

COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Cheswick Borough Police Pension Plan Allegheny County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2016 to December 31, 2017

May 2018



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council
Cheswick Borough
Allegheny County
Cheswick, PA 15024

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Cheswick Borough Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2016 to December 31, 2017. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform our audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The objectives of the audit were:

1. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report; and
2. To determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report, we inquired of plan officials and evaluated supporting documentation provided by officials evidencing that the suggested corrective action has been appropriately taken. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.

- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.
- We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing total members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- We determined that there were no benefit calculations prepared for the years covered by our audit period.
- We determined whether the January 1, 2015 and January 1, 2017 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted by March 31, 2016 and 2018, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.
- We determined whether the terms of the plan's unallocated insurance contract, including ownership and any restrictions, were in compliance with plan provisions, investment policies, and state regulations by comparing the terms of the contract with the plan's provisions, investment policies, and state regulations.

Cheswick Borough contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for an audit of its financial statements for the year ended December 31, 2016, prepared in conformity with the accounting practices prescribed or permitted by the Department of Community and Economic Development of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, which are available at the borough's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Cheswick Borough Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the borough's internal controls as they relate to the borough's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objectives, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and


interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Cheswick Borough Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Cheswick Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

May 17, 2018


EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background.....	1
Status of Prior Findings	3
Supplementary Information	4
Report Distribution List	11

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The Act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Cheswick Borough Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the former Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 600 - Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 767 et seq.

The Cheswick Borough Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 762-C, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 600. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the borough and its police officers. The plan was established July 12, 1955. Active members are required to contribute 5 percent of compensation to the plan. As of December 31, 2017, the plan had 1 active member, no terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 3 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2017, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

Eligibility Requirements:

- Normal Retirement Age 50 and 25 years of service.
- Early Retirement 20 years of service.
- Vesting A member is 100% vested after 12 years of service.

Retirement Benefit:

Benefit equals 50% of average compensation times accrued benefit adjustment, plus a service increment of \$100 per month if completed years of service exceed 25 years. Average compensation is monthly average of total pay received for 36 latest compensation months. Accrued benefit adjustment is quotient of the number of complete months of service on a given date, divided by the number of completed months of service on normal retirement date.

Survivor Benefit:

In the event of an off duty death or death after retirement, the amount paid to the spouse or dependent child is equal to 50% of the participant's vested accrued pension.

Service Related Disability Benefit:

Benefit equal 50% of the member's final one month salary prior to the date of disability offset by Social Security benefits.

CHESWICK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
STATUS OF PRIOR FINDINGS

Compliance With Prior Audit Recommendations

Cheswick Borough has complied with the prior audit recommendations concerning the following:

- Failure To Fully Pay The Minimum Municipal Obligation Of The Plan

In July 2017, the borough deposited \$152,968 into the plan for the remaining 2014 and 2015 minimum municipal obligation balances due, including interest.

- Failure To Deposit Member Contributions

In April 2017, the borough deposited the delinquent member contributions to the plan, totaling \$6,332, for the years 2013, 2014 and 2015.

CHESWICK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The supplementary information contained on Pages 4 through 6 reflects the implementation of GASB Statement No. 67, *Financial Reporting for Pension Plans*. The objective of this statement is to improve financial reporting by state and local governmental pension plans.

SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION
LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS
FOR THE YEARS ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2014, 2015, AND 2016

	<u>2014</u>	<u>2015</u>	<u>2016</u>
Total Pension Liability			
Interest	\$ 122,671	\$ 120,599	\$ 124,013
Difference between expected and actual experience	(22,032)	(38,140)	(62,072)
Changes of assumptions	102,708	(104,763)	402,070
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(86,148)	(87,582)	(87,582)
Net Change in Total Pension Liability	<u>117,199</u>	<u>(109,886)</u>	<u>376,429</u>
Total Pension Liability - Beginning	<u>1,811,121</u>	<u>1,928,320</u>	<u>1,818,434</u>
Total Pension Liability - Ending (a)	<u><u>\$ 1,928,320</u></u>	<u><u>\$ 1,818,434</u></u>	<u><u>\$ 2,194,863</u></u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position			
Contributions – employer*	\$ -	\$ 72,855	\$ -
Contributions – member**	2,832	-	-
Net investment income	81,677	(14,630)	84,316
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(86,148)	(87,582)	(87,582)
Administrative expense	(18,807)	(18,807)	(22,932)
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position	<u>(20,446)</u>	<u>(48,164)</u>	<u>(26,198)</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Beginning	<u>1,602,826</u>	<u>1,582,380</u>	<u>1,534,216</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Ending (b)	<u><u>\$ 1,582,380</u></u>	<u><u>\$ 1,534,216</u></u>	<u><u>\$ 1,508,018</u></u>
Net Pension Liability - Ending (a-b)	<u><u>\$ 345,940</u></u>	<u><u>\$ 284,218</u></u>	<u><u>\$ 686,845</u></u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability	82.06%	84.37%	68.71%
Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	\$ 89,879	\$ 87,098	\$ 86,461
Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll	384.90%	326.32%	794.40%

* The 2014 and 2016 employer contributions were not deposited to the plan until 2017, with interest. The 2015 employer contribution includes interest paid for late deposits of the plan's 2013, 2014, and 2015 minimum municipal obligations.

** The 2015 and 2016 member contributions were not deposited to the plan until 2017, with interest.

CHESWICK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to Changes in the Discount Rate

The following presents the net pension liability of the borough as of December 31, 2014, calculated using the discount rate of 6.41%, as well as what the borough's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (5.41%)	Current Discount Rate (6.41%)	1% Increase (7.41%)
Net Pension Liability	\$ 559,113	\$ 345,940	\$ 166,711

Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to Changes in the Discount Rate

The following presents the net pension liability of the borough as of December 31, 2015, calculated using the discount rate of 7.0%, as well as what the borough's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (6.0%)	Current Discount Rate (7.0%)	1% Increase (8.0%)
Net Pension Liability	\$ 472,630	\$ 284,218	\$ 124,537

CHESWICK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to Changes in the Discount Rate

The following presents the net pension liability of the borough as of December 31, 2016, calculated using the discount rate of 4.95%*, as well as what the borough's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (3.95%)	Current Discount Rate (4.95%)	1% Increase (5.95%)
Net Pension Liability	\$ 947,658	\$ 686,845	\$ 469,070

The discount rate of 4.95% was used in the preparation of the schedule above. This rate differs from the expected long-term rate of return assumption used in the plan's January 1, 2017 actuarial valuation report, as reported in the Notes to Supplementary Schedules on page 10 of this report.

SCHEDULE OF INVESTMENT RETURNS

Annual Money-Weighted Rate of Return, Net of Investment Expense:

2016	5.71%
2015	(0.95%)
2014	5.27%

CHESWICK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2013, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-13	\$ 1,448,305	\$ 1,798,644	\$ 350,339	80.5%
01-01-15	1,656,582	1,821,077	164,495	91.0%
01-01-17	1,806,114	1,964,299	158,185	91.9%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-13, 01-01-15, and 01-01-17 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 4-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

CHESWICK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

CHESWICK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2012	\$ 68,746	100.2%
2013	67,877	100.0%
2014	63,523	100.0%
2015	65,670	100.0%
2016	64,436	100.0%
2017	57,465	100.0%

CHESWICK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2017
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar, closed
Remaining amortization period	33 years
Asset valuation method	Fair value – 4 year smoothing
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	6.0%
Projected salary increases	3.75%
Cost-of-living adjustments	2.0%

CHESWICK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

The Honorable Daniel Carroll
Mayor

Mr. Paul Jack
Council President

Mr. Michael Girardi
Council Vice-President

Ms. Catherine Crail
Councilwoman

Ms. Kathleen Gillard
Councilwoman

Mr. Robert Kristof
Councilman

Mr. Frank Meledandri
Councilman

Mr. Ian Fitzgerald
Chief Administrative Officer

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.