

YOUNGSVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN

WARREN COUNTY

COMPLIANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR THE PERIOD

JANUARY 1, 2010, TO DECEMBER 31, 2012

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE - AUDITOR GENERAL

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL





Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council Youngsville Borough Warren County Youngsville, PA 16371

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Youngsville Borough Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2010, to December 31, 2012. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform our audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our finding and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The objectives of the audit were:

- 1. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report; and
- 2. To determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above. Our methodology addressed determinations about the following:

- Whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements.
- · Whether employer contributions are determined and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations.
- · Whether employee contributions are required and, if so, are determined, deducted and deposited into the pension plan and are in accordance with the plan provisions and applicable laws and regulations.

- · Whether benefit payments, if any, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and are properly determined in accordance with applicable laws and regulations.
- Whether obligations for plan benefits are accurately determined in accordance with plan provisions and based on complete and accurate participant data; and whether actuarial valuation reports are prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) in accordance with state law and selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program.
- Whether the terms of the contractual agreement with the Pennsylvania State Association of Boroughs are in accordance with the plan's governing document, if separately stated, and applicable laws and regulations.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Youngsville Borough Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the borough's internal controls as they relate to the borough's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objectives, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our tests indicated that, in all significant respects, the Youngsville Borough Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following finding further discussed later in this report:

Finding – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Provision Of Benefits In Excess Of Act 581

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Youngsville Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report.

August 12, 2013

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE

Eugent: O-Pager

Auditor General

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background	1
Status of Prior Finding	2
Finding and Recommendation:	
Finding – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Provision Of Benefits In Excess Of Act 581	3
Supplementary Information	5
Report Distribution List	9
ABBREVIATION	

PSABMRT - Pennsylvania State Association of Boroughs Municipal Retirement Trust

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Youngsville Borough Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

- Act 177 General Local Government Code, Act of December 19, 1996 (P.L. 1178, No. 177), as amended, 53 Pa.C.S. § 101 et seq.
- Act 581 The Borough Code, Act of February 1, 1966 (P.L. 1656, No. 581), Article XI(f), Police Pension Fund in Boroughs Having a Police Force of Less Than Three Members, as amended, 53 P.S. § 46131 et seq.

The Youngsville Borough Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 551, which adopts a joinder agreement with PSABMRT, effective December 31, 2002. The plan is also affected by the provisions of employment agreements between the borough and its police officers.

YOUNGSVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN STATUS OF PRIOR FINDING

Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation

Youngsville Borough has not complied with the prior audit recommendation concerning the following as further discussed in the Finding and Recommendation section of this report:

· Provision Of Benefits In Excess Of Act 581

YOUNGSVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

<u>Finding</u> – <u>Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Provision Of Benefits In Excess</u> Of Act 581

<u>Condition</u>: As disclosed in the prior audit report, the borough adopted a home rule charter pursuant to the Home Rule Charter and Optional Plans Law, 53 Pa. C.S. § 2901 <u>et seq.</u> (previously 53 P.S. § 1-101 <u>et seq.</u>). Our audit of the police pension plan has revealed that the borough has provided the option for survivor benefits in excess of the restrictions found in Act 581.

The joinder agreement with PSABMRT provides that the normal form of retirement benefit shall be a life annuity with 120 months certain, with optional forms additionally provided. Some of the optional forms provide for contingent annuitant benefits ranging from 50 percent to 100 percent of the member's retirement benefit.

Criteria: Section 1131 of Act 581 states, in part:

All pension funds established under the provisions of this section shall be under the direction of the borough council, or such committee as it may designate, and shall be applied under such regulations as the council may by ordinance prescribe for the benefit of such members of the police force as shall receive honorable discharge therefrom by reason of age or disability and the families of such as may be injured or killed in the service (emphasis added). Any allowances made to those who are retired by reason of disability or age shall be in conformity with a uniform scale.

Furthermore, on January 24, 2001, the Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania issued its opinion in *Municipality of Monroeville v. Monroeville Police Department Wage Policy Committee*. Therein, the court held that Section 2962(c)(5) of the Home Rule Charter and Optional Plans Law, 53 Pa. C.S. § 2962(c)(5), "clearly precludes home rule municipalities from providing pension benefits different from those prescribed in general law including Act 600." The court's holding was in accord with the position taken by this Department since at least January 1995.

<u>Cause</u>: Plan officials failed to establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure compliance with the prior audit recommendation.

YOUNGSVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

Finding – (Continued)

<u>Effect</u>: Providing unauthorized pension benefits increases the plan's pension costs and reduces the amount of funds available for investment purposes or for the payment of authorized benefits or administrative expenses. Since the borough received state aid based on unit value during the current audit period, it did not receive allocations attributable to the excess pension benefits provided. However, the increased costs to the pension plan as a result of the excess pension benefits could result in the receipt of excess state aid in the future and increase the municipal contributions necessary to fund the plan in accordance with Act 205 funding standards.

Recommendation: We again recommend that the borough restrict pension benefits to those authorized by Act 581 for all employees who began full-time employment on or after January 24, 2001 (the date *Monroeville* was issued) at its earliest opportunity to do so. To the extent that the borough is not in compliance with Act 581 and/or is contractually obligated to pay benefits in excess of those authorized by Act 581, the excess benefits must be reflected in the Act 205 actuarial valuation reports for the plan and funded in accordance with Act 205 funding standards. Furthermore, such benefits will be deemed ineligible for funding with state pension aid. In such case, municipal officials may be required to consult with the plan's actuary to determine if Supplemental Actuarial Information Form AG-MP-1 should be prepared to determine the effect on the borough's state aid allocations received subsequent to the current audit period. If it is determined the excess benefits provided had an impact on the borough's state aid allocations, the form should be submitted to the Department. Furthermore, after the submission of the form, the plan's actuary would be required to contact the Department to verify the overpayment of state aid received and plan officials would have to reimburse the overpayment of state aid to the Commonwealth.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception. It is the borough's intent to amend the pension plan in order to bring the plan into compliance with Act 581.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be evaluated during our next audit of the plan.

YOUNGSVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2007, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
						Unfunded
			Unfunded			(Assets in
		Actuarial	(Assets in			Excess of)
		Accrued	Excess of)			Actuarial
	Actuarial	Liability	Actuarial			Accrued
Actuarial	Value of	(AAL) -	Accrued	Funded	Covered	Liability as a %
Valuation	Assets	Entry Age	Liability	Ratio	Payroll	of Payroll
Date	(a)	(b)	(b) - (a)	(a)/(b)	(c)	[(b-a)/(c)]
01-01-07	\$ 364,042	\$ 425,315	\$ 61,273	85.6%	\$ 61,146	100.2%
01-01-09	361,336	443,365	82,029	81.5%	69,810	117.5%
01-01-11	367,306	452,864	85,558	81.1%	80,565	106.2%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-09 and 01-01-11 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses subject to a corridor between 70 to 130 percent of the market value of assets. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

YOUNGSVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

Trends in unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability and annual covered payroll are both affected by inflation. Expressing the unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability as a percentage of annual covered payroll (Column 6) approximately adjusts for the effects of inflation and aids analysis of the plan's progress made in accumulating sufficient assets to pay benefits when due. Generally, where there is an unfunded actuarial accrued liability, the smaller this percentage, the stronger the plan. When assets are in excess of the actuarial accrued liability, the higher the bracketed percentage, the stronger the plan.

YOUNGSVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2007	\$ 21,890	100.0%
2008	22,942	100.0%
2009	23,840	100.0%
2010	20,154	100.0%
2011	26,470	136.1%
2012	29,336	100.0%

YOUNGSVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the required supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date January 1, 2011

Actuarial cost method Entry age normal

Amortization method Level dollar

Remaining amortization period 10 years

Asset valuation method Plan assets are valued using the

method described in Section 210 of Act 205, as amended, subject to a corridor between 70-130% of the

market value of assets.

Actuarial assumptions:

Investment rate of return 7.5%

Projected salary increases 4.5%

YOUNGSVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom Corbett Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Youngsville Borough Police Pension Plan Warren County 40 Railroad Street Youngsville, PA 16371

The Honorable James L. Farr Mayor

Ms. Lisa M. Hagberg Borough Manager

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.auditorgen.state.pa.us. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 231 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@auditorgen.state.pa.us.