

COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Palo Alto Borough Police Pension Plan Schuylkill County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2018 to December 31, 2022

June 2023



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Timothy L. DeFoor • Auditor General



**Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov**

**TIMOTHY L. DEFOOR
AUDITOR GENERAL**

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council
Palo Alto Borough
Schuylkill County
Palo Alto, PA 17901

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Palo Alto Borough Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2018 to December 31, 2022. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (Act 205 of 1984, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.402(j)), which requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to audit every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited. The audit was not conducted, nor was it required to be, in accordance with Government Auditing Standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. We planned and performed the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.

- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.
- We determined that there were no employee contributions required for the years covered by our audit period due to the fact that there were no active employees during the audit period.
- We determined that there were no benefit calculations prepared for the years covered by our audit period.
- We determined whether the January 1, 2017, January 1, 2019, and January 1, 2021 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted by March 31, 2018, 2020, and 2022, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on this report is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.
- We determined whether the terms of the plan's unallocated insurance contract, including ownership and any restrictions, were in compliance with plan provisions, investment policies, and state regulations by comparing the terms of the contract with the plan's provisions, investment policies, and state regulations.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Palo Alto Borough Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. As previously described, we tested transactions, interviewed selected officials, and performed procedures to the extent necessary to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Palo Alto Borough Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following finding further discussed later in this report:

Finding – Failure To Adopt Mandatory Act 44 Procedures For The Procurement Of Professional Services

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Palo Alto Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Timothy L. DeFoor". The signature is written in a cursive style with a long horizontal line extending to the left of the first letter.

Timothy L. DeFoor
Auditor General
June 23, 2023

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background	1
Finding and Recommendation:	
Finding – Failure To Adopt Mandatory Act 44 Procedures For The Procurement Of Professional Services	2
Supplementary Information	4
Report Distribution List	8

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The Act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a two (2) percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Palo Alto Borough Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 37 - The Borough Code, Act of April 18, 2014 (P.L. 432, No. 37), Chapter 11, Subchapter F Police Pension Fund in Boroughs Having a Police Force of Less Than Three Members, as amended, 8 Pa. C.S. § 1131 et seq.

The Palo Alto Borough Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 114-77, adopted pursuant to Act 37. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the borough and its police officers. The plan was established December 12, 1977. Active members are required to contribute five (5.0) percent of compensation to the plan. As of December 31, 2022, the plan had no active members, no terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, and no retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

PALO ALTO BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

Finding – Failure To Adopt Mandatory Act 44 Procedures For The Procurement Of Professional Services

Condition: During the prior two audits, a verbal observation was issued to plan officials notifying them of the passage of Act 44 of 2009, which effectively amended Act 205 for the procurement of professional services contracts, and recommending that the municipality adopt the mandatory provisions, accordingly. However, during the current audit period, the municipality again failed to adopt such mandatory provisions.

Criteria: Section 701-A of Act 205, as amended by Act 44 of 2009, defines a “Professional Services Contract”, as follows:

“Professional services contract.” A contract to which the municipal pension system is a party that is:

- (1) for the purchase or provision of professional services, including investment services, legal services, real estate services and other consulting services; and
- (2) not subject to a requirement that the lowest bid be accepted.

In addition, Section 702-A (a) of Act 205 states, in part:

Each municipal pension system ... shall develop procedures to select the most qualified person to enter into a professional services contract. The procedures shall ensure that the availability of a professional services contract is advertised to potential participants in a timely and efficient manner. Procedures shall include applications and disclosure forms to be used to submit a proposal for review and to receive the award of a professional services contract.

Additionally, Section 702-A (c), (e), (f) and (h) state, in part:

Review. Procedures to select the most qualified person shall include a review of the person’s qualifications, experience and expertise and the compensation to be charged.

Conflict of interest. The municipal pension system shall adopt policies relating to potential conflicts of interest in the review of a proposal or the negotiation of a contract.

Public information. Following the award of a professional services contract, all applications and disclosure forms shall be public except for proprietary information or other information protected by law.

PALO ALTO BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

Finding – (Continued)

Notice and summary. The relevant factors that resulted in the award of the professional services contract must be summarized in a written statement to be included in or attached to the documents awarding the contract. Within ten days of the award of the professional services contract, the original application, a summary of the basis for the award and all required disclosure forms must be transmitted to all unsuccessful applications and posted on the municipal pension system’s Internet website, if an Internet website is maintained, at least seven days prior to the execution of the professional services contract.

Section 703-A (c) states, in part:

Upon advertisement for a professional services contract by the municipal pension system, the contractor may not cause or agree to allow a third party to communicate with officials or employees of the municipal pension system except for requests for technical clarification.

Cause: Plan officials failed to establish adequate procedures to ensure compliance with provisions of Act 205 as previously recommended.

Effect: The borough’s failure to adopt the required provisions stipulated in Act 205 regarding the procurement of professional investment and advisory services for the pension plan could result in a general lack of overall transparency of the proposed actions to be taken by plan officials relative to the awarding of future investment and advisory services contracts for the plan.

Recommendation: We recommend that municipal officials obtain a comprehensive understanding of Act 205 provisions for the procurement of professional services and develop and implement formal written procedures to ensure compliance with these provisions which should include the maintaining of appropriate and sufficient supporting documentation evidencing every phase of the process in the awarding of future professional services contracts for the pension plan, including authorizations/approvals of borough officials in the official minutes of formal board meetings and the required notifications and disclosure responsibilities to ensure the transparency of the actions taken by plan officials relative to the awarding of such professional services contracts.

Management Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception. Subsequent to the audit exit conference, municipal officials provided a copy of written procedures for compliance with the professional services contract provisions of Act 44 adopted by a resolution dated June 12, 2023.

Auditor Conclusion: Compliance will be evaluated during our next audit of the plan.

PALO ALTO BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan’s funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2017, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-17	\$ 283,948	\$ 59,431	\$ (224,517)	477.8%
01-01-19	310,672	-	(310,672)	N/A
01-01-21	338,643	-	(338,643)	N/A

N/A – Not applicable

PALO ALTO BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

PALO ALTO BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2017	None	Not applicable
2018	None	Not applicable
2019	None	Not applicable
2020	None	Not applicable
2021	None	Not applicable
2022	None	Not applicable

PALO ALTO BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2021
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Not applicable
Remaining amortization period	None
Asset valuation method	Fair value
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	4.5%
Projected salary increases	3.0%

PALO ALTO BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Joshua D. Shapiro
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

The Honorable John Deatrich
Mayor

Mr. Brian Dries
Council President

Ms. Angela LaSelva
Borough Secretary

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.