



**TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
ERIE COUNTY
25-211**

**LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
EXAMINATION REPORT**

**FOR THE PERIOD
JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011**

Released April 2013

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE - AUDITOR GENERAL

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL



TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
ERIE COUNTY
25-211

LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
EXAMINATION REPORT

FOR THE PERIOD
JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background.....	1
Independent Auditor’s Report.....	3
Financial Section:	
2010 Form MS-965 With Adjustments	7
2011 Form MS-965 With Adjustments	10
Notes To Forms MS-965 With Adjustments.....	13
Findings And Recommendations:	
Finding No. 1 - Documentation For Price Quotations Was Not Available For Examination.....	19
Finding No. 2 - Related Party Transaction	21
Summary Of Exit Conference.....	23
Report Distribution	25

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
ERIE COUNTY
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
BACKGROUND
FOR THE PERIOD
JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

Background

The Liquid Fuels Tax Municipal Allocation Law, Title 72 P.S. § 2615.5, provides municipalities other than counties (townships, boroughs, cities, towns, home rule, and optional plan governments) with an annual allocation of liquid fuels taxes from the state's Motor License Fund to be used for the maintenance and repair of streets, roads, and bridges for which the municipality is responsible. The allocation of these funds to municipalities is based: (1) 50 percent on the municipality's proportion of local road mileage to the total local road mileage in the state, and (2) 50 percent on the proportion of a municipality's population to the total population in the state.

The Vehicle Code, Title 75 P.S. § 9511, provides municipalities with annual maintenance payments to be received from the Motor License Fund for functionally local highways that were transferred to a municipality from the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.

Each municipality must deposit the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money and annual maintenance payments that it receives into a special fund called the Municipal Liquid Fuels Tax Fund or State Fund. A municipality may not deposit any other monies into this fund except when the municipality does not have enough money in the special fund to meet the payments called for by its current annual budget for road and bridge purposes. In this case, the municipality may borrow money or transfer money from its General Fund to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

The Department of Transportation has been given the regulatory authority for the administration of these funds. To qualify for its annual allocation, each municipality shall submit the following documents and information to the Department of Transportation:

1. Evidence that the treasurer is bonded in accordance with the law, or that its treasurer is a bank requiring no bond by January 31 of each year.
2. A report indicating the manner in which its liquid fuels tax allocation was expended in the previous year (Form MS-965) by January 31 of each year.
3. A report of elected and appointed officials by January 31 of each year.
4. A Survey of Financial Condition by March 15 of each year.

Department of Transportation *Publication 9* contains the policies and procedures that govern the use of Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money. However, if there is a difference between *Publication 9* and any legislation, the legislation shall govern.





Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL

Independent Auditor's Report

The Honorable Barry J. Schoch, P.E.
Secretary
Department of Transportation
Harrisburg, PA 17120

We examined the accompanying Forms MS-965 With Adjustments for the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund of the Township of Le Boeuf, Erie County, for the period January 1, 2010 to December 31, 2011. The municipality's management is responsible for the Forms MS-965. Our responsibility is to express an opinion on the Forms MS-965 With Adjustments based on our examination.

Our examination was conducted in accordance with attestation standards established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants and the standards applicable to attestation engagements contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. An examination includes examining, on a test basis, evidence supporting the Township of Le Boeuf, Erie County's Forms MS-965 for the period January 1, 2010 to December 31, 2011 and performing such other procedures as we considered necessary in the circumstances. We believe that our examination provides a reasonable basis for our opinion.

We are mandated by Section 403 of *The Fiscal Code*, 72 P.S. § 403, to audit each municipality's Liquid Fuels Tax Fund to ensure that funds received are expended in accordance with applicable laws and regulations. *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States include attestation engagements as a separate type of audit. An attestation engagement performed pursuant to *Government Auditing Standards* involves additional standards that exceed the standards provided by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants. Accordingly, this attestation engagement complies with both *Government Auditing Standards* and Section 403 of *The Fiscal Code*.

As described in Note 4, the adjustments included on the Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are made by the Department of the Auditor General.

Independent Auditor's Report (Continued)

As discussed in Finding No. 1, the township expended \$7,670.50 during 2011 from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund for bridge repairs. However, documentation for price quotations was not available for examination. Additionally, as discussed in Finding No. 2, the township expended \$1,976.00 during 2011 from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund for oversized stone and the rental of a loader from a business that is owned by the son of a township supervisor.

In our opinion, except for the matters discussed in the preceding paragraph, the Forms MS-965 With Adjustments present, in all material respects, the information required by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation for the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund of the Township of Le Boeuf, Erie County, for the period January 1, 2010 to December 31, 2011, in conformity with the criteria set forth in Note 1.

In accordance with *Government Auditing Standards*, we are required to report findings of significant deficiencies in internal control, violations of provisions of contracts or grant agreements, and abuse that are material to the Forms MS-965 and any fraud and illegal acts that are more than inconsequential that come to our attention during our examination. We are also required to obtain the views of management on those matters. We performed our examination to express an opinion on whether the Forms MS-965 are presented in accordance with the criteria described above and not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the internal control over reporting on the Forms MS-965 or on compliance and other matters; accordingly, we express no such opinions.

A control deficiency exists when the design or operation of a control does not allow management or employees, in the normal course of performing their assigned functions, to prevent or detect misstatements on a timely basis. A significant deficiency is a control deficiency, or combination of control deficiencies, that adversely affects the Township of Le Boeuf, Erie County's ability to initiate, authorize, record, process, or report data reliably in accordance with the applicable criteria such that there is more than a remote likelihood that a misstatement of the Township of Le Boeuf, Erie County's Forms MS-965 that is more than inconsequential will not be prevented or detected by the Township of Le Boeuf, Erie County's internal control.

A material weakness is a significant deficiency or combination of significant deficiencies that results in more than a remote likelihood that a material misstatement of the Forms MS-965 will not be prevented or detected by the Township of Le Boeuf, Erie County's internal control.

Independent Auditor's Report (Continued)

Our consideration of internal control over reporting on the Forms MS-965 was for the limited purpose described in the first paragraph of this section and would not necessarily identify all deficiencies in internal control that might be significant deficiencies or material weaknesses. We did not identify any significant deficiencies or material weaknesses, as defined above, in internal control over reporting on the Forms MS-965.

The results of our tests disclosed the following instances of noncompliance that are required to be reported under *Government Auditing Standards*:

- Documentation For Price Quotations Was Not Available For Examination.
- Related Party Transaction.

This report is intended solely for the information and use of the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation and the management of the Township of Le Boeuf, Erie County, and is not intended to be and should not be used by anyone other than these specified parties.



EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

March 21, 2012



TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
 ERIE COUNTY
 LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
 2010 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 1
 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

<u>Expenditure Summary</u>	<u>Reported</u>	<u>Adjustments (Note 4)</u>	<u>Adjusted Amount</u>
Major equipment purchases	\$ 15,052.35	\$ 54,697.00	\$ 69,749.35
Minor equipment purchases	-	-	-
Computer/Computer related training	-	-	-
Agility projects	-	-	-
Cleaning streets and gutters	-	-	-
Winter maintenance services	38,194.19	-	38,194.19
Traffic control devices	752.44	-	752.44
Street lighting	-	-	-
Storm sewers and drains	-	-	-
Repairs of tools and machinery	47,060.86	-	47,060.86
Maintenance and repair of roads and bridges	46,516.04	-	46,516.04
Highway construction and rebuilding projects	-	-	-
Miscellaneous	54,697.00	(54,697.00)	-
 Total (To Section 2, Line 5)	 <u>\$ 202,272.88</u>	 <u>\$ -</u>	 <u>\$ 202,272.88</u>

Notes To Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are an integral part of this report.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
 ERIE COUNTY
 LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
 2010 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 2
 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

<u>Fund Balance</u>	<u>Reported</u>	<u>Adjustments</u>	<u>Adjusted Amount</u>
1. Balance, January 1, 2010	\$ 1,216.88	\$ -	\$ 1,216.88
Receipts:			
2. State allocation	100,763.11	-	100,763.11
2a. Turnback allocation	37,960.00	-	37,960.00
2b. Interest on investments (Note 3)	242.63	-	242.63
2c. Miscellaneous (Note 5)	75,680.00	-	75,680.00
3. Total receipts	<u>214,645.74</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>214,645.74</u>
4. Total funds available	<u>215,862.62</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>215,862.62</u>
5. Expenditures (Section 1)	<u>202,272.88</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>202,272.88</u>
6. Balance, December 31, 2010	<u><u>\$ 13,589.74</u></u>	<u><u>\$ -</u></u>	<u><u>\$ 13,589.74</u></u>

Notes To Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are an integral part of this report.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
 ERIE COUNTY
 LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
 2010 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 3
 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

<u>Equipment Balance</u>	<u>Reported</u>	<u>Adjustments (Note 4)</u>	<u>Adjusted Amount</u>
1. Prior year equipment balance	\$ 1,216.88	\$ -	\$ 1,216.88
2. Add: Current year equipment allocation (20% of Lines 2 + 2a, Section 2)	27,744.62	-	27,744.62
3. PENNDOT approved adjustments	<u>-</u>	<u>75,000.00</u>	<u>75,000.00</u>
4. Total funds available for equipment acquisition	28,961.50	75,000.00	103,961.50
5. Less: Major equipment expenditures	<u>15,052.35</u>	<u>54,697.00</u>	<u>69,749.35</u>
6. Remainder	<u>13,909.15</u>	<u>20,303.00</u>	<u>34,212.15</u>
7. Equipment balance available for subsequent year (Lesser of Line 6 or Section 2 balance, but not less than zero)	<u>\$ 13,589.74</u>	<u>\$ -</u>	<u>\$ 13,589.74</u>

Notes To Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are an integral part of this report.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
 ERIE COUNTY
 LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
 2011 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 1
 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

<u>Expenditure Summary</u>	<u>Reported</u>	<u>Adjustments (Note 4)</u>	<u>Adjusted Amount</u>
Major equipment purchases	\$ -	\$ 12,273.63	\$ 12,273.63
Minor equipment purchases	-	-	-
Computer/Computer related training	-	-	-
Agility projects	-	-	-
Cleaning streets and gutters	-	-	-
Winter maintenance services	35,521.60	-	35,521.60
Traffic control devices	1,900.80	-	1,900.80
Street lighting	-	-	-
Storm sewers and drains	-	-	-
Repairs of tools and machinery	35,342.66	-	35,342.66
Maintenance and repair of roads and bridges	68,062.00	-	68,062.00
Highway construction and rebuilding projects	-	-	-
Miscellaneous	12,273.63	(12,273.63)	-
 Total (To Section 2, Line 5)	 <u>\$ 153,100.69</u>	 <u>\$ -</u>	 <u>\$ 153,100.69</u>

Notes To Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are an integral part of this report.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
 ERIE COUNTY
 LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
 2011 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 2
 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

<u>Fund Balance</u>	<u>Reported</u>	<u>Adjustments</u>	<u>Adjusted Amount</u>
1. Balance, January 1, 2011	\$ 13,589.74	\$ -	\$ 13,589.74
Receipts:			
2. State allocation	103,233.18	-	103,233.18
2a. Turnback allocation	37,960.00	-	37,960.00
2b. Interest on investments (Note 3)	98.78	-	98.78
2c. Miscellaneous (Note 5)	687.99	-	687.99
3. Total receipts	<u>141,979.95</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>141,979.95</u>
4. Total funds available	<u>155,569.69</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>155,569.69</u>
5. Expenditures (Section 1)	<u>153,100.69</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>153,100.69</u>
6. Balance, December 31, 2011	<u><u>\$ 2,469.00</u></u>	<u><u>\$ -</u></u>	<u><u>\$ 2,469.00</u></u>

Notes To Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are an integral part of this report.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
 ERIE COUNTY
 LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
 2011 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 3
 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

<u>Equipment Balance</u>	<u>Reported</u>	<u>Adjustments (Note 4)</u>	<u>Adjusted Amount</u>
1. Prior year equipment balance	\$ 13,589.74	\$ -	\$ 13,589.74
2. Add: Current year equipment allocation (20% of Lines 2 + 2a, Section 2)	28,238.64	-	28,238.64
3. PENNDOT approved adjustments	-	-	-
4. Total funds available for equipment acquisition	41,828.38	-	41,828.38
5. Less: Major equipment expenditures	-	12,273.63	12,273.63
6. Remainder	<u>41,828.38</u>	<u>(12,273.63)</u>	<u>29,554.75</u>
7. Equipment balance available for subsequent year (Lesser of Line 6 or Section 2 balance, but not less than zero)	<u>\$ 2,469.00</u>	<u>\$ -</u>	<u>\$ 2,469.00</u>

Notes To Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are an integral part of this report.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
ERIE COUNTY
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
NOTES TO FORMS MS-965 WITH ADJUSTMENTS
FOR THE PERIOD
JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

1. Criteria

Section 1

This section of Form MS-965 With Adjustments provides a summary of Liquid Fuels Tax Fund expenditures by category. Categories requiring explanation include:

- Major equipment purchases are purchases of road machinery and road equipment that cost in excess of \$4,000.00.
- Minor equipment purchases are purchases of road machinery and road equipment that cost \$4,000.00 or less.
- Agility projects are exchanges of services with the Department of Transportation.

Section 2

This section of Form MS-965 With Adjustments provides information on the fund balance. Categories requiring explanation include:

- The state allocation is generally received from the Department of Transportation during the first week in April of each year. The amount the municipality receives is based half on its population and half on its road mileage.
- The turnback allocation is generally received from the Department of Transportation during the first week in April of each year. A municipality receives a yearly turnback allocation based on road mileage for all roads that were transferred to the municipality from the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania through the Highway Transfer Program.
- Expenditures include the total transferred from Section 1.

Section 3

This section of Form MS-965 With Adjustments determines if the municipality expended Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money in excess of the permissible amount for equipment and the balance that the municipality may carry forward for the purchase of equipment to the subsequent year.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
ERIE COUNTY
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
NOTES TO FORMS MS-965 WITH ADJUSTMENTS
FOR THE PERIOD
JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

1. Criteria (Continued)

Section 3 (Continued)

Department of Transportation *Publication 9* requires that the amount expended for equipment purchases in a given year not exceed the sum of the equipment balance carried forward from the previous year and 20 percent of the current year's Liquid Fuels Tax Fund allocation and, if applicable, 20 percent of the turnback allocation plus other Department of Transportation approved adjustments.

If the municipality spent in excess of the amount listed on Line 4, the excess must be reimbursed to the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

The equipment balance to be carried forward for the subsequent year is the lesser of the amount on Line 6 or the ending fund balance on Line 6 of Section 2, but not less than zero.

Basis Of Presentation

The financial activities of the municipality are accounted for in separate funds. The Liquid Fuels Tax Fund is used to account for state aid revenues from the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation used primarily for building and improving local roads and bridges. The Forms MS-965 have been prepared in accordance with reporting requirements prescribed by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation as a result of the Fuels Tax Act 655, dated 1956 and as amended, which does not constitute a complete presentation of the entity's assets, liabilities, expenses, and fund balance. Accordingly, the presentation of Forms MS-965 With Adjustments is restricted to the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund, which represents a segment of the entity.

Basis Of Accounting

The accompanying Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are prepared in accordance with reporting requirements prescribed by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation. Under this method, revenues are recognized when received and expenditures are recorded when paid.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
ERIE COUNTY
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
NOTES TO FORMS MS-965 WITH ADJUSTMENTS
FOR THE PERIOD
JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

1. Criteria (Continued)

General Fixed Assets

General fixed assets are recognized as expenditures at the time of purchase. No depreciation has been provided on the heavy equipment used to maintain and repair roads and bridges.

2. Deposits

The Second Class Township Code, Title 53 P.S. § 68204, authorizes the township to deposit its funds in the following:

- Deposits in savings accounts or time deposits, other than certificates of deposit or share accounts of institutions having their principal place of business in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and insured by the Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation (FDIC) or other like insurance. For any amount above the insured maximum, the depository shall pledge approved collateral.
- Certificates of deposit purchased from institutions insured by the FDIC or other like insurance to the extent that such accounts are so insured. For any amounts in excess of the insured maximum, such deposits shall be collateralized by a pledge or assignment of assets. Certificates of deposit may not exceed 20 percent of a bank's total capital surplus or 20 percent of a savings and loan's or savings bank's assets minus liabilities.

Deposits consist of receipts and deposits in a financial institution. Pennsylvania statutes require all deposits to be insured and, for any amount above the insured maximum, to be secured with approved collateral as defined.

There were no deposits exposed to custodial credit risk as of December 31, 2011. Custodial credit risk, as defined by GASB No. 40, includes deposits that are not covered by depository insurance and the deposits are uncollateralized, collateralized with securities held by the pledging financial institution, or collateralized with securities held by the pledging financial institution's trust department or agent but not in the municipality's name.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
ERIE COUNTY
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
NOTES TO FORMS MS-965 WITH ADJUSTMENTS
FOR THE PERIOD
JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

2. Deposits (Continued)

Fund Balance

The fund balance as of December 31, 2011 consists of the following:

Cash	\$2,469.00
------	------------

3. Interest On Investments

Our examination disclosed that the municipality deposited idle liquid fuels tax money in an interest-bearing account which earned \$242.63 during 2010, and \$98.78 during 2011, thus providing additional funds for road maintenance and repairs.

4. Adjustments

2010 - Section 1

Adjustments were made to “Major equipment purchases” and “Miscellaneous” because expenditures of \$54,697.00 were misclassified.

2010 - Section 3

An adjustment of \$75,000.00 was made to “PENNDOT approved adjustments” because the proceeds from two loans were not reported.

An adjustment of \$54,697.00 was made to “Major equipment expenditures” to reflect the adjustment made to major equipment purchases in 2010 - Section 1.

2011 - Section 1

Adjustments were made to “Major equipment purchases” and “Miscellaneous” because expenditures of \$12,273.63 were misclassified.

2011 - Section 3

An adjustment of \$12,273.63 was made to “Major equipment expenditures” to reflect the adjustment made to major equipment purchases in 2011 - Section 1.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
 ERIE COUNTY
 LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
 NOTES TO FORMS MS-965 WITH ADJUSTMENTS
 FOR THE PERIOD
 JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

5. Miscellaneous Receipts

The following miscellaneous receipts were deposited into the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund during the examination period:

<u>Source</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>2010</u>	<u>2011</u>
Financial institution	Loan proceeds (Note 6)	\$50,000.00	\$ -
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania	Loan proceeds (Note 7)	25,000.00	-
Financial institution	Interest adjustment	-	7.99
Union Township	Maintenance agreement	680.00	680.00
Total		<u>\$75,680.00</u>	<u>\$687.99</u>

6. Bank Loan

On January 4, 2010, the municipality borrowed \$50,000.00 from Northwest Savings Bank to purchase a 2009 International Diamond dump truck with attachments. The term of the loan was for five years at an interest rate of 4.0 percent. Principal and interest payments of \$2,774.55 are due quarterly.

During the current examination period the municipality paid principal of \$16,378.29 and interest of \$3,043.56 from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund. These amounts are reflected in major equipment purchases on the 2010 and 2011 Forms MS-965 - Section 1. Additionally, the municipality paid principal of \$2,430.06 and interest of \$344.49 from the General Fund. The outstanding balance of the loan as of December 31, 2011 was \$31,191.65, plus interest.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
ERIE COUNTY
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
NOTES TO FORMS MS-965 WITH ADJUSTMENTS
FOR THE PERIOD
JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

7. Bank Loan

On February 1, 2010, the municipality borrowed an additional \$25,000.00 from the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania to purchase a 2009 International dump truck with attachments. The term of the loan was for five years at an interest rate of 2.0 percent. Principal and interest payments of \$1,316.66 are due quarterly.

During the current examination period the municipality paid principal of \$7,343.30 and interest of \$560.83 from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund. These amounts are reflected in major equipment purchases on the 2010 and 2011 Forms MS-965 - Section 1. Additionally, the municipality paid principal of \$1,246.37 and interest of \$70.29 from the General Fund. The outstanding balance of the loan as of December 31, 2011 was \$16,410.33, plus interest.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
ERIE COUNTY
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
FOR THE PERIOD
JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

Finding No. 1 - Documentation For Price Quotations Was Not Available For Examination

Our examination disclosed that the municipality expended \$7,670.50 during 2011 from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund for bridge repairs. The township was required to obtain three price quotations for the bridge repairs. However, documentation for price quotations was not available for examination.

The above expenditure was not made in compliance with the contract requirements of *The Second Class Township Code*, 53 P.S. § 68102(b), (also found at § 3102(b) of *The Second Class Township Code* as published by the Local Government Commission), which states, in part:

Written or telephonic price quotations from at least three qualified and responsible contractors shall be requested for all contracts that exceed four thousand dollars (\$4,000.00) but are less than the amount [in excess of \$10,000.00] requiring advertisement and competitive bidding or, in lieu of price quotations, a memorandum shall be kept on file showing that fewer than three qualified contractors exist in the market area within which it is practicable to obtain quotations. A written record of telephonic price quotations shall be made and shall contain at least the date of the quotation, the name of the contractor and the contractor's representative, the construction, reconstruction, repair, maintenance or work which was the subject of the quotation and the price. Written price quotations, written records of telephonic price quotations and memoranda shall be retained for a period of three years.

In addition, the above expenditure was not made in compliance with the Department of Transportation's *Publication 9*, Appendix D, Section 449.7(d), which states, in part:

...For material estimates between \$4,000 and \$10,000, three telephone price quotes shall be obtained prior to the selection of a supplier. In lieu of the price quotations, a memorandum shall be kept on file showing that fewer than three qualified contractors service the market area within which it is practicable to obtain quotations. If the cost during the year of an unadvertised item or group of like items ordinarily supplied by a single supplier exceeds \$10,000 or if the cost was between \$4,000 and \$10,000 and three price quotes were not obtained, the entire cost shall be ineligible for payment from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund unless it can be shown to the satisfaction of the Secretary [of the Department of Transportation] that it was reasonably believed that the cost of the year's requirements of that item or group of like items would not exceed \$10,000 or be between \$4,000 and \$10,000 as specified above.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
ERIE COUNTY
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
FOR THE PERIOD
JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

Finding No. 1 - Documentation For Price Quotations Was Not Available For Examination
(Continued)

The failure to comply with *The Second Class Township Code* and the Department of Transportation's *Publication 9* could result in the municipality having to reimburse \$7,670.50 to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

Recommendations

We recommend that the municipality reimburse \$7,670.50 to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund upon official notification by the Department of Transportation.

We further recommend that, in the future, the municipality comply with *The Second Class Township Code* and the Department of Transportation's *Publication 9* as noted in this finding.

Management's Response

The municipal officials stated:

The supervisors did not request additional quotes.

Auditor's Conclusion

The township should obtain at least three price quotations for all purchases between \$4,000.00 and \$10,000.00. During our next examination we will determine if the municipality complied with our recommendations.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
ERIE COUNTY
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
FOR THE PERIOD
JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

Finding No. 2 - Related Party Transaction

Our examination disclosed that the township expended \$1,976.00 during 2011 from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund for oversized stone and the rental of a loader from a business that is owned by the son of a township supervisor. Due to supervisor's son's financial interest in the company and the lack of an open and public award process, this contract appears to violate *The Second Class Township Code* and The Public Official and Employee Ethics Act. Therefore, it should not have been entered into by the township.

The Second Class Township Code, 53 P.S. § 68102(i), as amended, states, in part:

No township official, either elected or appointed, or township employe who knows, or who by the exercise of reasonable diligence could know, shall be interested to any appreciable degree, either directly or indirectly, in any contract for the sale or furnishing of any supplies or materials for the use of the township or for any work to be done for such township involving the expenditure by the township of more than five hundred dollars (\$500.00) in any year unless the contract is awarded through the public bid process. This limitation does not apply if the officer or appointee of the township is an employe of the person, firm or corporations to which the money is to be paid in a capacity with no possible influence on the transaction and the officer cannot possibly be benefited thereby, either financially or otherwise. If a supervisor is within this exception, the supervisor shall so inform the board of supervisors and refrain from voting on the payments and shall in no manner participate in the contract. . . .

This information is also published in § 3102(i) of *The Second Class Township Code* as published by the Local Government Commission.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
ERIE COUNTY
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
FOR THE PERIOD
JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

Finding No. 2 - Related Party Transaction (Continued)

The Public Official and Employee Ethics Act (“Ethics Act”), 65 P.S. 1103(f), states, in part:

No public official or public employee or his spouse or child or any business in which the person or his spouse or child is associated shall enter into any contract valued at \$500 or more with the governmental body with which the public official or public employee is associated or any subcontract valued at \$500 or more with any person who has been awarded a contract with the governmental body with which the public official or public employee is associated, unless the contract has been awarded through an open and public process, including prior public notice and subsequent public disclosure of all proposals considered and contracts awarded. In such a case, the public official or public employee shall not have any supervisory or overall responsibility for the implementation or administration of the contract.

Because this contract violates *The Second Class Township Code* and the Ethics Act the township could be required by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation to reimburse \$1,976.00 to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

Copies of this finding will be forwarded to the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation and the State Ethics Commission for their review and whatever action they may deem appropriate.

Recommendations

We recommend that the township reimburse \$1,976.00 to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund upon official notification by the Department of Transportation.

We further recommend that, in the future, the township comply with *The Second Class Township Code* and the Ethics Act.

Management’s Response

The municipal officials offered no formal response at this time.

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
ERIE COUNTY
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
SUMMARY OF EXIT CONFERENCE
FOR THE PERIOD
JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

An exit conference was held March 21, 2012. Those participating were:

TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF

Mrs. Catherine M. Wise, Secretary/Treasurer

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL

Ms. Ortenzia M. Keller, Auditor

The results of the examination were presented and discussed in their entirety.



TOWNSHIP OF LE BOEUF
ERIE COUNTY
LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND
REPORT DISTRIBUTION
FOR THE PERIOD
JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

This report was initially distributed to:

The Honorable Barry J. Schoch, P.E.
Secretary
Department of Transportation

Mr. Rob Caruso
Acting Executive Director
Pennsylvania State Ethics Commission

Township of Le Boeuf
Erie County
14270 Flatts Road
Waterford, PA 16441

The Honorable Jack Merry

Chairman of the Board of Supervisors

Mrs. Catherine M. Wise

Secretary/Treasurer

This report is a matter of public record. Copies of this report may be obtained from the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120. To view this report online or to contact the Department of the Auditor General, please access our web site at www.auditorgen.state.pa.us.