

# COMPLIANCE AUDIT

---

## Brighton Township Police Pension Plan Beaver County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2015

---

October 2016



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



**Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General  
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018  
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General  
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen  
www.PaAuditor.gov**

**EUGENE A. DePASQUALE  
AUDITOR GENERAL**

Board of Township Supervisors  
Brighton Township  
Beaver County  
Beaver, PA 15009

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Brighton Township Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2015. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.
- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.

- We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for the one plan member who elected to vest during the current audit period represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the pension benefit due and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined.
- We determined whether the January 1, 2011, January 1, 2013 and January 1, 2015 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2012, 2014 and 2016, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.

Brighton Township contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for audits of its basic financial statements which are available at the township's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Township officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Brighton Township Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the township's internal controls as they relate to the township's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Brighton Township Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Brighton Township and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank township officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

October 18, 2016

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Eugene A. DePasquale". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE  
Auditor General

## CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background.....	1
Supplementary Information .....	3
Report Distribution List .....	9

## BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Brighton Township Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 600 - Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 761 et seq.

The Brighton Township Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Resolution No. 94-18, as amended. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the township and its police officers. The plan was established February 12, 1968. Active members are required to contribute not less than 5 percent nor more than 8 percent of salary to the plan; however, during the current audit period, member contributions were reduced to 3.5 percent of salary. As of December 31, 2015, the plan had 8 active members, 1 terminated member eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 4 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

## **BACKGROUND – (Continued)**

As of December 31, 2015, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

### Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	Age 55 and 25 years of service.
Early Retirement	None
Vesting	A member is 100% vested after 12 years of service.

### Retirement Benefit:

Benefit equals 50% of final 36 months average compensation. Compensation includes base salary, overtime and longevity pay.

### Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility	Refund of member contributions plus interest.
After Retirement Eligibility	A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension the member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the day of the member's death.

### Service Related Disability Benefit:

Benefit equals 50% of the member's salary at the time the disability was incurred, offset by Social Security disability benefits received for the same injury.

BRIGHTON TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
(UNAUDITED)

The supplementary information contained on Pages 3 through 5 reflect the implementation of GASB Statement No. 67, *Financial Reporting for Pension Plans*. The objective of this statement is to improve financial reporting by state and local governmental pension plans.

SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION  
LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS  
FOR THE YEARS ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2014 AND 2015

	<u>2014</u>	<u>2015</u>
Total Pension Liability		
Service cost	\$ 67,223	\$ 82,147
Interest	126,338	111,489
Difference between expected and actual experience	(214,195)	-
Changes of assumptions	29,076	-
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(77,307)	(77,305)
Net Change in Total Pension Liability	(68,865)	116,331
Total Pension Liability - Beginning	1,808,938	1,740,073
Total Pension Liability - Ending (a)	<u>\$ 1,740,073</u>	<u>\$ 1,856,404</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position		
Contributions - employer	\$ 101,159	\$ 104,474
Contribution - member	17,829	17,866
Net investment income	111,093	(944)
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(77,307)	(77,305)
Administrative expense	(994)	(2,897)
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position	151,780	41,194
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Beginning	1,422,999	1,574,779
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Ending (b)	<u>\$ 1,574,779</u>	<u>\$ 1,615,973</u>
Net Pension Liability - Ending (a-b)	<u>\$ 165,294</u>	<u>\$ 240,431</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability	90.5%	87.0%
Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	\$ 522,866	\$ 545,884
Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll	31.6%	44.0%



BRIGHTON TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN  
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
 (UNAUDITED)

Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to Changes in the Discount Rate

The following presents the net pension liability of the township at December 31, 2014, calculated using the discount rate of 6.5%, as well as what the township's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease 5.5%	Current Discount Rate 6.5%	1% Increase 7.5%
Net Pension Liability	\$ 374,597	\$ 165,294	\$ (11,274)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS

Year Ended December 31	Actuarially Determined Contribution	Actual Contributions	Contribution Deficiency (Excess)	Covered- Employee Payroll	Contributions as a Percentage of Covered- Employee Payroll
2008	\$ 29,556	\$ 29,556	\$ -	\$ 318,108	9.29%
2009	33,939	33,939	-	334,665	10.14%
2010	57,016	57,016	-	375,419	15.19%
2011	60,446	60,446	-	404,741	14.93%
2012	82,180	82,180	-	416,010	19.75%
2013	83,327	83,327	-	421,724	19.76%
2014	85,605	101,159	(15,554)	522,866	19.35%
2015	104,474	104,474	-	545,884	19.14%

BRIGHTON TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF INVESTMENT RETURNS

Annual Money-Weighted Rate of Return, Net of Investment Expense:

2014	7.88%
2013	13.48%
2012	6.67%
2011	2.41%
2010	8.19%
2009	10.49%
2008	(14.06%)

BRIGHTON TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN  
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2011, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-11	\$ 1,184,900	\$ 1,485,576	\$ 300,676	79.8%
01-01-13	1,346,100	1,709,803	363,703	78.7%
01-01-15	1,574,779	1,740,073	165,294	90.5%

Note: The market value of the plan's assets at 01-01-11 has been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 5-year averaging period. The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-13 and 01-01-15 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses subject to a corridor of 80 to 120 percent of the market value of assets. These methods will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

BRIGHTON TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

BRIGHTON TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES  
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2015
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar
Remaining amortization period	11 years
Asset valuation method	Plan assets are valued using the method described in Section 210 of Act 205, as amended, subject to a corridor between 80-120% of the market value of assets.
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	6.5%
Projected salary increases	4.75%
Cost-of-living adjustments	2.5%

BRIGHTON TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN  
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

**The Honorable Tom W. Wolf**  
Governor  
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

**Mr. John Curtaccio**  
Chairman, Board of Township Supervisors

**Mr. James E. Equels, Sr.**  
Vice-Chairman, Board of Township Supervisors

**Mr. Mark Piccirilli**  
Township Supervisor

**Mr. Bryan K. DeHart**  
Township Manager

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at [www.PaAuditor.gov](http://www.PaAuditor.gov). Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: [news@PaAuditor.gov](mailto:news@PaAuditor.gov).