



BUTLER COUNTY

COMPLIANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR THE PERIOD

JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

RELEASED DECEMBER 2013

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE - AUDITOR GENERAL

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL





Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

Mr. Edward Wade, III, President EAU CLAIRE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION Butler County

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Eau Claire Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association pursuant to authority derived from Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, Act of April 9, 1929, (P.L. 343, No. 176), and mandated by the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act, as consolidated by the Act of November 23, 2010 (P.L. 1181, No. 118), at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 *et seq.*, for the period January 1, 2010 to December 31, 2011.

We conducted this compliance audit in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* applicable to performance audits, issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our audit results and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our audit results and conclusions based on our audit results and conclusions based on our audit results and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The objectives of the audit were:

- 1. To determine if the volunteer firefighters' relief association took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report; and
- 2. To determine if the volunteer firefighters' relief association received state aid and expended state aid and accumulated relief funds in compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above.

Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Eau Claire Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association's administration of state aid and accumulated relief funds

complies with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures including the safeguarding of assets. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the volunteer firefighters' relief association's internal controls as they relate to the association's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of the audit objectives, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Our audit procedures also included tests of documentary evidence supporting the Eau Claire Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association's recorded financial transactions, tests of the physical existence of inventories, interviews of selected officials and direct confirmation of the Eau Claire Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association's cash, investments, and certain other assets and liabilities as of December 31, 2011, with the custodians of the funds, debtors, creditors, and financial institutions to the extent necessary to satisfy the audit objectives. Additionally, we performed procedures to provide a reasonable assurance of detecting instances of violations of legal and regulatory requirements or violations of provisions of contracts that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our audit, for the period January 1, 2010 to December 31, 2011, found the Eau Claire Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report and, in all significant respects, received state aid and expended state aid and accumulated relief funds in compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures, except as noted in the findings listed below and discussed later in this report. The results of our tests also indicated the Eau Claire Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association expended funds as presented in the Accompanying Expenditure Information and, as of December 31, 2011, had a cash balance of \$21,503 and an investment balance with a fair value of \$8,488.

Finding No. 1 – Failure to Adhere to Relief Association Bylaws

Finding No. 2 – Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Membership Roster

Finding No. 3 – Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Equipment Roster

The contents of this report were discussed with the management of the Eau Claire Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association and, where appropriate, their response has been included in the report.

Eugent: O-Purger

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE Auditor General

July 3, 2013

CONTENTS

Background	1
Status of Prior Finding	3
Findings and Recommendations:	
Finding No. 1 – Failure to Adhere to Relief Association Bylaws	4
Finding No. 2 – Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Membership Roster	5
Finding No. 3 – Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Equipment Roster	6
Accompanying Expenditure Information	8
Report Distribution List	9

BACKGROUND

Pursuant to Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, Act of April 9, 1929, (P.L. 343, No. 176), and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act, as consolidated by the Act of November 23, 2010, (P.L. 1181, No. 118), at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 *et seq.*, the Department of the Auditor General's duty is to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association to determine that funds received under the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution Law, Act of December 18, 1984, (P.L. 1005, No. 205), as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.701 *et seq.* (commonly referred to as Act 205), are properly expended.

The Eau Claire Fire Relief Association, herein referred to as Eau Claire Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association, is a charitable organization that was formed primarily to afford financial protection to volunteer firefighters and to encourage individuals to participate in volunteer fire service.

Act 118 governs the overall operation of the volunteer firefighters' relief association. The relief association's bylaws define the specific operational procedures by which the volunteer firefighters' relief association conducts business. To fulfill its primary purpose, Act 118 authorizes specific types of expenditures and prescribes appropriate volunteer firefighters' relief association investment options. Within the parameters established by Act 118, it is the responsibility of the volunteer firefighters' relief association to choose investments in a proper and prudent manner.

Volunteer firefighters' relief associations receive public tax monies, and the association officers therefore have a responsibility to the public to conduct the association's financial affairs in a businesslike manner and to maintain sufficient financial records to support the propriety of all association transactions. Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are also responsible for ensuring that the association operates in accordance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures.

Act 205 sets forth the computation of the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution paid to each applicable municipality throughout the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. The amount of the distribution is based upon the population of each municipality and the market value of real estate within the municipality. Upon receipt of this distribution, the municipality must allocate the funds to the volunteer firefighters' relief association of the fire service organization or fire service organizations, which is or are recognized as providing the service to the municipality.

BACKGROUND (Continued)

The Eau Claire Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association was allocated state aid from the following municipalities:

Municipality	County	2010	2011
Allegheny Township	Butler	\$ 979	\$1,525
Cherry Valley Borough	Butler	\$ 424	\$ 629
Eau Claire Borough	Butler	\$1,884	\$2,533
Venango Township	Butler	\$5,189	\$8,195

The volunteer firefighters' relief association and the affiliated fire service organization are separate, legal entities. The Eau Claire Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association is affiliated with the following fire service organization:

Eau Claire Volunteer Fire Department

EAU CLAIRE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION STATUS OF PRIOR FINDING

COMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

The Eau Claire Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association has complied with the following prior audit finding and recommendation:

• Failure to Deposit State Aid

By depositing the 2009 state aid of \$4,610 from Venango Township, and by establishing accounting and internal control procedures to ensure that all income received is deposited in the relief association's account.

We commend the relief association management for its efforts in complying with the finding and recommendation contained in the prior audit report. The association management should strive to remain in compliance with all applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures.

EAU CLAIRE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – Failure to Adhere to Relief Association Bylaws

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association failed to adhere to provisions in the association's bylaws. Specifically, the relief association did not abide by the following bylaw stipulation:

• To include a board member (Vice-President) as an officer of the relief association.

<u>Criteria</u>: The relief association's bylaws stipulate the following:

- Article III Section 3 Duties of the officers shall be:
- Board Member: The Board Member shall have the full power of the President in his absence. The Board Member will provide a smooth transition in the administration of the association.

Furthermore, prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should adhere to all provisions stipulated in the relief association's bylaws to ensure that the relief association conducts its affairs with proper authorization.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials were not familiar with the requirements of the association's bylaws.

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of the relief association officials not adhering to the mandatory provisions stipulated in the relief association's bylaws, the relief association may have conducted its affairs without proper authorization.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that relief association officials familiarize themselves with the bylaws governing their organization and establish guidelines and procedures to ensure that the association conducts its affairs with proper authorization. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented after the audit exit conference by telephone and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

EAU CLAIRE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (Continued)

Finding No. 2 – Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Membership Roster

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association officials failed to maintain a complete and accurate roster of relief association members.

<u>Criteria</u>: Relief association officials should maintain a complete and accurate roster of the relief association's membership, as identified by criteria set forth in the relief association's bylaws. A comprehensive roster of all relief association members should include the following:

- Names of each member;
- Members' mailing addresses;
- Dates of births;
- Dates of memberships; and
- Membership classifications.

In addition, when warranted, a notation should be made on the roster identifying the date of a member's resignation or death.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials were unaware that they should maintain a comprehensive roster of relief association members.

<u>Effect</u>: The failure to maintain a comprehensive membership roster could result in the payment of benefits to nonmembers, or deprive eligible relief association members from receiving authorized benefit payments.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials compile and maintain a complete and accurate roster of the relief association's membership. For additional guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

EAU CLAIRE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (Continued)

Finding No. 3 – Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Equipment Roster

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association officials failed to maintain a complete and accurate roster of equipment owned by the relief association. During the current audit period, the relief association expended \$10,186 for equipment purchased; however, none of the equipment was properly accounted for on the relief association's equipment roster. In addition, there was no indication that a physical inventory of equipment was conducted on an annual basis, nor whether such inventory accounted for all of the relief association's equipment.

<u>Criteria</u>: Prudent business practice dictates the relief association should establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster of all items purchased by the relief association in order to provide an effective accounting control over the relief association's equipment. A cumulative equipment roster of all relief association equipment should include the following:

- Types of equipment purchased;
- Dates of purchase;
- Unit costs;
- Names of suppliers;
- Serial numbers, if applicable;
- Current locations of items;
- Final dispositions of sold or damaged equipment; and
- Evidence of the performance and results of an annual physical inventory.

Furthermore, prudent business practice requires the performance of an annual physical inventory of all relief association owned equipment.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials neglected to establish adequate internal control procedures over equipment requiring the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster and the performance of an annual physical inventory of equipment.

<u>Effect</u>: The failure to properly record equipment purchases in a detailed equipment roster prevents officials from effectively monitoring the relief association's equipment purchases. In addition, the failure to maintain a detailed equipment roster and perform an annual physical inventory of equipment prevents adequate accountability for, and safeguarding of, relief association equipment.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend the relief association officials maintain a cumulative equipment roster of all relief association owned equipment. Furthermore, the relief association should ensure it performs an annual physical inventory of all operable equipment and that the completion of the inventory be sufficiently documented. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

EAU CLAIRE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (Continued)

Finding No. 3 – (Continued)

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

EAU CLAIRE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION ACCOMPANYING EXPENDITURE INFORMATION FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2010 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7412 states: a volunteer firefighters' relief association is an organization formed primarily for the purpose of affording financial protection to volunteer firefighters against the consequences of misfortune suffered as a result of their participation in the fire service. The organization may contain within its membership the members of one or more fire companies and may serve secondary purposes, as set forth in this subchapter, but only if adequate provisions have been first made to serve the primary purpose.

Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7416 authorizes the investment of relief association funds and outlines the types of benefits and services that can be provided with volunteer firefighters' relief association funds.

Furthermore, all expenditures must be properly authorized as prescribed in the volunteer firefighters' relief association bylaws and approved at an association meeting.

USES OF FUNDS:

Benefit Services:	
Insurance premiums	\$ 5,052
Total Benefit Services	\$ 5,052
Fire Services:	
Equipment purchased	\$ 10,186
Equipment maintenance	3,826
Training expenses	120
Total Fire Services	\$ 14,132
Administrative Services:	
Other administrative expenses	\$ 510
Total Administrative Services	\$ 510

EAU CLAIRE VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom Corbett Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Eau Claire Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Governing Body:

Mr. Edward Wade, III, President

Ms. Dena Wade, Secretary

Ms. Jennifer Rottman, Treasurer

The following municipalities allocated foreign fire insurance tax monies to this relief association and received a copy of this report.

Ms. Susan L. Klinger, Secretary	Ms. Lana Toth, Secretary
Venango Township	Eau Claire Borough
Ms. Robin Farrington, Secretary	Mr. Earl H. Young, Jr., Secretary
Allegheny Township	Cherry Valley Borough

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at <u>www.auditorgen.state.pa.us.</u> Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@auditorgen.state.pa.us.