
Contributions – PMRS assessment	-	140	20
Contributions – employee	1,530	1,940	3,290
PMRS investment income	3,827	3,765	3,199
Market value investment income	(72)	(3,767)	1,969
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(1,124)	(8,011)	(3,836)
PMRS Administrative expense	(60)	(200)	(80)
Additional administrative expense	(147)	(157)	(157)
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position	4,139	(6,290)	4,405
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Beginning	68,997	73,136	66,846
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Ending (b)	<u>\$ 73,136</u>	<u>\$ 66,846</u>	<u>\$ 71,251</u>
Net Pension Liability - Ending (a-b)	<u>\$ (24,000)</u>	<u>\$ (22,013)</u>	<u>\$ (26,991)</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability	148.84%	149.10%	160.98%
Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	\$ 57,089	\$ 62,876	\$ 109,674
Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll	-42.04%	-35.01%	-24.61%

* 2014 employer contributions consist of administrative expenses and allocated insurance premiums paid from actuarial surplus.

WATERFORD BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to Changes in the Discount Rate

The following presents the net pension liability of the borough as of December 31, 2014 and 2015, calculated using the discount rate of 5.50%, as well as what the borough's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (4.50%)	Current Discount Rate (5.50%)	1% Increase (6.50%)
Net Pension Liability - 12/31/14	\$ (17,334)	\$ (24,000)	\$ (29,631)
Net Pension Liability - 12/31/15	\$ (14,870)	\$ (22,013)	\$ (28,027)

The following presents the net pension liability of the borough as of December 31, 2016, calculated using the discount rate of 5.25%, as well as what the borough's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (4.25%)	Current Discount Rate (5.25%)	1% Increase (6.25%)
Net Pension Liability – 12/31/16	\$ (22,527)	\$ (26,991)	\$ (30,823)

WATERFORD BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2013, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-13	\$ 65,510	\$ 41,603	\$ (23,907)	157.5%
01-01-15	74,217	49,136	(25,081)	151.0%
01-01-17	76,231	44,260	(31,971)	172.2%

WATERFORD BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

WATERFORD BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2012	\$ 1,349	100.0%
2013	None	N/A
2014	None	N/A
2015	None	N/A
2016	None	N/A
2017	1,139	100.0%

WATERFORD BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2017
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	N/A
Remaining amortization period	N/A
Asset valuation method	The Actuarial Value of Assets equals the plan's member, municipal, DROP (if applicable) reserve accounts plus the retiree actuarial liability. This asset smoothing is based on the unique legislative structure of PMRS and the administrative rules adopted by the PMRS Board in conjunction with Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement Law, all of which are subject to comply with the Actuarial Standards of Practice No. 44, Selection and Use of Asset Valuation Methods when defining the actuarial Value of Assets.
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	5.25%, compounded annually, net of investment and administration expenses
Salary scale	Total rate (including inflation) (e.g. age 25 – 7.05%; age 35 – 4.55%; age 45 – 3.97%; age 55 – 3.44%; age 65 – 2.80%)
Cost-of-living adjustments	2.8% per year, subject to plan limitations

WATERFORD BOROUGH NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

The Honorable Justin Blose
Mayor

Mr. Timothy E. LaFlamme
Council President

Ms. Stacy L. Mattson
Secretary

Ms. Charity Rosenberry, CPA
Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement System

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.