

# COMPLIANCE AUDIT

---

## Phoenixville Borough Police Pension Plan Chester County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2015 to December 31, 2016

---

March 2018



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General  
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018  
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General  
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen  
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DePASQUALE  
AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council  
Phoenixville Borough  
Chester County  
Phoenixville, PA 19460

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Phoenixville Borough Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2015 to December 31, 2016. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform our audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The objectives of the audit were:

1. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report; and
2. To determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report, we inquired of plan officials and evaluated supporting documentation provided by officials evidencing that the suggested corrective action has been appropriately taken. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.

- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.
- We determined that there were no employee contributions required for the years covered by our audit period due to the fact that employee contributions were appropriately waived by the municipality.
- We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for the plan member who retired during the current audit period represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefit due to the retired individual and comparing this amount to supporting documentation evidencing the amount determined and actually paid to the recipient.
- We determined whether the January 1, 2011, January 1, 2013, and January 1, 2015 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the former Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2012, 2014, and 2016, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.

Phoenixville Borough contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for annual audits of its basic financial statements which are available at the borough's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Phoenixville Borough Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the borough's internal controls as they relate to the borough's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objectives, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Phoenixville Borough Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Phoenixville Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

March 15, 2018

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Eugene A. DePasquale". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE  
Auditor General

## CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background.....	1
Status of Prior Finding.....	3
Supplementary Information .....	4
Report Distribution List .....	10

## BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The Act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Phoenixville Borough Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the former Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 600 - Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 767 et seq.

The Phoenixville Borough Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 2013-2212, adopted pursuant to Act 600. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the borough and its police officers. The plan was established January 1, 1965. Active members are required to contribute 5 percent of compensation to the plan; however, member contributions were eliminated during the audit period. As of December 31, 2016, the plan had 29 active members, 1 terminated member eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 18 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

## **BACKGROUND – (Continued)**

As of December 31, 2016, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

### Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement    Age 50 and 25 years of service

Early Retirement     20 years of service

Vesting                100% after 12 years of service

### Retirement Benefit:

50% of final 36 months average salary, plus a service increment of \$100 per month for each year of service in excess of 25 years, up to a maximum of \$100 per month.

### Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility    Refund of member contributions plus interest.

After Retirement Eligibility     A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension the member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the day of the member's death.

### Service Related Disability Benefit:

50% of the member's salary at the time the disability was incurred.

PHOENIXVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN  
STATUS OF PRIOR FINDING

Compliance With Prior Audit Recommendation

Phoenixville Borough has complied with the prior audit recommendation concerning the following:

- Failure To Properly Determine And Fully Pay The Minimum Municipal Obligation Of The Plan

In 2015, the borough deposited \$49,499 into the pension plan representing the minimum municipal obligation due to the plan for the year 2014, with interest.



PHOENIXVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
(UNAUDITED)

The supplementary information contained on Pages 4 and 5 reflects the implementation of GASB Statement No. 67, *Financial Reporting for Pension Plans*. The objective of this statement is to improve financial reporting by state and local governmental pension plans.

SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION  
LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS  
FOR THE YEARS ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2014, 2015, AND 2016

	<u>2014</u>	<u>2015</u>	<u>2016</u>
Total Pension Liability			
Service cost	\$ 336,874	\$ 380,294	\$ 399,309
Interest	723,044	751,072	810,556
Difference between expected and actual experience	-	(385,864)	-
Changes of assumptions	-	322,782	-
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(314,537)	(327,900)	(331,934)
Net Change in Total Pension Liability	<u>745,381</u>	<u>740,384</u>	<u>877,931</u>
Total Pension Liability - Beginning	<u>9,460,976</u>	<u>10,206,357</u>	<u>10,946,741</u>
Total Pension Liability - Ending (a)	<u><u>\$ 10,206,357</u></u>	<u><u>\$ 10,946,741</u></u>	<u><u>\$ 11,824,672</u></u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position			
Contributions - employer	\$ 280,262	\$ * 393,533	\$ 316,607
Net investment income	587,261	11,750	660,325
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(314,537)	(327,900)	(331,934)
Administrative expense	(49,213)	(9,135)	(7,650)
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position	<u>503,773</u>	<u>68,248</u>	<u>637,348</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Beginning	<u>10,831,709</u>	<u>11,335,483</u>	<u>11,403,731</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Ending (b)	<u><u>\$ 11,335,482</u></u>	<u><u>\$ 11,403,731</u></u>	<u><u>\$ 12,041,079</u></u>
Net Pension Liability - Ending (a-b)	<u><u>\$ (1,129,125)</u></u>	<u><u>\$ (456,990)</u></u>	<u><u>\$ (216,407)</u></u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability	111.06%	104.17%	101.83%
Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	\$ 2,464,671	\$ 2,296,154	\$ 2,296,154
Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll	-45.81%	-19.90%	-9.42%

\* Additional 2014 minimum municipal obligation of \$43,723 deposited in 2015 with interest, totaling \$49,499.

PHOENIXVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN  
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
 (UNAUDITED)

Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to Changes in the Discount Rate

The following presents the net pension liability of the borough as of December 31, 2014, calculated using the discount rate of 7.50%, as well as what the borough's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (6.50%)	Current Discount Rate (7.50%)	1% Increase (8.50%)
Net Pension Liability - 12/31/14	\$ 324,100	\$ (1,129,125)	\$ (2,341,963)

The following presents the net pension liability of the borough as of December 31, 2015 and 2016, calculated using the discount rate of 7.25%, as well as what the borough's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (6.25%)	Current Discount Rate (7.25%)	1% Increase (8.25%)
Net Pension Liability - 12/31/15	\$ 1,095,459	\$ (456,990)	\$ (1,748,990)
Net Pension Liability - 12/31/16	\$ 1,440,060	\$ (216,407)	\$ (1,596,115)

SCHEDULE OF INVESTMENT RETURNS

Annual Money-Weighted Rate of Return, Net of Investment Expense:

2016	5.70%
2015	0.08%
2014	4.70%

PHOENIXVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN  
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2011, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-11	\$ 7,818,936	\$ 8,370,804	\$ 551,868	93.4%
01-01-13	9,185,369	8,785,775	(399,594)	104.5%
01-01-15	11,353,473	10,143,275	(1,210,198)	111.9%

PHOENIXVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

PHOENIXVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER  
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2011	\$ 514,221	118.0%
2012	389,755	100.0%
2013	448,816	100.8%
2014	323,984	100.0%
2015	344,034	100.0%
2016	316,607	100.0%

PHOENIXVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES  
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2015
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar
Remaining amortization period	N/A
Asset valuation method	N/A
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	7.25%
Projected salary increases	5.0%
Cost-of-living adjustments	Equal to Philadelphia CPI (CPI-W), made to retirees with a maximum total increase of 15% for members who terminated prior to 1-1-2002, and a maximum total increase of 30% for members who terminate after 1-1-2002.

PHOENIXVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN  
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

**The Honorable Tom W. Wolf**  
Governor  
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

**The Honorable Peter J. Urscheler**  
Mayor

**Mr. James C. Kovaleski**  
Council President

**Mr. Jonathan Ewald**  
Council Vice-President

**Mr. Jeremy Dalton**  
Councilman

**Ms. Catherine Doherty**  
Councilwoman

**Ms. Beth Burckley**  
Councilwoman

**Mr. Richard M. Kirkner**  
Councilman

**Mr. Edwin Soto**  
Councilman

**Ms. Dana Dugan**  
Councilwoman

**Mr. E. Jean Krack**  
Borough Manager

**Ms. Monica Koza-Lubinsky**  
Finance Director

PHOENIXVILLE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN  
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

**Ms. Dina Coull**  
Human Resources Director

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at [www.PaAuditor.gov](http://www.PaAuditor.gov). Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: [news@PaAuditor.gov](mailto:news@PaAuditor.gov).