

# SAYRE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN BRADFORD COUNTY

FOR THE PERIOD

**JANUARY 1, 2009, TO DECEMBER 31, 2011** 

**RELEASED MARCH 2013** 

# **COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA**

**EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE - AUDITOR GENERAL** 

**DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL** 





# SAYRE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN BRADFORD COUNTY

COMPLIANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR THE PERIOD

JANUARY 1, 2009, TO DECEMBER 31, 2011

# CONTENTS

<u>F</u>	Page
Background	1
Letter from the Auditor General	3
Status of Prior Finding	7
Finding and Recommendation:	
Finding – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Inconsistent Pension Benefits	8
Supplementary Information	11
Report Distribution List	15
A DEDUCTION	

## **ABBREVIATION**

PERC - Public Employee Retirement Commission

#### **BACKGROUND**

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system State aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system State aid is deposited.

Pension plan aid is provided from a 2 percent foreign casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Sayre Borough Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

- Act 147 Special Ad Hoc Municipal Police and Firefighter Postretirement Adjustment Act, Act of December 14, 1988 (P.L. 1192, No. 147), as amended, 53 P.S. § 896.101 et seq.
- Act 600 Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 761 et seq.

The Sayre Borough Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 607, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 600. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the borough and its police officers.





#### Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen

#### EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council Sayre Borough Bradford County Sayre, PA 18840

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Sayre Borough Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2009, to December 31, 2011. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform our audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

#### The objectives of the audit were:

- 1. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report; and
- 2. To determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above. Our methodology addressed determinations about the following:

- · Whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements.
- Whether employer contributions are determined and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether employee contributions are required and, if so, are determined, deducted and deposited into the pension plan and are in accordance with the plan provisions and applicable laws and regulations.

- Whether benefit payments, if any, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and are properly determined in accordance with applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether obligations for plan benefits are accurately determined in accordance with plan provisions and based on complete and accurate participant data; and whether actuarial valuation reports are prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) in accordance with state law and selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program.
- · Whether the terms of the unallocated insurance contract, including ownership and any restrictions, are in compliance with plan provisions, investment policies and state regulations.
- · Whether benefit payments have only been made to living recipients, based on the Social Security numbers found in the pension records for retirees and beneficiaries.

Sayre Borough contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for annual audits of its basic financial statements which are available at the borough's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Sayre Borough Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the borough's internal controls as they relate to the borough's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objectives, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our tests indicated that, in all significant respects, the Sayre Borough Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following finding further discussed later in this report:

Finding - Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation - Inconsistent Pension Benefits

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Sayre Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report.

December 26, 2012

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE

Eugnat: O-Pasper

**Auditor General** 



### SAYRE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN STATUS OF PRIOR FINDING

# Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation

Sayre Borough has not complied with the prior audit recommendation concerning the following as further discussed in the Finding and Recommendation section of this report:

· Inconsistent Pension Benefits

# SAYRE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

#### <u>Finding – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Inconsistent Pension Benefits</u>

<u>Condition</u>: As disclosed in the prior audit report, the pension plan's governing document, Ordinance No. 607, as amended, contains benefit provisions that conflict with the collective bargaining agreement between the police officers and the borough. In addition, the normal retirement benefit contained in the collective bargaining agreement is not in compliance with Act 600, as noted below:

Benefit Provision	Governing Document	Collective Bargaining Agreement	
Normal retirement	Every participant in the pension fund may retire from active duty, provided that he/she has completed 25 years of service in the aggregate with the employer and that he/she has attained the age of 50 years.	Participants who have twenty (20) years of service and have reached their fiftieth birthday may retire and receive their retirement benefit.	
Early retirement	A partial superannuation retirement benefit provided to members of the police force with twenty (20) or more years of service.	Not provided	
Service-related disability benefit	A pension calculated at a rate of no less than 50 per centum of the member's salary at the time the disability was incurred reduced by the amount of Social Security benefits paid for the same injury.	A pension calculated in an amount equal to seventy-five percent (75%) of the participant's monthly compensation, based on the participants last thirty-six (36) months of compensation.	

In addition, the actuarial valuation report forms 201C, dated January 1, 2007, January 1, 2009, and January 1, 2011, submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission, reported the normal retirement and early retirement benefit provisions included in the governing document, and reported the disability benefit provision included in the collective bargaining agreement.

# SAYRE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

<u>Finding – (Continued)</u>

Criteria: Act 600 at Section 3 states, in part:

Each ordinance or resolution establishing a police pension fund shall prescribe a minimum period of total service in the aggregate of twenty-five years in the same borough, town, township or regional police department and shall fix the age of the members of the force at fifty-five years, or, if an actuarial study of the cost shows that such reduction in age is feasible, may fix the age of the members of the force at fifty years....

In addition, Act 600 at Section 5(h)(i) states, in part:

The ordinance or resolution establishing the police pension fund may provide for an early retirement benefit. The early retirement benefit shall be provided to a member of the police force with twenty or more years of service who terminates employment prior to the completion of superannuation retirement age and service requirements and who files a written application for an early retirement benefit with the governing body of the municipality or regional police department. The early retirement benefit shall become effective as of the date the application is filed with the governing body or the date designated on the application, whichever is later, and shall be the actuarial equivalent of a partial superannuation retirement benefit. . . .

Furthermore, Act 600 at Section 5(e)(i) states:

In the case of the payment of pensions for permanent injuries incurred in service, the amount and commencement of the payments shall be fixed by regulations of the governing body of the borough, town, township or regional police department and shall be calculated at a rate no less than fifty per centum of the member's salary at the time the disability was incurred, provided that any member who receives benefits for the same injuries under the Social Security Act (49 Stat. 620, 42 U.S.C. § 301 et. seq.) shall have his disability benefits offset or reduced by the amount of such benefits.

<u>Cause</u>: Plan officials failed to establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the plan's governing document and the collective bargaining agreement contained consistent benefit provisions that are in compliance with Act 600.

<u>Effect</u>: Inconsistent plan documents could result in inconsistent or improper benefit calculations and incorrect benefit payments from the pension plan.

# SAYRE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

# Finding – (Continued)

<u>Recommendation</u>: We again recommend that municipal officials take appropriate action to ensure the plan's governing document and the collective bargaining agreement contain consistent benefit provisions, which are in compliance with Act 600, at their earliest opportunity to do so.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

## SAYRE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

#### SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2007, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
						Unfunded
			Unfunded			(Assets in
		Actuarial	(Assets in			Excess of)
		Accrued	Excess of)			Actuarial
	Actuarial	Liability	Actuarial			Accrued
Actuarial	Value of	(AAL) -	Accrued	Funded	Covered	Liability as a %
Valuation	Assets	Entry Age	Liability	Ratio	Payroll	of Payroll
Date	(a)	(b)	(b) - (a)	(a)/(b)	(c)	[(b-a)/(c)]
01-01-07	\$ 2,592,278	\$ 2,126,688	\$ (465,590)	121.9%	\$ 470,767	(98.9%)
01-01-09	2,507,395	2,411,161	(96,234)	104.0%	490,890	(19.6%)
01-01-11	2,529,275	2,721,692	192,417	92.9%	510,684	37.6%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-09 and 01-01-11 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses at 130% of market value. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

## SAYRE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

Trends in unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability and annual covered payroll are both affected by inflation. Expressing the unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability as a percentage of annual covered payroll (Column 6) approximately adjusts for the effects of inflation and aids analysis of the plan's progress made in accumulating sufficient assets to pay benefits when due. Generally, where there is an unfunded actuarial accrued liability, the smaller this percentage, the stronger the plan. However, when assets are in excess of the actuarial accrued liability, the higher the bracketed percentage, the stronger the plan.

## SAYRE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

# SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2006	\$ 2,233	1,128.1%
2007	28,370	100.0%
2008	31,420	104.2%
2009	37,882	100.0%
2010	39,288	100.0%
2011	75,587	102.9%

## SAYRE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the required supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date January 1, 2011

Actuarial cost method Entry age normal

Amortization method Level dollar

Remaining amortization period 11 years

Asset valuation method Plan assets are valued using the

method described in Section 210 of Act 205, as amended, subject to a ceiling of 130% of the market value

of assets.

Actuarial assumptions:

Investment rate of return 8.0%

Projected salary increases 5.0%

#### SAYRE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom Corbett Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Sayre Borough Police Pension Plan Bradford County 110 West Packer Avenue Sayre, PA 18840

The Honorable Michael D. Thomas Mayor

Mr. Henry Farley Council President

Mr. David M. Jarrett Borough Manager

Ms. Elizabeth Fice Finance Director

This report is a matter of public record. Copies of this report may be obtained from the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, Room 318 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120. If you have any questions regarding this report or any other matter, you may contact the Department of the Auditor General by accessing our website at www.auditorgen.state.pa.us.