

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY 25-206

LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND EXAMINATION REPORT

FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE - AUDITOR GENERAL

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL





Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

Independent Auditor's Report

The Honorable Barry J. Schoch, P.E. Secretary
Department of Transportation
Harrisburg, PA 17120

We examined the accompanying Forms MS-965 With Adjustments for the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund of the Township of Franklin, Erie County, for the period January 1, 2010 to December 31, 2011. The municipality's management is responsible for the Forms MS-965. Our responsibility is to express an opinion on the Forms MS-965 With Adjustments based on our examination.

Our examination was conducted in accordance with attestation standards established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants and the standards applicable to attestation engagements contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. An examination includes examining, on a test basis, evidence supporting the Township of Franklin, Erie County's Forms MS-965 for the period January 1, 2010 to December 31, 2011 and performing such other procedures as we considered necessary in the circumstances. We believe that our examination provides a reasonable basis for our opinion.

We are mandated by Section 403 of *The Fiscal Code*, 72 P.S. § 403, to audit each municipality's Liquid Fuels Tax Fund to ensure that funds received are expended in accordance with applicable laws and regulations. *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States include attestation engagements as a separate type of audit. An attestation engagement performed pursuant to *Government Auditing Standards* involves additional standards that exceed the standards provided by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants. Accordingly, this attestation engagement complies with both *Government Auditing Standards* and Section 403 of *The Fiscal Code*.

As described in Note 4, the adjustments included on the Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are made by the Department of the Auditor General.

Independent Auditor's Report (Continued)

As discussed in Finding No. 1, the township expended \$17,000.00 from its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund for the purchase of a 1999 Ford F-450 truck that was restrictively bid. Additionally, as discussed in Finding No. 2, the township expended \$14,763.00 from its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund for the purchase of a new brine tank without advertising for bids.

In our opinion, except for the matters discussed in the preceding paragraph, the Forms MS-965 With Adjustments present, in all material respects, the information required by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation for the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund of the Township of Franklin, Erie County, for the period January 1, 2010 to December 31, 2011, in conformity with the criteria set forth in Note 1.

In accordance with *Government Auditing Standards*, we are required to report findings of significant deficiencies in internal control, violations of provisions of contracts or grant agreements, and abuse that are material to the Forms MS-965 and any fraud and illegal acts that are more than inconsequential that come to our attention during our examination. We are also required to obtain the views of management on those matters. We performed our examination to express an opinion on whether the Forms MS-965 are presented in accordance with the criteria described above and not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the internal control over reporting on the Forms MS-965 or on compliance and other matters; accordingly, we express no such opinions.

A control deficiency exists when the design or operation of a control does not allow management or employees, in the normal course of performing their assigned functions, to prevent or detect misstatements on a timely basis. A significant deficiency is a control deficiency, or combination of control deficiencies, that adversely affects the Township of Franklin, Erie County's ability to initiate, authorize, record, process, or report data reliably in accordance with the applicable criteria such that there is more than a remote likelihood that a misstatement of the Township of Franklin, Erie County's Forms MS-965 that is more than inconsequential will not be prevented or detected by the Township of Franklin, Erie County's internal control.

A material weakness is a significant deficiency or combination of significant deficiencies that results in more than a remote likelihood that a material misstatement of the Forms MS-965 will not be prevented or detected by the Township of Franklin, Erie County's internal control.

Independent Auditor's Report (Continued)

Our consideration of internal control over reporting on the Forms MS-965 was for the limited purpose described in the first paragraph of this section and would not necessarily identify all deficiencies in internal control that might be significant deficiencies or material weaknesses. We did not identify any significant deficiencies or material weaknesses, as defined above, in internal control over reporting on the Forms MS-965.

The results of our tests disclosed the following instances of noncompliance that are required to be reported under *Government Auditing Standards*:

- Restrictive Bidding.
- Purchase Over \$10,000.00 In Noncompliance With Advertising And Bidding Requirements.

This report is intended solely for the information and use of the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation and the management of the Township of Franklin, Erie County, and is not intended to be and should not be used by anyone other than these specified parties.

February 13, 2013

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE

Eugraf. O-Pager

Auditor General

CONTENTS

<u>Pag</u>	e
Background1	
Financial Section:	
2010 Form MS-965 With Adjustments	,
2011 Form MS-965 With Adjustments5	į
Notes To Forms MS-965 With Adjustments	,
Findings And Recommendations:	
Finding No. 1 - Restrictive Bidding	,
Finding No. 2 - Purchase Over \$10,000.00 In Noncompliance With Advertising And Bidding Requirements	Ļ
Summary Of Exit Conference16	,
Report Distribution	,

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND BACKGROUND FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

Background

The Liquid Fuels Tax Municipal Allocation Law, Title 72 P.S. § 2615.5, provides municipalities other than counties (townships, boroughs, cities, towns, home rule, and optional plan governments) with an annual allocation of liquid fuels taxes from the state's Motor License Fund to be used for the maintenance and repair of streets, roads, and bridges for which the municipality is responsible. The allocation of these funds to municipalities is based: (1) 50 percent on the municipality's proportion of local road mileage to the total local road mileage in the state, and (2) 50 percent on the proportion of a municipality's population to the total population in the state.

The Vehicle Code, Title 75 P.S. § 9511, provides municipalities with annual maintenance payments to be received from the Motor License Fund for functionally local highways that were transferred to a municipality from the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.

Each municipality must deposit the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money and annual maintenance payments that it receives into a special fund called the Municipal Liquid Fuels Tax Fund or State Fund. A municipality may not deposit any other monies into this fund except when the municipality does not have enough money in the special fund to meet the payments called for by its current annual budget for road and bridge purposes. In this case, the municipality may borrow money or transfer money from its General Fund to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

The Department of Transportation has been given the regulatory authority for the administration of these funds. To qualify for its annual allocation, each municipality shall submit the following documents and information to the Department of Transportation:

- 1. Evidence that the treasurer is bonded in accordance with the law, or that its treasurer is a bank requiring no bond by January 31 of each year.
- 2. A report indicating the manner in which its liquid fuels tax allocation was expended in the previous year (Form MS-965) by January 31 of each year.
- 3. A report of elected and appointed officials by January 31 of each year.
- 4. A Survey of Financial Condition by March 15 of each year.

Department of Transportation *Publication 9* contains the policies and procedures that govern the use of Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money. However, if there is a difference between *Publication 9* and any legislation, the legislation shall govern.

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2010 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 1 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

F. B. G		D . 1	A 1'			Adjusted
Expenditure Summary	Reported		Adjustments		Amount	
Major equipment purchases	\$	17,000.00	\$	-	\$	17,000.00
Minor equipment purchases		2,197.16		-		2,197.16
Computer/Computer related training		-		-		-
Agility projects		-		-		-
Cleaning streets and gutters		5,679.18		-		5,679.18
Winter maintenance services		4,536.59		-		4,536.59
Traffic control devices		862.94		-		862.94
Street lighting		-		-		-
Storm sewers and drains		1,878.06		-		1,878.06
Repairs of tools and machinery		18,446.29		-		18,446.29
Maintenance and repair of						
roads and bridges		64,429.98		-		64,429.98
Highway construction and						
rebuilding projects		-		-		-
Miscellaneous						
Total (To Section 2, Line 5)	\$	115,030.20	\$		\$	115,030.20

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2010 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 2 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Fund Balance	Reported		Reported Adjustments		Adjusted Amount		
1. Balance, January 1, 2010	\$	27,658.14	\$	-	\$	27,658.14	
Receipts: 2. State allocation		88,571.33		_		88,571.33	
2a. Turnback allocation		-		- -		-	
2b. Interest on investments (Note 3)		41.13		-		41.13	
2c. Miscellaneous		-					
3. Total receipts		88,612.46				88,612.46	
4. Total funds available		116,270.60				116,270.60	
5. Expenditures (Section 1)		115,030.20				115,030.20	
6. Balance, December 31, 2010	\$	1,240.40	\$		\$	1,240.40	

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2010 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 3 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Equipment Balance]	Reported	Adju	stments	Adjusted Amount
1. Prior year equipment balance	\$	18,488.52	\$	-	\$ 18,488.52
2. Add: Current year equipment allocation (20% of Lines 2 + 2a, Section 2)	1	17,714.27		-	17,714.27
3. PENNDOT approved adjustments					
4. Total funds available for equipment acquisition		36,202.79		-	36,202.79
5. Less: Major equipment expenditures		17,000.00			17,000.00
6. Remainder		19,202.79		_	19,202.79
7. Equipment balance available for subsequent year (Lesser of Line 6 or Section 2 balance, but not less than zero)	\$	1,240.40	\$	<u>-</u>	\$ 1,240.40

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2011 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 1 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Expenditure Summary	Reported	Adjustments (Note 4)		Adjusted Amount	
Major equipment purchases	\$ _	\$	14,763.00	\$	14,763.00
Minor equipment purchases	-		-		-
Computer/Computer related training	-		-		-
Agility projects	-		-		-
Cleaning streets and gutters	3,426.86		-		3,426.86
Winter maintenance services	1,288.94		-		1,288.94
Traffic control devices	810.13		-		810.13
Street lighting	-		-		-
Storm sewers and drains	11,681.99		-		11,681.99
Repairs of tools and machinery	38,346.60		(14,763.00)		23,583.60
Maintenance and repair of					
roads and bridges	34,632.71		-		34,632.71
Highway construction and					
rebuilding projects	-		-		-
Miscellaneous	 		_		
Total (To Section 2, Line 5)	\$ 90,187.23	\$		\$	90,187.23

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2011 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 2 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Fund Balance	Reported		Reported Adjustments		Adjusted Amount		
1. Balance, January 1, 2011	\$	1,240.40	\$	-	\$	1,240.40	
Receipts:							
2. State allocation		90,194.31		-		90,194.31	
2a. Turnback allocation 2b. Interest on investments (Note 3)		- 0 00		-		8.80	
2b. Interest on investments (Note 3) 2c. Miscellaneous		8.80		<u>-</u>		-	
3. Total receipts		90,203.11		-		90,203.11	
4. Total funds available		91,443.51		-		91,443.51	
5. Expenditures (Section 1)		90,187.23		-		90,187.23	
6. Balance, December 31, 2011	\$	1,256.28	\$	-	\$	1,256.28	

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2011 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 3 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Equipment Balance	Adjustments Reported (Note 4)		•	Adjusted Amount	
1. Prior year equipment balance	\$	1,240.40	\$	-	\$ 1,240.40
2. Add: Current year equipment allocation (20% of Lines 2 + 2a, Section 2)	1	18,038.86		-	18,038.86
3. PENNDOT approved adjustments				<u>-</u>	
4. Total funds available for equipment acquisition		19,279.26		-	19,279.26
5. Less: Major equipment expenditures		<u>-</u>		14,763.00	 14,763.00
6. Remainder		19,279.26		(14,763.00)	 4,516.26
7. Equipment balance available for subsequent year (Lesser of Line 6 or Section 2 balance, but not less than zero)	\$	1,256.28	\$	<u>-</u>	\$ 1,256.28

1. Criteria

Section 1

This section of Form MS-965 With Adjustments provides a summary of Liquid Fuels Tax Fund expenditures by category. Categories requiring explanation include:

- Major equipment purchases are purchases of road machinery and road equipment that cost in excess of \$4,000.00.
- Minor equipment purchases are purchases of road machinery and road equipment that cost \$4,000.00 or less.
- Agility projects are exchanges of services with the Department of Transportation.

Section 2

This section of Form MS-965 With Adjustments provides information on the fund balance. Categories requiring explanation include:

- The state allocation is generally received from the Department of Transportation during the first week in April of each year. The amount the municipality receives is based half on its population and half on its road mileage.
- The turnback allocation is generally received from the Department of Transportation during the first week in April of each year. A municipality receives a yearly turnback allocation based on road mileage for all roads that were transferred to the municipality from the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania through the Highway Transfer Program.
- Expenditures include the total transferred from Section 1.

Section 3

This section of Form MS-965 With Adjustments determines if the municipality expended Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money in excess of the permissible amount for equipment and the balance that the municipality may carry forward for the purchase of equipment to the subsequent year.

1. <u>Criteria (Continued)</u>

Section 3 (Continued)

Department of Transportation *Publication 9* requires that the amount expended for equipment purchases in a given year not exceed the sum of the equipment balance carried forward from the previous year and 20 percent of the current year's Liquid Fuels Tax Fund allocation and, if applicable, 20 percent of the turnback allocation plus other Department of Transportation approved adjustments.

If the municipality spent in excess of the amount listed on Line 4, the excess must be reimbursed to the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

The equipment balance to be carried forward for the subsequent year is the lesser of the amount on Line 6 or the ending fund balance on Line 6 of Section 2, but not less than zero.

Basis Of Presentation

The financial activities of the municipality are accounted for in separate funds. The Liquid Fuels Tax Fund is used to account for state aid revenues from the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation used primarily for building and improving local roads and bridges. The Forms MS-965 have been prepared in accordance with reporting requirements prescribed by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation as a result of the Fuels Tax Act 655, dated 1956 and as amended, which does not constitute a complete presentation of the entity's assets, liabilities, expenses, and fund balance. Accordingly, the presentation of Forms MS-965 With Adjustments is restricted to the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund, which represents a segment of the entity.

Basis Of Accounting

The accompanying Forms MS-965 With Adjustments are prepared in accordance with reporting requirements prescribed by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation. Under this method, revenues are recognized when received and expenditures are recorded when paid.

1. Criteria (Continued)

General Fixed Assets

General fixed assets are recognized as expenditures at the time of purchase. No depreciation has been provided on the heavy equipment used to maintain and repair roads and bridges.

2. Deposits

The Second Class Township Code, Title 53 P.S. § 68204, authorizes the township to deposit its funds in the following:

- Deposits in savings accounts or time deposits, other than certificates of deposit or share accounts of institutions having their principal place of business in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and insured by the Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation (FDIC) or other like insurance. For any amount above the insured maximum, the depository shall pledge approved collateral.
- Certificates of deposit purchased from institutions insured by the FDIC or other like insurance to the extent that such accounts are so insured. For any amounts in excess of the insured maximum, such deposits shall be collateralized by a pledge or assignment of assets. Certificates of deposit may not exceed 20 percent of a bank's total capital surplus or 20 percent of a savings and loan's or savings bank's assets minus liabilities.

Deposits consist of receipts and deposits in a financial institution. Pennsylvania statutes require all deposits to be insured and, for any amount above the insured maximum, to be secured with approved collateral as defined.

There were no deposits exposed to custodial credit risk as of December 31, 2011. Custodial credit risk, as defined by GASB No. 40, includes deposits that are not covered by depository insurance and the deposits are uncollateralized, collateralized with securities held by the pledging financial institution, or collateralized with securities held by the pledging financial institution's trust department or agent but not in the municipality's name.

2. <u>Deposits (Continued)</u>

Fund Balance

The fund balance as of December 31, 2011 consists of the following:

Cash \$1,256.28

3. <u>Interest On Investments</u>

Our examination disclosed that the municipality deposited idle liquid fuels tax money in an interest-bearing account which earned \$41.13 during 2010, and \$8.80 during 2011, thus providing additional funds for road maintenance and repairs.

4. Adjustments

2011 - Section 1

Adjustments were made to "Major equipment purchases" and "Repairs of tools and machinery" because expenditures of \$14,763.00 were misclassified.

2011 - Section 3

An adjustment of \$14,763.00 was made to "Major equipment expenditures" to reflect the adjustment made to major equipment purchases in 2011 - Section 1.

Finding No. 1 - Restrictive Bidding

Our examination disclosed that on December 8, 2010, the municipality purchased a 1999 Ford F-450 truck for \$18,500.00. The municipality expended \$17,000.00 from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund and \$1,500.00 from the General Fund. The advertisement for this purchase requested sealed proposals for a 1999 or newer, Ford F-450 or F-550. Ford is a Brand name. The use of Brand names in advertising for equipment without including the words "or its equivalent," is considered restrictive bidding, and therefore, is prohibited by the Department of Transportation's *Publication 9*, § 449.3(f), which states:

Brand names. In advertising for equipment to be rented or purchased, or for materials to be purchased or delivered in place, it is unlawful to require or specify any particular make or brand thereof, thereby excluding other makes or brands; however, a particular brand name or its equivalent may be specified if equal consideration is given to all brands which are reasonably similar to the specified brand. Such specifications must be reasonable and not merely imposed in order to exclude some brands of equipment or material in favor of other brands.

The failure to follow the Department of Transportation's *Publication 9* as noted above could result in the municipality having to reimburse \$17,000.00 to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

Recommendations

We recommend that the municipality reimburse \$17,000.00 to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund upon official notification by the Department of Transportation.

We further recommend that, in the future, the municipality follow with the Department of Transportation's *Publication 9* if it uses Brand names in future advertisements for purchases as cited above.

Management's Response

The municipal officials stated:

The bid was for a specific used piece of equipment.

Finding No. 1 - Restrictive Bidding (Continued)

Auditor's Conclusion

The municipal officials should comply with the Department of Transportation's *Publication 9* as noted above. During our next examination we will determine if the municipality complied with our recommendations.

<u>Finding No. 2 - Purchase Over \$10,000.00 In Noncompliance With Advertising And Bidding</u> Requirements

Our examination disclosed that the township expended \$14,763.00 during 2011 from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund for the purchase of a new brine tank without advertising for bids.

The above expenditure was not made in compliance with the advertising, bidding, and contract requirements of *The Second Class Township Code*, 53 P.S. § 68102(a), (also found at § 3102(a) of *The Second Class Township Code* as published by the Local Government Commission), which requires that purchases over \$10,000.00 must be advertised, bid, and awarded by contract. *The Second Class Township Code*, 53 P.S. § 68104(a), (also found at § 3104(a) of *The Second Class Township Code* as published by the Local Government Commission) further states that advertising, bidding and contract requirements should not be evaded through piecemeal purchases.

We further noted that the township received insurance proceeds of \$13,486.10 for the previous brine tank that was damaged beyond repair. However, the \$13,486.10 was deposited into the General Fund on January 6, 2011.

The failure to comply with *The Second Class Township Code* could result in the township having to reimburse \$14,763.00 to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

Recommendations

We recommend that the township reimburse \$14,763.00 to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund upon official notification by the Department of Transportation.

We further recommend that, in the future, the township comply with *The Second Class Township Code* and the Department of Transportation's *Publication 9* as noted in this finding.

Management's Response

The township officials stated:

The funds received from insurance should have been deposited into the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund but were deposited into the General Fund.

<u>Finding No. 2 - Purchase Over \$10,000.00 In Noncompliance With Advertising And Bidding</u> Requirements (Continued)

Auditor's Conclusion

Because the brine tank cost more than \$10,000.00, the township was required to advertise for bids for the new tank even though it received insurance proceeds for the old tank. During our next examination we will determine if the municipality complied with our recommendations.

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND SUMMARY OF EXIT CONFERENCE FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

An exit conference was held February 13, 2013. Those participating were:

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN

Mr. David G. Henderson, Secretary

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL

Ms. Ortenzia M. Keller, Auditor

The results of the examination were presented and discussed in their entirety.

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND REPORT DISTRIBUTION FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

This report was initially distributed to:

The Honorable Barry J. Schoch, P.E. Secretary
Department of Transportation

Township of Franklin Erie County 10411 Route 98 Edinboro, PA 16412-9743

The Honorable John J. Sachar Chairman of the Board of Supervisors

Mrs. Bonnie J. Bernhardt Treasurer

Mr. David G. Henderson Secretary

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at http://www.auditorgen.state.pa.us. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@auditorgen.state.pa.us.