



LUZERNE COUNTY

COMPLIANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR THE PERIOD

JANUARY 1, 2011 TO DECEMBER 31, 2012

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE - AUDITOR GENERAL

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL





Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and City Council City of Hazleton Luzerne County Hazleton, PA 18201

We have conducted a compliance audit of the City of Hazleton Aggregate Pension Fund for the period January 1, 2011 to December 31, 2012. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension fund was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. Our methodology addressed determinations about the following:

- Whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements.
- Whether employer contributions are determined and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether employee contributions are required and, if so, are determined, deducted and deposited into the pension plans and are in accordance with the plans' provisions and applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether benefit payments, if any, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and are properly determined in accordance with applicable laws and regulations.

- Whether obligations for plan benefits are accurately determined in accordance with plan provisions and based on complete and accurate participant data; and whether actuarial valuation reports are prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) in accordance with state law and selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program.
- Whether the special ad hoc postretirement adjustment granted to eligible pensioners is in accordance with applicable laws and regulations and whether the ad hoc reimbursement received by the municipality was treated in accordance with applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether benefit payments have only been made to living recipients, based on the Social Security numbers found in the pension records for retirees and beneficiaries.
- Whether the pension fund is in compliance with state regulations for distressed municipalities.

The City of Hazleton contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for an audit of its basic financial statements for the year ended December 31, 2011, which is available at the city's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

City officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the City of Hazleton Aggregate Pension Fund is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the city's internal controls as they relate to the city's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our tests indicated that, in all significant respects, the City of Hazleton Aggregate Pension Fund was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. As previously noted, the objective of our audit of the City of Hazleton Aggregate Pension Fund was to determine compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. Act 205 was amended on September 18, 2009, through the adoption of Act 44 of 2009. Among several provisions relating to municipal pension plans, the bill provides for the implementation of a distress recovery program. Three levels of distress have been established:

Level	Indication	Funding Criteria
Ι	Minimal distress	70-89%
II	Moderate distress	50-69%
III	Severe distress	Less than 50%

Based on the data from the city's non-uniformed and aggregate pension fund's January 1, 2011, actuarial valuation reports, the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) issued a notification that the City of Hazleton is currently in Level III severe distress status.

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it. However, we are extremely concerned about the historical trend information contained in the respective schedules of funding progress included in this report which indicate a continued decline of assets available to satisfy the long-term liabilities of the fund. For example, the police pension plan's funded ratio went from 69.8% as of January 1, 2007, to a ratio of 47.0% as of January 1, 2011, and the paid firemen's pension plan's funded ratio went from 75.5% as of January 1, 2007, to 42.1% as of January 1, 2011, which is the most recent date available. In addition, the city's annual required contribution to the police pension plan has gone from \$1,078,538 in 2007, to \$2,076,598 in 2012. Similarly, the city's annual required contribution to the paid firemen's pension plan has gone from \$380,765 in 2007 to \$1,186,247 in 2012. These changes in the plans' funded status and the increase in the city's required contributions to the plans are due, in part, to the effect of prior arbitration awards and memoranda of understanding granting excess pension benefits to the city's police officers and firefighters and the provision of Act 44 of 2009 which mandated that if a municipality assesses or utilizes the special municipal tax increase to fund other post-employment benefits, the cost of those benefits shall be subject to the actuarial funding and reporting standards of this act.

We encourage city officials to make fiscally responsible decisions as plan fiduciaries that will benefit the City of Hazleton and its taxpayers to ensure the city's pension plans have adequate resources to meet current and future benefit obligations to the city's hard working police officers and firefighters that are determined in accordance with the provisions and the intent of the Third Class City Code.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of the City of Hazleton and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank city officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

March 26, 2014

Eugent: O-Pager

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE Auditor General

CONTENTS

Page

Background	1
Supplementary Information	4
Report Distribution List	11

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 <u>et seq.</u>). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the City of Hazleton Aggregate Pension Fund is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

- Act 147 Special Ad Hoc Municipal Police and Firefighter Postretirement Adjustment Act, Act of December 14, 1988 (P.L. 1192, No. 147), as amended, 53 P.S. § 896.101 et seq.
- Act 317 The Third Class City Code, Act of June 23, 1931 (P.L. 932, No. 317), as amended, 53 P.S. § 35101 et seq.

The City of Hazleton Aggregate Pension Fund serves as a common investment and administrative agent for the city's police and paid firemen's pension plans.

The City of Hazleton Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 1949, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 317. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the city and its police officers. The plan was established October 10, 1968. Active members are required to contribute 3 percent of compensation to the plan. As of December 31, 2012, the plan had 36 active members, no terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future and 43 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2012, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	20 years of service.
Early Retirement	None
Vesting	100% after 12 years of service.

Retirement Benefit:

Benefit Level 1 - 50% of Average Monthly Compensation plus service increment of 5% of compensation for service in excess of 20 years to a maximum of 75%.

Benefit Levels 2 & 3 - 50% of average monthly compensation.

Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility	Refund of member contributions.
After Retirement Eligibility	A monthly benefit equal to 100% of the pension the member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the day of the member's death.

Service Related Disability Benefit:

Same as normal retirement benefit.

The City of Hazleton Paid Firemen's Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 1913, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 317. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the city and its firefighters. The plan was established July 20, 1968. Active members are required to contribute 5 percent of compensation to the plan. As of December 31, 2012, the plan had 21 active members, no terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future and 35 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2012, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	20 years of service.
Early Retirement	None
Vesting	100% after 12 years of service.

Retirement Benefit:

Members Hired Prior to January 1, 1988:

50% of the final average salary of such member at the time of retirement. A service increment of 5% of final average salary for each year of completed service to a maximum of 75% of final average salary after completing 25 years of service.

Members Hired After January 1, 1988 and Prior to September 1, 2000:

55% of the final average salary of such member at the time of retirement.

Members Hired After September 1, 2000:

50% of the final average salary of such member at the time of retirement.

Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility	Refund of member contributions.
After Retirement Eligibility	A monthly benefit equal to 100% of the pension the member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the day of the member's death.

Service Related Disability Benefit:

Less than 20 years of service, the benefit is equal to $1/20^{\text{th}}$ of the normal retirement benefit times years of service to a maximum of 10 years of service (50% of salary).

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2007, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
						Unfunded
			Unfunded			(Assets in
		Actuarial	(Assets in			Excess of)
		Accrued	Excess of)			Actuarial
	Actuarial	Liability	Actuarial			Accrued
Actuarial	Value of	(AAL) -	Accrued	Funded	Covered	Liability as a %
Valuation	Assets	Entry Age	Liability	Ratio	Payroll	of Payroll
Date	(a)	(b)	(b) - (a)	(a)/(b)	(c)	[(b-a)/(c)]
01-01-07	\$ 12,199,911	\$ 17,482,036	\$ 5,282,125	69.8%	\$ 1,678,067	314.8%
01-01-09	13,051,913	26,587,647	13,535,734	49.1%	2,153,014	628.7%
01-01-11	14,421,603	30,695,169	16,273,566	47.0%	2,308,027	705.1%

POLICE PENSION PLAN

Note 1: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-07, 01-01-09 and 01-01-11, have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 4-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

Note 2: The increase in the plan's actuarial accrued liability at January 1, 2009, was due, in part, to the cost of post-employment benefits included in the plan's actuarial valuation report pursuant to Act 44 of 2009.

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS – (Continued)

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
						Unfunded
			Unfunded			(Assets in
		Actuarial	(Assets in			Excess of)
		Accrued	Excess of)			Actuarial
	Actuarial	Liability	Actuarial			Accrued
Actuarial	Value of	(AAL) -	Accrued	Funded	Covered	Liability as a %
Valuation	Assets	Entry Age	Liability	Ratio	Payroll	of Payroll
Date	(a)	(b)	(b) - (a)	(a)/(b)	(c)	[(b-a)/(c)]
01-01-07	\$ 9,005,811	\$ 11,928,222	\$ 2,922,411	75.5%	\$ 955,534	305.8%
01-01-09	8,058,703	17,693,566	9,634,863	45.5%	1,046,563	920.6%
01-01-11	8,103,199	19,246,376	11,143,177	42.1%	1,093,878	1,018.7%

PAID FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN

Note 1: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-07, 01-01-09 and 01-01-11 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 4-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

Note 2: The increase in the plan's actuarial accrued liability at January 1, 2009, was due, in part, to the cost of post-employment benefits included in the plan's actuarial valuation report pursuant to Act 44 of 2009.

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

Trends in unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability and annual covered payroll are both affected by inflation. Expressing the unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability as a percentage of annual covered payroll (Column 6) approximately adjusts for the effects of inflation and aids analysis of the plan's progress made in accumulating sufficient assets to pay benefits when due. Generally, where there is an unfunded actuarial accrued liability, the smaller this percentage, the stronger the plan. When assets are in excess of the actuarial accrued liability, the higher the bracketed percentage, the stronger the plan.

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

POLICE PENSION PLAN

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2007	\$ 1,078,538	100.0%
2008	1,155,549	119.5%
2009	1,152,628	100.0%
2010	2,041,542	100.0%
2011	2,086,865	100.0%
2012	2,076,598	100.0%

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

PAID FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2007	\$ 380,765	100.0%
2008	381,312	159.0%
2009	531,056	100.0%
2010	1,167,215	100.0%
2011	1,186,505	100.0%
2012	1,186,247	100.0%

CITY OF HAZLETON AGGREGATE PENSION FUND SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the required supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

POLICE PENSION PLAN

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2011
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar
Remaining amortization period	13 years
Asset valuation method	Fair value, 4-year smoothing
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	8.0%
Projected salary increases	5.5%
Cost-of-living adjustments	3.0%

CITY OF HAZLETON AGGREGATE PENSION FUND SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES (UNAUDITED)

PAID FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2011
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar
Remaining amortization period	20 years
Asset valuation method	Fair value, 4-year smoothing
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	8.0%
Projected salary increases	5.5%
Cost-of-living adjustments	3.0%

CITY OF HAZLETON AGGREGATE PENSION FUND REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom Corbett Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

City of Hazleton Aggregate Pension Fund Luzerne County 40 North Church Street Hazleton, PA 18201

The Honorable Joseph Yannuzzi	Mayor
Mr. Jack Mundie	Council President
Mr. Thomas Pribula	Director of Administration

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at <u>www.auditorgen.state.pa.us</u>. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@auditorgen.state.pa.us.