

# ATTESTATION ENGAGEMENT

---

**Township of Chatham**  
**Tioga County, Pennsylvania**  
**58-204**  
**Liquid Fuels Tax Fund**  
**For the Period**  
**January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2013**

---

June 2015



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General  
Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General  
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018  
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General  
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen  
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE  
AUDITOR GENERAL

### Independent Auditor's Report

The Honorable Leslie Richards  
Secretary  
Department of Transportation  
Harrisburg, PA 17120

We examined the accompanying Forms MS-965 With Adjustments for the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund of the Township of Chatham, Tioga County, for the period January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2013. The municipality's management is responsible for the Forms MS-965. Our responsibility is to express an opinion on the Forms MS-965 With Adjustments based on our examination.

Our examination was conducted in accordance with attestation standards established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants and the standards applicable to attestation engagements contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. An examination includes examining, on a test basis, evidence supporting the Township of Chatham, Tioga County's Forms MS-965 for the period January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2013 and performing such other procedures as we considered necessary in the circumstances. We believe that our examination provides a reasonable basis for our opinion.

We are mandated by Section 403 of *The Fiscal Code*, 72 P.S. § 403, to audit each municipality's Liquid Fuels Tax Fund to ensure that funds received are expended in accordance with applicable laws and regulations. *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States include attestation engagements as a separate type of audit. An attestation engagement performed pursuant to *Government Auditing Standards* involves additional standards that exceed the standards provided by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants. Accordingly, this attestation engagement complies with both *Government Auditing Standards* and Section 403 of *The Fiscal Code*.

As described in Note 4, the adjustments included on the Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are made by the Department of the Auditor General.

### Independent Auditor's Report (Continued)

As discussed in the Finding and Recommendations section of this report, the municipality purchased a 1996 Mack truck during 2012 for \$21,945.00 and a CAT roller during 2013 for \$30,000.00 using Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money that were restrictively bid.

In our opinion, except for the matters discussed in the preceding paragraph, the Forms MS-965 With Adjustments present, in all material respects, the information required by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation for the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund of the Township of Chatham, Tioga County, for the period January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2013, in conformity with the criteria set forth in Note 1.

In accordance with *Government Auditing Standards*, we are required to report all deficiencies that are considered to be significant deficiencies or material weaknesses in internal control; fraud and noncompliance with provisions of laws or regulations that have a material effect on the Forms MS-965; and any other instances that warrant the attention of those charged with governance; noncompliance with provisions of contracts or grant agreements, and abuse that has a material effect on the Forms MS-965. We are also required to obtain and report the views of responsible officials concerning the findings, conclusions, and recommendations, as well as any planned corrective actions. We performed our examination to express an opinion on whether the Forms MS-965 are presented in accordance with the criteria described above and not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on internal control over reporting on the Forms MS-965 or on compliance and other matters; accordingly, we express no such opinions.

*A deficiency in internal control* exists when the design or operation of a control does not allow management or employees, in the normal course of performing their assigned functions, to prevent, or detect and correct, misstatements on a timely basis. *A material weakness* is a deficiency, or combination of deficiencies, in internal control such that there is a reasonable possibility that a material misstatement of the Forms MS-965 will not be prevented, or detected and corrected, on a timely basis. *A significant deficiency* is a deficiency, or a combination of deficiencies, in internal control that is less severe than a material weakness, yet important enough to merit attention by those charged with governance.

Our consideration of internal control over reporting on the Forms MS-965 was for the limited purpose of expressing an opinion on whether the Forms MS-965 are presented in accordance with the criteria described above and would not necessarily identify all deficiencies in internal control that might be material weaknesses or significant deficiencies. Given these limitations, during our engagement we did not identify any deficiencies in internal control that we consider to be material weaknesses. However, material weaknesses may exist that have not been identified.

Independent Auditor's Report (Continued)

As part of obtaining reasonable assurance about whether the Forms MS-965 are free from material misstatement, we performed tests of the Township of Chatham, Tioga County's compliance with certain provisions of laws, regulations, contracts, and grant agreements, noncompliance with which could have a direct and material effect on the determination of amounts on the Forms MS-965. However, providing an opinion on compliance with those provisions was not an objective of our engagement, and accordingly, we do not express such an opinion. The results of our tests disclosed the following instance of noncompliance that is required to be reported under *Government Auditing Standards*:

- Restrictive Bidding And Failure To Properly Advertise For Bids.

This report is intended solely for the information and use of the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation and the management of the Township of Chatham, Tioga County, and is not intended to be and should not be used by anyone other than these specified parties.

We appreciate the courtesy extended by the Township of Chatham, Tioga County, to us during the course of our examination. If you have any questions, please feel free to contact Michael B. Kashishian, CPA, CGAP, CFE, Director, Bureau of County Audits, at 717-787-1363.



Eugene A. DePasquale  
Auditor General

March 9, 2015

# CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background .....	1
Financial Section:	
2012 Form MS-965 With Adjustments .....	2
2013 Form MS-965 With Adjustments .....	5
Notes To Forms MS-965 With Adjustments.....	8
Finding And Recommendations:	
Finding - Restrictive Bidding And Failure To Properly Advertise For Bids .....	14
Summary Of Exit Conference.....	16
Report Distribution .....	17

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
BACKGROUND  
FOR THE PERIOD  
JANUARY 1, 2012 TO DECEMBER 31, 2013

Background

The Liquid Fuels Tax Municipal Allocation Law, Title 72 P.S. § 2615.5, provides municipalities other than counties (townships, boroughs, cities, towns, home rule, and optional plan governments) with an annual allocation of liquid fuels taxes from the state's Motor License Fund to be used for the maintenance and repair of streets, roads, and bridges for which the municipality is responsible. The allocation of these funds to municipalities is based: (1) 50 percent on the municipality's proportion of local road mileage to the total local road mileage in the state, and (2) 50 percent on the proportion of a municipality's population to the total population in the state.

*The Vehicle Code*, Title 75 P.S. § 9511, provides municipalities with annual maintenance payments to be received from the Motor License Fund for functionally local highways that were transferred to a municipality from the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.

Each municipality must deposit the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money and annual maintenance payments that it receives into a special fund called the Municipal Liquid Fuels Tax Fund or State Fund. A municipality may not deposit any other monies into this fund except when the municipality does not have enough money in the special fund to meet the payments called for by its current annual budget for road and bridge purposes. In this case, the municipality may borrow money or transfer money from its General Fund to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

The Department of Transportation has been given the regulatory authority for the administration of these funds. To qualify for its annual allocation, each municipality shall submit the following documents and information to the Department of Transportation:

1. Evidence that the treasurer is bonded in accordance with the law, or that its treasurer is a bank requiring no bond by January 31 of each year.
2. A report indicating the manner in which its liquid fuels tax allocation was expended in the previous year (Form MS-965) by January 31 of each year.
3. A report of elected and appointed officials by January 31 of each year.
4. A Survey of Financial Condition by March 15 of each year.

Department of Transportation *Publication 9* contains the policies and procedures that govern the use of Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money. However, if there is a difference between *Publication 9* and any legislation, the legislation shall govern.

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
2012 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 1  
WITH ADJUSTMENTS

<u>Expenditure Summary</u>	<u>Reported</u>	<u>Adjustments (Note 4)</u>	<u>Adjusted Amount</u>
Major equipment purchases	\$ 21,945.00	\$ -	\$ 21,945.00
Minor equipment purchases	-	-	-
Computer/Computer related training	-	-	-
Agility projects	-	-	-
Cleaning streets and gutters	-	-	-
Winter maintenance services	19,591.82	-	19,591.82
Traffic control devices	-	-	-
Street lighting	-	-	-
Storm sewers and drains	-	-	-
Repairs of tools and machinery	14,901.62	(4,900.00)	10,001.62
Maintenance and repair of roads and bridges	101,493.96	-	101,493.96
Highway construction and rebuilding projects	-	-	-
Miscellaneous (Finding)	-	4,900.00	4,900.00
	<u>                    </u>	<u>                    </u>	<u>                    </u>
Total (To Section 2, Line 5)	<u>\$ 157,932.40</u>	<u>\$ -</u>	<u>\$ 157,932.40</u>

Notes to Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are an integral part of this report.

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
2012 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 2  
WITH ADJUSTMENTS

<u>Fund Balance</u>	<u>Reported</u>	<u>Adjustments (Note 4)</u>	<u>Adjusted Amount</u>
1. Balance, January 1, 2012	\$ 144,235.81	\$ 78.06	\$ 144,313.87
Receipts:			
2. State allocation	104,696.19	-	104,696.19
2a. Turnback allocation	71,360.00	-	71,360.00
2b. Interest on investments (Note 3)	54.66	3.96	58.62
2c. Miscellaneous (Note 5)	8,061.43	-	8,061.43
3. Total receipts	<u>184,172.28</u>	<u>3.96</u>	<u>184,176.24</u>
4. Total funds available	<u>328,408.09</u>	<u>82.02</u>	<u>328,490.11</u>
5. Expenditures (Section 1)	<u>157,932.40</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>157,932.40</u>
6. Balance, December 31, 2012	<u><u>\$ 170,475.69</u></u>	<u><u>\$ 82.02</u></u>	<u><u>\$ 170,557.71</u></u>

Notes to Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are an integral part of this report.



TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
2012 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 3  
WITH ADJUSTMENTS

<u>Equipment Balance</u>	<u>Reported</u>	<u>Adjustments (Note 4)</u>	<u>Adjusted Amount</u>
1. Prior year equipment balance	\$ 58,972.20	\$ (5,650.00)	\$ 53,322.20
2. Add: Current year equipment allocation (20% of Lines 2 + 2a, Section 2)	35,211.24	-	35,211.24
3. PENNDOT approved adjustments	<u>4,969.00</u>	<u>(4,969.00)</u>	<u>-</u>
4. Total funds available for equipment acquisition	99,152.44	(10,619.00)	88,533.44
5. Less: Major equipment expenditures	<u>21,945.00</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>21,945.00</u>
6. Remainder	<u>77,207.44</u>	<u>(10,619.00)</u>	<u>66,588.44</u>
7. Equipment balance available for subsequent year (Lesser of Line 6 or Section 2 balance, but not less than zero)	<u>\$ 77,207.44</u>	<u>\$ (10,619.00)</u>	<u>\$ 66,588.44</u>

Notes to Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are an integral part of this report.

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
2013 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 1  
WITH ADJUSTMENTS

<u>Expenditure Summary</u>	<u>Reported</u>	<u>Adjustments</u>	<u>Adjusted Amount</u>
Major equipment purchases	\$ 30,000.00	\$ -	\$ 30,000.00
Minor equipment purchases	362.91	-	362.91
Computer/Computer related training	-	-	-
Agility projects	-	-	-
Cleaning streets and gutters	-	-	-
Winter maintenance services	38,029.83	-	38,029.83
Traffic control devices	-	-	-
Street lighting	-	-	-
Storm sewers and drains	-	-	-
Repairs of tools and machinery	40,166.12	-	40,166.12
Maintenance and repair of roads and bridges	107,058.67	-	107,058.67
Highway construction and rebuilding projects	-	-	-
Miscellaneous	-	-	-
 Total (To Section 2, Line 5)	 <u>\$ 215,617.53</u>	 <u>\$ -</u>	 <u>\$ 215,617.53</u>

Notes to Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are an integral part of this report.

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
2013 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 2  
WITH ADJUSTMENTS

<u>Fund Balance</u>	<u>Reported</u>	<u>Adjustments (Note 4)</u>	<u>Adjusted Amount</u>
1. Balance, January 1, 2013	\$ 170,475.69	\$ 82.02	\$ 170,557.71
Receipts:			
2. State allocation	102,937.14	-	102,937.14
2a. Turnback allocation	71,360.00	-	71,360.00
2b. Interest on investments (Note 3)	54.85	(2.16)	52.69
2c. Miscellaneous (Note 5)	19,648.12	-	19,648.12
3. Total receipts	<u>194,000.11</u>	<u>(2.16)</u>	<u>193,997.95</u>
4. Total funds available	<u>364,475.80</u>	<u>79.86</u>	<u>364,555.66</u>
5. Expenditures (Section 1)	<u>215,617.53</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>215,617.53</u>
6. Balance, December 31, 2013	<u>\$ 148,858.27</u>	<u>\$ 79.86</u>	<u>\$ 148,938.13</u>

Notes to Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are an integral part of this report.

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
2013 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 3  
WITH ADJUSTMENTS

<u>Equipment Balance</u>	<u>Reported</u>	<u>Adjustments (Note 4)</u>	<u>Adjusted Amount</u>
1. Prior year equipment balance	\$ 77,207.44	\$ (10,619.00)	\$ 66,588.44
2. Add: Current year equipment allocation (20% of Lines 2 + 2a, Section 2)	34,859.43	-	34,859.43
3. PENNDOT approved adjustments	-	14,500.00	14,500.00
4. Total funds available for equipment acquisition	112,066.87	3,881.00	115,947.87
5. Less: Major equipment expenditures	30,000.00	-	30,000.00
6. Remainder	82,066.87	3,881.00	85,947.87
7. Equipment balance available for subsequent year (Lesser of Line 6 or Section 2 balance, but not less than zero)	\$ 82,066.87	\$ 3,881.00	\$ 85,947.87

Notes to Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are an integral part of this report.

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
NOTES TO FORMS MS-965 WITH ADJUSTMENTS  
FOR THE PERIOD  
JANUARY 1, 2012 TO DECEMBER 31, 2013

1. Criteria

Section 1

This section of Form MS-965 With Adjustments provides a summary of Liquid Fuels Tax Fund expenditures by category. Categories requiring explanation include:

- Major equipment purchases are purchases of road machinery and road equipment with varying yearly costs in excess of the amounts indicated below:

Prior To 2012	2012	2013	2014
\$4,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$10,200.00	\$10,300.00

- Minor equipment purchases are purchases of road machinery and road equipment with varying yearly costs, or less, than the amounts indicated below:

Prior To 2012	2012	2013	2014
\$4,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$10,200.00	\$10,300.00

- Agility projects are exchanges of services with the Department of Transportation.

Section 2

This section of Form MS-965 With Adjustments provides information on the fund balance. Categories requiring explanation include:

- The state allocation is generally received from the Department of Transportation during the first week in April of each year. The amount the municipality receives is based half on its population and half on its road mileage.
- The turnback allocation is generally received from the Department of Transportation during the first week in April of each year. A municipality receives a yearly turnback allocation based on road mileage for all roads that were transferred to the municipality from the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania through the Highway Transfer Program.

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
NOTES TO FORMS MS-965 WITH ADJUSTMENTS  
FOR THE PERIOD  
JANUARY 1, 2012 TO DECEMBER 31, 2013

1. Criteria (Continued)

Section 2 (Continued)

- Expenditures include the total transferred from Section 1.

Section 3

This section of Form MS-965 With Adjustments determines if the municipality expended Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money in excess of the permissible amount for equipment and the balance that the municipality may carry forward for the purchase of equipment to the subsequent year.

Department of Transportation *Publication 9* requires that the amount expended for equipment purchases in a given year not exceed the sum of the equipment balance carried forward from the previous year and 20 percent of the current year's Liquid Fuels Tax Fund allocation and, if applicable, 20 percent of the turnback allocation plus other Department of Transportation approved adjustments.

If the municipality spent in excess of the amount listed on Line 4, the excess must be reimbursed to the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

The equipment balance to be carried forward for the subsequent year is the lesser of the amount on Line 6 or the ending fund balance on Line 6 of Section 2, but not less than zero.

Basis Of Presentation

The financial activities of the municipality are accounted for in separate funds. The Liquid Fuels Tax Fund is used to account for state aid revenues from the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation used primarily for building and improving local roads and bridges. The Forms MS-965 have been prepared in accordance with reporting requirements prescribed by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation as a result of the Fuels Tax Act 655, dated 1956 and as amended, which does not constitute a complete presentation of the entity's assets, liabilities, expenses, and fund balance. Accordingly, the presentation of Forms MS-965 With Adjustments is restricted to the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund, which represents a segment of the entity.

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
NOTES TO FORMS MS-965 WITH ADJUSTMENTS  
FOR THE PERIOD  
JANUARY 1, 2012 TO DECEMBER 31, 2013

1. Criteria (Continued)

Basis Of Accounting

The accompanying Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are prepared in accordance with reporting requirements prescribed by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation. Under this method, revenues are recognized when received and expenditures are recorded when paid.

General Fixed Assets

General fixed assets are recognized as expenditures at the time of purchase. No depreciation has been provided on the heavy equipment used to maintain and repair roads and bridges.

2. Deposits

*The Second Class Township Code*, Title 53 P.S. § 68204, authorizes the township to deposit its funds in the following:

- Deposits in savings accounts or time deposits, other than certificates of deposit or share accounts of institutions having their principal place of business in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and insured by the Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation (FDIC) or other like insurance. For any amount above the insured maximum, the depository shall pledge approved collateral.
- Certificates of deposit purchased from institutions insured by the FDIC or other like insurance to the extent that such accounts are so insured. For any amounts in excess of the insured maximum, such deposits shall be collateralized by a pledge or assignment of assets. Certificates of deposit may not exceed 20 percent of a bank's total capital surplus or 20 percent of a savings and loan or savings bank's assets minus liabilities.

Deposits consist of receipts and deposits in a financial institution. Pennsylvania statutes require all deposits to be insured and, for any amount above the insured maximum, to be secured with approved collateral as defined.

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
NOTES TO FORMS MS-965 WITH ADJUSTMENTS  
FOR THE PERIOD  
JANUARY 1, 2012 TO DECEMBER 31, 2013

2. Deposits (Continued)

There were no deposits exposed to custodial credit risk as of December 31, 2013. Custodial credit risk, as defined by GASB No. 40, includes deposits that are not covered by depository insurance and the deposits are uncollateralized, collateralized with securities held by the pledging financial institution, or collateralized with securities held by the pledging financial institution's trust department or agent but not in the municipality's name.

Fund Balance

The fund balance as of December 31, 2013 consists of the following:

Cash	<u>\$148,938.13</u>
------	---------------------

3. Interest On Investments

Our examination disclosed that the municipality deposited idle liquid fuels tax money in an interest-bearing account which earned \$58.62 during 2012, and \$52.69 during 2013, thus providing additional funds for road maintenance and repairs.

4. Adjustments

2012 – Section 1

Adjustments were made to “Repairs of tools and machinery” and “Miscellaneous” because expenditures of \$4,900.00 were misclassified.

2012 - Section 2

An adjustment of \$78.06 was made to “Balance, January 1, 2012” because of prior report adjustments that were not carried forward in the fund balance.

An adjustment of \$3.96 was made to “Interest on investments” because interest earnings were understated.



TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
NOTES TO FORMS MS-965 WITH ADJUSTMENTS  
FOR THE PERIOD  
JANUARY 1, 2012 TO DECEMBER 31, 2013

4. Adjustments (Continued)

2012 - Section 3

An adjustment of \$(5,650.00) was made to “Prior year equipment balance” because of prior report adjustments that were not carried forward in the equipment balance.

An adjustment of \$(4,969.00) was made to “PENNDOT approved adjustments” because there were no approved adjustments.

2013 - Section 2

An adjustment of \$82.02 was made to “Balance, January 1, 2013” to reflect the adjustment made to the fund balance in 2012 - Section 2.

An adjustment of \$(2.16) was made to “Interest on investments” because interest earnings were overstated.

2013 - Section 3

An adjustment of \$(10,619.00) was made to “Prior year equipment balance” to reflect the adjustment made to the equipment balance in 2012 - Section 3.

An adjustment of \$14,500.00 was made to “PENNDOT approved adjustments” because approved adjustments were not reported.

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
NOTES TO FORMS MS-965 WITH ADJUSTMENTS  
FOR THE PERIOD  
JANUARY 1, 2012 TO DECEMBER 31, 2013

5. Miscellaneous Receipts

The following miscellaneous receipts were deposited into the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund during the examination period:

<u>Source</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>2012</u>	<u>2013</u>
Knoxville Borough	Grader rental	\$ 400.00	\$ -
Department of Transportation	Winter maintenance agreement	2,761.43	2,813.90
Vendor	Reimbursement (Finding)	4,900.00	-
Various Municipalities	Sale of equipment	-	6,500.00
Shippen Township	Winter maintenance agreement	-	2,300.00
Local business	Sale of truck	-	8,000.00
Vendor	Refund for overpayment	-	34.22
Total		<u>\$8,061.43</u>	<u>\$19,648.12</u>

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
FINDING AND RECOMMENDATIONS  
FOR THE PERIOD  
JANUARY 1, 2012 TO DECEMBER 31, 2013

**Finding - Restrictive Bidding And Failure To Properly Advertise For Bids**

Our examination disclosed that on November 1, 2012, the municipality made a down payment of \$4,900.00 on a 1996 Mack truck. On November 7, 2012 and November 14, 2012 the municipality advertised for bids for a 1996 or newer Mack truck. Mack is a Brand name making the bid restrictive. On November 20, 2012, the municipality accepted the only bid that was received for the 1996 Mack truck of \$21,945.00. The municipality expended \$21,945.00 on November 20, 2013 from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund for the purchase of the truck resulting in an overpayment of \$4,900.00. The \$4,900.00 was refunded to the municipality on December 7, 2012 and was deposited into the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund. The municipality also circumvented bidding procedures by placing a down payment on a truck before advertising for bids.

Additionally, on October 16, 2013 and October 23, 2013, the municipality advertised for bids for a CAT vibratory roller. CAT is a Brand name making the bid restrictive. Bids were to be opened on October 25, 2013. On October 25, 2013, the municipality accepted the low bid of \$30,000.00. The municipality expended \$30,000.00 from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund on that date for the roller.

The use of Brand names in advertising for equipment without including the words “or its equivalent,” is considered restrictive bidding, and therefore, is prohibited by the Department of Transportation’s *Publication 9*, § 449.3(f), which states:

Brand names. In advertising for equipment to be rented or purchased, or for materials to be purchased or delivered in place, it is unlawful to require or specify any particular make or brand thereof, thereby excluding other makes or brands; however, a particular brand name or its equivalent may be specified if equal consideration is given to all brands which are reasonably similar to the specified brand. Such specifications must be reasonable and not merely imposed in order to exclude some brands of equipment or material in favor of other brands.

Furthermore, the municipality did not leave enough time between the second advertisement and the bid opening. *The Second Class Township Code*, 53 P.S. § 68102(a), (also found at § 3102(a) of *The Second Class Township Code* as published by the Local Government Commission), states:

The first advertisement shall be published not more than forty-five days, and the second advertisement not less than ten days, before the date set for the opening of bids.

The second advertisement for both purchases did not leave the required 10 days before bid opening.

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
FINDING AND RECOMMENDATIONS  
FOR THE PERIOD  
JANUARY 1, 2012 TO DECEMBER 31, 2013

**Finding - Restrictive Bidding And Failure To Properly Advertise For Bids (Continued)**

The failure to follow the Department of Transportation's *Publication 9* and *The Second Class Township Code* as noted above could result in the municipality having to reimburse \$51,945.00 to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

Recommendations

We recommend that the municipality reimburse \$51,945.00 to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund upon official notification by the Department of Transportation.

We further recommend that, in the future, the municipality follow with the Department of Transportation's *Publication 9* if it uses Brand names in future advertisements for purchases as cited above.

Additionally, we recommend that the municipality ensure that it complies with the advertising requirements of *The Second Class Township Code* and discontinue making down payments for purchases before they are bid.

Management's Response

The municipal officials stated:

Our advertising did ask for the Mack truck and CAT roller. We bid for preferred make and will ask for equivalent make and model in the future.

Auditor's Conclusion

The municipality should also refrain from making down payments for purchases before they are bid and ensure that its second advertisement is at least 10 days before the bid opening. During our next examination we will determine if the municipality complied with our recommendations.

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
SUMMARY OF EXIT CONFERENCE  
FOR THE PERIOD  
JANUARY 1, 2012 TO DECEMBER 31, 2013

An exit conference was held January 28, 2015. Those participating were:

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM

Ms. Shelly Wattles, Secretary/Treasurer

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL

Mr. Christopher Heglen, Auditor

The results of the examination were presented and discussed in their entirety.

TOWNSHIP OF CHATHAM  
TIOGA COUNTY  
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND  
REPORT DISTRIBUTION  
FOR THE PERIOD  
JANUARY 1, 2012 TO DECEMBER 31, 2013

This report was initially distributed to:

The Honorable Leslie Richards  
Secretary  
Department of Transportation

Township of Chatham  
Tioga County  
1579 Blair Creek Road  
Little Marsh, PA 16950

The Honorable Dan Bailey

Chairman of the Board of Supervisors

Ms. Shelly Wattles

Secretary/Treasurer

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at <http://www.PaAuditor.gov>.  
Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor  
General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to:  
[news@PaAuditor.gov](mailto:news@PaAuditor.gov).