

PETROLIA VOLUNTEER FIRE RELIEF ASSOCIATION BUTLER COUNTY

COMPLIANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR THE PERIOD

JANUARY 1, 2009 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

RELEASED MAY 2013

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE - AUDITOR GENERAL

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL





PETROLIA VOLUNTEER FIRE RELIEF ASSOCIATION BUTLER COUNTY

COMPLIANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR THE PERIOD

JANUARY 1, 2009 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011



CONTENTS

Background 1
Letter From the Auditor General
Status of Prior Findings
Findings and Recommendations:
Finding No. 1 – Failure to Define Discretionary Benefits
Finding No. 2 – Failure to Secure Ownership Interest in Jointly Purchased Equipment 8
Finding No. 3 – Investments Inappropriately Registered Under the Name of the Affiliated Fire Company
Observation:
Observation – Diversification of Investments
Accompanying Expenditure Information
Report Distribution List



BACKGROUND

Pursuant to Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, Act of April 9, 1929, (P.L. 343, No. 176), and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act, as consolidated by the Act of November 23, 2010, (P.L. 1181, No. 118), at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 et seq., the Department of the Auditor General's duty is to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association to determine that funds received under the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution Law, Act of December 18, 1984, (P.L. 1005, No. 205), as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.701 et seq. (commonly referred to as Act 205), are properly expended.

The Petrolia Volunteer Fire Relief Association, herein referred to as Petrolia Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association, is a charitable organization that was formed primarily to afford financial protection to volunteer firefighters and to encourage individuals to participate in volunteer fire service.

Act 118 governs the overall operation of the volunteer firefighters' relief association. The relief association's bylaws define the specific operational procedures by which the volunteer firefighters' relief association conducts business. To fulfill its primary purpose, Act 118 authorizes specific types of expenditures and prescribes appropriate volunteer firefighters' relief association investment options. Within the parameters established by Act 118, it is the responsibility of the volunteer firefighters' relief association to choose investments in a proper and prudent manner.

Volunteer firefighters' relief associations receive public tax monies, and the association officers therefore have a responsibility to the public to conduct the association's financial affairs in a businesslike manner and to maintain sufficient financial records to support the propriety of all association transactions. Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are also responsible for ensuring that the association operates in accordance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures.

Act 205 sets forth the computation of the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution paid to each applicable municipality throughout the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. The amount of the distribution is based upon the population of each municipality and the market value of real estate within the municipality. Upon receipt of this distribution, the municipality must allocate the funds to the volunteer firefighters' relief association of the fire service organization or fire service organizations, which is or are recognized as providing the service to the municipality.

BACKGROUND (Continued)

The Petrolia Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association was allocated state aid from the following municipalities:

Municipality	County	2009	2010	2011
D T 1'		ф1 22 <i>4</i>	Φ1 5 01	ф2 20 <i>5</i>
Perry Township	Armstrong	\$1,334	\$1,501	\$2,205
Fairview Borough	Butler	\$ 909	\$1,023	\$1,460
Fairview Township	Butler	\$5,689	\$6,403	\$9,865
Karns City Borough	Butler	\$ 654	\$ 736	\$ 873
Parker Township	Butler	\$ 905	\$1,019	\$1,498
Petrolia Borough	Butler	\$1,040	\$1,171	\$1,772

The volunteer firefighters' relief association and the affiliated fire service organization are separate, legal entities. The Petrolia Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association is affiliated with the following fire service organization:

Petrolia Volunteer Fire Department



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

Mr. Jeff Larimore, President
PETROLIA VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS'
RELIEF ASSOCIATION
Butler County

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Petrolia Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association pursuant to authority derived from Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, Act of April 9, 1929, (P.L. 343, No. 176), and mandated by the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act, as consolidated by the Act of November 23, 2010 (P.L. 1181, No. 118), at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 *et seq.*, for the period January 1, 2009 to December 31, 2011.

We conducted this compliance audit in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* applicable to performance audits, issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our audit results and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our audit results and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The objectives of the audit were:

- 1. To determine if the volunteer firefighters' relief association took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report; and
- 2. To determine if the volunteer firefighters' relief association received and expended state aid and accumulated relief funds in compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above.

Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Petrolia Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association's administration of state aid and accumulated relief funds complies with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures including

the safeguarding of assets. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the volunteer firefighters' relief association's internal controls as they relate to the association's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of the audit objectives, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Our audit procedures also included tests of documentary evidence supporting the Petrolia Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association's recorded financial transactions, tests of the physical existence of inventories, interviews of selected officials and direct confirmation of the Petrolia Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association's cash, investments, and certain other assets and liabilities as of December 31, 2011, with the custodians of the funds, debtors, creditors, and financial institutions to the extent necessary to satisfy the audit objectives. Additionally, we performed procedures to provide a reasonable assurance of detecting instances of violations of legal and regulatory requirements or violations of provisions of contracts that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our audit, for the period January 1, 2009 to December 31, 2011, found the Petrolia Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report and, in all significant respects, received and expended state aid and accumulated relief funds in compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws and administrative procedures, except as noted in the findings listed below and discussed later in this report. The results of our tests also indicated the Petrolia Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association expended funds as presented in the Accompanying Expenditure Information and, as of December 31, 2011, had a cash balance of \$21,741 and an investment balance with a fair value of \$47,850.

Finding No. 1 – Failure to Define Discretionary Benefits

Finding No. 2 – Failure to Secure Ownership Interest in Jointly Purchased Equipment

Finding No. 3 – Investments Inappropriately Registered Under the Name of the Affiliated Fire Company

We also noted another matter that has been included in the following observation and detailed in the Observation section of this report.

Observation – Diversification of Investments

The contents of this report were discussed with the management of the Petrolia Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report.

January 30, 2012

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE

Eugent O-Pager

Auditor General

PETROLIA VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION STATUS OF PRIOR FINDINGS

COMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The Petrolia Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association has complied with the following prior audit findings and recommendations:

- Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Membership Roster
 - By maintaining a comprehensive listing of the relief association membership.
- Failure to Maintain a Complete and Accurate Equipment Roster
 - By detailing all equipment purchases.

PETROLIA VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – Failure to Define Discretionary Benefits

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association did not formally define and approve discretionary benefits that were being offered to its members. During the current audit period, the relief association paid \$900 (\$300 each to three members) in discretionary benefits. Although these expenditures were authorized by Act 118, the types, amounts, and criteria to be met before receiving the benefits were not described in a formal policy approved by the relief association membership.

Criteria: Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7413 (3) and (5) states, funds shall be available:

- (3) For payment, either by insurance or by operation of a beneficial fund, of a sum certain to designated beneficiaries of a participating member following the death of a member for any cause and **to establish criteria which members must meet in order to qualify** as participants in a death benefit fund. (emphasis added)
- (5) Financial assistance to volunteer firefighters who, after having actively participated in the fire service **for a specified minimum term**, are no longer physically able to continue participation and are in need of financial assistance. (emphasis added)

Furthermore, prudent business practice dictates that when a relief association offers death benefits, disability benefits, officer compensation, or any other type of discretionary benefit provided by Act 118, it should establish a precedent for those benefits being offered. Such a precedent should be documented in the bylaws, a formal relief association policy, or in the official meeting minutes. The formal approval is necessary to clarify the types and amounts of benefits offered to its membership as well as the criteria to be met in order to receive the benefits.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials were not aware of the specific stipulations of Act 118 and did not perceive the formal approval to be an essential internal control in safeguarding relief association assets. As a result, they failed to establish procedures to formally define the benefits and related criteria for the benefits offered to members.

<u>Effect</u>: The relief association's failure to formally define discretionary benefits prevents the membership from being aware of the types and amounts of benefits offered to its membership. The absence of formal approval increases the risk of unauthorized expenditures and could also lead to benefits not being applied equally to all members of the relief association.

PETROLIA VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (Continued)

Finding No. 1 – (Continued)

Recommendation: We recommend relief association officials formally define and document the criteria of the discretionary benefits being offered to its membership. The formal approval of benefits and related criteria should be documented in the bylaws, a policy statement, or in the official meeting minutes, and should be maintained for an indefinite period of time so as to afford the membership of the relief association with a formal document defining the benefits offered and the criteria to be met before receiving the benefit. Furthermore, all approved discretionary benefits should be in accordance with provisions of Act 118. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

PETROLIA VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (Continued)

Finding No. 2 – Failure to Secure Ownership Interest in Jointly Purchased Equipment

<u>Condition</u>: As verbally cited during our prior audit, the relief association expended \$5,848 towards the purchase of radios with the Petrolia Volunteer Fire Department. However, the relief association did not adequately secure its ownership interest in this jointly purchased radio equipment.

<u>Criteria</u>: Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418(a) states:

The Office of Auditor General shall have the power and its duty shall be to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association receiving money under Chapter 7 of the Act of December 18, 1984 (P.L. 1005, No. 205), [FN1] known as the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act, as far as may be necessary to satisfy the Auditor General that the money received was or is being expended for no purpose other than that authorized by this subchapter. Copies of all audits shall be furnished to the Governor.

Prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should secure its proportional ownership interest in the jointly purchased equipment by executing a formal written agreement that enumerates the relief association's proportional share of ownership. Such agreement shall specify that the relief association shall receive its prorated share of the proceeds upon sale of the equipment, in the event the equipment is ever sold.

<u>Cause</u>: Relief association officials failed to adequately secure its proportional ownership interest in the jointly purchased equipment.

<u>Effect</u>: Failure to adequately secure the proportional share of ownership interest in the jointly purchased equipment places the relief association's ownership interest at greater risk.

Recommendation: We recommend the relief association execute a formal written agreement with the fire department that enumerates the relief association's proportional ownership interest in the jointly purchased equipment as well as stipulating that the proportionate sales proceeds shall revert to the relief association in the event the equipment is ever sold. If such action is not taken, we recommend that the relief association be reimbursed \$5,848. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

PETROLIA VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (Continued)

Finding No. 3 – Investments Inappropriately Registered Under the Name of the Affiliated Fire Company

<u>Condition</u>: As of December 31, 2011, the relief association held mutual funds, with a total fair value of \$32,850, which were inappropriately registered under the Petrolia Volunteer Fire Department and the Petrolia Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association. These mutual fund investments represent 47 percent of the relief association's total assets.

<u>Criteria</u>: Sound business practice dictates that the relief association maintain ownership of all investments as a means of safeguarding its assets from unauthorized use or disposition.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association failed to establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure that the investments purchased were registered in the name of the relief association only.

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of the investments being inappropriately registered in the name of the affiliated fire department and the relief association, these relief association assets were not properly safeguarded.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend the relief association secure ownership rights to all monetary assets. This requirement can be accomplished by ensuring that all investments are registered under the relief association's federal tax identification number. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

PETROLIA VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION OBSERVATION

Observation – Diversification of Investments

Within the parameters established by the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act¹, it is the responsibility of the volunteer firefighters' relief association to invest its funds in a proper and prudent manner.

As these investments typically provide an income stream to the relief association for annual operations, it is generally sensible not to invest all VFRA money in one asset or asset class that places the principal at risk. In fact, state law requires VFRA's to "reasonably diversify investments, unless the [VFRA] reasonably determines that it is in the interest of the beneficiaries not to diversify..."².

By diversifying investments, the VFRA can help preserve capital, increase liquidity and decrease volatility. Diversification means spreading one's money among different investments; asset allocation diversifies total investments among different investment classes, such as stocks, bonds, government securities, and cash equivalents.

As of December 31, 2011, the VFRA had \$32,850 (fair value) or 47% of the VFRA's cash and investments in mutual funds.

The VFRA management should periodically review its specific cash needs and investment goals and ensure that its investments are allocated and diversified to prudently meet those needs and goals.

_

¹ 53 P.S. § 8506(c)(1997). This provision incorporates the "prudent investor rule" of the Probate, Estates, and Fiduciaries Code, 20 Pa. C.S.A. §7201 et seq.

² 20 Pa. C.S.A. § 7204(a) (Supp. 2005).

PETROLIA VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION ACCOMPANYING EXPENDITURE INFORMATION FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2009 TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7412 states: a volunteer firefighters' relief association is an organization formed primarily for the purpose of affording financial protection to volunteer firefighters against the consequences of misfortune suffered as a result of their participation in the fire service. The organization may contain within its membership the members of one or more fire companies and may serve secondary purposes, as set forth in this subchapter, but only if adequate provisions have been first made to serve the primary purpose.

Act 118 at 35 Pa.C.S. § 7416 authorizes the investment of relief association funds and outlines the types of benefits and services that can be provided with volunteer firefighters' relief association funds.

Furthermore, all expenditures must be properly authorized as prescribed in the volunteer firefighters' relief association bylaws and approved at an association meeting.

USES OF FUNDS:

Benefit Services:						
Insurance premiums	\$	14,490				
Death benefits		300				
Relief benefits		1,270				
Tokens of sympathy and goodwill		200				
Total Benefit Services	\$	16,260				
Fire Services:						
Equipment purchased	\$	105,961				
Equipment maintenance		2,375				
Training expenses		4,992				
Total Fire Services		113,328				
Administrative Services:						
Miscellaneous administrative expenses	\$	1,610				
Total Administrative Services	\$	1,610				
Total Investments Purchased:	\$	9,000				



PETROLIA VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATION REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom Corbett Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Petrolia Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Governing Body:

Mr. Jeff Larimore, President

Mr. Jim H. Zedak, Vice President

Ms. Tammy Larimore, Secretary

Mr. James W. H. Barnes, Treasurer

The following municipalities allocated foreign fire insurance tax monies to this relief association and received a copy of this report.

Ms. Tracy A. Jack, Secretary Ms. Burnadette C. Jack, Secretary

Perry Township Fairview Borough

Ms. Dusty Neff, Secretary Ms. Sharon McElravy, Secretary

Fairview Township Karns City Borough

Ms. Vicki Steiner, Secretary Ms. Margaret Merryman, Secretary

Parker Township Petrolia Borough

This report is a matter of public record. Copies of this report may be obtained from the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 318 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120. If you have any questions regarding this report or any other matter, you may contact the Department of the Auditor General by accessing our website at www.auditorgen.state.pa.us.