

JIM THORPE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN

CARBON COUNTY

COMPLIANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR THE PERIOD

JANUARY 1, 2010, TO DECEMBER 31, 2012

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE - AUDITOR GENERAL

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL





Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council Jim Thorpe Borough Carbon County Jim Thorpe, PA 18229

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Jim Thorpe Borough Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2010, to December 31, 2012. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform our audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The objectives of the audit were:

- 1. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report; and
- 2. To determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above. Our methodology addressed determinations about the following:

- Whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements.
- · Whether employer contributions are determined and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether employee contributions are required and, if so, are determined, deducted and deposited into the pension plan and are in accordance with the plan provisions and applicable laws and regulations.

- · Whether benefit payments, if any, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and are properly determined in accordance with applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether obligations for plan benefits are accurately determined in accordance with plan provisions and based on complete and accurate participant data; and whether actuarial valuation reports are prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) in accordance with state law and selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program.
- · Whether benefit payments have only been made to living recipients, based on the Social Security numbers found in the pension records for retirees and beneficiaries.

Jim Thorpe Borough contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for audits of its basic financial statements for the years ended December 31, 2010 and 2011, and for an audit of its financial statements prepared in conformity with the accounting practices prescribed or permitted by the Department of Community and Economic Development of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania for the year ended December 31, 2012, which are available at the borough's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Jim Thorpe Borough Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the borough's internal controls as they relate to the borough's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objectives, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our tests indicated that, in all significant respects, the Jim Thorpe Borough Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following finding further discussed later in this report:

Finding – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Pension Benefit Not Authorized By The Plan's Governing Document

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Jim Thorpe Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

September 17, 2013

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE

Eugraf. J-Pagur

Auditor General

CONTENTS

	Page
Background	1
Status of Prior Findings	2
Finding and Recommendation:	
Finding – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Pension Benefit Not Authorized By The Plan's Governing Document	3
Supplementary Information	5
Report Distribution List	9

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Jim Thorpe Borough Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 600 - Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 761 et seq.

The Jim Thorpe Borough Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 96-3, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 600. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the borough and its police officers. As of December 31, 2012, the plan had 6 active members, no terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future and 5 retirees receiving pension benefits.

JIM THORPE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN STATUS OF PRIOR FINDINGS

Compliance With Prior Audit Recommendation

Jim Thorpe Borough has complied with the prior audit recommendation concerning the following:

· Failure To Adopt Benefit Provision Mandated By Act 30

The borough adopted Ordinance No. 2011-2 which provides for a pre-vesting death benefit in accordance with Act 600, as amended by Act 30.

Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation

Jim Thorpe Borough has not complied with the prior audit recommendation concerning the following as further discussed in the Finding and Recommendation section of this report:

· Pension Benefit Not Authorized By The Plan's Governing Document

JIM THORPE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

<u>Finding – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Pension Benefit Not Authorized By The Plan's Governing Document</u>

<u>Condition</u>: As disclosed in the prior audit report, municipal officials provided a pension benefit in excess of what is authorized by the pension plan's governing document. Municipal officials improperly included a lump sum payment for unused vacation and sick time in the salary used to calculate a retiree's monthly pension benefit.

Criteria: Ordinance No. 96-3 at Section 2.5 states, in part:

Salary means the amount of compensation received by a Participant in each and every month, including base pay, overtime pay, longevity pay, night differential, and any other such increments. The term salary shall include regular payments made for vacation time, sick time, compensation time, personal days and bereavement leave but shall not include lump sum payments for any unused days for any of the foregoing listed benefits. (Emphasis added)

<u>Cause</u>: Plan officials failed to adopt adequate internal control procedures to ensure compliance with the prior audit recommendation.

<u>Effect</u>: The plan is paying pension benefits to a retiree in excess of those authorized by the plan's governing document. The retiree is receiving excess benefits of \$47 per month, which totaled approximately \$2,068 from the date of retirement through the date of audit fieldwork completion.

Providing unauthorized pension benefits increases the plan's pension costs and reduces the amount of funds available for investment purposes or for the payment of authorized benefits or administrative expenses. Since the borough received state aid based on unit value for its pension plans during the current audit period, it did not receive allocations attributable to the excess pension benefits provided; however, the increased costs to the pension plan as a result of the excess pension benefits could result in the receipt of excess state aid in the future and increase the municipal contributions necessary to fund the plan in accordance with Act 205 funding standards.

JIM THORPE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

Finding – (Continued)

<u>Recommendation</u>: We again recommend that the pension benefit of the retiree whose benefit was not determined in accordance with the provisions of the plan's governing document be adjusted prospectively. In addition, any excess benefit payments made from the plan will be deemed ineligible for funding with state aid. Accordingly, the pension plan's actuary may be required to determine the impact, if any, of the excess benefit payments on the borough's future state aid allocations and submit this information to the department.

We also recommend that plan officials establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure that future pension benefits are determined in accordance with the provisions contained in the plan's governing document in effect at the time of a plan member's retirement.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception and intend to contact the retiree to inform him that the pension determination was completed improperly and possible corrective action may be necessary.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: Compliance will be evaluated during our next audit of the plan. We are concerned by the borough's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding and strongly encourage timely implementation of the finding recommendation.

JIM THORPE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2007, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
						Unfunded
			Unfunded			(Assets in
		Actuarial	(Assets in			Excess of)
		Accrued	Excess of)			Actuarial
	Actuarial	Liability	Actuarial			Accrued
Actuarial	Value of	(AAL) -	Accrued	Funded	Covered	Liability as a %
Valuation	Assets	Entry Age	Liability	Ratio	Payroll	of Payroll
Date	(a)	(b)	(b) - (a)	(a)/(b)	(c)	[(b-a)/(c)]
01-01-07	\$ 1,048,364	\$ 1,198,273	\$ 149,909	87.5%	\$ 267,959	55.9%
01-01-09	1,122,124	1,277,598	155,474	87.8%	278,957	55.7%
01-01-11	1,230,673	1,467,807	237,134	83.8%	332,946	71.2%

Note: The market value of the plan's assets at 01-01-07 has been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 4-year averaging period. The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-09 and 01-01-11 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses at 130% and 120%, respectively, of market value. These methods will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

JIM THORPE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

Trends in unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability and annual covered payroll are both affected by inflation. Expressing the unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability as a percentage of annual covered payroll (Column 6) approximately adjusts for the effects of inflation and aids analysis of the plan's progress made in accumulating sufficient assets to pay benefits when due. Generally, where there is an unfunded actuarial accrued liability, the smaller this percentage, the stronger the plan. When assets are in excess of the actuarial accrued liability, the higher the bracketed percentage, the stronger the plan.

JIM THORPE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed		
2007	\$ 51,526	100.0%		
2008	71,630	100.0%		
2009	62,266	100.0%		
2010	77,381	100.0%		
2011	77,689	100.0%		
2012	93,070	100.0%		

JIM THORPE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the required supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date January 1, 2011

Actuarial cost method Entry age normal

Amortization method Level dollar

Remaining amortization period 15 years

Asset valuation method Plan assets are valued using the

method described in Section 210 of Act 205, as amended, subject to a ceiling of 120% of the market value

of assets.

Actuarial assumptions:

Investment rate of return 7.0%

Projected salary increases 4.0%

Cost-of-living adjustments 3.0%

JIM THORPE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom Corbett Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Jim Thorpe Borough Police Pension Plan Carbon County 101 East Tenth Street Jim Thorpe, PA 18229

The Honorable Michael Sofranko Mayor

Ms. Elizabeth Ahner Council President

Ms. Maria Sebelin Treasurer

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.auditorgen.state.pa.us. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@auditorgen.state.pa.us.